

MEETING

STATE OF CALIFORNIA

AIR RESOURCES BOARD

ZOOM PLATFORM

CALIFORNIA ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY

BYRON SHER AUDITORIUM

1001 I STREET

SACRAMENTO, CALIFORNIA

THURSDAY, JANUARY 25, 2024

9:03 A.M.

JAMES F. PETERS, CSR  
CERTIFIED SHORTHAND REPORTER  
LICENSE NUMBER 10063

APPEARANCES

BOARD MEMBERS:

Liane Randolph, Chair

John Balmes, MD

Hector De La Torre

John Eisenhut

Dean Florez

Eric Guerra

Davina Hurt

Gideon Kracov

Tania Pacheco-Werner, PhD

V. Manuel Perez

Cliff Rechtschaffen

Susan Shaheen, PhD

Senator Henry Stern

Diane Takvorian

Nora Vargas

STAFF:

Steve Cliff, PhD, Executive Officer

Edie Chang, Deputy Executive Officer, Planning, Freight,  
and Toxics

Chanell Fletcher, Deputy Executive Officer, Environmental  
Justice

Annette Hébert, Deputy Executive Officer, Southern  
California Headquarters & Mobile Source Compliance

APPEARANCES CONTINUED

STAFF:

Edna Murphy, Deputy Executive Officer, Internal Operations

Rajinder Sahota, Deputy Executive Officer, Climate Change and Research

Sydney Vergis, PhD, Deputy Executive Officer, Mobile Sources & Incentives

Ellen Peter, Chief Counsel

Analisa Bevan, Assistant Division Chief, Mobile Source Control Division(MSCD)

Banpreet Bhambra, ZEV Infrastructure Section, Sustainable Transportation and Communities Division (STCD)

Joshua Cunningham, Vehicle Program Specialist, STCD

Caitlin Greenway, Staff Air Pollution Specialist, STCD

Jennifer Gress, Division Chief, STCD

Diane Kiyota, Senior Attorney, Legal Office

Andrew Martinez, Manager, ZEV Infrastructure Section, STCD

Lys Mendez, Communications Director, Chair's Office

Andrea Morgan, Staff Air Pollution Specialist, MSCD

Margaret Sanchez, Information Officer II, Chair's Office

Annalisa Schilla, Assistant Division Chief, STCD

ALSO PRESENT:

Ricardo Alvarado

Leslie Austin, Let's Green CA!

Robert Barrosa, Electrify America

Sara Baumann, Port of Long Beach

APPEARANCES CONTINUED

ALSO PRESENT:

Maureen Blanc, Charge Across Town

Mary Matteson Bryan, MMB Engineering

Piet Canin, Ecology Action

Wendy Chou, Acterra: Action for a Health Planet

Carleen Cullen, Cool the Earth

Sarah Deslauriers, California Association Sanitation Agencies

Emily Dilger, Ignited

Sean Edgar, Cleanfleets.net

Elena Engel, 350 Bay Area

William Forsythe

Laura Rosenberger Haider

Stephen Israel, BTC Power

Steve Jepsen, Clean Water SoCal

Tom Knox, Valley Clean Air Now

Munni Krishna, Veloz

Julia Levin, Bioenergy Association of California

Amy Lilly, Mercedes-Benz

Cameron Lind

Jerome Mayfield

Ralph Megna

Frank Meza, BTC Power

APPEARANCES CONTINUED

ALSO PRESENT:

Kevin Morrison, Above the Beehive

Jim O'Leary, NFI

Maria Perez, Regeneración - Pajaro Valley Climate Action

Brenna Rivett, EVHybridNoire

Kaia Robinson, Los Angeles Cleantech Incubator

Michele Robinson

Vanessa Rodriguez

David Rothbart, Clean Water SoCal

Savannah Saunders, Indivisible Ross Valley

David Silberfarb, BTC Power

Susan Smith, SeaHold, LLC

Eric Way, News Coulomb

Kyle Williams, Electrify America

INDEX

	<u>PAGE</u>
Call to Order	1
Roll Call	1
Opening Remarks	2
Item 24-1-1	
Chair Randolph	7
Executive Officer Cliff	7
Motion	9
Vote	9
Item 24-1-2	
Chair Randolph	10
Executive Officer Cliff	12
Staff Presentation	14
Robert Barrosa	30
Board Discussion and Q&A	55
Kyle Williams	111
David Silberfarb	113
Tom Knox	115
Frank Meza	116
Ricardo Alvarado	117
Amy Lilly	118
Carleen Cullen	120
Munni Krishna	122
Sara Baumann	123
Wendy Chou	124
Maureen Blanc	125
Ralph Megna	127
Susannah Saunders	128
Maria Perez	130
Mary Matteson Bryan	131
Brenna Rivett	132
Leslie Austin	134
Jim O'Leary	136
Eric Way	137
Kaia Robinson	139
Jerome Mayfield	140
Kevin Morrison	141
Vanessa Rodriguez	143
Emily Dilger	144
Piet Canin	146
Elena Engel	147
Cameron Lind	148
William Forsythe	150

INDEX CONTINUED

	<u>PAGE</u>
Item 24-1-2 (continued)	
Michele Robinson	151
Stephen Israel	152
Board Discussion and Q&A	153
Motion	170
Vote	170
Closed Session	172
Afternoon Session	173
Item 24-1-3	
Chair Randolph	173
Executive Officer Cliff	175
Julia Levin	187
Sarah Deslauriers	189
David Rothbart	190
Steve Jepsen	192
Susan Smith	193
Board Discussion and Q&A	195
Public Comment	
Sean Edgar	103
Laura Rosenberger Haider	205
Adjournment	206
Reporter's Certificate	207

PROCEEDINGS

1  
2 CHAIR RANDOLPH: Good morning. The January 25th,  
3 2024 public meeting of the California Air Resources Board  
4 will come to order.

5 Board clerk, please call the roll.

6 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Dr. Balmes?

7 BOARD MEMBER BALMES: Here.

8 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Mr. De La Torre?

9 BOARD MEMBER DE LA TORRE: Here.

10 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Mr. Eisenhut?

11 BOARD MEMBER EISENHUT: Here.

12 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Senator Florez?

13 BOARD MEMBER FLOREZ: Here.

14 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Assemblymember Garcia?

15 Ms. Guerra?

16 BOARD MEMBER GUERRA: Here.

17 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Ms. Hurt.

18 BOARD MEMBER HURT: Here.

19 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Mr. Kracov?

20 BOARD MEMBER KRACOV: I'm here. I'm just landing  
21 on the airplane and I'll be in the Board member as soon as  
22 I can, hopefully before 10.

23 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Noted. Thank you.

24 Dr. Pacheco-Werner?

25 Supervisor Perez?



1 BOARD MEMBER PEREZ: Here.

2 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Mr. Rechtschaffen?

3 BOARD MEMBER RECHTSCHAFFEN: Here.

4 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Dr. Shaheen?

5 BOARD MEMBER SHAHEEN: Here.

6 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Senator Stern?

7 Ms. Takvorian?

8 BOARD MEMBER TAKVORIAN: Here.

9 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Supervisor Vargas?

10 BOARD MEMBER VARGAS: Vargas here.

11 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Chair Randolph?

12 CHAIR RANDOLPH: Here.

13 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Madam Chair, we have a  
14 quorum.

15 CHAIR RANDOLPH: Thank you. Okay.

16 So we are going to start with our housekeeping  
17 items. We are conducting today's meeting in person as  
18 well as offering remote options for public participation  
19 both by phone and in Zoom.

20 Anyone who wishes to testify in person should  
21 fill out a request-to-speak card available in the foyer  
22 outside the Board room. Please turn it into a Board  
23 assistant prior to the commencement of the item. If you  
24 are participating remotely, you will raise your hand in  
25 Zoom or dial star nine, if calling in by phone. The Clerk

1 will provide further details regarding how public  
2 participation will work in just a moment.

3           For safety reasons, please note the emergency  
4 exit to the rear of the room through the foyer. In the  
5 event of a fire alarm, we are required to evacuate this  
6 room immediately and go down the stairs to the lobby and  
7 out of the building. When the all-clear signal is given,  
8 we will return to the auditorium and resume the hearing.

9           A closed captioning feature is available for  
10 those of you joining us in the Zoom environment. In order  
11 to turn on the subtitles, please look for a button labeled  
12 "CC" at the bottom of the Zoom window as shown in the  
13 example on the screen now. I would like to take this  
14 opportunity to remind everyone to speak clearly and from a  
15 quiet location, whether you are joining us in Zoom or  
16 calling in by phone.

17           Interpretation services will be provided today in  
18 Spanish for both in-person and Zoom attendees. If you are  
19 joining us using Zoom, there is a button labeled  
20 "Interpretation" on the Zoom screen. Click on that  
21 interpretation button and select Spanish to hear the  
22 meeting in Spanish. If you are joining us here in person  
23 and would like to listen to the meeting in Spanish, please  
24 speak to a Board assistant and they will provide you with  
25 further instructions. I want to remind all of our

1 commenters to speak slowly and pause intermittently to  
2 allow the interpreters the opportunity to accurately  
3 interpret your comments.

4 THE INTERPRETER: Thank you, Madam Chair. I'll  
5 now -- I will now repeat the same instructions for your  
6 Spanish speaking audience.

7 (Interpreter translated in Spanish).

8 THE INTERPRETER: Thank you, Chair Randolph.  
9 Back to you.

10 CHAIR RANDOLPH: Thank you, Chair Randolph.

11 I will now ask the Board Clerk to provide more  
12 details regarding public participation.

13 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Thank you, Chair Randolph.  
14 Good morning, everyone. I will be providing additional  
15 information on how public participation will be organized  
16 for today's meeting.

17 We will first be calling on any in-person  
18 commenters who have turned in a request-to-speak card and  
19 then we will be calling on commenters who are joining us  
20 remotely. If you are joining us remotely and wish to make  
21 a verbal comment on one of today's Board items or during  
22 the open comment period at the end of today's meeting, you  
23 must be using Zoom webinar or calling in by telephone. If  
24 you are currently watching the webcast on CAL-SPAN, but  
25 you wish to comment remotely, please register for the Zoom

1 webinar or call in. Information for both can be found on  
2 the public agenda for today's meeting.

3           To make a verbal comment, we will be using the  
4 raise-hand feature in Zoom. And if you wish to speak on a  
5 Board item, please virtually raise your hand as soon as  
6 the item has begun to let us know you wish to speak. To  
7 do this, if you are using a computer or tablet, there is a  
8 raise-hand button. And if you are calling in on the  
9 telephone, dial star nine to raise your hands. Even if  
10 you previously indicated which item you wish to speak on  
11 when you registered, you must raise your hand at the  
12 beginning of the item, so that you can be added to the  
13 queue.

14           And for anyone giving your verbal comments today  
15 in Spanish and requiring an interpreter's assistance,  
16 please indicate so at the beginning of your testimony and  
17 our translator will assist you. During your comment,  
18 please pause after each sentence to allow for the  
19 interpreter to translate your comment into English.

20           When the comment period starts, the order of  
21 commenters will be determined by who raises their hand  
22 first. We will call each commenter by name and will  
23 activate each commenter's audio when it is their turn to  
24 speak. For those calling in, we will identify you by the  
25 last three digits of your phone number. We will not show

1 a list of remote commenters, however, we will be  
2 announcing the next three or so commenters in the queue,  
3 so you are ready to testify and know who is coming up  
4 next. Please note, you will not appear by video during  
5 your testimony. I would also like to remind everyone to  
6 please state your name for the record before you speak.  
7 This is especially important for those calling in by phone  
8 to testify.

9 We will have a time limit for each commenter and  
10 we'll begin the comment period with a two-minute time  
11 limit, although this could change at the Chair's  
12 discretion. During public testimony, you will see a timer  
13 on the screen. For those calling in by phone, we will run  
14 the timer and let you know when you have 30 seconds left  
15 and when your time is up. If you require Spanish  
16 interpretation for your comment, your time will be  
17 doubled.

18 And if you wish to submit written comments today,  
19 please visit CARB's send-us-your-comments page or look at  
20 the public agenda on our webpage for links to send these  
21 documents electronically. Written comments will be  
22 accepted on each item until the Chair closes the record  
23 for that item.

24 And if you experience any technical difficulties,  
25 please call (805)772-2715 so that an IT person can assist.

1           Thank you. I'll turn it back to Chair Randolph  
2 now.

3           CHAIR RANDOLPH: All right. Thank you. The  
4 first item on the agenda is item number 24-1-1, proposed  
5 2023 amendments to area designations for State ambient air  
6 quality standards. If you are here with us in the room  
7 and wish to comment on this item, please fill out a  
8 request-to-speak card as soon as possible and submit it to  
9 a Board assistant. If you are joining us remotely and  
10 wish to comment on this item, please click the raise hand  
11 button or dial star nine now. We will first call on  
12 in-person commenters followed by any remote commenters  
13 when we get to the public comment portion of this item.

14           Dr. Cliff, will you please summarize this item.

15           EXECUTIVE OFFICER CLIFF: Thank you, Chair  
16 Randolph.

17           State law requires CARB to annually review and  
18 update the area designations for the State ambient air  
19 quality standards as appropriate. Therefore, based on a  
20 review of 2020 through 2022 air quality data, staff is  
21 proposing amendments to existing area designations for  
22 ozone, hydrogen sulfide, and fine particulate matter or  
23 PM2.5.

24           For ozone, staff recommends the Board redesignate  
25 Lake Tahoe air basin, Amador, Calaveras, and Placer

1 counties in the Mountain Counties Air Basin; Butte,  
2 Sutter, and Yuba counties in the Sacramento Valley Air  
3 Basin; and San Francisco Bay Area Air Basin from  
4 nonattainment to nonattainment transitional.

5           Additionally, for hydrogen sulfide, staff  
6 recommends the Board redesignate Riverside County in the  
7 Salton Sea Air Basin from unclassified to nonattainment.

8           Finally, for PM2.5, staff recommends the Board  
9 redesignate Butte County in the Sacramento Valley Air  
10 Basin from nonattainment to attainment.

11           In summary, these changes reflect the current air  
12 quality in these areas and staff recommends approval of  
13 the proposed changes to the state area designations. This  
14 concludes my summary of the item.

15           Thank you.

16           CHAIR RANDOLPH: Thank you.

17           We will now hear from the public who signed up to  
18 speak on this item, either by submitting a  
19 request-to-speak card or by a raised hand in Zoom.

20           Board Clerk, do we have public comment on this  
21 item?

22           BOARD CLERK GARCIA: We have no commenters for  
23 this item.

24           CHAIR RANDOLPH: Okay. I will now close the  
25 record on this agenda item.

1           The Board has before them resolution number 24-1.  
2 Do I have a motion and a second for this resolution?

3           BOARD MEMBER HURT: Move approval.

4           BOARD MEMBER BALMES: Second.

5           CHAIR RANDOLPH: All right. Clerk, would you  
6 please call the roll.

7           BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Dr. Balmes?

8           BOARD MEMBER BALMES: Yes.

9           BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Mr. De La Torre?

10          BOARD MEMBER DE LA TORRE: Yes.

11          BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Mr. Eisenhut?

12          BOARD MEMBER EISENHUT: Yes.

13          BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Senator Florez?

14          BOARD MEMBER FLOREZ: Aye.

15          BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Mr. Guerra?

16          BOARD MEMBER GUERRA: Aye.

17          BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Ms. Hurt?

18          BOARD MEMBER HURT: Aye.

19          BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Mr. Kracov?

20          BOARD MEMBER KRACOV: Yes.

21          BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Dr. Pacheco-Werner.

22          BOARD MEMBER KRACOV: Yes. Yes.

23          BOARD MEMBER PACHECO-WERNER: Yes.

24          BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Noted. Thank you.

25          Supervisor Perez?



1 BOARD MEMBER PEREZ: Yes.

2 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Mr. Rechtschaffen?

3 BOARD MEMBER RECHTSCHAFFEN: Yes.

4 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Dr. Shaheen?

5 BOARD MEMBER SHAHEEN: Aye.

6 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Ms. Takvorian?

7 BOARD MEMBER TAKVORIAN: Yes.

8 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Supervisor Vargas?

9 BOARD MEMBER VARGAS: Vargas yes.

10 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Chair Randolph?

11 CHAIR RANDOLPH: Yes.

12 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Madam Chair, the motion  
13 passes.

14 CHAIR RANDOLPH: All right. Thank you.

15 The next item on the agenda is Item number 24-1-2  
16 to consider approval of Electrify America's proposed cycle  
17 4 zero-emission vehicle, or ZEV, investment plan.

18 If you are here with us in the room and wish to  
19 comment on this item, please fill out a request-to-speak  
20 card as soon as possible and submit it to a Board  
21 assistant. And if you are joining us remotely and wish to  
22 comment, please click the raise hand button or dial star  
23 nine now. We will first call on in-person commenters  
24 followed by any remote commenters when we get to the  
25 public comment portion of this item.

1           For this item, we will be hearing about Electrify  
2 America's draft cycle 4 ZEV investment plan and staff's  
3 assessment of how well it aligns with the requirements set  
4 forth in appendix C of the Volkswagen 2.0 liter partial  
5 consent decree, to goals of Senate Bill 92, and Board  
6 resolutions 17-23, 18-54, and 21-14.

7           A growing ZEV market is essential for California  
8 to achieve our climate and public health goals. Electrify  
9 America's investments represent an important opportunity  
10 to enable widespread ZEV adoption in use.

11           The need to expand the fueling and charging  
12 network for ZEVs with reliable and accessible stations as  
13 well as to ensure consumer awareness about the benefits of  
14 ZEVs is significant. Executive Order B-48-18 sets a goal  
15 of 250,000 chargers including 10,000 fast chargers in  
16 California by 2025. With almost 94,000 EV chargers in  
17 California today, the State is still far from that goal.  
18 Additionally, with the Advanced Clean Cars II regulation  
19 setting the course to 100 percent ZEV sales by 2035, it's  
20 critical that we accelerate the deployment and maintenance  
21 of reliable ZEV fueling infrastructure well beyond the  
22 2025 Executive Order goal for chargers.

23           Electrify America's investment in the cycle 4  
24 plan intends to expand California's ZEV fueling  
25 infrastructure and importantly increase the overall

1 performance of the network helping to fill a critical gap  
2 in California's infrastructure needs and support our fast  
3 growing ZEV market.

4           In addition to having adequately and reliable  
5 infrastructure, equitable access to ZEVs will be necessary  
6 for a successful transition to zero-emission  
7 transportation. And to that end, the proposed plan  
8 continues its commitments to ensure that at least 35  
9 percent of its investments benefit low-income or  
10 disadvantaged communities. And Electrify America proposes  
11 to work closely with equity stakeholders and others to  
12 expand outreach and education.

