

# San Francisco Bay Conservation and Development Commission

375 Beale Street, Suite 510, San Francisco, California 94105 tel 415 352 3600 fax 888 348 5190

State of California | Gavin Newsom – Governor | [info@bcdc.ca.gov](mailto:info@bcdc.ca.gov) | [www.bcdc.ca.gov](http://www.bcdc.ca.gov)

TO: Greenhouse Gas Reduction Fund Program

FROM: *Natural Resources Agency*

*San Francisco Bay Conservation & Development Commission*

*Lawrence J. Goldzband, Executive Director, San Francisco Bay Conservation and Development Commission*

DATE: *November 7, 2019*

SUBJECT: GREENHOUSE GAS REDUCTION FUND:  
*San Francisco Bay Conservation & Development Commission*

EXPENDITURE RECORD FOR FISCAL YEAR 2019-20  
Climate Change Adaptation and Coastal Resilience Planning

This Attestation Memorandum documents that the San Francisco Bay Conservation and Development Commission completed the attached Expenditure Record on November 7, 2019, for Climate Change Adaptation and Coastal Resilience Planning. The Expenditure Record is consistent with the statutory requirements of Government Code Section 16428.9 to support expenditures from the Greenhouse Gas Reduction Fund.

This Attestation Memorandum and Expenditure Record will be submitted to CARB for public posting on the CARB website at: [www.arb.ca.gov/caclimateinvestments](http://www.arb.ca.gov/caclimateinvestments). Questions on this Attestation Memorandum or Expenditure Record may be directed to Steve Goldbeck, Chief Deputy Director, [Steve.Goldbeck@bcdc.ca.gov](mailto:Steve.Goldbeck@bcdc.ca.gov) and 415-352-3611.

Attachment

cc: Steve Goldbeck, Chief Deputy Director, BCDC

# San Francisco Bay Conservation and Development Commission

375 Beale Street, Suite 510, San Francisco, California 94105 tel 415 352 3600 fax 888 348 5190

State of California | Gavin Newsom – Governor | [info@bcdc.ca.gov](mailto:info@bcdc.ca.gov) | [www.bcdc.ca.gov](http://www.bcdc.ca.gov)

## **Greenhouse Gas Reduction Fund: Expenditure Record**

San Francisco Bay Conservation and Development Commission  
Climate Change Adaptation and Coastal Resilience Planning

**Authorizing legislation:** Item 3820-001-3228 of the Budget Act of 2019, Assembly Bill (AB) 74 (Chapter 23, Statutes of 2019) appropriates \$1,841,000 to the San Francisco Bay Conservation and Development Commission.

### **Element (1) A description of the proposed use(s)**

<input type="checkbox"/> Agency that will administer funding	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>San Francisco Bay Conservation and Development Commission (BCDC).</li></ul>
<input type="checkbox"/> Amount of proposed expenditure and appropriation reference	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>The total expenditure is \$1,841,000 to the San Francisco Bay Conservation and Development Commission, per Item 3820-001-3228 of the Budget Act of 2019, as amended by AB 74 (Chapter 23, Statutes of 2019)</li></ul>
<input type="checkbox"/> Estimated amount of expenditures for administering agency administrative costs	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>The total expenditure includes \$1.841 million for State Operations costs. BCDC will expend \$1,841,000 for state operations. Administrative costs for BCDC will not exceed 5 percent.</li></ul>
<input type="checkbox"/> If applicable, identify laws or regulations that govern how funds will be used	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>AB 1532 (Perez, Chapter 807, Statutes of 2012), Senate Bill (SB) 535 (de Leon, Chapter 830, Statutes of 2012), SB 1018 (Budget and Fiscal Review Committee, Chapter 39, Statutes of 2012), SB 862 (Budget and Fiscal Review Committee, Chapter 36, Statutes of 2014), and AB 1550 (Gomez, Chapter 369, Statutes of 2016) provide the general framework for how the auction proceeds will be administered to further the purposes of The Global Warming Solutions Act of 2006.</li><li>BCDC works under the mandate of the McAteer-Petris Act to promote responsible planning and regulation of San Francisco Bay shoreline and placement of fill in the Bay.</li><li>AB 398 (E. Garcia, Chapter 135, Statutes of 2017) identifies legislative priorities for allocating auction revenue proceeds to include climate adaptation and resiliency. The Budget Act of 2017, as amended by AB 109, provides direction on the types of projects that should be funded.</li></ul>

San Francisco Bay Conservation and Development Commission  
Expenditure Record Climate Change Adaptation and Coastal Resilience Planning

