

SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT AND RELEASE

This SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT AND RELEASE (hereinafter "Agreement") is entered into between the STATE OF CALIFORNIA AIR RESOURCES BOARD (hereinafter "ARB") 1001 I Street, Sacramento, California 95814, and J R Transportes (hereinafter "JRT"), Calle 4, NO. 629 Guadalupe Victoria, P.O. Box 1945 Calexico, CA 92232.

I. RECITALS

- (1) Health and Safety Code, Section 39650-39675 mandates the reduction of the emissions of substances that have been determined to be toxic air contaminants (TACs). In 1998, following an exhaustive 10-year scientific assessment process, the Air Resources Board identified particulate matter (PM) from diesel-fueled engines as a toxic air contaminant. Transport Refrigeration Units (TRUs) are powered by diesel fueled engines that emit toxic particulate matter. TRUs are controlled under Title, 13 California Code of Regulations (CCR), section 2477.
- (2) CCR, Title 13, section 2477 (e) (1) (A) (1) states: No owner/operator shall operate a TRU or TRU generator (gen) set in California unless it meets the in-use emission category performance standard.
- (3) CCR, Title 13, section 2477 (e) (1) (E) (1) states: On or before January 31, 2009, delayed until July 31, 2009, owner/operators of all California-based TRUs subject to this regulation shall apply for an ARB identification numbers (IDN) for all California-based TRUs operated by the operator. Failure to apply or submittal of false information is a violation of state law subject to civil penalty.
- (4) The ARB Enforcement Division has documented that JRT, failed to bring their fleet of TRUs in compliance with the applicable in-use performance standards and failed to apply for an ARB IDN prior to July 31, 2009.
- (5) Health and Safety Code, Sections 39674 (a) and (b) authorize civil penalties for the violation of the programs for the regulation of toxic air contaminants not to exceed one thousand dollars (\$1,000.00) or not to exceed ten thousand dollars (\$10,000.00) respectively, for each day in which the violation occurs.
- (6) California Health and Safety Code (*H&SC*) Section 44011.6 established the Heavy Duty Vehicle Inspection Program (HDVIP). It authorizes ARB to inspect on-road heavy-duty vehicles for excessive smoke emissions and engine tampering and to issue citations, accordingly. The program also requires the vehicle owner to repair its engines that exceed the prescribed ARB smoke opacity standards, perform a post-repair opacity test, and submit proof of repairs and any assessed penalties under the Regulations of the Heavy-Duty Smoke Inspection Program, Chapter 3.5, Sections 2180-2188, Title 13, California Code of Regulations (CCR).

SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT AND RELEASE

ARB and J R Transportes

Page 2 of 10

- (7) *H&SC* Section 43701 provides that ARB shall adopt regulations that require owners or operators of heavy-duty diesel motor vehicles to perform regular inspections of their vehicles for excess smoke emissions.
- (8) Title 13, CCR sections 2190 et seq. was adopted under the authority of *H&SC* section 43701 and, with limited exceptions, which are not applicable here, applies to all heavy-duty diesel powered vehicles with gross vehicle weight ratings greater than 6,000 pounds that operate on the streets or highways within the State of California.
- (9) Title 13, CCR sections 2190 et seq. authorize the Periodic Smoke Inspection Program (PSIP) which requires the owners and operators of California based vehicle fleets of two or more heavy duty diesel motor vehicles with gross vehicle weight ratings greater than 6,000 pounds that operate on the streets or highways within the State of California to conduct annual smoke opacity inspections of their vehicles that are four years older than the model year of the vehicle's engine.
- (10) Title 13, CCR section 2192 (a) requires inter alia that the owner of the vehicle "[t]est the vehicle for excessive smoke emissions periodically according to the inspection intervals specified in section 2193 (a), (b), and (c)", "[m]easure the smoke emissions for each test...", "[r]ecord the smoke test opacity levels and other required test information as specified in section 2194..." and "[k]eep the records specified in section 2194 for two years after the date of inspection."
- (11) *H&SC* Section 43016 states, "Any person who violates any provision of this part, or any order, rule, or regulation of the state board adopted pursuant to this part, and for which violation there is not provided in this part any other specific civil penalty or fine, shall be subject to a civil penalty of not to exceed five hundred dollars (\$500.00) per vehicle."
- (12) The ARB considers testing, measuring, recording, and recordkeeping to be critical components in reducing excessive smoke emissions from these heavy-duty vehicles.
- (13) ARB contends JRT failed to test, measure, record, and maintain records of smoke emissions from its fleet of heavy-duty diesel vehicles for 2010 and 2011 in violation of Title 13, CCR Sections 2190 et seq.
- (14) JRT is willing to enter into this Agreement solely for the purpose of settlement and resolution of this matter with ARB. ARB accepts this Agreement in termination of this matter. Accordingly, the parties agree to resolve this matter completely by means of this Agreement, without the need for formal litigation, and therefore agree as follows:

II. TERMS & RELEASE

In consideration of ARB not filing a legal action against JRT, for the violations alleged above, ARB and JRT agree as follows:

- (1) Upon execution of this Agreement, JRT shall pay a civil penalty of \$51,375.00. Payment shall be made in check form as described below and the full amount shall be submitted as per the agreed payment schedule.
 - \$38,531.25 to the **California Air Pollution Control Fund**.
 - \$12,843.75 to the **Peralta Community College District**.

ARB to receive by:

10/01/2012	First Payment
01/01/2013	Second Payment
04/01/2013	Third Payment
07/01/2013	Fourth Payment
10/01/2013	Fifth Payment
01/01/2014	Sixth Payment

- First payment is due on October 01, 2012 and shall be made in form of a check payable to the **Peralta Community College District** in the amount of \$8,562.50.
- Second payment is due on January 01, 2013 and shall be made in form of two checks 1) payable to the **Peralta Community College District** in the amount of \$4,281.25 and 2) to the **California Air Pollution Control Fund** in the amount of \$4,281.25.
- Third payment is due on April 01, 2013 and shall be made in form of a check payable to the **California Air Pollution Control Fund** in the amount of \$8,562.50.
- Fourth payment is due on July 01, 2013 and shall be made in form of a check payable to the **California Air Pollution Control Fund** in the amount of \$8,562.50.

SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT AND RELEASE

ARB and J R Transportes

Page 4 of 10

- Fifth payment is due on October 01, 2013 and shall be made in form of a check payable to the **California Air Pollution Control Fund** in the amount of \$8,562.50.
- Sixth payment is due on January 01, 2014 and shall be made in form of a check payable to the **California Air Pollution Control Fund** in the amount of \$8,562.50.
- All payments and documents shall be sent to the attention of:

Eric Bissinger, Air Pollution Specialist
Air Resources Board, Enforcement Division
1001 I Street
P.O. Box 2815
Sacramento, CA 95812

- (2) Effect of Untimely Payment. If any payment is more than 15 days late, the entire remaining balance becomes immediately due and payable. In addition, if the Attorney General files a civil action to enforce this settlement agreement, JRT shall pay all costs of investigating and prosecuting the action, including expert fees, reasonable attorney's fees, and costs.
- (3) It is agreed that if JRT, including its subsidiary or parent company, at any time becomes insolvent, or makes an assignment for the benefit of creditors or similar action adversely involving JRT, its subsidiary, or parent company, or a proceeding or petition under any bankruptcy, reorganization, arrangement of debt, insolvency, readjustment of debt, or receivership law or statute is filed by or against JRT, its subsidiary, or parent company, or a trustee in bankruptcy, custodian, receiver or agent is appointed or authorized to take charge of any of JRT's, its subsidiary, or parent company's properties, or if any deposit account or other property of JRT, its subsidiary, or parent company be attempted to be obtained or held by writ of execution, garnishment, attachment, condemnation, levy, forfeiture or other legal process, or JRT, its subsidiary, or parent company takes any action to authorize any of the foregoing, the entire remaining balance becomes immediately due and payable without notice or demand.
- (4) It is further agreed that the penalties described in Terms and Release paragraph (1) are punitive in nature, rather than compensatory. Furthermore, the penalty is intended to deter and punish JRT for violations of state environmental statutes, and these penalties are payable to and for the benefit of ARB, a government unit. Therefore, it is agreed that these penalties imposed on JRT by the ARB arising from the facts described in recital paragraphs (1) – (13) are nondischargeable under 11 U.S.C. § 523 (a) (7), which provides an exception from discharge for

SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT AND RELEASE

ARB and J R Transportes

Page 5 of 10

any debt to the extent such debt is for a fine, penalty or forfeiture payable to and for benefit of governmental unit, and is not compensation for actual pecuniary loss, other than certain types of tax penalties.