13           I look forward to hearing much more about  
14 Electrify America's proposals to support an equitable  
15 transition and to ensure that its network remains  
16 accessible and reliable.

17           After the staff presentation, we have the  
18 opportunity to hear from Electrify America's President and  
19 CEO Rob Barrosa. And following public comment, we will  
20 consider a resolution to approve or disapprove in whole or  
21 in part the cycle 4 plan.

22           Dr. Cliff, would you please introduce the item.

23           EXECUTIVE OFFICER CLIFF: Thank you. Chair  
24 Randolph.

25           I'm pleased to introduce Electrify America's

1 cycle 4 zero-emission vehicle investment plan, which  
2 describes how Electrify America will invest its fourth and  
3 final \$200 million installment to fulfill the requirements  
4 of appendix C of the two liter partial consent decree.

5 Appendix C of the two liter partial consent  
6 decree, also referred to as the ZEV investment commitment,  
7 is one component of Volkswagen's settlement with CARB  
8 resulting from the use of illegal defeat devices in VWs  
9 two and three liter diesel engines. The ZEV investment  
10 commitment requires VW to invest \$800 million in  
11 California over four consecutive 30-month periods to  
12 increase the availability and use of ZEVs. These  
13 investments will support ZEV adoption and raise ZEV  
14 awareness in California.

15 Eligible projects include ZEV charging and  
16 fueling infrastructure, brand neutral consumer awareness  
17 campaigns to increase ZEV awareness and grow the ZEV  
18 market and projects that will increase access to ZEVs for  
19 all Californians, including those in low-income and  
20 disadvantaged communities.

21 Today' presentation to the Board summarizes key  
22 provisions of the cycle 4 plan and provides an assessment  
23 of how well the plan aligns with the requirements set  
24 forth in appendix C of the partial consent decree, and the  
25 goals of Senate Bill 92 and Board resolutions 17-23,

1 18-54, and 21-14. It also highlights comments received  
2 during the public comment period established for this  
3 item.

4 I will note for the Board that the approval or  
5 disapproval can be in whole or in part and is limited to  
6 whether or not it meets the requirements of the consent  
7 decree SB 92 and past Board resolutions that provide  
8 guidance for Electrify America to consider in developing  
9 their plan, but do not serve as the basis for approval or  
10 rejection. Nevertheless, staff analyzed the extent to  
11 which the proposed cycle 4 plan is consistent with this  
12 guidance.

13 I will now ask Banpreet Bhambra of the  
14 Sustainable Transportation and Communities Division to  
15 begin the staff presentation.

16 Banpreet.

17 (Thereupon a slide presentation).

18 STCD AIR RESOURCES ENGINEER BHAMBRA: Thank you,  
19 Dr. Cliff.

20 Good morning, Chair Randolph and members of the  
21 Board. Today, I will summarize Electrify America's  
22 proposed cycle 4 zero -- today, I will summarize Electrify  
23 America's proposed cycle 4 zero-emission vehicle  
24 investment plan as well as staff's assessment of the plan.

25 Next slide, please.



1 plan before you today?

2 In 2015, CARB discovered that Volkswagen had  
3 installed emission defeat devices on nearly 600,000  
4 Volkswagen, Audi, and Porsche diesel vehicles sold in the  
5 United States. Approximately 85,000 of these vehicles  
6 were sold in California. The resulting settlement is  
7 comprise of the two liter engine, the three liter engine,  
8 and the California-only three liter partial consent  
9 decrees, as well as a California-only civil penalty  
10 agreement of approximately \$154 million.

11 The two liter partial consent decree is comprised  
12 of appendices A, B, C and D. Appendix A prescribes the  
13 requirements for buybacks of Volkswagen vehicles, while  
14 appendix B prescribes requirements for recall and repair  
15 of Volkswagen vehicles for consumers who did not wish to  
16 sell their vehicle back to Volkswagen. Appendix C is the  
17 Volkswagen ZEV investment commitment, which requires  
18 Volkswagen to invest \$800 million over ten years in  
19 California. And finally, appendix D provides CARB \$423  
20 million to mitigate the past excess nitrogen oxide  
21 emissions from the sale of Volkswagen diesel vehicles  
22 equipped with emission defeat devices to California  
23 consumers.

24 The total settlement funding for California  
25 amounts to approximately \$1.4 billion. This presentation

1 focuses on Appendix C, the ZEV investment commitment.

2 Next slide, please.

3 --o0o--

4 STCD AIR RESOURCES ENGINEER BHAMBRA: This slide  
5 illustrates the overall framework for investments under  
6 Appendix C, the ZEV investment commitment. Volkswagen  
7 must invest \$800 million in California over 10 years. The  
8 goal of the ZEV investment commitment is to increase the  
9 availability and the use of ZEVs in the State. Allowable  
10 investments -- investment categories include: ZEV  
11 infrastructure; public education and outreach that builds  
12 and increases awareness of ZEVs; ZEV access projects that  
13 increase exposure to ZEVs without making consumers  
14 purchase or lease a ZEV such as car sharing; and lastly,  
15 green city investments in two cities. Volkswagen created  
16 a subsidiary, Electrify America to implement these  
17 investments.

18 Next slide, please.

19 --o0o--

20 STCD AIR RESOURCES ENGINEER BHAMBRA: The consent  
21 decree requires that the 10-year ZEV investment commitment  
22 be implemented in four 30-month cycles. For each cycle,  
23 Electrify America submits to CARB and investment plan that  
24 identifies what they intend to invest in, a projection of  
25 creditable costs, and how investments meet the goals of





1 staff also convened a virtual stakeholder public meeting  
2 on August 16th, 2023 to receive public comments on  
3 progress implementing the plans.

4 Next slide, please.

5 --o0o--

6 STCD AIR RESOURCES ENGINEER BHAMBRA: This  
7 graphic displays the status of Electrify America's  
8 ultra-fast chargers in California. As you can see, 1,093  
9 chargers are operational, another 52 chargers have  
10 construction complete, 62 chargers have permits complete  
11 or are in construction, and 48 chargers have permits  
12 submitted. Electrify America has stated that more than 50  
13 percent of the total chargers in each stage of the  
14 development process are in low-income and disadvantaged  
15 communities. This exceeds the commitment Electrify  
16 America made in previous Board resolutions to strive to  
17 ensure that at least 35 percent of its investments benefit  
18 low-income or disadvantaged communities.

19 Next slide, please.

20 --o0o--

21 STCD AIR RESOURCES ENGINEER BHAMBRA: Moving to  
22 the green city investments. As part of cycle 1, Electrify  
23 America invested in the first green city in Sacramento,  
24 which brought charging stations, car share programs, and  
25 electric transit services to the city. The GIG free-float

1 or point-to-point car share fleet in Sacramento and the  
2 Envoy Multi-Unit Dwelling car share program operated in  
3 the Sacramento area from Q1 2019 until Q2 2023.

4           Electrify America continues to work with the  
5 Sacramento Regional Transit and Yolo County Transportation  
6 District on the Causeway Connection, which is an electric  
7 bus service linking the University of California, Davis to  
8 downtown Sacramento, and the UC Davis Medical Center.  
9 Through this effort, Electrify America provided 12  
10 Proterra E2 Catalyst electric transit buses and charging  
11 infrastructure.

12           Electrify America also continues to work with Sac  
13 RT and the Franklin Neighborhood Development Corporation  
14 to develop on-demand micro-transit shuttle bus service  
15 along Franklin Boulevard using two GreenPower EV Star  
16 shuttles -- two GreenPower EV Star shuttles.

17           As part of cycle 3, Electrify America invested in  
18 the second green city, which is in the Long Beach and  
19 Wilmington area, and primarily focused on zero-emission  
20 freight. Electrify America announced dedicated chargers  
21 at the Port of Long Beach with additional chargers to be  
22 installed at a nearby facility to support electric trucks.  
23 In June 2023, Electrify America broke ground on  
24 construction of 38 balanced fleet chargers and 4 megawatt  
25 battery energy storage systems to support 70 plus electric

1 trucks in drayage operations within the City of Ontario,  
2 which support operations at the Port of Long Beach. In  
3 May 2023, construction began on the 14 power balanced  
4 fleet chargers to support 60 electric trucks and drayage  
5 operations within the City of Rialto.

6 Next slide, please.

7 --o0o--

8 STCD AIR RESOURCES ENGINEER BHAMBRA: With that  
9 background, let's move to Electrify America's proposed  
10 cycle 4 plan. The cycle 4 process began with Electrify  
11 America presenting CARB a straw man proposal of investment  
12 ideas for the plan. CARB staff provided feedback on ideas  
13 and budget allocations. Electrify America then submitted  
14 to CARB a confidential draft version of the cycle 4 plan.  
15 This provided CARB an additional opportunity to provide  
16 comments on the draft cycle 4 plan.

17 CARB also held a public meeting on August 16th,  
18 2023, as noted in the prior slide, which also helped  
19 inform the plan. Following this input from the CARB and  
20 the public, Electrify America submitted to CARB and  
21 publicly posted the proposed cycle 4 plan on October 20th,  
22 2023. With the posting of the cycle 4 plan, CARB opened a  
23 public comment docket on October 24th through November 7th  
24 to solicit comments on the cycle 4 plan.

25 CARB staff reviewed and evaluated the cycle 4

1 plan for compliance with the consent decree and  
2 consistency with SB 92 and Board resolutions. This  
3 analysis was summarized in the staff plan analysis, which  
4 was publicly released on January 11th. Today, staff is  
5 now presenting the cycle 4 plan for Board approval at the  
6 this meeting.

7 Next slide, please.

8 --o0o--

9 STCD AIR RESOURCES ENGINEER BHAMBRA: Now, I will  
10 turn to summarizing Electrified America's proposed cycle 4  
11 investment plan. The proposed cycle 4 plan would fund the  
12 following project categories in approximately the  
13 following amounts: \$172 million for fueling infrastructure  
14 - this includes \$91 million for new stations including  
15 operations and maintenance for those stations and \$81  
16 million to upgrade existing stations, including operation,  
17 maintenance, and demand charges for those stations; \$5  
18 million for ZEV awareness and education; \$3 million under  
19 the category of ZEV access for branded marketing that  
20 drives station utilization; and \$20 million for allowable  
21 operational expenses.

22 Let's take a closer look at these proposed  
23 investments.

24 Next slide, please.

25 --o0o--

1           STCD AIR RESOURCES ENGINEER BHAMBRA: The largest  
2 piece of infrastructure spending \$91 million is to expand  
3 the charging network by increasing the number of charging  
4 stations and the geographic coverage of the fast-charging  
5 network in California. The \$91 million includes funding  
6 for operation and maintenance for the new stations  
7 installed during cycle 4. Expanding the network will be  
8 critical to supporting the growth of ZEVs we expect to see  
9 in the coming years due to the Advanced Clean Cars II  
10 regulations.

11           Electrify America will continue to invest in nine  
12 previously approved metropolitan areas from cycles 1, 2,  
13 and 3, and will expand to six additional metropolitan  
14 areas, El Centro, Merced, Modesto, Redding,  
15 Vallejo-Fairfield, and Yuba City. On the right side of  
16 the slide are maps pulled from Electrify America's cycle 4  
17 plan, which visually describe the minimum and maximum  
18 number of chargers that will go into each metropolitan  
19 area. The highest charger installation is in Los Angeles  
20 with up to 140 chargers estimated, while San Francisco Bay  
21 Area, San Diego, and Riverside counties could get up to  
22 100. The rest of the metropolitan areas could receive  
23 between 10 and 60 chargers.

24           The key takeaway here is that this investment  
25 built on its previous investments in key markets while

1 also expanding to new areas. Furthermore, based on  
2 Electrify America's investments to date, we expect that a  
3 significant percentage of these stations will be in  
4 low-income and disadvantaged communities.

5 Next slide, please.

6 --o0o--

7 STCD AIR RESOURCES ENGINEER BHAMBRA: The second  
8 largest piece of the infrastructure investment, \$81  
9 million, is to upgrade existing sites. This investment  
10 amount is a combination of capital expense for charger  
11 replacement and operational and maintenance expenses  
12 related to increasing reliability. Electrify America has  
13 acknowledged the need to improve reliability of stations  
14 and the overall customer experience.

15 Accordingly, they are investing significantly  
16 more of their infrastructure investment to upgrade old  
17 stations relative to past cycles. Electrify America has  
18 established metrics to determine which sites will be  
19 eligible for upgrades, including the age of the charger,  
20 utilization, uptime performance, number and type of work  
21 orders for the station, customer feedback of the station,  
22 location on key travel routes, parts availability for the  
23 station, and service ability.

24 The chargers at these sites will be -- will be  
25 replaced with Electrify America's current gen 4 ultra-fast

1 chargers that are capable of delivering 350 kilowatts.  
2 According to Electrify America, the gen 4 technology has  
3 improved reliability and allows for remote monitoring and  
4 repairs of some issues.

5           Within the station upgrades, Electrify America  
6 also proposes to remove the CHAdeMO charger, which can  
7 only deliver up to 50 kilowatts and replace it with a CCS  
8 charger, if there is another CHAdeMO charger within five  
9 miles of the Electrify America site.

10           Next slide, please.

11                           --o0o--

12           STCD AIR RESOURCES ENGINEER BHAMBRA: In  
13 recognition of the reliability challenges, Electrify  
14 America has significantly expanded its maintenance plan  
15 relative to past investment plans. This slide highlights  
16 the key elements of its maintenance plan. These actions  
17 would apply to all stations including those built in  
18 previous cycles and those upgraded or installed with cycle  
19 4 funds.

20           I will highlight a few items that could be  
21 particularly useful to ensure chargers are well maintained  
22 and operational: recurring preventative maintenance checks  
23 by conducting on-site visits periodically and continued  
24 quality assurance maintenance is conducted to identify any  
25 unreported issues.



1 Next slide, please.

2 --o0o--

3 STCD AIR RESOURCES ENGINEER BHAMBRA: I'll turn  
4 now to Electrify America's proposed spending for ZEV  
5 education and outreach as well as for ZEV access.

6 Electrify America proposed to invest \$5 million  
7 in a number of programs to ensure that the benefits of  
8 zero-emission transportation and charging are socially  
9 responsible and accessible to all. As part of the fourth  
10 cycle, Electrify America has committed to support the  
11 California Workforce Development Science, Technology,  
12 Engineering and Mathematics Program, a Veloz "Electric For  
13 All" sponsorship, the California ZEV Equitable Access  
14 Program, and the California Membership and Sponsorship  
15 Program.

16 The ZEV Equitable Access Program will provide  
17 community-based organizations with funds to further  
18 education and awareness within California's low-income or  
19 disadvantaged communities. Electrify America proposes to  
20 engage with the CARB ZEV Equity Task Force to develop  
21 program requirements, which would be included in a Request  
22 for Proposal to select partners to implement the program.

23 The ZEV Equity Task Force is a task force  
24 established by CARB to help implement Board's direction  
25 when adopting Advanced Clean Cars II to bring stakeholders



1 the Legislature passed SB 92, which set out a number of  
2 procedural requirements that CARB must follow and  
3 substantive direction to Electrify America.

4 In general, SB 92 focused on increasing  
5 transparency regarding the approval and implementation of  
6 the plans and it directed Electrify America to strive to  
7 ensure that at least 35 percent of its investments benefit  
8 low-income and disadvantaged communities. Electrify  
9 America's plan is consistent with the requirements of SB  
10 92.

11 Next slide, please.

12 --o0o--

13 STCD AIR RESOURCES ENGINEER BHAMBRA: Staff's  
14 assessment of the proposed cycle 4 plan also included  
15 consistency with guidance provided in previous Board  
16 resolutions 17-23, 18-54, and 21-14. The Board adopted  
17 these resolutions when approving Electrify America's  
18 cycles 1, 2, and 3 plans respectively. The plan is  
19 consistent with the resolutions.

20 Of note, the plan strives to ensure that at least  
21 35 percent of investments benefit low-income and  
22 disadvantaged communities. It includes job creation and  
23 training estimates, especially minority, women, and  
24 veteran-owned businesses, and it provides hiring  
25 opportunities for qualified residents of disadvantaged

1 communities. And Electrify America has provided evidence  
2 that projects -- that projects will be executed in manners  
3 that ensure investments are self-sustaining and continue  
4 to exist after the 10-year period of the ZEV investment  
5 commitment.

6 Next slide, please.

7 --o0o--

8 STCD AIR RESOURCES ENGINEER BHAMBRA: CARB will  
9 continue to monitor implementation by ensuring receipt of  
10 quarterly and annual reports from Electrify America and  
11 ensuring that the public reports continue to be publicly  
12 posted. CARB will report annually to the Legislature and  
13 the Board.

14 Finally, as required by the consent decree, an  
15 independent third-party auditor will continue to provide  
16 annual reports to CARB and will: review Electrify  
17 America's implementation and accounting records; conduct  
18 select on-site audits; and review all expenses and  
19 recommend approval of only those that are found to be  
20 creditable.

21 Next slide, please.

22 --o0o--

23 STCD AIR RESOURCES ENGINEER BHAMBRA: In  
24 conclusion, CARB staff recommends that the Board adopt  
25 Resolution 24-2 approving Electrify America's proposed

1 cycle 4 ZEV investment plan. Approval of the plan will  
2 allow Electrify America to commence the investments its  
3 plans, providing benefits to California's air quality,  
4 climate, and current and future ZEV drivers. The Board  
5 resolution always directs Electrify America to strive to  
6 ensure that at least 35 percent of its investments are in  
7 low-income or disadvantaged communities, and to achieve  
8 uptime reliability that has consistency with industry  
9 standards, such as those required by the National Electric  
10 Vehicle Infrastructure Program, or NEVI.

11 This concludes my presentation.

12 Thank you.

13 EXECUTIVE OFFICER CLIFF: Thank you, Banpreet.

14 I would now like to introduce Mr. Robert Barrosa,  
15 President and CEO of Electrify America, to address the  
16 Board. It's helpful to have the leadership from Electrify  
17 America here in person to provide their perspective and be  
18 on hand to answer your questions.

19 (Thereupon a slide presentation).

20 ROBERT BARROSA: Okay. Perfect. So first off,  
21 thank you very much for giving me the opportunity to speak  
22 on behalf of Electrify America. I've been with the  
23 company since about 2018 -- early 2018 and held various  
24 positions. In June of last year, I was asked to take the  
25 leadership role as CEO and President of the company. I'm

1 a native Californian, born and raised in Southern  
2 California in Los Angeles County. I grew up in South Gate  
3 California right off the 710 freeway. I still live in the  
4 San Gabriel Valley. And I know how important, living in  
5 these communities, air quality is, so I want to thank the  
6 Board and CARB for everything they have done throughout  
7 the years to improve the life for millions of Angelenos  
8 across the region there.