<input type="checkbox"/> Continuation of existing Expenditure Record	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ This is a new Expenditure Record submitted by BCDC.</li> </ul>
<input type="checkbox"/> Project type(s)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Climate adaptation and resiliency</li> <li>▪ Wetlands and watershed restoration</li> <li>▪ Permitting of projects that involve climate adaptation, non-motorized transportation (Bay Trail), wetland restoration, and beneficial reuse of dredge material.</li> <li>▪ Implementation of the OPC Guidelines on Sea Level Rise in planning and permitting</li> <li>▪ Addressing Environmental Justice and Social Equity for climate adaptation and resilience.</li> </ul>
<input type="checkbox"/> Describe the projects and/or measures that will be eligible for funding	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ BCDC will use the funds to prepare vulnerability assessments and to conduct climate resilience planning, and to increase resilience of projects proposed in BCDC's permit jurisdiction to rising sea levels.</li> </ul>
<input type="checkbox"/> Intended recipients	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ BCDC planning and regulatory operations efforts that facilitate greenhouse gas reductions and support climate adaptation planning</li> </ul>
<input type="checkbox"/> Process for selecting projects for funding	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Direct funding of BCDC operations that are critical to support staff work and efforts on climate adaptation planning, including facilitating greenhouse gas reductions in land use plans and addressing coastal hazards related to rising sea levels.</li> </ul>

**Element (2) A description of how the proposed expenditure(s) will further the regulatory purposes of AB 32 and related statutes**

<input type="checkbox"/> How the expenditure is reflected in the Investment Plan and the Scoping Plan	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ AB 1532 (Chapter 807, Statutes of 2012) requires that monies from the Fund be appropriated in a manner that is consistent with the three-year Investment Plan. The “Cap-and-Trade Auction Proceeds Third Investment Plan: Fiscal Years 2019-20 through 2021-22” supports projects that “advance management practices that make healthier ecosystems that are more resilient to climate change, and implement climate adaptation projects.” The Investment Plan also recognizes that “coastal programs focus climate adaptation projects on planning and preparing for sea level</li> </ul>
---	---

rise due to climate change”; furthermore; “California Climate Investments support measures to build both adaptation and resilience in a variety of ways to advance this priority investment area.” Expenditures in this record support putting coastal policies in place that address wetland adaptation and environmental justice, as well as help coastal communities and the Bay Area region adapt to climate changes threats such as sea level rise, flooding and erosion to improve the resilience of the Bay. As such, this expenditure record is consistent with the Investment Plan.

- California’s 2017 Climate Change Scoping Plan identifies key strategies and recommendations to continue reducing GHG emissions and achieve the goals and purposes of AB 32 and related statutes. The Scoping Plan supports “enacting policies and incentives at multiple jurisdictional levels [to] further ensure the advancement of land use and natural resource management objectives for GHG mitigation, climate adaptation, and other co-benefits.” The plan also states: “Keeping [natural and working lands] and waters intact and at high levels of ecological function is necessary for the well-being and security of Californians...” Through its permitting and planning work as described in this expenditure record, BCDC’s Adapting to Rising Tides program and Bay shoreline development projects consistent with the McAteer Petris Act will advance multi-jurisdictional advancement of land use, community resilience and natural resource management activities that facilitate GHG mitigation, climate adaptation and other co-benefits. Therefore, the expenditures covered by this record are consistent and align with the priorities expressed in the Scoping Plan.
- 

**Element (3) A description of how the proposed expenditure(s) will contribute to achieving and maintaining GHG emission reductions**

- 
- Describe how expenditures will facilitate the achievement of GHG emission reductions in the State
    - Expenditures by BCDC through state operations for regulatory and planning actions, such as through special conditions of permit approval, local and sea level rise regional vulnerability assessments and plans, approval of Bay Plan policies will facilitate GHG emission reductions. Examples include:
      - Permitting projects that enhance GHG sequestration in protecting and/or restoring wetlands, coastal habitats, and agricultural lands.
      - Permitting of transportation-related projects that reduce GHG emissions
-

San Francisco Bay Conservation and Development Commission  
Expenditure Record Climate Change Adaptation and Coastal Resilience Planning

---

- Adoption of Bay Plan policies that: (1) allow for additional fill in the Bay to permit Bay habitats to keep pace with sea level rise; (2) consider environmental justice and social equity in the issuance of BCDC permits and adaptation planning.
- Coordinating across jurisdictions to create adaptation plans that reduce GHG emissions while addressing coastal hazards
- Planning activities to ensure that sea level rise adaptation planning is aligned with the Sustainable Communities Plan (Plan Bay Area)
- Some expenditures by BCDC will facilitate GHG reductions by planning and implementing regulatory actions to reduce vehicle miles travelled, concentrating development, supporting green infrastructure and protecting or restoring wetlands, coastal habitats, and agricultural lands.
- Expenditures by BCDC will facilitate GHG emission reductions by increasing resilience to rising sea level that will reduce future flooding and need for cleanup and rebuilding. GHG emissions are avoided by increasing resilience and thereby reducing flooding and the resultant remediation and rebuilding of flooded areas.