- (5) JRT shall not violate H&SC sections 43701 *et seq.* and 44011.6 *et seq.* and Title 13, CCR Sections 2180 *et seq.*, 2190 *et seq.*, and 2485 *et seq.*
- (6) JRT shall comply with one or both of the following options to attend the California Council on Diesel Education and Technology (CCDET I) class, (SAE J1667 Snap Acceleration Smoke Test Procedure for Heavy-Duty Diesel Powered Vehicles) as described on the ARB webpage at <http://www.arb.ca.gov/enf/hdvp/ccdet/ccdet.htm>. This class is conducted by various California Community Colleges and instructs attendees on compliance with the PSIP, ECL and the HDVIP.
 - (a) JRT shall have the fleet maintenance manager (or equivalent) and all staff performing opacity tests for compliance with PSIP and the HDVIP attend the CCDET I class. Proof of CCDET I completion shall be provided to ARB within one year of the date of this Agreement and be maintained in each applicable employee's file for the term of his or her employment.
 - (b) If JRT uses a contractor to perform the annual smoke opacity testing required under the PSIP, in addition to having the fleet maintenance manager (or equivalent) attend the CCDET I course, JRT shall obtain proof that the contractor's staff conducting the smoke opacity tests completed the CCDET course within the past four years. This proof of CCDET completion shall be provided to ARB with PSIP records as required by this Agreement and be maintained with the annual PSIP records.
- (7) JRT shall comply with one or both of the following options to attend the CCDET II class (Diesel Exhaust After Treatment and Maintenance), described on the ARB's webpage <http://www.arb.ca.gov/enf/hdvp/ccdet/ccdet.htm>. This class is conducted by various California Community Colleges and instructs attendees on California's emission regulations and the proper care and maintenance of exhaust after treatment systems (EATS).
 - (a) JRT shall have the fleet maintenance manager (or equivalent) and all staff responsible for maintenance of EATS attend the CCDET II class. Proof of CCDET II completion shall be provided to ARB within one year of the date of this Agreement and also be maintained in each applicable employee's file for the term of his or her employment.

SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT AND RELEASE

ARB and J R Transportes

Page 6 of 10

- (b) In case JRT uses a contractor for the maintenance of EATS, in addition to having the fleet maintenance manager (or equivalent) attend the CCDET II course, JRT shall obtain proof that the contractor's staff maintaining the EATS device(s) completed the CCDET II course within the last four years. This proof of the CCDET II completion shall be provided by JRT to the ARB within one year of the date of this settlement and be maintained with the EATS installation and maintenance records.
- (8) JRT shall submit copies of all PSIP compliance records for years 2012 and 2013 to the ARB by January 31 of the following year. Copies shall be addressed to the attention of Eric Bissinger at the California Air Resources Board, Enforcement Division, P.O. Box 2815, Sacramento, CA 95812. The ARB reserves the right to visit any JRT fleet location at any time to conduct compliance audits for the HDVIP and PSIP, or any other applicable ARB program.
- (9) JRT shall complete Low NOx Software Upgrades (reflash) on all applicable heavy-duty diesel engines operating in California and report to the ARB within 45 days of this agreement.
- (10) Each 1974 or newer diesel powered heavy-duty vehicle in the JRT fleet shall continue to comply with the emission control label (ECL) requirements set forth in the CCR, Title 13, Section 2183 (c).
- (11) JRT shall instruct all employees who operate diesel-fueled vehicles to comply with the idling regulations set forth in CCR, Title 13, Section 2485, within 45 days of this Agreement.
- (12) JRT shall comply with the TRU in-use performance standards set forth in Title 13, CCR, Section 2477 (e) (1) (A). Within 45 days of the execution of this Agreement, JRT shall submit the proof of the compliance with the TRU ATCM to Mr. Eric Bissinger, Air Pollution Specialist, ARB Enforcement Division, Air Resources Board, Enforcement Division, P.O. Box 2815, Sacramento, CA 95812.
- (13) JRT shall not violate the TRU ATCM, as codified in CCR, Title 13, Section 2477.
- (14) Within 45 days of the execution of this Agreement, JRT shall comply with the Truck and Bus Regulation as codified in CCR, Title 13, Section 2025.
- (15) This Agreement shall apply to and be binding upon JRT, and its officers, directors, receivers, trustees, employees, successors and assignees, subsidiary and parent corporations and upon ARB and any successor agency that may have responsibility for and jurisdiction over the subject matter of this Agreement.

SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT AND RELEASE

ARB and J R Transportes

Page 7 of 10

- (16) This Agreement constitutes the entire agreement and understanding between ARB and JRT, concerning the subject matter hereof, and supersedes and replaces all prior negotiations and agreements between ARB and JRT, concerning the subject matter hereof.
- (17) No agreement to modify, amend, extend, supersede, terminate, or discharge this Agreement, or any portion thereof, is valid or enforceable unless it is in writing and signed by all parties to this Agreement.
- (18) Severability. Each provision of this Agreement is severable, and in the event that any provision of this Agreement is held to be invalid or unenforceable, the remainder of this Agreement remains in full force and effect.
- (19) This Agreement shall be interpreted and enforced in accordance with the laws of the State of California, without regard to California's choice-of-law rules.
- (20) This Agreement is deemed to have been drafted equally by the Parties; it will not be interpreted for or against either party on the ground that said party drafted it.
- (21) **SB 1402 Statement**

Senate Bill 1402 (Dutton, Chapter 413, statutes of 2010) requires the ARB to provide information on the basis for the penalties it seeks (see Health and Safety Code section 39619.7). This information, which is provided throughout this settlement agreement, is summarized here.

The manner in which the penalty amount was determined, including a per unit or per vehicle penalty.

Penalties must be set at levels sufficient to discourage violations. The penalties in this matter were determined in consideration of all relevant circumstances, including the eight factors specified in Health and Safety Code sections 42403 and 43024.

TRU Violations

The per unit penalty for the TRU violations involved in this case is a maximum of \$1,000 per unit per day for strict liability violations or \$10,000 per unit per day for negligent or intentional violations pursuant to H&SC section 39674. The penalty obtained for the 23 TRU violations involved in this case is \$17,250.00 or \$750 for each TRU failing to meet in-use performance standard and \$7,875 for 21 TRUs or \$375 for each TRU not registered with ARB prior to July 31, 2009 . The penalty was discounted based on the fact that this was a first time violation and the violator made unusually diligent efforts to cooperate with the investigation.

SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT AND RELEASE

ARB and J R Transportes

Page 8 of 10

PSIP Violations

The per vehicle penalty for the PSIP violations involved in this case is a maximum of \$500 per vehicle per violation. The penalty obtained for the 46 PSIP violations involved in this case is \$17,250.00 from 23 vehicles over two years, or \$375 per violation. The penalty was discounted based on the fact that this was a first time violation and the violator made unusually diligent efforts to comply and to cooperate with the investigation.

Truck and Bus Regulation Violations

The per unit penalty for the Truck & Bus violations involved in this case is a maximum of \$1,000 per unit per day for strict liability violations or \$10,000 per unit per day for negligent or intentional violations pursuant to H&SC section 39674. The penalty obtained for the Truck & Bus violations involved in this case is \$6,000.00 or \$750.00 each for 8 non-compliant vehicles. After considering all factors specified in 43024, the penalty reflects that fact these were unintentional first time violations and that JRT cooperated with the investigation.

The provision of law the penalty is being assessed under and why that provision is most appropriate for that violation.