9           And one of the reasons why I've committed my  
10 career to transportation electrification to do my part to  
11 help the state and clean the air.

12           So next slide, please.

13                           --o0o--

14           ROBERT BARROSA: So I want to talk a little bit  
15 about what we've done today, highlight a few things. I  
16 want to tackle the network reliability. That is a big  
17 topic and something assuredly we're taking on head on and  
18 not shying away from. So I want to have a good discussion  
19 around that and then highlight some of the key points  
20 around our cycle 4 plan and how that incorporates a lot of  
21 the things that the public has concerns about and make  
22 sure we address those in that cycle 4 plan.

23           Next slide, please.

24                           --o0o--

25           ROBERT BARROSA: You can probably skip over a



1 charging to places where maybe power can't get to. So  
2 we've put in over 60 grid independent level 2 chargers in  
3 a lot of community centers, hospitals, clinics and things  
4 like that where people go to support those communities.

5 We've also made a lot of investments outside of  
6 the consent decree. We are in this for the long term,  
7 right? We want to see this business be successful past  
8 2026 and continue to thrive and support the market here in  
9 California. And so some of our investments outside of the  
10 consent decree is going to new stations, so we're building  
11 above and beyond what we've committed to in the consent  
12 decree. And we're also making long-term investments in  
13 terms of where our energy is coming from.

14 So we entered into a 15-year PPA deal with a  
15 developer to develop a solar plant that went live in July  
16 in the Mojave Desert to offset the power that we're  
17 dispensing through our network. So very important, but  
18 again to show the commitment we have to the state to  
19 continue forward well beyond 2026.

20 Next slide, please.

21 --o0o--

22 ROBERT BARROSA: Again, you know, working with  
23 CARB in the early days, we established some  
24 strive-to-achieve metrics of 35 percent to make  
25 investments in our low-income and disadvantaged



1 communities. And we have taken that to heart and  
2 instituted that in how we think about our investments.  
3 And we've been able to far achieve a well beyond the 35  
4 percent target and hit over 50 percent.

5 This is critical. These kind of metrics go into  
6 our logic as we think through our investments. And that's  
7 why we've been able to achieve the 50 percent. So it's  
8 been institutionalized and we take this very seriously as  
9 we look at our further investments.

10 Next slide, please.

11 --o0o--

12 ROBERT BARROSA: In terms of the usage of the  
13 network and the growth in the network. It's been  
14 astonishing to see how fast it's grown, right? And I  
15 think part of that is as we deployed -- you know, when we  
16 started deploying equipment back in 2019, 2020, it was  
17 like our -- for those who drove CCS vehicles, there  
18 weren't very many out there, it was almost our personal  
19 stations that we had that we could use. But quickly, as  
20 the market share developed in California, capacity becomes  
21 a problem. And so you could see today, and we measure --  
22 I want to talk about utilization. We measure utilization  
23 basically on a 24-hour period, a time basis how often are  
24 these stations basically used?

25 And so you can see in December of '22 about 41

1 percent of the stations were at 20 percent utilization.  
2 At that same time period, about only three percent of the  
3 stations were at 40 percent utilization. Fast forward  
4 just 12 months, over 20 percent of our stations are  
5 used -- or 80 percent of our stations are used 20 percent  
6 more of the time, 43 percent. So we moved 3 percent to 43  
7 percent of our stations now are at over 40 percent  
8 utilization. That is astonishing. It's great to see that  
9 this -- the stations are being used.

10 But it poses a couple problems. Obviously,  
11 uptime on the stations. And remember, when we built our  
12 stations, we had to balance density versus geography,  
13 right? We wanted to build the network to build that  
14 confidence to drive anywhere. But that meant with the  
15 amount of dollars we had, we could only build stations  
16 that were four stalls, four chargers big, right? So  
17 there's not a lot of capacity. In some metro markets,  
18 there's only three chargers at a station.

19 So when you start reaching 40 percent utilization  
20 on a four-charger site, it means there's probably three or  
21 four cars lined up waiting to charge. So we have people  
22 that are waiting an hour or two hours to charge. So  
23 already from a capacity standpoint, if everything works  
24 perfect, you still have a customer confidence problem,  
25 right? Because it doesn't drive a lot of motivation if I



1 zero-emission vehicle adoption.

2 Next slide.

3 --o0o--

4 ROBERT BARROSA: We've done a lot of work on our  
5 outreach, access, education. And we found a lot of  
6 success working with our community-based organizations  
7 throughout the state. They've been vital members in  
8 helping us get to -- get to different parts of the  
9 communities where we are not as effective getting there.

10 And so we've helped fund various different  
11 community-based organizations to help us do that. They're  
12 trusted members of the community and they know how to  
13 reach this audience. And so we've funded different --  
14 several different organizations throughout the cycles and  
15 have just had tremendous success overall helping teach  
16 people about zero-emission vehicles, helping get these  
17 communities into electric vehicles, as well as focusing on  
18 STEM, right, developing the next level of workforce that  
19 we need in the state to help install, maintain, and  
20 operate charging stations.

21 Next slide.

22 --o0o--

23 ROBERT BARROSA: So next, I'll touch on network  
24 reliability and talk about kind of what we're seeing, what  
25 we're doing about it, and how we're moving forward.

1 Next slide.

2 --o0o--

3 ROBERT BARROSA: So first off, I want to say is  
4 our head is not in the sand, right? We are listening to  
5 customers. We are looking at our data, and we're making  
6 substantial improvements to the system overall to better  
7 handle what we're seeing in the field. When we started  
8 this adventure seven years ago, there was not a vibrant  
9 high-powered DC fast charging market out there in terms of  
10 supply, right? There was a few suppliers out there. A  
11 lot of startups. And so we went -- there was probably  
12 five reputable companies that we could choose from and we  
13 actually went with four of these companies to procure  
14 equipment and deploy.

15 And we are part of an open standard, right? So  
16 we don't control the vehicle. We don't necessarily  
17 control the charger. There's an interconnection and  
18 interoperability that happens based on this standard.  
19 Everyone interprets the standard their own way. So there  
20 was a lot of these things that we had to work there and we  
21 continue to have to work and struggle through some of  
22 these interoperability issues.

23 But certainly as we started deploying  
24 infrastructure, we started to see, as utilization  
25 increased, you know, different issues pop up with each

1 manufacturer. Each manufacturer had its own flavor in  
2 some sense. And so we've had to work through with these  
3 manufacturers all these different issues. Some were  
4 pretty quick and easy in terms of software change that we  
5 could do remotely or with a tech visit, some were deeper,  
6 right, where there needed to be a design change. And so  
7 that design change has to be re-qualified, right, and then  
8 production done, and then a campaign has to happen.

9           And so we've been working those things, learning,  
10 feeding that information back into the manufacturers, as  
11 well as working with OEMs to work out these  
12 interconnection problems and feeding that back to the  
13 OEMs, so they can improve their vehicles and drive the  
14 industry forward. These advancements, these learnings,  
15 they go back into these manufacturers. We don't own an IP  
16 on those. They take that, put that into their product,  
17 and other CPOs and others get into this space to invest.  
18 They're taking those learnings and installing that in  
19 their product. So again, we're advancing the product  
20 forward.

21           But there is a lot of good that also happens,  
22 right? Five million sessions, 170 gigawatt hours. That  
23 doesn't necessarily happen with a network that doesn't  
24 work, right? So that is a significant amount of usage.  
25 We're not perfect, absolutely, and we've got a lot of work



1           ROBERT BARROSA: So hardware is one part of it  
2 and we know we have hardware that, under intense pressure,  
3 that we're seeing especially in California, but even in  
4 moderate utilization, has some issues, right, and we've  
5 got to work through those. So part of it is working with  
6 manufacturers to drive corrective actions, the long-term  
7 corrective actions, but it's also about how do we respond?  
8 Do we have the right maintenance team and operations to be  
9 able to respond to issues quickly, because we have to,  
10 right? We have stalls that are three or four stalls big.  
11 Our stations that are three or four stalls. So if a  
12 four-stall charger goes down, now you're down to three.  
13 If you have a line of three or four cars waiting, right,  
14 the anxiety just goes up. The dissatisfaction goes up.  
15 So we have to respond faster.

16           So our maintenance teams have been really working  
17 with our service providers in the state to find ways how  
18 do we respond faster, how do we get spare parts and other  
19 things into these four logistic areas and make the -- make  
20 the changes faster. And so, you know, over the year in  
21 2023, that's something the team has really worked on and  
22 so we've been able to dis -- decrease our response time  
23 from 40 hours -- or 48 hours to almost 24 hours. So great  
24 progress, all the while utilization continues to increase  
25 at a high rate. So very good progress from the team and



1 this is working not only with our people and processes  
2 internally, but also our service providers throughout the  
3 state.

4 Next slide.

5 --o0o--

6 ROBERT BARROSA: We -- to -- EV charging  
7 basically on an open standard, we're a part of a bigger  
8 puzzle, right? There's a lot of players that have to come  
9 in. I talked about the charger manufacturers. You have  
10 the network. You have the automaker, and then you have  
11 the customer in the middle of all that to make it happen.  
12 The standard is a standard, but it's not perfect. And it  
13 could -- and it needs to evolve, and grow, and be better.

14 So one of the things that we found is customers  
15 having to continually retry to get communication to work  
16 with the charger. There's several steps that have -- that  
17 happen when you plug in a car when electrons flow.  
18 There's initiation communication, payment, other things,  
19 safety checks. If any one of those fails, the whole thing  
20 fails, and you to have interact, you have to unplug, and  
21 you've got to plug in again.

22 So one of the things we did after looking at the  
23 data, we went back with some automakers and the charger  
24 manufacturer and said, well, why don't -- why don't we  
25 just do an auto-restart. Why do we have to have the

1 customer go through this pain? And so we've developed it  
2 with some of the automakers, as well as with charger  
3 manufacturers. We deployed it on a pilot basis to see the  
4 success. We saw a better success rate overall the  
5 customers. And that -- we're driving that back into the  
6 standards organization, so it becomes a standard across  
7 the Board that everyone can implement. And we can drive  
8 that benefit to the industry overall.

9           There are some things we don't have control over  
10 that have direct impact on customer experience. I'll give  
11 you one example in 2023 that really affected us heavily.  
12 In early 2023 again, we had customer complaints coming in.  
13 The car won't connect. I'm plugging it in. It will not  
14 connect. What's going on? And so we had to go -- and we  
15 see a huge amount of these coming in, specifically in and  
16 around California, surprisingly enough.

17           But when we actually did our investigation and  
18 started diving deeper, we actually physically looked at  
19 the connector. Inside one of the socket was this little  
20 plastic cap stuck inside the connector that was  
21 prohibiting a customer from connecting. So then we  
22 investigated where is this cap coming from? And lo and  
23 behold, it's being dropped by some of the vehicles that  
24 are connecting. It's -- as you unplug this plastic cap,  
25 protective cap that's over one of the pins is being left

1 in connector.

2           And so what that did is forced us to, when we  
3 identified this issue, we had to take that connector  
4 offline, right? We don't want a customer struggling, so  
5 it's better to take it offline. This was happening at  
6 hundreds of stations, hundreds of chargers. So we had to  
7 take several hundred connectors offline, dispatch  
8 technicians as fast as we could, clean out the connector,  
9 inspect the connector, make a repair to the connector if  
10 we needed to, or put that service -- that equipment back  
11 in service.

12           So it was -- it was sort of a whack-a-mole for a  
13 good period of the year there where we were taking  
14 hundreds of ports offline unfortunately. But we quickly  
15 got with our automaker partners, identified which were the  
16 culprit vehicles, had discussions with them. We reached  
17 out to our other CBO partners in the area, EVgo being one  
18 of them, shared data and information to make sure are you  
19 suing this? We're seeing this. And we collaborated  
20 together. We wrote a white paper that we published into  
21 CharIN. We brought the issue into the ChargeX Consortium,  
22 so that everyone is aware. And then we worked with  
23 automakers to make the appropriate fixes in place. And  
24 then also worked in the new standards development to make  
25 sure that the specifications that are being set for the



1 charger. We're building new stations with this  
2 technology. It's performing very well. We're very happy.  
3 Our manufacturers have really stepped up, taken the  
4 lessons learned and incorporated that into their product.  
5 And we're also going back, as staff had presented, looking  
6 at existing stations where we can upgrade, again to  
7 achieve better performance and better customer  
8 satisfaction overall.

9 Next slide.

10 --o0o--

11 ROBERT BARROSA: Okay. So next, I'll just  
12 highlight quickly. Cycle 4. We've heard a lot from the  
13 staff update.

14 Next slide.

15 --o0o--

16 ROBERT BARROSA: So really number one investment  
17 area, station reliability. That's our core area that we  
18 want to focus on and maintain as a top priority. Second  
19 is new station development and we'll talk a little bit  
20 about what that looks like. And then obviously continue  
21 on the great success we had working with our CBO partners  
22 funding those organizations, really get now to the  
23 communities they serve, and then working on a lot of the  
24 education and awareness around our branded and non-branded  
25 marketing.

1 Next slide.

2 --o0o--

3 ROBERT BARROSA: So as part of the process, we --  
4 the cycle 4 process, we have a national outreach to  
5 various stakeholders, drivers, customers, government  
6 agencies, whoever can feed in comments. And we take those  
7 comments in and see what are -- what are the things that  
8 we should be investing in, as well as our own data in  
9 terms of what we're hearing from customers. Reliability  
10 obviously was a big one, right? And I think I touched on  
11 a -- quite a few different areas. Making sure partners  
12 are there, chargers are working, right, is critical to  
13 drive ZEV adoption. Understood 100 percent. And so  
14 that's why the number one topic for us is really focused  
15 in that area and going forward.

16 Next slide.

17 --o0o--

18 ROBERT BARROSA: In terms of the spend, we kind  
19 of saw this already in our split via the station upgrades  
20 and the operation and maintenance. That will continue on.  
21 That's a good portion of the spend. Where we can expand,  
22 we'll expand. So if we have a three-charger site or a  
23 four-charger site and we can make that a 10-charger site,  
24 we'll expand that location, as well as build new stations.  
25 And then obviously, we -- we'll talk a little bit more

1 in-depth in terms of our work with The CBOs and how that  
2 will move forward.

3 Next slide.

4 --o0o--

5 ROBERT BARROSA: So again, three main areas we're  
6 focused on, high quality, which really means station  
7 reliability, growth of the network, the three to four  
8 charger sites served us well early on to build geography,  
9 build reach. But as you saw from the utilization numbers,  
10 they're being overwhelmed, so we need to find a pressure  
11 relief valve here, right? We can't -- having these  
12 stations run at above 40 percent, I mean, we have sites --  
13 there's a couple sites in Burbank hitting 70 percent  
14 utilization, 70 percent. I mean, I go on the app and I  
15 look at two in the morning, and, you know, half the  
16 station is full.

17 So the usage of these stations is very high and  
18 so we have to -- we have to build bigger, right? We have  
19 to build more stations, but we've got to build them  
20 bigger, right, so we don't have as much queuing to drive  
21 that better customer experience. And that's very  
22 critical, right? Along with the reliability and  
23 everything that goes with it, but having to sit two hours  
24 to charge is not a good experience, right? That doesn't  
25 motivate somebody to get into an EV. And so building

1 bigger stations, not only us, but anyone else that's  
2 coming into the space, build bigger is my message overall.

3           And then obviously continue to focus on fast  
4 public charging. I think that served the industry well.  
5 It served the market well. We hear from customers they  
6 like speed. They want speed. They want to get in and  
7 out. And so that's very critical and we see the roadmaps  
8 of electric vehicles going that route.

9           Next slide.

10                           --o0o--

11           ROBERT BARROSA: We continue to make significant  
12 investments from the operation and maintenance side, and  
13 that's people, processes, and systems across the board,  
14 right? There's a lot of learnings from the early days  
15 from where we're at today. And so how we organize, how we  
16 dispatch, that also feeds into the technology. What more  
17 information can we get from the charger to the network  
18 operation centers, so that if an issue does happen, we're  
19 able to better respond with the right kind of technician,  
20 the right kind of parts to quickly fix an issue. So we're  
21 getting better at it. We saw in our response times in  
22 California, they're coming down. We're getting better at  
23 getting out there and getting things fixed.

24           Next slide.

25                           --o0o--



1           ROBERT BARROSA: We're also looking at our rural  
2 communities, right? A lot of these stations are in pretty  
3 remote locations. And so how we address issues there  
4 needs to change as well, right? Technicians maybe live  
5 two or three hours away from these locations. And so we  
6 need to make sure that the way we're handling these  
7 stations when we go visit is a little bit broader and more  
8 in scope in terms of maybe some stations that we handle in  
9 urban areas. So, for example, when we go to a site now  
10 for a specific issue that may happen outside of a  
11 preventative maintenance activity, but if a connector  
12 broke on a station or something like that, we'll go out to  
13 replace that connector.

14           But while a technician is there now, their scope  
15 of work has increased to go in depth on every single  
16 station that's there in terms of cleaning, checking out  
17 subsystems to see what may fail next and make the proper  
18 repairs while they're there, right? So trying to be as  
19 proactive as possible in these rural communities, because  
20 they serve, you know, vital linkage points as well, and  
21 making sure we can -- we can, you know, address issues  
22 before they happen.

23           Next slide.

24                           --o0o--

25           ROBERT BARROSA: Staff talked about our

1 replacement plan. So, you know, we have a set of metrics  
2 by which we look at chargers in terms of what -- which  
3 should -- which should be on the list first in terms of  
4 replacement. In the plan, we have somewhere about 500  
5 chargers, 600 chargers that we would like to replace going  
6 forward. About half of those are in LIC/DAC communities  
7 as well as rural communities. And if you can look by the  
8 map, right? It's spread out, you know, by geography  
9 across the state. So there's no one region, no one urban  
10 core that's getting all the upgrades, right? We took a  
11 broad-based approach in terms of how we look at this and  
12 making sure we're serving the whole of the state.

13 Next slide.

14 --o0o--

15 ROBERT BARROSA: In terms of new investment,  
16 we'll use the same rubric that we've continued to use  
17 through or cycle 1, 2, and 3. A big part of that rubric  
18 is also focusing on the LIC/DAC community. That's why  
19 we've been successful to achieve the above 50 percent  
20 target. We'll continue to do that and move forward using  
21 that in our metric. Again, that is ingrained in our  
22 organization in terms of how we think about our  
23 investments and making sure we're always addressing those  
24 communities.

25 Next slide.



1 vehicle -- electric vehicle, and helping them with  
2 incentives and other things and figuring those things out.