---

Explain when GHG emission reductions and/or co-benefits are expected to occur and how they will be maintained

- Benefits begin once a permitted plan or project is implemented, such as wetland enhancement and non-motorized transportation projects
  - Adapting to Rising Tides plans and a Regional Shoreline Protection Plan are key planning documents that shape development patterns along the Bay and will have long term benefit to facilitate GHG reductions
-

**Element (4) A description of how the administering agency considered the applicability and feasibility of other non-GHG emission reduction objectives; and**

<p><input type="checkbox"/> Expected co-benefits, particularly environmental, economic, public health and safety, and climate resiliency</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Climate adaptation projects will result in a number of co-benefits such as reducing the impacts of climate change on public health, preventing loss of property or disruption of critical infrastructure, helping conserve natural resources, improving water quality, addressing environmental justice concerns and creating jobs.</li> <li>▪ Providing more bike and pedestrian paths will improve public health by creating recreational amenities that encourage physical activity. Some paths will also make it easier for people to bike or walk to work, school, local businesses or transit connections, thereby reducing vehicle miles travelled, as described above.</li> </ul>
<p><input type="checkbox"/> How the project will support other objectives of AB 32 and related amendments</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Maximizes additional environmental and economic co-benefits for the Bay;</li> <li>▪ Complements the State's efforts to improve air quality;</li> <li>▪ Focus planning efforts toward the most disadvantaged communities in the Bay Area.</li> </ul>
<p><input type="checkbox"/> Percentage of total funding that will be expended for projects that benefit disadvantaged or low-income communities and low-income households per CARB's guidance</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Because BCDC is not providing grants, it is not possible to determine a percentage. BCDC's work on climate resilience has a strong focus on social equity and disadvantaged communities. It is infused as a major component of all planning activities.</li> </ul>
<p><input type="checkbox"/> Describe the benefits to disadvantaged or low-income communities and low-income households per CARB's guidance</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ These expenditures will support projects located in and benefiting disadvantaged and low-income communities as identified by CalEPA and BCDC's Vulnerability Community Indicators through other benefits. Outcomes of the planning and permitting activities may include:             <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Improving trails and connectivity that benefits disadvantaged and low-income communities</li> <li>▪ Expanding or improving active transportation routes (e.g., walking or bicycle paths) that are publicly accessible by walking within one or more disadvantaged or low income communities;</li> </ul> </li> </ul>

San Francisco Bay Conservation and Development Commission  
Expenditure Record Climate Change Adaptation and Coastal Resilience Planning

---

- Improving or creating new open spaces, parks, greenbelts, and recreational areas publicly accessible by walking within one or more disadvantaged or low income communities;
    - Reducing vulnerability of disadvantaged and low-income communities to impacts of climate change, including flooding and damage to critical infrastructure;
    - Involving disadvantaged and low-income communities in planning and policy processes
  - Explain strategies the administering agency will use to maximize benefits to disadvantaged communities
    - BCDC's regulatory and planning and grant programs will focus on identifying actions and benefits to disadvantaged communities.
    - Implementation of BCDC's new policies on environmental justice will require meaningful engagement with disadvantaged communities and require the considerations of potential disproportionate burdens by projects on specific populations.
    - Addressing the needs of disadvantaged communities is a main goal of BCDC's Adapting to Rising Tides Program and the Regional Shoreline Adaptation Plan.
- 

**Element (5) A description of how the administering agency will document the result(s) achieved from the expenditure**

---

- How the administering agency will track / report progress to make sure projects are implemented per requirements in statute and CARB guidance
    - BCDC will make sure that expenditures are implemented as required in statute.
  - Describe the approach that will be used to document GHG emission reductions and/or other benefits before and after project completion. Include citations for references that support methodology
    - BCDC will provide narrative summary of staff work and projects, including a qualitative analysis of GHG benefits achieved and documentation of climate change adaptation planning accomplishments.
-

San Francisco Bay Conservation and Development Commission  
Expenditure Record Climate Change Adaptation and Coastal Resilience Planning

---

- ❑ Type of information that will be collected to document results, consistent with CARB guidance
    - BCDC will collect data on investments including information such as: project location, qualitative GHG emission reductions, co-benefits, land use policies that support climate adaptation, and benefits to disadvantaged and low-income communities.

---

  - ❑ How the administering agency will report on program status
    - BCDC will report to CARB consistent with CARB guidance. BCDC will provide regular updates on the program, including expenditure amounts, GHG emission reductions (qualitative, when feasible), and other co-benefits, as applicable (e.g. reduced impacts of climate change, conserved natural resources, improved water quality, hazard avoidance, new recreational opportunities). Reports will also include information on project outcomes for a portion of operational /completed projects over a time period chosen in accordance with CARB guidance.
-