TRU Violations

The penalty provision being applied for the In-Use Diesel-Fueled Transport Refrigeration Units Regulation (Title 13, CCR, section 2477 et seq.) violations (including labeling) is Health and Safety Code section 39674 because the TRU rule is a Toxic Air Contaminant Control Measure adopted pursuant to authority contained in Health and Safety Code Sections 39650-39675 and because JRT failed to meet the in-use performance standards set forth by the TRU rule, on one unit over an unspecified number of days.

PSIP Violations

The penalty provision being applied to the PSIP violations is H&SC section 43016 because JRT failed to test, measure, record, and maintain records of smoke emissions from its fleet of heavy duty diesel vehicles for years 2010, and 2011 in violation of the PSIP regulation in Title 13, CCR sections 2190 et seq. for 46 violations. Since the PSIP regulation was adopted pursuant to authority granted in Part 5 of Division 26 of the H&SC and since there is no specific penalty or fine provided for PSIP violations in Part 5, H&SC section 43016 is the applicable penalty provision.

Truck & Bus Violations

The penalty provision being applied for the Truck & Bus regulation (Title 13, CCR, section 2025) violations in this case is H&SC section 39674 because the Truck & Bus regulation is a Toxic Air Contaminant Control Measure adopted pursuant to authority contained in H&SC section 39002, et seq., 39650-39675 and because J.R.Transportes failed to bring their diesel fleet into compliance by the deadlines set forth in Title 13, CCR, section 2025 (g) (1).

Is the penalty being assessed under a provision of law that prohibits the emission of pollution at a specified level, and, if so a quantification of excess emissions, if it is practicable to do so.

TRU Violations

The provisions cited above do prohibit emissions above a specified level of grams/horse power-hour. However, since the hours of operation of the non-compliant TRU involved and its individual emission rate is not known, it is not practicable to quantify the excess emissions.

PSIP Violations

The provisions cited above do prohibit emissions above a specified opacity level. However, since the hours of operation of the non-compliant trucks involved and their individual emission rates are not known, it is not practicable to quantify the excess emissions.

Truck & Bus Violations

The provisions cited above do prohibit emissions above a specified of g/hp-hr. However, since the hours of operation of the non-compliant trucks involved and its individual emission rate are not known, it is not practicable to quantify the excess emissions.

- (22) JRT acknowledges that ARB has complied with SB 1402 in prosecuting and settling this case. Specifically, ARB has considered all relevant facts, including those listed at HSC section 43024, has explained the manner in which the penalty amount was calculated, has identified the provision of law under which the penalty is being assessed and has considered and determined that this penalty is being assessed under a provision of law that prohibits the emission of pollutants at a specified level.

SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT AND RELEASE

ARB and J R Transportes

Page 10 of 10

- (23) Penalties were determined based on the unique circumstances of this matter, considered together with the need to remove any economic benefit from noncompliance, the goal of deterring future violations and obtaining swift compliance, the consideration of past penalties in similar cases, and the potential costs and risk associated with litigating these particular violations. The penalty was discounted based on the fact that this was a first time violation and the violator made unusually diligent efforts to cooperate with the investigation. Penalties in future cases might be smaller or larger on a per unit/vehicle basis.
- (24) The penalty was based on confidential settlement communications between ARB and JRT that ARB does not retain in the ordinary course of business either. The penalty is the product of an arms length negotiation between ARB and JRT and reflects ARB's assessment of the relative strength of its case against JRT, the desire to avoid the uncertainty, burden and expense of litigation, obtain swift compliance with the law and remove any unfair advantage that JRT may have secured from its actions.
- (25) Now, therefore, in consideration of the payment by JRT, in the amount of fifty-one thousand three hundred seventy five dollars (\$51,375.00), ARB hereby releases JRP and its principals, officers, directors, agents, subsidiaries, predecessors, and successors from any and all claims that ARB may have based on the facts and allegations described in recital paragraphs (1) through (13) above. The undersigned represent that they have the authority to enter into this Agreement.

California Air Resources Board

By: Ellen M. Peter
Name: Ellen M. Peter
Title: Chief Counsel
Date: 9/18/2012

J R Transportes

By: J.R. TRANSPORTES
Name: JAVIER ROBLES ZAVALA
Title: OWNER
Date: 09/11/12