3           So they've been very vital. They've also really  
4 helped us from a STEM standpoint, right, not only  
5 providing curriculum in teaching for 4th to 12th graders,  
6 but also at the -- at the trade level, right, working with  
7 community colleges to provide education to create the next  
8 technicians that can work on electric vehicle supply  
9 equipment.

10           Next slide.

11                           --o0o--

12           ROBERT BARROSA: And on our branded and  
13 non-branded marketing side, I think the real focus we want  
14 to take here is education, right? How do you use a  
15 charger, what to expect when you go on? Our data says if  
16 it's a first-time user, they have a high success of  
17 failing on their first try, probably on their first two  
18 tries. So we know we have work to do there.

19           I'm a long-time user. I drove from LA to  
20 Sacramento. On Tuesday, I stopped in Kettleman City. I  
21 went to charge, I plugged it in, and I got a communication  
22 error. But what happens is I didn't plug the connector  
23 all the way. I didn't hear the little click that you have  
24 to hear, right? And I've charged thousands of times, but  
25 it happens, right? And so for a new user, how do you deal



1 people, plus our suppliers and partners in the space have  
2 done to continue to focus on reliability and improvement  
3 of the network. All that will continue, as well as then  
4 starting our next cycle in the CBOs and working with those  
5 community-based organizations.

6 And with that, I think that's the last slide, so  
7 thank you very much. I'm happy to take questions, if  
8 there are any, or whatever the process is next.

9 CHAIR RANDOLPH: All right. Thank you. I think  
10 what we'll do is have some time for Board members to ask  
11 you some questions, and then we will go to public comment,  
12 then we'll bring it back to the Board for some more  
13 discussion.

14 I'm going to go -- I'm going to go ahead and  
15 start the questions, because as you know, longtime very  
16 heavy user of the Electrify America network. Appreciate  
17 the growth of that network, you know, seeing some of these  
18 gaps starting to fill in. I think that growth is really  
19 important. And I'm really pleased to see the maintenance  
20 piece in this plan, because that customer experience is,  
21 as you have articulated, the biggest concern and the  
22 biggest challenge I think you all need to overcome.

23 I know Electrify America is not alone in this  
24 issue. You know, there are reliability challenges with  
25 the other companies as well. And so I paid particular

1 attention to the maintenance plan and it's partly informed  
2 by, you know, obviously by my own anecdotal experience,  
3 which is not --

4 ROBERT BARROSA: Absolutely, yeah.

5 CHAIR RANDOLPH: -- you know -- which as we know  
6 is not scientifically valid, but it is what people are --

7 ROBERT BARROSA: Absolutely.

8 CHAIR RANDOLPH: -- hearing when they're making  
9 decisions about electric vehicles. In slide 20, you had a  
10 picture of the Raju Countryside Mart in Lost Hills. I was  
11 there two weeks ago. I tried to charge a charger 3, it  
12 didn't work. Called the customer service line, waited,  
13 you know, like 10-ish minutes. The guy goes -- oh, and it  
14 was showing operable on the -- on the app. And the guy  
15 goes, oh, my data is showing me that that has not had a  
16 successful charge in three days. I'm like, okay, why is  
17 it showing available on the app, and, you know, consider  
18 this yet another report of an unsuccessful charge. The  
19 next day I went on my app after I got home, still showing  
20 available. PlugShare check-in still showing, oh, charger  
21 3 is not working, charger 3 is not working.

22 And I know this is not unique to the older  
23 stations, because as I'm sure you are aware at Kettleman  
24 City over the holidays, there were three chargers out at  
25 that beautiful brand new station and they were out for

1 several days.

2 ROBERT BARROSA: Um-hmm.

3 CHAIR RANDOLPH: So I am getting to my question,  
4 which is your presentation had more detail around customer  
5 response time and responses to outages than is presented  
6 in your maintenance plan. So I kind of want to dig into  
7 that a little bit, because I do think it's important to  
8 have some standards for, you know, what are you -- what  
9 are you trying to achieve, what are you trying to target  
10 in terms getting out there and addressing the problem?

11 And so my two-part question is what are your  
12 goals for customer response and what are some of the  
13 specific strategies you're using to speed up that process?  
14 Because to your point, there's a lot of a point --  
15 potential points of failure. And so perfection is not  
16 possible, but responsiveness makes all the difference.

17 ROBERT BARROSA: Right. Yes.

18 CHAIR RANDOLPH: So can you talk about that?

19 ROBERT BARROSA: Yeah. You know, these issues  
20 are not -- are not easy. And so there's a lot of things  
21 that have to come together. So in terms of metrics of  
22 what we're trying to achieve, right, we're always across  
23 the network trying to respond and get to charging stations  
24 within 48 hours. That's sort of been our internal metric.  
25 But even in California as we've seen such high



1 utilization, we knew we needed to do better, right? We're  
2 in this -- in this sort of -- I would say a bit  
3 unsustainable, I think especially in some of these -- some  
4 of these stations at 70 percent utilization, 80 percent  
5 utilization that we have to bolster up with the teams and  
6 the service personnel that we use throughout the state.

7           So we've done a lot of training material. So  
8 we've done a lot of videos and other things to help our  
9 service providers and companies like Pearce, who is a  
10 California-based company who does a lot of our service,  
11 helping them, providing them the training materials and  
12 other things, so that they can go find members throughout  
13 the state to be closer to where the work is going to be,  
14 so they can respond faster, right? But to train them up  
15 and get them there, it could be a long process. So we've  
16 actually stepped in and helped provide a lot of the  
17 materials they need to find the -- to find the people and  
18 then train them to be adequately capable of responding and  
19 dealing with issues.

20           A lot of the issues have been supply chain  
21 challenges I'd say overall. So while we can respond and  
22 potentially work through a connector issue, a more  
23 consumable problem, if it's a deeper issue -- I have all  
24 these terms inside like main board. There's all these  
25 specific names that we see failures around. Sometimes

1 supply chain issues are what drive and keep a station down  
2 longer.

3           We also -- you know, we have a lot of issues in  
4 terms of -- or I've seen a lot of issues which kind of  
5 cause these inaccuracies in terms of the data that comes  
6 from the charger to the back-end network system and making  
7 sure that those are -- those are aligned, right? And so  
8 there's still a significant amount of work going on there.  
9 We work with, you know, essentially three different --  
10 well, we had four original manufacturers. One stepped out  
11 of the market completely. Now, we're down to three.

12           You know, every software implementation they do,  
13 while we try to standardize it, you know, how that  
14 integrates into the back-end still has some challenges.  
15 And I think that's what you see in some of the app  
16 inaccuracies that we've improving along the way.

17           We've gone ahead and invested more on the  
18 software side, especially for us internally, so that we  
19 can get a handle on that. And we actually -- you know,  
20 when we originally started, we actually went to the open  
21 market and used a cloud service provider to manage the  
22 network, and we quickly saw the limitations of that  
23 system. We'd get to ten or twenty thousand sessions and  
24 the system would crash and we would literally put the  
25 stations on free vend, basically free to use for a week,

1 while we sort out problems. And in 2021 and 2022, we  
2 invested and developed a new back-end system that's better  
3 capable of handling the number of sessions that we're  
4 seeing.

5           And now today across the county we see on a  
6 weekly basis, and it's growing, 250,000 to 300,000  
7 sessions a week and the system is maintaining. There's  
8 still some improvements we need to make in how they  
9 integrate to the charging station, so that we don't have  
10 this discrepancy in terms of what's available, but it is  
11 getting better and we're doing software releases as often  
12 as possible to make that happen.

13           CHAIR RANDOLPH: And so how are you thinking  
14 about your response times, your process -- you know, your  
15 process, your tracking, and metrics around response times?

16           ROBERT BARROSA: Yeah. Like I said, we have our  
17 internal metrics and SLAs that we work with our partners  
18 and hold them to, as well as ourselves. And so we work to  
19 those, but obviously in certain regions, like, you know,  
20 heavily utilized stations and how we deal with a lot of  
21 these rural communities, we had to make improvements,  
22 right? We've got to strengthen those. And even if it's  
23 for a short period of time until there's a pressure  
24 relief, right, to take some of the utilization down,  
25 improve the equipment, right -- we had to staff up and do

1 some things to get better. And that's where you see, I  
2 think, the improvement in response time, number one,  
3 getting out there.

4           And then I think what you're starting to see too  
5 is the improvements in equipment are starting to drive --  
6 at least as utilizations go up, the number of work orders  
7 isn't necessarily going up, so we're able to stabilize  
8 that. So we're getting the technology to be better,  
9 right, not only from a legacy standpoint, but also from  
10 a -- from a new product standpoint.

11           CHAIR RANDOLPH: Okay. I'll let me other  
12 colleagues jump in with their questions. I will just say  
13 that the -- you know, perhaps it's a transparency issue,  
14 perhaps some of these internal metrics should become part  
15 of more of the maintenance plan that you have articulated,  
16 because you've sort of articulated your overall spend,  
17 some of your strategies, but, you know, haven't taken the  
18 additional step to kind of say, okay, this is -- this is  
19 what we're striving for, so that there is an opportunity  
20 to really, you know, see if that's how that's playing out.

21           I will let my other colleagues go. I'm going to  
22 start from the right. Board Member Rechtschaffen. I  
23 almost called you commissioner.

24           BOARD MEMBER RECHTSCHAFFEN: Thank you. I have a  
25 couple of questions. And maybe this just follows on Chair

1 Randolph. What are your figures in uptime? And I know  
2 you said it was a complex mix of factors determining when  
3 the stations are up. But what are your figures and what  
4 are you striving for?

5 ROBERT BARROSA: So we're striving for 97 percent  
6 and above uptime across all our equipment. Obviously,  
7 with the legacy equipment, we have -- it's a struggle,  
8 right? It's a struggle to keep it at the 90 percent or  
9 above number. And we're working hard with our  
10 manufacturers to do that.

11 The newer equipment, we're seeing great success  
12 with that equipment. And we're seeing that 97 percent up  
13 or thereabouts, right, on a daily basis. So we have  
14 confidence in the new equipment and we've seen -- we see  
15 the progress and the learnings that we've taken from, you  
16 know, the first generation to the second generation and  
17 how that's improved the experience overall.

18 It's still -- again, it's new technology.  
19 There's a lot of tweaks and things that we can still do to  
20 improve it even further. And we're working closely with  
21 our charger manufacturers to do that, as well as our own  
22 software side of things. And we'll continue to do that,  
23 right? And that's to drive the numbers even higher or be  
24 able to live in an environment where we're seeing a  
25 majority of the stations at 40 percent utilization or

1 higher, right?

2 Living at that duty cycle -- living at that duty  
3 cycle in that regime is going to challenge any piece of  
4 equipment you put out there in the public to use in the  
5 public sphere, right? Things are going to break. It's  
6 getting more runtime. It's like a jet engine, like I  
7 said, you've got to take that thing. You've got to  
8 refurbish more often.

9 So living in that regime is a very difficult  
10 space to be and that's where we're in today, especially in  
11 California. So part of this is having to figure out how  
12 do we build that pressure relief, right? There's other  
13 infrastructure that needs to come in so we can drive the  
14 utilization back to a reasonable level. That improves  
15 customer experience as well, right, not having to sit in  
16 long lines or queues.

17 BOARD MEMBER RECHTSCHAFFEN: Well, I'm going to  
18 ask you again, what -- do you have figures on uptime that  
19 you can share with us and the public? I understand it's  
20 difficult. You have more success with the newer chargers,  
21 but surely you must have some figures internally on what  
22 uptime is. Can you share those with us?

23 ROBERT BARROSA: Yeah. So like I said, our new  
24 generation equipment is achieving high uptime percentages,  
25 in the 97 percent range. The legacy equipment still

1 struggles, right? It's in the lower percentage range of  
2 the 90s, right? Sometimes at 90 or maybe a little bit  
3 below depending on what's happening on utilization across  
4 the network. So I'm trying to be as transparent as  
5 possible. It's work to be done, but that's where we're at  
6 today.

7 BOARD MEMBER RECHTSCHAFFEN: All right. Well, I  
8 guess maybe as a follow-up, you could send us the specific  
9 information. And maybe staff has it. I don't know. But  
10 I don't have it as a Board member and I'd be interested in  
11 seeing exactly what the uptime is for all your stations.

12 And did you put in the investment plan a  
13 commitment to 97 percent as a goal, uptime, or did you  
14 have a specific uptime goal?

15 ROBERT BARROSA: Yeah. Again, our  
16 strive-to-achieve and what we're trying to get to is 97  
17 percent or above. I don't think that -- our interests are  
18 aligned, right? Drive highest reliability across the  
19 Board, so -- and it's a matter of like how do we get  
20 there, right? And can we get there potentially with the  
21 legacy equipment? That's going to be -- that's going to  
22 be a struggle, right, because we know the issues that  
23 exist there. Can we get it with, as we improve the  
24 technology and equipment and we see some pressure relief  
25 coming off of -- off the network, right, with other

1 stations taking on load as well and bringing down the  
2 utilization factors, to be at a more reasonable level, I  
3 would say.

4           You know, a lot of things have to come together  
5 to make that happen, right? We can't put a thousand  
6 chargers out there, see 25 percent new vehicle market --  
7 you know, new vehicles being sold being BEVs, and then  
8 expect this just to handle the whole capacity, right?  
9 More has to happen. Obviously, reliability. We've got to  
10 do everything we can to keep that up as high as possible -  
11 absolutely. Don't disagree there - but more and bigger  
12 infrastructure is also needed.

13           BOARD MEMBER RECHTSCHAFFEN: All right. My  
14 second question deals with how you decide on where these  
15 chargers are placed and you described a data-driven  
16 process. You described compliance with SB 92. Can you  
17 talk about how you work to achieve other State goals in  
18 where you're deciding to place the chargers, as opposed to  
19 profit maximization, for example?

20           ROBERT BARROSA: So, I mean, we certainly support  
21 all the State goals in driving electrification, right?  
22 And I think that's the primary goal. And then we have  
23 subsequent goals around making sure our investments are  
24 also going to low-income and disadvantaged communities.  
25 And so, you know, we take that into the rubric into the



1 metrics that we look at, right?

2           But there's a whole series of things that we look  
3 at, not just profitability of a station, but, you know,  
4 what is the market, what are the travel patterns, where  
5 are other stations being announced now with NEVI coming  
6 in, right? We don't want to build right next to where a  
7 NEVI station is going to go in, so how do we make one plus  
8 one equal three, right? So we take a lot of those  
9 different factors into account, as well as our LIC/DAC  
10 communities.

11           BOARD MEMBER RECHTSCHAFFEN: Thank you.

12           CHAIR RANDOLPH: Dr. Pacheco-Werner.

13           BOARD MEMBER PACHECO-WERNER: Thank you so much.  
14 I really appreciate seeing -- you know, I thank Electrify  
15 America for the commitment to equity, both in the past and  
16 then what's in the plan now. I mean, the public who  
17 should be the ultimate benefactors of the investments have  
18 had questions about the network as it stands now, and some  
19 of my Board members have asked and will be asking.

20           I think my concern is really how we're setting up  
21 these investments to look like and function in year 11,  
22 particularly how the investments in the disadvantaged  
23 communities have been set up to succeed from an equity and  
24 business perspective. My primary concern with the plan as  
25 it stands now is how the criteria proposed for the up --

1 for the -- not the -- necessarily the new stations, but  
2 the upgrades how those are prioritized and ensuring how  
3 that 35 percent threshold investment is kept well and in  
4 shape.

5 ROBERT BARROSA: Um-hmm. Yep.

6 BOARD MEMBER PACHECO-WERNER: While the eight  
7 million proposed in education and outreach is crucial, I'm  
8 concerned right now that the reliability upgrade  
9 methodology doesn't account for the intersection of how a  
10 disadvantaged community may be uniquely experiencing  
11 challenges to, and reporting or lack of reporting. And  
12 so -- and so I'm concerned on that end in terms of the  
13 criteria as it stands now.

14 I think the network growth has a good methodology  
15 that has accounted for some of this. But I'd like to see  
16 more forward-looking planning on the upgrade methodology,  
17 so that in year 11 those chargers in disadvantaged  
18 communities are not left behind.

19 To that -- to end, I do -- I did see that, you  
20 know, you talked about cycle 3 some as well. And I don't  
21 know if this is a question for staff or for you, but is  
22 all of the money from cycle 3 investment planning  
23 committed now, and if not, is there -- you know, are there  
24 amendments that we could make to really respond to the  
25 public's concerns as they stand now on the reliability and

1 upgrade question?

2 ROBERT BARROSA: So I don't know if staff wants  
3 to answer the -- sort of the committed dollars, but those  
4 dollars are committed based on the cycle 3 plan and what  
5 we're moving forward with there.

6 In terms of answering your questions on the  
7 reliability and upgrade, right, the map I showed showed a  
8 wide dispersion of these upgrades happening throughout the  
9 state. In fact, you know, we've identified about 490  
10 sites that we'd like to proceed with. Over 50 percent of  
11 those are in low-income and disadvantaged communities. A  
12 lot of our sites in low-income and disadvantaged  
13 communities are actually performing quite well in terms  
14 of from a utilization standpoint. So they're very  
15 important stations in our network and we treat those just  
16 the same as we would any others in terms of making sure  
17 we -- we're putting all the resources just like we would  
18 any other region of the state. And especially like I talk  
19 about in our rural regions, right, making sure we're  
20 beefing up and really thinking through our maintenance  
21 strategy and being as proactive in those areas.

22 So we'll continue to do that. And like I said in  
23 the beginning, right, we've institutionalize how we think  
24 about these communities and making that part of the  
25 investment cycle. And the business overall, right, we've

1 always intended this business to be sustainable. It has  
2 to go beyond 2026, all the infrastructure we put out  
3 there, right? And that's why we've made long-term  
4 commitments like in PPA and our Solar 1 Glow -- or Solar  
5 Glow 1 deal. We're making a long-term commitment to the  
6 renewable energy space, right, in terms of offsetting our  
7 power that we're dispensing across the region. But also,  
8 too, is we're investing additional stations, right,  
9 throughout the state outside of the consent decree, right,  
10 through other -- through other investments that we're  
11 raising and moving forward with.

12 So we want to push this industry forward. We  
13 want to push adoption forward. And really our focus on  
14 high-powered charging has always been to drive electric  
15 for all, right? To make sure that folks that don't have  
16 an overnight place to charge their car or workplace to  
17 charge their car, that they can still drive an electric  
18 vehicle. And having ultra-fast charging where you can get  
19 your 300 miles of range in 20 minutes, right, that helps  
20 people get confidence to get into an electric vehicle.  
21 That's where we focused and that helps all Californians  
22 get into the electric movement.

23 BOARD MEMBER PACHECO-WERNER: You mentioned --  
24 one last question. You mentioned in response to the  
25 Chair's question, one of the issues that you're working on

1 is the supply chain. And in your plan, you mention under  
2 that section I believe like a warehouse or something to  
3 that effect. What other things are you doing that may be  
4 aren't in the plan around that particular issue?

5           ROBERT BARROSA: Yeah. So having adequate stock,  
6 right? We came out of COVID and still deal with still  
7 lingering supply chain issues around connectors and other  
8 things. And then there's instances like the pin cap issue  
9 I described, right, where we had to take a lot of chargers  
10 down. There were -- there were a number of connectors  
11 that we had to upgrade, because there was damage from  
12 customer frustration, trying to wiggle a connector in and  
13 something may have happened to the connector where we had  
14 to change it. So then we had a huge increase need of  
15 connectors, right? And that kind of blew through our  
16 stock inventory for replacement parts and now we had to go  
17 back to the manufacturer and expedite and hurry up to try  
18 to get more connectors. And so that has a lot of  
19 downstream effects. So there's situations like that we  
20 can't always account for.

21           But what we do do is look at the replacement  
22 parts that we need that we look at network-wide, what are  
23 the common failure modes, what are the common replacement  
24 parts. Let's make sure we set thresholds in terms of our  
25 better managed inventory, or VMIs we call it and keep

1 those at certain levels with our suppliers. And then we  
2 look at how do we put them at more forward logistics  
3 areas, so that we can get it to technicians faster. And  
4 so really looking at how do we close down that gap to get  
5 the right parts to the technician. But a lot of that also  
6 has to do with what information are we getting from the  
7 chargers that tell us what to fix.

8           And sometimes that is a big piece that's missing.  
9 And a big part of sort of the struggle with a lot of the  
10 legacy equipment that we have to deal with, right? So we  
11 may not know exactly what we have, and so that might take  
12 a one trip, two trips, sometimes three types to fix. And  
13 then you layer on if there's any delays in a particular  
14 part trying to get to that -- to that location, then that  
15 can extend the time for a repair.

16           CHAIR RANDOLPH: Dr. Balmes.

17           BOARD MEMBER BALMES: Thank you, Chair Randolph.  
18 And thank you, Mr. Barrosa. You know, I'm going to say  
19 some good things before I have more critical comments.

20           I appreciate the new focus that Electrify America  
21 is making on maintenance. I could go through my personal  
22 stories with Electrify America. And the Fresno location  
23 is the only place I've ever charged, actually the same  
24 charging station behind a fashion mall. And, you know, I  
25 found kiosks that weren't working. I have had trouble

1 connecting. And I just was down there and it took me 40  
2 minutes to charge my EV 6, which is one of the  
3 fast-charging cars to go -- because I was literally down  
4 to 20 miles of battery range. So I didn't look to see if  
5 that was one of your brand new gen 4 or whatever chargers.

6 ROBERT BARROSA: Um-hmm.

7 BOARD MEMBER BALMES: So I've experienced, like  
8 Chair Randolph, frustration at Electrify America  
9 locations, but I appreciate that this new approach to  
10 putting almost half the funds into maintenance is  
11 appropriate at this point.

12 I also realize there's a need to expand the  
13 network. So I think overall, the funding allocation is  
14 reasonable, but I -- I also -- in part, because I used to  
15 be his boss, I've read Dr. Rempel's and Cool the Earth's  
16 2022 evaluation of Bay Area charging stations. And while  
17 Electrify America did the best of the three companies that  
18 were being looked at, and had the most charging  
19 stations -- kiosks, it's -- it was nowhere near -- the  
20 uptime was nowhere near the 97 percent that you're  
21 striving for.

22 So I guess my first question is I'm sure you read  
23 that report. How did you -- how did Electrify America  
24 respond to that report, which was -- I think it was well  
25 conducted and pretty straightforward the results. So how

1 did you respond to that?

2           ROBERT BARROSA: Yeah like any reports and data  
3 that's -- you know, analyzes the infrastructure, we take  
4 it very seriously, right, and we look at that. And we had  
5 conversations with Cool the Earth and the UC professor --  
6 UC Berkeley professor that conducted this study. There  
7 were a couple things, I think -- you know, we had a few  
8 explanations in terms of this that would have increased  
9 our scores a little bit, but okay, we would have gotten to  
10 80 percent. Still nowhere near, right, to your point,  
11 before we wanted to get to, and that's well understood.

12           So how did we respond?

13           Those were actually some of the first pilot sites  
14 and replacement sites we took on to improve. So we've  
15 actually upgraded that equipment. I think it's probably,  
16 out of the sites they visited, almost 60 percent of those  
17 sites now have been upgraded to the newer generation  
18 equipment, because we looked at that those sites and then  
19 trying to figure out, okay, well how many work orders are  
20 we doing, how often are we going out there, what's the  
21 utilization, are we meeting the demand. So we've gone  
22 ahead and made upgrades to those stations, so that we  
23 can -- we can improve performance, as well as looking  
24 across the state, where else we could take advantage and  
25 start -- get started early on some of these upgrades.



1           So we've taken no steps as well as a lot of the  
2 other steps that we've talked about, right, in terms of  
3 how are we increasing our response time, right? How are  
4 we -- how are we moving our logistics a little bit  
5 forward, how are we increasing our spare parts inventory?  
6 How are we looking at all these things and how can we do  
7 better, because we're living in a world now, especially in  
8 the Bay Area -- those sites I could probably guarantee  
9 you, they're all at 40 percent or above utilization. So  
10 you're in a heavy-duty cycle and that requires us to, you  
11 know, act differently, do a few things differently. And  
12 so we've done that.

13           Is it perfect? No. Are we getting better?  
14 Absolutely. And that's through a combination of upgrades,  
15 that's a combination of what we're doing from a  
16 maintenance standpoint, and it's combination of what we  
17 want to do in the future of build bigger, right?

18           One of the sites we're opening up right off of  
19 Harrison Street right when you get off the Bay Bridge,  
20 it's a brand new --

21           BOARD MEMBER BALMES: I just got an invitation.  
22 I'm going to go to the opening.

23           ROBERT BARROSA: Oh, perfect. But it's a  
24 20-stall site, right? That's one of the -- as I made my  
25 way up from Los Angeles to Sacramento, I stopped there to

1 see how things were coming along. It's a 20-stall  
2 location, right? Building bigger, building more  
3 availability, trying to provide that pressure relief that  
4 we're seeing now in the network.

5           And we -- as an industry, as a state, we've  
6 really got to push forward on the pressure relief. We  
7 need more infrastructure. We see our growth continue to  
8 grow as more adoption happens. And so trying to figure  
9 out how we can do that, not just with our investment.  
10 Because even though the cycle 4 plan, that's still not  
11 enough. We're -- if it's just us doing it and a few  
12 others doing a little bit, it's not enough. We've got to  
13 really push forward on that aspect.

14           BOARD MEMBER BALMES: And a specific critique  
15 from that Cool the Earth report. You know, seven percent  
16 of your kiosk had in quotes "Design failure," because the  
17 cable wasn't long enough to charge Bolts -- Chevy Bolts.  
18 Have you fixed that at all your locations?

19           ROBERT BARROSA: So that was actually one of the  
20 points of contention we had with the study, because our  
21 early design or gen 1 kiosk, one of the things we wanted  
22 to avoid was a -- was a long cable and a cable retraction  
23 system, so we decided for each dispenser, there would be  
24 two tables. And two cables only power can go through one  
25 at a time, so one dispenser only services one car. So you

1 pick one connector that can -- that can fit any -- if the  
2 port location is on the -- sort of the front quarter panel  
3 or the front of the car, it reaches that side. The other  
4 connector reaches the rear quarter panel, right? So that  
5 provides you the length and the reach. It's not meant to  
6 you park and both connectors must fit into your vehicle.  
7 Only one needs to fit into your vehicle to service your  
8 vehicle.

9 And so that was one of the areas that --

10 BOARD MEMBER BALMES: That's how you could get to  
11 80 percent.

12 ROBERT BARROSA: Yeah. That's how you get to 80  
13 percent. But again, to your point, 80 percent is still  
14 not good enough, right? We have work to do. That was  
15 2022. We went through our wrath of issues on sort of the  
16 pin caps in '23. That took a lot of ports offline and we  
17 had to restore those and we're getting a head of that now.  
18 And we've seen progress overall in the network.

19 BOARD MEMBER BALMES: And my last comment is I  
20 just want to echo Dr. Pacheco-Werner's concern about your  
21 chargers -- your charging stations in low-income,  
22 disadvantaged communities because they frequently cannot  
23 charge at home like I can. And so it's really vital that  
24 those stations are maintained to the best of your  
25 company's ability.

1 ROBERT BARROSA: Yeah, absolutely agree.

2 Thank you.

3 CHAIR RANDOLPH: Thank you.

4 Board Member Takvorian.

5 BOARD MEMBER TAKVORIAN: Thank you, Chair. Thank  
6 you for being here today. Appreciate it. My colleagues  
7 have covered a few of the issues that I had, so I'm going  
8 to follow up on the issues related to disadvantaged  
9 communities and accessibility in those communities. The  
10 report indicates and you said that Electrify America is  
11 exceeding the DAC requirement with 55 percent in DACs.

12 I'm concerned about the validity of that number  
13 frankly. And I'm not sure how it's calculated. I ask  
14 staff and appreciate that they sent me a map of the  
15 charging stations. And so I was able to take a look at  
16 that. And the first thing that jumps out is that many of  
17 the chargers are adjacent to freeways, which happen to be  
18 in our communities -- in disadvantaged communities. So  
19 you get points for disadvantaged communities, but also  
20 it's good for motorists who are on freeways. So that's  
21 good, but it really doesn't serve residents of  
22 disadvantaged communities I think in the way that we  
23 anticipated.

24 The second thing is that I drilled down for South  
25 San Diego, which is where I'm from. And I know those

1 communities, so I could kind of take a look at them point  
2 by point, and there's one charger in Barrio Logan and  
3 there are six in Coronado. They're about a mile apart  
4 from each other, but they're about a million miles apart  
5 in terms of income. So I think that there's a clear  
6 discrepancy there and it's a big concern.

7           Barrio Logan is a huge workforce area and I think  
8 could really benefit from charging stations and there are  
9 virtually none there. There's two in Imperial Beach. And  
10 there's more than I can count in La Jolla. So I think  
11 there's a clear discrepancy. There's four in National  
12 City and they all appear to be at car dealerships, which I  
13 don't think are available to the public.

14           So I could be wrong about that, but that's what  
15 shows up. It's Mossy Nissan and something else Toyota.  
16 So I'm just -- my takeaway is that DACs really aren't  
17 being served. And I'm concerned about reliability as my  
18 colleagues are, but we need those stations to be in our  
19 communities. And so I'd like to know how you're planning  
20 to improve that, not just reliability, which is obviously  
21 critical, but actual accessibility, because it -- from my  
22 look, it's -- they're not there. So that's my first  
23 question. I have a second one, but I wanted you to answer  
24 that.

25           ROBERT BARROSA: Yeah. So, you know, we take

1 that into the metrics as we -- as we look and how we  
2 invest. I can look like, for example, Los Angeles, which  
3 I'm also very familiar with, and the investments we've  
4 made in Riverside county, and the San Bernardino counties  
5 as well, have put a lot of stations in the community in  
6 and around those areas. And so we'll continue to look at  
7 all these communities to see where we can put  
8 infrastructure in.

9 Imperial Valley is another area. We know we need  
10 to do more. We have several projects going on in that  
11 area and we've invested a lot through the Central Valley,  
12 in Bakersfield, Fresno, and other communities through  
13 there that are just not on the highways, but in the  
14 communities themselves. So, you know, it's hard to do --  
15 sort of kind of please everybody. Absolutely. And  
16 there's an evolution to this, right, that the spending  
17 goes on.

18 And so we'll continue to look those -- at those  
19 communities, continue to factor that into our investment  
20 into what the network looks like, and try to address as  
21 many concerns, right, and communities as possible.

22 BOARD MEMBER TAKVORIAN: Okay. Well, maybe this  
23 is a question to staff, but I feel like if we're looking  
24 at entire communities as low-income communities and  
25 being -- all of those areas are not high on

1 CalEnviroScreen, let me put it that way, that I see that  
2 are on -- that are blue on the map. So perhaps we could  
3 have more of a conversation about targeting more. I  
4 understand that that's what's specified in the agreement,  
5 but it really doesn't get to where people live and work, I  
6 think, in at least some of the communities I'm looking at.  
7 So I don't know if you all would like to respond to that  
8 and have other ideas for how we might target better.

9 STCD CHIEF GRESS: This is Jennifer Gress, Chief  
10 of the Sustainable Transportation and Communities  
11 Division. Certainly, you know, we meet with Electrify  
12 America staff every month. And as they proceed on cycle  
13 4, these are the kinds of conversations we can have with  
14 them, you know, how are they thinking about LIC/DAC and  
15 what is -- you know, what more can they do to get within  
16 communities?

17 So I think some dialogue will be helpful. But  
18 the other thing we can do, at least with staff, is I think  
19 do a little more analysis about -- to get at this question  
20 of what's the sort of the level of LIC/DAC. So we map out  
21 where the stations are, as you know, and maybe we can do a  
22 little bit more analysis to determine kind of what the  
23 level is.

24 BOARD MEMBER TAKVORIAN: Okay. That would be  
25 helpful I think. And, you know, I know we're all evolving

1 for that. And so if we can help Electrify America to  
2 target a little bit better. And we have representatives  
3 from all over the state here. And I think we know our  
4 communities. And the Chair has shared her experience.  
5 And so, you know, I think we can be tapped to talk about  
6 where we think would be appropriate locations.

7 So the second question I have, and I talked to  
8 staff about this a little bit, but didn't have a chance to  
9 talk with you when we met, but I'm interested in what the  
10 evaluation analysis of the education and outreach  
11 campaigns are.

12 ROBERT BARROSA: Um-hmm.

13 BOARD MEMBER TAKVORIAN: I really appreciate the  
14 fact that you're working with CBOs. I think that's really  
15 an important way to get the message out. They are trusted  
16 messengers in our communities. And so I think that's  
17 great. But what I don't see it's like a check the box  
18 that you did the -- you're doing the CBO agreements,  
19 you're doing the social media and the videos, and that's  
20 great, but we don't know whether they're working. And so  
21 I wonder if you have a plan for how you're going to  
22 evaluate the media and education and outreach work that  
23 you're doing to see how effective it is, not just that  
24 you're doing it.

25 ROBERT BARROSA: Yeah. No. Certainly, as we



1 work with our CBO partners and we go through the RFP  
2 process to select different programs, once they're  
3 selected, we actually sit down and map out what are the  
4 metrics by which we're going to measure the work and the  
5 activity. So if it's a ride and drive in sort of a rural  
6 community or a disadvantaged community, you know, how many  
7 of those are you going to have? Like, okay, let's set  
8 some metrics and some timelines of what you want to  
9 achieve by when.

10           And then let's -- how many participants are you  
11 going to try to get to, right? So let's some targets  
12 around that. Are you helping community members with  
13 applications, right, for incentives and other things?  
14 Okay. How many -- how many do you want to -- how many can  
15 we hit? Let's set some targets and try to map those out.

16           And so we sit down with the CBOs and map these  
17 targets out and then meet with them on a monthly basis to  
18 kind of understand how they're progressing in this  
19 process. If they're having issues, how can we step in,  
20 how can we help support? Many times we'll bring a lot of  
21 the CBOs together to kind of take lessons learned. So  
22 we'll kind of be the glue that brings them together to  
23 bring best practices from each of the different regions  
24 and the work they're doing, so that everyone can advance  
25 in their mission. And so we'll track this, meet with them

1 on a monthly basis, and then we report out in our  
2 quarterly annual reports, and also in our meetings with  
3 staff on a regular basis of how these programs are  
4 progressing.

5 BOARD MEMBER TAKVORIAN: Okay. Thank you. On  
6 that, so what's your qualitative analysis for your media  
7 campaigns?

8 ROBERT BARROSA: So yeah, we look at census  
9 tracts, viewership, and there's a bunch of other metrics  
10 that we look at. I don't have all the data in front of  
11 me, but there are a set of metrics that we look at. What  
12 audiences are they reaching in the state? And so we --  
13 and we provide all that back into the reporting that we  
14 do.

15 BOARD MEMBER TAKVORIAN: But can you see whether  
16 they're having an effect about whether or not those  
17 populations are purchasing EVs more than other populations  
18 that aren't seeing that or do you --

19 ROBERT BARROSA: Yeah. I think it's -- I think  
20 it's difficult. I think we have to go back and look at  
21 the data. I don't if we've reported on that specific  
22 factor and what's driving which. It's difficult, but we  
23 can certainly get back and provide more information to you  
24 on that.

25 BOARD MEMBER TAKVORIAN: Okay. Thanks very much.

1 ROBERT BARROSA: Yeah.

2 CHAIR RANDOLPH: Dr. Shaheen.

3 BOARD MEMBER SHAHEEN: Thank you, Chair. And I'd  
4 like to thank the staff and Mr. Barrosa for your briefing.  
5 So one of the questions I have is around sustainability of  
6 the business model and ultimately the charging  
7 affordability. So the goal is to be as self-sustaining  
8 business model after the 10-year investment. One of the  
9 concerns I have is is how much the charging rate going to  
10 be? These rates are quite high for many people. And  
11 that's something I think should be on the table, in  
12 addition to many of the other discussion items. And I  
13 have a second follow-up question.

14 ROBERT BARROSA: No, absolutely. Yeah. And  
15 look, it's a -- it's a -- obviously, it's a big concern  
16 for us, right, because we want to make sure this is a  
17 sustainable business model going forward. There are a lot  
18 of other companies that are now public, that are sort of  
19 in a similar business model, and you see sort of the  
20 financial strains, and, you know, their ability to try to  
21 get to profitability is also very difficult as the -- as  
22 the market is emerging, right, and growing.

23 We have always tried to make sure we're providing  
24 simplicity in pricing, especially in these early years.  
25 You know, a lot of other companies have gone to

1 time-of-use pricing and try to, you know -- and sometimes  
2 it kind of complicate. Charging is already hard enough.  
3 I don't want to confuse customers on like, okay, is it 2  
4 o'clock, is it 3 o'clock? Should I -- you know, what  
5 should I do, right?

6           So we try to keep standard prices, you know,  
7 throughout the day and those things to help grow the  
8 market. Obviously, there are energy rates that we have to  
9 cover that are not covered by the consent decree. So the  
10 money that's raised through the stations primarily goes to  
11 cover energy, as the network grows across the country.  
12 And so -- and we see those rates going higher, right? I  
13 think we see some pretty heavy rates, you know, summer  
14 time, peak times, PG&E and SCE we're hitting \$0.55, \$0.60  
15 a kilowatt hour.

16           So that's a -- that's a -- you know, that is  
17 pretty stressful. And so one of the things we've also  
18 done is invested quite a bit in energy storage to help  
19 offset some of that energy expense. We've deployed, I  
20 think it's about 70 energy storage devices. Alongside our  
21 DC fast chargers, I want to say we are probably the  
22 world's largest deployment of energy storage along with DC  
23 fast chargers. And that's helping to keep things in  
24 check, especially from a demand charge perspective, also  
25 from least time-of-use, so that we can start to offer sort

1 of a one price all day.

2           Eventually that will change, right, to drive  
3 certain customer behavior, but certainly we've tried to  
4 keep it as simple as possible for customers. And these  
5 assets we've deployed also now provide services back to  
6 the grid. So we've actually aggregated some of these  
7 assets. Participate in the CAISO market as well as some  
8 other programs through PG&E that take advantage of the  
9 energy storage. So we're providing not only a benefit to,  
10 you know, trying to keep prices as low as possible, but  
11 also supporting the grid at the same time, because we are  
12 putting some heavy loads on the grid and we need to make  
13 sure we look at that side of the equation as well.

14           BOARD MEMBER SHAHEEN: Yeah. Thank you. I'm  
15 very interested in continuing to know more about that and  
16 I believe there's quarterly and annual reporting  
17 requirements. So I think that's something we really need  
18 to keep our eye on.

19           And then obviously, the big topic today has been  
20 the reliability in the maintenance plan. And I'm  
21 delighted to hear that you think the NEVI uptake 97  
22 percent standard is achievable for your new chargers. In  
23 terms of the legacy, I believe you were saying that  
24 approximately 90 percent uptime is your objective, is that  
25 correct?

1           ROBERT BARROSA: We'd like to get all equipment  
2 up to 97 percent, so that's our goal of overall, whatever  
3 the equipment is. That equipment varies drastically  
4 depending on time of year, things that are happening in  
5 the field, but we're trying to drive everything to 97  
6 percent and striving for that figure.

7           BOARD MEMBER SHAHEEN: Okay. So a couple just  
8 data questions, simple quick answers. So you mentioned  
9 that you wanted to upgrade 490 chargers as part of cycle  
10 4. How many legacy chargers does that leave us with in  
11 the system?

12           ROBERT BARROSA: I'd have to go back and look at  
13 the numbers. Approximately 700 at the end of -- that  
14 would be at the end of the consent decree -- by the end of  
15 the consent decree based on new station development.

16           BOARD MEMBER SHAHEEN: And the target would be to  
17 raise those as well to a 97 percent uptick?

18           ROBERT BARROSA: Yeah, it would improve  
19 reliability across the board, right.

20           BOARD MEMBER SHAHEEN: Okay. So the response  
21 time you talked about in terms of a metric, you said you  
22 had internal metrics for response time. The closest I  
23 could get to in understanding of what that metric might be  
24 seemed to be related to reducing it to a period of a day.  
25 So I think we went from 48 hours to 24 hours. So would it

1 be reasonable to use some kind of an hour metric for  
2 evaluating response time? What would be the appropriate  
3 data for that?

4 ROBERT BARROSA: Yeah. So I think looking at  
5 response times in terms of number of hours you could get  
6 out there is reasonable, absolutely.

7 BOARD MEMBER SHAHEEN: Okay. I'd love to follow  
8 up in bit more on some of these issues, but thank you for  
9 your time and questions -- answers to my questions.

10 ROBERT BARROSA: Thank you.

11 CHAIR RANDOLPH: All right. Board Member Florez.

12 BOARD MEMBER FLOREZ: Thank you. Am I the  
13 last --

14 CHAIR RANDOLPH: No. There's more people in the  
15 queue.

16 BOARD MEMBER FLOREZ: Great. I think -- first I  
17 thank you very much. I know we also had an opportunity to  
18 chat. I want to put it in context. So you are the third  
19 CEO coming to the Board within the last five years,  
20 correct?

21 ROBERT BARROSA: Yes.

22 BOARD MEMBER FLOREZ: Okay. So I mean, maybe to  
23 the Board -- when this item came up, I think my concern at  
24 that time was how are we going to view this investment?  
25 This came from obviously a big scandal of which our staff

1 rightfully caught. But I think my issue then and it is  
2 now is, you know, how would we view this investment?

3           So we knew that charging companies were going to  
4 be building at some point in time, and it's really  
5 ratcheted up, towards some deployment in the State of  
6 California. And I think at that very first hearing, we  
7 understood that Dr. Balmes' point and to my colleague's  
8 point, Diane's point, north and south seem to be the paths  
9 for our charging stations. It's east/west that they're  
10 challenged to me. And if you look at where disadvantaged  
11 communities are in the state of California is probably and  
12 east/west pattern. Most are going across towns. Most are  
13 working nearby. Most aren't driving, you know, an hour up  
14 and down I-5 or 405, there's going to be -- they're  
15 probably trying to travel, particularly in rural  
16 communities, east/west.

17           And so when this item came up, I think we had a  
18 lot of conversations with your predecessor who promised  
19 that he would be back here at the very last investment.  
20 And I kind of had a little skepticism towards that. And I  
21 think if you go back to the tape, I said you're going to  
22 be here the last investment, right? And we find ourselves  
23 with a third CEO of a company -- great company by the way  
24 that is giving us this last rendition for the last drop of  
25 \$200 million.



1 I guess my thought and to speak to Diane's point,  
2 I always felt like this investment should be the  
3 additional, the extra. Because this is a drop of dollars  
4 due to a penalty, it should be something that goes on top  
5 of. In other words, we know where electric charging  
6 companies are not going to build. We really do. I bet if  
7 we got a list of free school lunch programs and we  
8 overlaid charging stations, on top of that free school  
9 lunch program map, we'd find very little charging  
10 stations, if any.

11 Why is that? Because there's no incentive for  
12 these companies to build and what I think they believe is  
13 really not quote "a market", a place where communities  
14 have not yet adopted. And so the Board was struggling  
15 with how do we get those communities to adopt. The CEC  
16 has got a program. We've got thoughts. How do we get  
17 more people of color, get more disadvantaged communities  
18 to move to the next level of charging. And yet, the  
19 companies themselves and -- are moving in a different  
20 direction. You know, we know Kettleman City. We know the  
21 large places where people are going San Francisco to Los  
22 Angeles. I can tell you there a lot of those. We know  
23 the affluent communities near Ms. Takvorian's area. You  
24 know, we know where those are. You know, they're probably  
25 not likely to be in, you know, El Centro. They're

1 probably likely to be in Encinitas.

2 I guess my question to the Board and maybe to you  
3 is if you look at this final last drop of 200 million and  
4 a deployment of, let's say, 500 new chargers, I'm not sure  
5 we really do know whether that 35 percent that's been  
6 mentioned is really going to not -- but 35 percent is a  
7 great goal. It would produce a lot in communities of  
8 color. But what -- how can you -- this is kind of the  
9 same question I asked your first predecessor. How can we  
10 be assured that at the end of the day, the monthly  
11 check-in with our staff, everything that's pointed out in  
12 the resolution, all of the kind of the bells and whistles  
13 that at least staff will get to see -- because I believe  
14 this may be our last hearing on this item.

15 Staff is the one that really gets to evaluate in  
16 some sense. And I'm sure we're going to ask Mr. Cliff to  
17 come back at some point and say how did it go? But how do  
18 we know that you'll come through on the 35 percent. I  
19 mean, what's the specific plan? And I appreciate the  
20 overlay. And I did see some of those communities it looks  
21 like made greater progress than the past two CEOs. But  
22 just kind of maybe give me and the Board a thought process  
23 on how that's going to be achieved.

24 ROBERT BARROSA: Yeah. So first -- to address  
25 your first question.

1 BOARD MEMBER FLOREZ: Sure.

2 ROBERT BARROSA: I've Been with the company since  
3 2018.

4 BOARD MEMBER FLOREZ: Okay.

5 ROBERT BARROSA: So I just didn't appear on the  
6 stage. And I've been electrification for over -- well  
7 over 15 years now. I started my career fast charging  
8 forklifts, if you can believe that, lead acid batteries  
9 back in the day. So I've been in the world of  
10 electrification and believe in it dearly. And I'm  
11 committed to this space. Giovanni Palazzo has not gone  
12 away. He's the chairman of our board. We were texting  
13 just before this and -- to get prepared. So he's very  
14 much involved in the business, and in the process, and in  
15 this investment.

16 In terms of, you know, making sure we continue  
17 this progress, right, I think we set great relationships  
18 up with staff to really look at our investments and where  
19 they're going, right, and identifying where our  
20 achievements are and highlighting where our achievements  
21 are not, right?

22 BOARD MEMBER FLOREZ: Um-hmm.

23 ROBERT BARROSA: And I don'T think we shy away  
24 from those. And so we're always continually looking to  
25 see how we can do better, right? We have the 35 percent

1 target. We've been able to achieve 55. Obviously, I  
2 think there's some question of like, well, let's really  
3 dig into that and see, okay, if you get down to the micro  
4 level. That's at the macro. Now, let's get to the micro  
5 and look at certain areas in San Diego or other regions,  
6 right, are we really addressing those areas?

7           And it those are -- those are tough, you know,  
8 ones to look at and see how we can make investments there.  
9 But the nice thing to see is that I think overall, right,  
10 you know, when we look at to cycle one, there were very  
11 few CCS vehicles out on the market, right? We really  
12 needed to figure out how are we going to spur growth  
13 overall to try to meet the State's goals, right? And we  
14 did that in a way that was fair and balanced in terms of  
15 making sure we take care of our rural, and low-income, and  
16 disadvantaged communities, right, while we're making  
17 investments in other areas in the state.

18           And we've seen that growth in the marketplace now  
19 and the 25 percent new vehicles sold being electric, which  
20 is fantastic. And so we've got to continue that progress,  
21 right, to continue to look at these investments, take  
22 these census data, data tracts, and other things looking  
23 at the network map and take those into account when we do  
24 our investments. And that's exactly what we do. We've  
25 taken that to heart. We've institutionalized. It's part

1 of our rubric when we make our investments. And so we'll  
2 continue to do that and strive to hit the largest targets  
3 possible.

4 BOARD MEMBER FLOREZ: Okay. Maybe just a last  
5 comment. I think most of the Board members spoke to the  
6 disadvantaged community question. I guess for staff, as  
7 we hear the next round of folks and public comment, we are  
8 going to be voting on this resolution. And I just wanted  
9 to ask a question for you, given this resolution has to do  
10 with this. Do you have any problems with us adding and  
11 incorporating a similar report from Electrify America on  
12 low-income and disadvantaged communities, because our  
13 resolution right now remember speak to "strive towards."

14 And those are great words, but it isn't really  
15 specific to I think what this Board wants to see and  
16 measure. And, you know, I think one of the -- what is  
17 that famous saying, you know, what gets measured, gets  
18 managed, right? So if we can't measure it and if we're  
19 asking you to strive for it -- it's just maybe the  
20 mismatch of language. Diane mentioned earlier like being  
21 suspect of the 35 percent, because I don't think anything  
22 to date is somewhat measurable in the metrics that you're  
23 tack about. We're fixing old ones. We're upgrading  
24 others. We're taking 91 million -- or 81 million for  
25 upgrades out of a total of 91 million for new. Ninety-one

1 gets us how many, like 500 chargers or something of that  
2 sort, but yet, we're spending half the dollars to just  
3 upgrade cycle 1 and 2 chargers.

4           So we're not building anymore chargers. We're  
5 actually upgrading, which are great. We just heard about  
6 the reliability issues. Those need to happen. But I  
7 think in our minds, when this money was looked at towards  
8 infrastructure, it was building many, many chargers with  
9 the entire maximum amount, knowing you still had to do  
10 maintenance. But this is a very large number. It's  
11 almost 30 percent where you're now going back cycle 1 and  
12 2 and actually retrofitting, expanding. Those are all  
13 great goals, but now we're down to the last 500, right?  
14 Now, we're actually down to the last 200 million.

15           So I would like to, as we're doing this -- maybe  
16 Mr. Cliff talk and maybe talk to the Chair as well looking  
17 at some additional language -- and I know how staff feels  
18 about last minute language on resolutions, but I think  
19 this would be very simple. And I'll just as -- before we  
20 get to the comment, let me just read it. It would  
21 basically say to the very last paragraph to the  
22 resolution, "Additionally, incorporate a similar report on  
23 Electrify America's website regarding the charging  
24 stations situated in low-income and disadvantaged  
25 communities. And it would provide details on the number

1 of stations in these areas accompanied by maps  
2 illustrating their locations and identifying any existing  
3 public stations within these communities."

4           It is just a furtherance and a little more micro  
5 down, at least for me, to vote for this resolution,  
6 because it feels like that's measurable, it's tangible,  
7 and it's a little bit more than strive for, which I think  
8 is super important. And I just -- you know, as CEO, do  
9 you have any issues with that type of language from your  
10 perspective?

11           ROBERT BARROSA: Well, look, I think we set to  
12 strive for a 35 percent goal.

13           BOARD MEMBER FLOREZ: Sure.

14           ROBERT BARROSA: And we've overachieved that  
15 goal, right? We took it seriously --

16           BOARD MEMBER FLOREZ: Yeah.

17           ROBERT BARROSA: -- whether it's hard or strive,  
18 however you want to term it, and we've moved forward on it  
19 and continued to do that. So we've demonstrated and  
20 hopefully we've built some trust that we continue to  
21 execute in that -- in that arena. There is already I  
22 believe quite a bit we report in the annual and quarterly  
23 report in terms of our investments as they relate to  
24 LIC/DAC.

25           So I would look first towards, you know, the data

1 the we share with staff and how that's incorporated,  
2 because it may answer a lot of the questions that you  
3 already have in terms of seeing the data. And so I would  
4 suggest we start there and look at that.

5 BOARD MEMBER FLOREZ: So the -- just that the  
6 answer is yes or no?

7 ROBERT BARROSA: I think what we've established  
8 35 -- is a strive to 35 percent. And so I think from  
9 Electrify America's viewpoint, that's accurate.

10 BOARD MEMBER FLOREZ: Yeah.

11 ROBERT BARROSA: And we continue to achieve that  
12 and we continue to report on those metrics.

13 BOARD MEMBER FLOREZ: Got it. I guess the issue  
14 I'm having - I don't know about the Board members - is  
15 that striving -- it sounds like we've committed to 35  
16 percent. We don't see -- we see the commitment to 35  
17 percent, but we don't see the actual roadmap - no pun  
18 intended - in terms of what specifically that looks like  
19 on an ongoing basis on the monthly meetings you'll have  
20 with our staff. I think if we know -- if we have some  
21 sense of that, it will allow us to measure your progress,  
22 but more importantly it will help I think us to also  
23 manage what we think is the most -- probably I think the  
24 most important thing about this settlement is having the  
25 ability to build in disadvantaged communities where maybe



1 other companies won't go.

2           And then not to say that you shouldn't do what  
3 other companies are doing, but remember these are  
4 settlement dollars due to a violation. And I always have  
5 felt under this agreement, we should mandate that you  
6 build in those areas, because this is not a compet -- you  
7 can build with your own anywhere you want. But for these  
8 dollars, it feels like it should go specifically towards  
9 those communities that don't have a chance in the regular  
10 marketplace to ever get a charging station. To me, you're  
11 our last hope with these settlement dollars. So I think  
12 the goal is to try to measure that. So please consider it  
13 as we have public comment. Thank you.

14           CHAIR RANDOLPH: Okay. We have two more. Board  
15 Member Guerra and then Board Member Hurt.

16           BOARD MEMBER GUERRA: Thank you, Chair.  
17 Appreciate it and appreciate my colleagues for asking a  
18 lot of questions. And so at least on the disadvantaged  
19 communities, you know, I'm hopeful and optimistic that we  
20 hit the 35 mark and beyond that. But I think that if and  
21 when we hit that mark, what I still have concern is is  
22 that the communities that will be dependent upon the  
23 infrastructure. And what we see here today again is the  
24 lack of specificity in the maintenance plan. And in  
25 general on a resolution like this, I probably wouldn't be

1 as concerned. Tend to be larger in scope very directive  
2 to staff. But, you know, in our conversation I first  
3 wanted to say thanks for -- thank you bringing to light  
4 the changes from a 48-hour response time to a 26-hour  
5 response time.

6 But I think -- you know, in thinking about this  
7 today is I worry that we leave today in our last  
8 opportunity to really hold some accountability on making  
9 sure that those that are in disadvantaged communities that  
10 are looking at this as another option of reliability, of  
11 lower transportation costs for them, particularly as the  
12 new used car market comes in on electric vehicles, that  
13 the lack of maintenance will continue to do great.

14 And so -- and I -- and while it's laudable that  
15 26 hours is a response -- a quick response time, when you  
16 have locations where there are only four chargers and one  
17 is down, that's only three, but many times you may have  
18 two down. And so I think that the -- this flat response  
19 of, you know, when something is down, there needs to be a  
20 I bigger response or a different way to recognize when we  
21 need to respond quicker to particular stations.

22 If you have a charging station with 10 chargers  
23 and is one down, that's different than one -- four when  
24 one is down. And particularly, and I think about it in my  
25 own council district, where there -- we have some of the

1 four-unit charging stations, those lines can be long. And  
2 I -- and when I think about who is using these type of  
3 charging stations, it is generally working families. And  
4 so I think about my commute this morning and I had two  
5 very upset toddlers who were, you know, waiting to get to  
6 school. And even on the return home there at their final  
7 part of their day and they're trying to get to a location,  
8 26 hours, 26 hours is a very, very long time.

9           And so I think for me the concern that I have,  
10 maybe a question for the Board here and Chair, and I think  
11 you brought it up Chair in the beginning is given the  
12 resolution, you know, what -- you know, what level of  
13 specificity should we be adding in for accountability and  
14 oversight when it comes to the maintenance plan. And so  
15 let me -- let me bring that as an open-ended question.  
16 This is a public hearing. Your comments are on the  
17 record, but there have been three prior CEOs, and so we  
18 take that into effect.

19           So let me stop there and say, you know, should we  
20 be adding more specificity in this maintenance plan. And  
21 particularly in our conversation, I worry about the  
22 subcontractors and the agreements that you have with your  
23 contractors to their responsiveness to fix these  
24 locations. And that may be extremely micromanaging of a  
25 resolution, but that's almost down to the point where

1 we're at is how are we ensuring that we have immediate  
2 responsiveness on this in areas where you -- where you --  
3 where you have such limited charging?

4           Finally, I'll just say thank you for recognizing  
5 the fact that bigger is better, more charging stations,  
6 more availability. We're doing a lot of that. But this  
7 hearing today is about the issues with maintenance of the  
8 EA system here. So let me ask that, Mr. Barrosa.

9           ROBERT BARROSA: No. Absolutely. Thank you for  
10 your comments. And look, much of the network across  
11 California are four-stall sites, right? It wasn't more  
12 towards the end of cycle 3 that we started building  
13 six-stall, some eight-stall sites, right, and you're  
14 starting see more of those. And that's where we want to  
15 progress, right, because, you know, just using Tesla as a  
16 proxy, they sort of double down, right, build bigger,  
17 build everywhere, build out -- built that confidence.

18           Yeah, because even if you have all four chargers  
19 perfectly working, there's still a line of cars and you're  
20 still waiting. So again, that's not a great customer  
21 experience, but, you know, we're living in a world where  
22 we're seeing, you know, half the station -- almost half  
23 the stations now at 40 percent or above utilization. So  
24 there's got to be some sort of pressure relief here at  
25 some point to drive a better customer experience, right,

1 so that's one aspect

2           The maintenance aspect absolutely, right? And so  
3 we've been putting things in place. We're -- like, it  
4 doesn't -- it does us no good to have a broken charger,  
5 right, at all, right? We're -- our -- you know, we're  
6 aligned in terms of driving, right, uptime performance to  
7 the highest degree possible. And we're doing that, right,  
8 making the investments, like I've talked about, you know,  
9 training materials, videos, how-tos, so that we can work  
10 with our subcontractors and other service providers to  
11 train more techs to bring them on so we can continue to  
12 increase performance as we live in this world. Right now,  
13 we're carrying a pretty heavy load as market adoption  
14 increases.

15           And so that forces us as a business to try to  
16 increase things where we can and improve performance  
17 overall. And we'll continue to do that. We're committed  
18 to doing that. We want to see improved performance in  
19 areas where we just can't get there or it's sort of a this  
20 thing is a lemon now. We've got to move on and we need to  
21 make an upgrade to ensure better preponderance,  
22 absolutely. Especially if it's a site that maybe we can't  
23 expand and it's a four-charger site and its heavily  
24 utilized. Okay. Well, it's going to be there. Well,  
25 let's upgrade it to the latest equipment, get better

1 performance. We're still going to be have long lines.  
2 That's not going to go away until we get more charging out  
3 there.

4 BOARD MEMBER GUERRA: Well, shouldn't we have  
5 more specificity in the maintenance plan? I mean, it  
6 almost would seem to me it's a benefit to you when you're  
7 working with your subcontractors saying this is what the  
8 State is requiring us --

9 ROBERT BARROSA: Um-hmm.

10 BOARD MEMBER GUERRA: -- for us to be more  
11 responsiveness. And I guess that's my worry here. I  
12 don't want this -- maybe this is a question for our Board,  
13 but I would hate that today becomes a rubber stamp for a  
14 maintenance plan that says trust us. You know, I guess  
15 the question is how do we verify? That, to me -- that, to  
16 me, is the last point. So should we not have more  
17 specificity in the maintenance plans on how Electrify  
18 America is going to execute this?

19 CHAIR RANDOLPH: And I'm going to jump in here,  
20 because I think we've heard this point from several Board  
21 members and I think it's a really critical point. And I  
22 think, as we, you know, finish up the comments and for  
23 Board questions and then hear public comment, maybe staff  
24 can be thinking about like, you know, what are some  
25 options here, because I do hear that folks want to see

1 more specificity in the maintenance plans. So why don't  
2 we kind of mull that over as we are finishing our  
3 dialogue.

4 BOARD MEMBER GUERRA: Thank you.

5 CHAIR RANDOLPH: Board Member Hurt.

6 BOARD MEMBER HURT: What can be said going last?  
7 (Laughter).

8 BOARD MEMBER HURT: Well, I'll start off by  
9 saying that I appreciate the leadership of Electrify  
10 America continuing to invest in our zero-emission  
11 transformation. I think, for me, my concerns this year  
12 are really based on reliability, maintenance, and  
13 partnerships, and in those areas, focusing on metrics,  
14 transparency, and auditing. And I agree with many of the  
15 comments that have already been said.

16 I am going to vote in favor of this, because I  
17 want to get the money out. I want to get the money out.  
18 I want it on the ground and I want people working. But we  
19 do need to tighten up the maintenance plan, because the  
20 numbers are just hard for me to understand. This  
21 investment that you have moving forward is a response to  
22 being bad actors. And so there's a need for there to be  
23 teeth and strength around the maintenance plan and the  
24 metrics.

25 And not just being, but being better is, I think,

1 what the whole community is really looking for in  
2 Electrify America and giving back to the community who's  
3 been harmed in this process. When I see 40 percent  
4 utilization, that seems extremely low to me out of 100.  
5 So can we talk about that some more? Can we understand  
6 that some more?

7           When I hear how long it takes to get chargers  
8 back online, I think, gosh, the maintenance division needs  
9 to be bigger and better. When I hear that we have 700 old  
10 chargers, or legacy chargers, we've got a future where  
11 there's a lot of work that needs to be done. And I am  
12 very concerned about some of our priority communities that  
13 have been left behind that are mostly impacted by sources,  
14 freeways, and what we're doing to uplift them to be a part  
15 of this transformation.

16           So I hope and I'm looking to staff right now to  
17 see if we can do more when it comes to the maintenance  
18 plan. I think we have authority to do more and I think we  
19 need to take that authority and use it at this time. And  
20 that means more specificity. That means really getting  
21 towards those chargers that are quote/unquote legacy, how  
22 is that going to happen, how is that money going to be  
23 spent, and making a plan to make sure that it happens.

24           Again, I do really appreciate all the work that  
25 you all have done, but there's more that absolutely has to



1 be done. I would say -- you spoke a little bit about over  
2 a hundred sites have been identified for the future and  
3 I'd like to know whether you're coordinating with the  
4 local and regional associations of government to see what  
5 it is that they're also planning and thinking about and  
6 whether there can be partnerships there to work together.

7 ROBERT BARROSA: Yeah. In terms of outreach with  
8 stakeholders, right, as part of our national outreach  
9 plan, and we hold webinars and other things with all sorts  
10 of community members to talk about our investment plan as  
11 we move forward, so -- and we take a lot of those inputs  
12 into account when we develop the cycle 4 plan. And we  
13 continue to engage where we can or where possible, right,  
14 to talk about our investment in what we're doing and what  
15 we're doing in those local communities.

16 BOARD MEMBER HURT: I would say it's probably not  
17 enough to just kind of have a community meeting and ask  
18 people to come. I would tell you many of the cities and  
19 counties are extremely busy. I think it really takes an  
20 extra direct walk over to say let's discuss. This is  
21 where we're talking about putting chargers. Where do you  
22 see the need? Because some of these entities have been --  
23 have been researching and thinking about this for years.  
24 And so I think it would behoove you to speak directly to  
25 the local cities and regional entities.

1           And I guess that is all for me. I just -- if we  
2 could, just looking back again at the staff, can we have a  
3 better maintenance plan and just more metrics and move  
4 forward with really ensuring that these are reliable.

5           CHAIR RANDOLPH: Okay. You were not the last  
6 one. We have two Board members who are remote who would  
7 like to ask questions and then we do want to get public  
8 comment. So I'm going to call on Board member Eisenhut  
9 and then Supervisor Vargas.

10           BOARD MEMBER EISENHUT: Yeah. Thank you, Chair.  
11 This time slot seems to have morphed into a comment  
12 period, so I wanted to follow that -- follow that thread.

13           I also will vote to support this motion. I look  
14 forward to a more robust possibility or language with  
15 regard to the metrics of maintenance. In a -- in a slight  
16 shift of emphasis, I'd like to hear from staff about the  
17 lessons we have learned in this process since we've been  
18 very, very intimately involved with at least one, in this  
19 case Electrify America, provider of charging stations,  
20 what lessons we have learned, how those lessons are  
21 applicable to the charging infrastructure as a whole, and  
22 what our role might or could be in implementing those  
23 lessons.

24           CHAIR RANDOLPH: I think that's a great question.  
25 I want to table it for a couple minutes and let Supervisor

1 Vargas ask her question, then do public comment. We'll  
2 let Mr. Barrosa sit down. And then I would love to hear  
3 from staff, because I think that's a great question  
4 it's -- it will be interesting to hear the response.

5 BOARD MEMBER EISENHUT: Okay. Thank you.

6 CHAIR RANDOLPH: So Supervisor Vargas.

7 BOARD MEMBER VARGAS: Thank you. I think most of  
8 my colleagues have already shared some of my concerns,  
9 particularly in communities of color. I think the part  
10 that -- and maybe I might have missed it, but -- so the  
11 relationship with some of the non-profits that are doing  
12 some of this work already as well, and if there's any  
13 relationship that are taking place because I -- because of  
14 their connection to community as well in addition to  
15 everything that's been said. So it is a question  
16 specifically.

17 ROBERT BARROSA: Yeah, absolutely. So every  
18 cycle we go through an RFP process to select different  
19 community-based organizations and specific projects they  
20 have, and we'll select those. So we've had a few in cycle  
21 3. Ecology Action, Valley CAN are a couple that come to  
22 mind. And so we'll go through that same process as we  
23 look to cycle 4 and then work with them to develop the  
24 metrics by which we'll measure their activities and report  
25 that out through the quarterly and annual report.

1           BOARD MEMBER VARGAS: So I guess my suggestion  
2 would be, and I -- and, you know, I understand that this  
3 is the question period, but maybe trying to identify those  
4 spaces where, you know, using the data of where the --  
5 what we have underinvested in communities where you can --  
6 you can tell that it's important for us to work with those  
7 organizations, that understand those communities, and the  
8 communities that are going to be mostly impacted. It  
9 seems like that would be a good direction to be able to  
10 reach out to, you know, those that are in need.

11           ROBERT BARROSA: Okay. We'll take that.

12           CHAIR RANDOLPH: Supervisor Perez.

13           BOARD MEMBER PEREZ: Just very quickly, Madam  
14 Chair and colleagues. And you know, once again, a lot of  
15 great questions, a lot of great points. And this might  
16 have been already stated out loud, but I'm just wondering  
17 about timelines. As far as reliability is concerned, how  
18 soon can we start seeing these changes for example? And  
19 then as well, mapping, if you will, of what exists already  
20 and what potentially is going to exist in the future,  
21 especially in communities of color, because I think those  
22 one-pagers, if you will, or that information in which  
23 people might not have access to over a website or over  
24 technology, that's where I think our non-profits that  
25 supervisor Vargas is discussing could share with folks on

1 the ground. So it's just a couple points that I'm not  
2 sure I heard about -- if I heard anyone express those or  
3 those were answered, but I just wanted to put that out  
4 there. Thank you.

5 ROBERT BARROSA: Yeah, certainly. So all our  
6 stations are all online. We feed that through a variety  
7 of channels so it gets out into the public sphere. The  
8 DOE has the alternative fuels database that we publish  
9 there. Other third-party entities like PlugShare, A  
10 Better Route Planner, they pull feeds from the alternative  
11 fuels database. We actually provide a lot of direct feeds  
12 to the automakers, so it goes right into their telematics  
13 on the vehicle itself. So we try to get that information  
14 out as broadly as possible.

15 In terms of where we're putting the next stations  
16 and our selections, right, we start with zones and then we  
17 start coming down. And then once we get to a place where,  
18 you know, in coordination with local officials, utilities,  
19 really trying to figure out is there power, can we build  
20 on a site, right? Then once we get to that stage, then we  
21 identify the exact location where we would be building.

22 CHAIR RANDOLPH: Okay. Thank you very much, Mr.  
23 Barrosa for that lengthy Q&A period. It is now time for  
24 public comment. Board clerk, will you please call the  
25 public commenters?

1 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Yes. We'll start with our  
2 in-person commenters for this item. I believe we have  
3 seven. The first commenter will be Kyle Williams.

4 KYLE WILLIAMS: A bit of a walk up. Sorry.

5 Good morning, CARB Board members and staff.  
6 Thank you for the opportunity to speak today on the  
7 Electrify America cycle 4 ZEV investment plan. My name is  
8 Kyle Williams. I represent Pearce Renewables as the  
9 senior leader of our EV Services Division, the maintenance  
10 guy. I wish I had more than two minutes to talk to you  
11 all.

12 Pearce is a California-based field services  
13 company and the largest independent service provider of  
14 nationwide services for mission critical energy  
15 infrastructure including EV charging, battery energy  
16 storage, wind and solar. Specifically, regarding our EV  
17 services, my organization has partnered with Electrify  
18 America to provide maintenance and repair services  
19 throughout the state of California and nationwide.

20 CARB's commitments to programs like this from  
21 Electrify America have created significant employment  
22 opportunities and allowed Pearce to build a diverse,  
23 local, and highly skilled workforce. At Pearce alone, we  
24 have 616 employees residing in the state of California,  
25 including myself, which has created opportunities for 367

1 employees who live in California's low-income and  
2 disadvantaged communities. I'd love to note additionally  
3 of the 616, 227 of our employees are made up of veterans  
4 who have proudly served the U.S. military, including  
5 myself.

6           Given my Organization's over 12 years of efforts  
7 in the ZEV industry totaling hundreds of thousands of  
8 touchpoints across all major brands, makes, and models of  
9 chargers, coupled with my personal nearly three years of  
10 experience as a senior leader within Tesla's Energy  
11 Division, I believe I can offer this Board a unique  
12 perspective on just how challenging our collective mission  
13 is to ensure the swift and successful transition to our  
14 state's infrastructure to renewable energy sources.

15           Simply put, the challenges discussed here today  
16 are not unique to Electrify America. And all major charge  
17 point operators are dealing with the same problems, past,  
18 present, or future. And while our work is far from over,  
19 I strongly believe that the Electrify America team has  
20 been a critically important leader in driving the  
21 evolution of higher quality of hardware, technology, and  
22 training standards that are undoubtedly benefiting the  
23 entire EV industry as a whole.

24           Is that a fire alarm or me?

25           Okay.

1 I'll wrap it up. Mostly notably among these  
2 benefits, our collaborative partnership Electrify America  
3 has enabled us to develop a training and workforce career  
4 development program --

5 CHAIR RANDOLPH: Mr. Williams, sorry, your time  
6 is up, so --

7 KYLE WILLIAMS: Oh, okay.

8 CHAIR RANDOLPH: Yeah. Feel free to submit a  
9 written comment.

10 KYLE WILLIAMS: Will do. Thank you. Appreciate  
11 it.

12 CHAIR RANDOLPH: Thank you.

13 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Thank you.

14 Next, we'll hear from David Silberfarb. And I  
15 apologize in advance if I mispronounce anyone's name.

16 DAVID SILBERFARB: My name is --

17 CHAIR RANDOLPH: Mic. Turn on the mic.

18 DAVID SILBERFARB: All right. Yes. You  
19 pronounced it perfect. Thank you. And thank you to the  
20 board for allowing me to come here and speak. I am David  
21 Silberfarb from BTC Power. I'm our EVP of Operations  
22 focusing on our field service and repair of our charging  
23 stations. So it's been a big topic of today and I wanted  
24 to give you my perspective on things.

25 We've been a partner with Electrify America since



1 cycle 1. We've been to several of these meetings and, you  
2 know, we've been making hardware with them since the  
3 beginning. And they've been really key to our growth and  
4 supporting us when we were a small company, like Mr.  
5 Barrosa spoke about. They've been instrumental to our  
6 growth and really supported us. We're headquartered in  
7 Santa Ana, California. We have -- most of our employees  
8 are California-based employees. And, you know, it's just  
9 been a great partnership with Electrify America.

10           They've been really key to our new hardware, when  
11 a lot has been discussed about, that is driving toward 98  
12 percent uptime is what we're -- our goal is. We want to  
13 exceed the 97 percent. We call this our gen 4 hardware.  
14 And Electrify America has been instrumental in supporting  
15 us in developing this hardware, their investment in us,  
16 their labs. We're really worked closely together to get  
17 this hardware in and installed. They've helped us set up  
18 training facilities. We've trained over 50 companies and  
19 over 300 technicians, most of them based in California, to  
20 help keep the uptime of the machine working. They've  
21 worked with us to make our new hardware more serviceable,  
22 so that it can be fixed easier, so that we can really meet  
23 some of the timelines that we're discussing and fixing it,  
24 just so a tech can roll in, swap a part, and move on. And  
25 I'm just here to ask you to please approve their proposal.

1           And I thank you for your time.

2           BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Thank you.

3           Tom Knox.

4           TOM KNOX: Good morning, Chair and Board members.  
5 I'm Tom Knox Valley Clean Air Now speaking in support of  
6 the cycle 4 proposal. Valley CAN has been working closely  
7 with Electrify America since 2018 on both their ZEV  
8 outreach and education program as well as their STEM  
9 Education Grant Program.

10           Electrify America funding for ZEV outreach in  
11 disadvantaged communities has been a critical part of the  
12 growth and success of Clean Cars 4 All in San Joaquin  
13 Valley. Their funding and collaboration enabled the two  
14 most effective elements of our outreach program, namely  
15 right and drive events hosted by Charge Across Town,  
16 featuring affordable used ZEVs and community clinics held  
17 up to four nights per week throughout the valley where  
18 low-income drivers get face-to-face help in qualifying for  
19 Clean Cars 4 All.

20           Within weeks of adding ride and drives and  
21 community clinics in late 2018, our application completion  
22 rate tripled, while our demographic Remained very  
23 disadvantaged. Since then, we've hosted hundreds of ride  
24 and drives and community clinics, which has resulted in an  
25 organic awareness throughout the valley that used ZEVs are

1 a real solution for low-income drivers. That organic  
2 awareness is a key factor in thousands of valley residents  
3 switching to ZEV.

4 In addition, Electrify America was an early  
5 supporter of our collaboration of community college  
6 automotive programs to develop ZEV maintenance training,  
7 which has now expanded to EVSE maintenance training. We  
8 believe that expanding all types of ZEV maintenance  
9 training to all community college automotive programs  
10 statewide is an important part of an equitable ZEV  
11 transition.

12 Valley CAN respectfully requests that the Board  
13 approve the cycle 4 plan, which will continue the strong  
14 results they've accomplished for ZEV awareness and  
15 workforce development in cycles 1 through 3.

16 Thank you.

17 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Thank you.

18 Frank Meza.

19 FRANK MEZA: Hi. My name is Frank Meza. I'm the  
20 CEO and founder of BTC Power. We've grown from a  
21 basically a minority business enterprise and we've been in  
22 electrification for over 20 years. And today, we are now  
23 one of the main suppliers for Electrify America. So this  
24 topic about reliability is a -- really, you know, it goes  
25 to the core of what we're -- what we're doing, you know.

1           We've been with EA since cycle 1, cycle 2, and  
2 cycle 3, hopefully now into cycle 4. Yes, when we  
3 initially started, our uptime availability was hovering in  
4 the 90 percent range. But today, yes, our goal is to  
5 reach 98 percent. And typically with our new product, our  
6 generation 4 product, that was in essence funded by the  
7 production orders that Electrify America gave us, now it's  
8 consistently above 97 percent, but our internal goal is 98  
9 percent.

10           And so when we talk about reliability and  
11 maintenance, the ultimate way for -- you know, to achieve  
12 the maintenance that we need is never have the charger  
13 break. And that's what we're trying actually to do. And  
14 we live, eat and, breathe this. We deal with the -- all  
15 the echelons of management at Electrify America. They're  
16 all deeply involved in the day-to-day maintenance of the  
17 chargers. And I'm here to request approval for the last  
18 cycle, cycle 4.

19           Thank you.

20           BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Thank you.

21           Ricardo Alvarado.

22           RICARDO ALVARADO: Good morning. My wife and I  
23 are EV drivers and I just wanted to be here and listen to  
24 everything that's going on with Electrify America. I just  
25 wanted to thank you all. It's been very educational. And

1 I can just say that you guys can't put them out there fast  
2 enough, so if the Board would approve this.

3 The complaints that my neighbors and I have is  
4 that there's not enough chargers to go around. We have a  
5 level 2 in our home, but, you know, sometimes that takes  
6 too long and we have to get to our workplace and be able  
7 to get to a charger that can get us out there in 20  
8 minutes. That would be great. Thank you.

9 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Thank you.

10 Amy Lilly.

11 AMY LILLY: Hello. Thank you for the opportunity  
12 to speak today. My name is Amy Lilly and I'm speaking on  
13 behalf of Mercedes-Benz U.S.A.

14 We support Electrify America's cycle 4 California  
15 ZEV plan and its approval by the Board today, so that  
16 investment can begin as soon as possible. Mercedes-Benz  
17 continues to pursue a path towards emission-free driving.  
18 And today, we offer five electric vehicles for sale in the  
19 U.S., two of which are produced in the United States.  
20 Soon our electric Sprinter will be available and we have  
21 many more to come in the near future. As we expand our  
22 product offerings and as consumer adoption increases, one  
23 thing remains clear, chargers must keep pace with the  
24 ongoing interaction of ZEV vehicles.

25 Indeed, Mercedes-Benz is rolling out our own

1 charging network, but Electrify America's plans are  
2 critical to complement our efforts. Chargers also need to  
3 be strategically placed. Furthermore, we believe that  
4 charger reliability, charger upgrades, and charger  
5 maintenance are also very important. Electrify America's  
6 plan addresses these three critical areas.

7           Like most of the industry, Mercedes-Benz is  
8 moving to adopt the North American Charging Standard, or  
9 NACS for our BEV vehicles. We embrace of Electrify  
10 America's plans to continue to support the CCS-1 plug  
11 standard and to offer NACS connectors at both new and  
12 legacy stations

13           In summary, Mercedes-Benz U.S.A. is firmly  
14 committed to bringing EVs to market, but we need charging  
15 in every community in California in order to enable and  
16 expedite EV adoption. Therefore, we ask that the Board  
17 approve Electrify America's cycle 4 investment plan.

18           I want to go off my script though and say this  
19 has been such a great conversation today. You brought up  
20 so many important topics. Thank you all for raising them.  
21 And we need reliable stations. And thank you, Electrify  
22 America, for all your work. Thank you for considering my  
23 comments.

24           BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Thank you.

25           Carleen Cullen.

1 CARLEEN CULLEN: Thank you. My name is Carleen  
2 Cullen. I'm the founder and the Executive Director of the  
3 Cool the Earth. A 2018 campaign policy advisor for  
4 Governor Newsom and on the ChargeX Consortium.

5 I urge CARB to reject Electrify America's plan  
6 due to widespread evidence of station failures and  
7 customer dissatisfaction, particularly impacting those in  
8 our equity communities who rely most on public charging.

9 Recommendations. Reject the plan.

10 Number two, prioritize station replacement and  
11 maintenance. From the \$80 million allocated for existing  
12 sites, note that only 25 million is for station  
13 replacements with the rest for operations, maintenance,  
14 and demand fees. CARB should work with Electrify America  
15 to remove the \$25 million cap, prioritizing replacement of  
16 stations from all cycles with gen 4 models, although these  
17 also have real reliability issues. New stations and  
18 demand sheets -- fees should follow using any remaining  
19 funds.

20 Three, develop specific metrics. EA should  
21 use -- EA should submit detailed metrics in the selection  
22 methodology with CARB staff ensuring these metrics  
23 identify all performing station -- all underperforming  
24 stations. Excuse me.

25 Fourth, enforce penalties. Implement consent

1 decrease penalties from the time underperforming stations  
2 are decommissioned to the ones that are now operational.  
3 The focus should be on reliability. The expected increase  
4 in stations fueled by Tesla, State, and federal  
5 investments will expand availability.

6 Other issues that contribute to station  
7 congestion are EA's broken stations, slow power delivery,  
8 and possibly their business practice of offering free  
9 charging to drivers who -- with select popular vehicles  
10 from Ford, Kia, Hyundai, and three companies from the  
11 Volkswagen Group itself, including the ID4, Audi, and  
12 Porsche.

13 I urge the Board to match investment in Clean  
14 Cars 4 All with reliable charging stations.

15 Thank you.

16 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Thank you.

17 That concludes our in-person commenters. I'll  
18 turn it over to our Zoom commenters. We currently have 21  
19 hands raised. If you would like to speak on this item,  
20 please virtually raise your hand.

21 So the first few commenters will be Munni  
22 Krishna, Sara Baumann, Wendy Chou, Maureen Blanc, Ralph  
23 Megna, and Susannah Saunders.

24 So Munni, I have activated your microphone.  
25 Please unmute and begin.



1           MUNNI KRISHNA: Thank you. Good morning, Chair  
2 Randolph, members of the Board, and staff. My name is  
3 Munni Krishna and I'm speaking today in my capacity as  
4 Veloz's Senior Director of Business Development. Veloz is  
5 a California based 501(c)(3) non-profit based in  
6 Sacramento that is driving towards 100 percent  
7 zero-emission vehicles here in California and nationwide.  
8 Electrify America, along with 39 other organizations in  
9 the ZEV industry, is a member of Veloz and their President  
10 and CEO, Rob Barrosa, serves on our leadership board.

11           Veloz is pleased today to support Electrify  
12 America's cycle 4 ZEV investment plan. I'd like to speak  
13 briefly about the value to California and its people.  
14 This cycle 4 investment plan proposes to invest \$172  
15 million in charging infrastructure, which will augment  
16 \$384 million in NEVI funding, as well as funding being  
17 made available by the California Energy Commission and  
18 local governments. These efforts, in tandem, will play a  
19 critical role in California's efforts to reach its  
20 ambitious climate and air quality goals by removing a lack  
21 of reliable public charging infrastructure as one of the  
22 main barriers to EV adoption.

23           In addition, and as described Electrify America's  
24 cycle 4 plan, public education and marketing will be  
25 critical to informing consumers of new vehicle launches,

1 incentives, and available infrastructure. The \$8 million  
2 allocation for this education and marketing activities  
3 includes a commitment to continue funding Veloz's brand  
4 neutral Electric For All consumer campaigns which focus on  
5 priority communities as defined by the state.

6           Electrify America has fund -- has provided  
7 funding for the past three iterations of these consumer  
8 campaigns, which have achieved the following key  
9 performance indicates statewide, 400 million impressions  
10 and an associated two million plus visits to the brand  
11 neutral and free to use electricforall.org website, which  
12 hosts a zip code based vehicle and incentive finder.

13           As Electrify America's cycle 4 investment plan  
14 builds on their previous plans, we are in support today.

15           Thank you.

16           BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Thank you.

17           Next, we'll hear from Sara Baumann. Sara, I have  
18 activated your microphone. Please unmute and begin.

19           SARA BAUMANN: Thank you. Good morning, Madam  
20 Chair and members of the Board. My name is Sara Baumann,  
21 speaking on behalf of the Port of Long Beach.

22           The Port of Long Beach is supportive of the  
23 Electrify America cycle 4 ZEV investment plan. The port  
24 is committed to improving the environment, air quality,  
25 and implementing decarbonization strategies. We have

1 established aggressive zero-emission goals for terminal  
2 equipment by 2030 and on-road trucks by 2035. To support  
3 this transition to zero emissions, we need immediate  
4 investment in charging infrastructure for heavy-duty  
5 equipment and trucks.

6 The plan proposes new stations and more chargers  
7 that will facilitate the transition to zero-emission  
8 trucks, including those operating at the Port of Long  
9 Beach. We therefore ask the Board to approve the plan. T

10 Thank you so much.

11 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Thank you.

12 Next, we'll hear from Wendy Chou. Wendy, I have  
13 activated your microphone. Please unmute and begin.

14 WENDY CHOU: Hello. Thank you so much for this  
15 wonderful discussion and opportunity to comment. My name  
16 is Wendy Chou and I'm an EV driver since 2018. I am a  
17 Senior Manager with the 501(c)(3) non-profit organization  
18 Acterra: Action for a Healthy Planet based in the Bay  
19 Area. My comments are from the perspective of  
20 community-based organization Acterra, which has partnered  
21 with Electrify America for years, most recently with  
22 another organization Ignite Ed to implement STEM-related  
23 programming for students and to provide outreach and  
24 education about EVs. I ask the Air Resources Board to  
25 approve the Electrify America cycle 4 ZEV investment plan.

1           What's extremely important to us as an  
2 organization committed to a just and equitable transition  
3 to a clean energy society is that the plan continues much  
4 needed support for education and outreach for underserved  
5 communities, including by sponsoring ZEV education, STEM  
6 programming, and workforce development training.

7           These investments are vitally important to  
8 Acterra as we work to lower the barriers to residents in  
9 underserved communities knowing about and trusting that  
10 EVs are a workable solution for their needs. As we switch  
11 sway from fossil fuels, we appreciate that this plan  
12 invests in supporting education, outreach, and training on  
13 EVs and electrification so a wider audience can reap the  
14 benefits of this technology.

15           On behalf of Acterra, I request the Board's  
16 approval of the cycle 4 ZEV investment plan.

17           Thank you very much.

18           BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Thank you.

19           Maureen, I have activated your microphone.  
20 Please unmute and begin.

21           MAUREEN BLANC: Good morning. Chair Randolph and  
22 Board members, my name is Maureen Blanc and I'm with  
23 Charge Across Town. We're a non-profit organization  
24 speaking in support of Electrify America's cycle 4  
25 proposal. Charge Across Town works very closely with

1 Valley CAN as a partner on the Electrify America ZEV  
2 outreach and education program in the San Joaquin Valley.

3 As you have heard from Tom NOx, the Electrify  
4 America funding for ZEV outreach in disadvantaged  
5 communities has been critical to the growth and success of  
6 the Clean Cars 4 All Program in the San Joaquin Valley.

7 Electrify America's funding from cycles 1 through  
8 3 have allowed Charge Across Town to plan and support  
9 their efforts in the valley resulting in thousands of  
10 residents in these communities adopting new and used  
11 electric vehicles. Specifically, our efforts have focused  
12 on ride and drive events featuring affordable and used  
13 electric vehicles, educational workshops to share  
14 introductory videos on cars, State and regional incentives  
15 in charging, and community clinics held up to four nights  
16 per week with qualified EVs, as well as test drives where  
17 drivers get behind the wheel of the car, take a test  
18 drive, and in many cases visit an EV charging station to  
19 learn how to use it. Again, this program has been  
20 tremendously successful and welcomed by communities across  
21 the valley.

22 Charge Across Town respectfully requests that the  
23 Board approve the cycle 4 plan, which will continue the  
24 strong results they've accomplished in cycles 1 through 3.

25 Thank you.

1 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Thank you.

2 Ralph, I have activated your microphone. Please  
3 unmute and you can begin.

4 RALPH MEGNA: Thank you. Madam Chair and members  
5 of the Board, my name is Ralph Megna and I live in  
6 (inaudible), California. I'm an Electrify America Pass+  
7 member who has used EA for 95 billed DC fast charging  
8 sessions in just the last 12 months spread out over eight  
9 different states. That number does not include dozens of  
10 failed sessions, two of which occurred just yesterday at  
11 EA's flagship station in Baker, California. In short, I  
12 am a very experienced and very frustrated customer of  
13 Electrify America.

14 Today, I wish to reiterate the point I made back  
15 in August, when I provided both oral and written comments  
16 related to the cycle 4 plan. It doesn't matter if EA has  
17 opened hundreds of stations in California if they don't  
18 work. Surveys and studies by industry professionals,  
19 academics, and analytical EV enthusiasts agree that,  
20 first, charging station reliability not their number of  
21 locations, is now the single most troubling obstacle to EV  
22 adoption. Second, Electrify America is, by a wide margin,  
23 the worst EV charging network in the United States with  
24 quality of experience scores that are just a fraction of  
25 Tesla's. It is not hyperbole to say that EA is

1 single-handedly undermining the transition to EVs with its  
2 miserable operational performance.

3           Today, you have a chance to start fixing this  
4 disaster. As an EV driver who must use public DC fast  
5 charging on long trips, I beg you, I beg you to reject  
6 EA's comic book parody of a plan along with this staff  
7 review and demand that they return with a roadmap that  
8 includes hard data on EA current performance levels,  
9 transparent methodology and metrics for judging future  
10 performance, and a detailed budget that makes reliability,  
11 speed, and quality of experience the priorities, and not  
12 the sheer number of new stations.

13           Thank you.

14           BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Thank you.

15           After Susannah, we're going to hear from Maria  
16 Perez, Mary Matteson Bryan, Brenna Rivett, Leslie Austin,  
17 Jim O'Leary, and Eric Way.

18           So Susannah, I have activated your microphone.  
19 Please unmute and begin.

20           SUSANNAH SAUNDERS: Good morning. Sue Saunders  
21 from the Bay Area. My life has been devoted to the care  
22 of children. I was a stay-at-home parent and then a  
23 special education instructor. Climate change has taken a  
24 wrecking ball to their mental health. It's causing great  
25 emotional distress for all of us, but especially for young

1 people who have inherited our failure to stop it.

2 I volunteered to become the lead tester for the  
3 Cool the Earth UC Berkeley study, because during my  
4 electric vehicle advocacy work, I knew many EV drivers  
5 were frustrated. During my testing, I was shocked by the  
6 magnitude of the problem and the number of dismayed and  
7 regretful EV drivers I encountered. I am angry that the  
8 work done by many of us, including this Board, has been  
9 hindered by the inadequate effort by Electrify America.  
10 This plan must be rejected.

11 They consistently ranked last in consumer  
12 satisfaction. They have repeatedly made promises to  
13 improve, but follow-up testing has shown it has not  
14 happened. Driver education is not the problem. Like CEO  
15 Barrosa, last month I too stopped at Kettleman City on my  
16 way to LA, and four out of the six chargers were not  
17 working. At the next EA station in Los Angeles in 100  
18 degree weather two people were on the phone with EA  
19 because all three chargers were down.

20 They will not improve without strict oversight.  
21 If you give them another 200 million without specific  
22 metrics, enforcement, and the threat of fines, we're going  
23 to see more people choose gas cars. That would be a  
24 tragedy, because every time a person drives that gas car,  
25 it releases carbon into the atmosphere that stays there



1 for hundreds of years.

2 Please reject this plan. And if you don't, then  
3 we simply failing our young people who need EV adoption to  
4 have a chance of a bright future. Please do not enable  
5 this company to continue to derail EV adoption.

6 Thank you.

7 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Thank you.

8 Maria, I have activated your microphone. Please  
9 unmute and begin.

10 MARIA PEREZ: Good morning. My name is Maria  
11 Perez. I'm the community organizer with Regeneración  
12 -Pajaro Valley Climate Action, located in Watsonville,  
13 Santa Cruz County. We work alongside with Ecology Action  
14 in supporting residents in both English and Spanish to  
15 consider and to learn about all the grants and rebates  
16 available for buying EVs in low-income and disadvantaged  
17 neighborhoods.

18 I'm here to speak in support of Electrify America  
19 to ask the Board to approve the plan to provide more  
20 widespread and equitable adoption of zero-emission  
21 vehicles through the deployment of public EV charging  
22 infrastructure. And I do hope to see more chargers in  
23 Watsonville.

24 Thank you.

25 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Thank you.

1           Mary, I have activated your microphone. Please  
2 unmute and begin.

3           MARY MATTESON BRYAN: Thank you. My name is Mary  
4 Matteson Bryan. I'm an energy engineer with over 30 years  
5 of experience in energy efficiency and renewables, and  
6 have provided technical consulting services to the CEC,  
7 California utilities, and Department of Energy labs. I'm  
8 also a board member of Cool the Earth, and was one of the  
9 authors of the 2022 Fast Charger Reliability Study led by  
10 UC Berkeley.

11           We tested every open system DC fast charger in  
12 the Bay Area, 655 chargers total. Of the those, nearly 60  
13 percent were Electrify America chargers. We found that 21  
14 percent of the EA chargers were not functional, and four  
15 percent had cables that were too short to reach a Chevy  
16 Bolt. We shared the details with Electrify America and  
17 CARB staff. Upon retesting the same chargers in Alameda  
18 and San Mateo counties four months later little had  
19 changed, indicating a lack of timely maintenance.

20           There have been similar findings from large  
21 surveys of EV drivers. A recent 2023 study by JD Power  
22 found a 20 percent failure rate in charging attempts  
23 industry-wide. Additionally, they reported customer  
24 satisfaction is at an all-time low, with Electrify America  
25 receiving a satisfaction score of only a 538 out of 1,000.

1           We appreciate that Electrify America has promised  
2 to prioritize reliability going forward. However, with  
3 out specific metrics and enforcement mechanisms, these  
4 promises may not materialize. These cycle 4 investments  
5 are in critical to the ZEV transition and we look forward  
6 to them being spent. But as such, we urge CARB to reject  
7 Electrify America's current plan. It is imperative that  
8 the plan is modified first to mandate explicit metrics to  
9 improve functionality and include enforcement mechanisms.

10           Thank you.

11           BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Thank you.

12           Brenna, I have activated your microphone. Please  
13 unmute and begin.

14           BRENNA RIVETT: Good afternoon CARB Board members  
15 and staff. Thank you for the opportunity to speak today  
16 on the Electrify America cycle 4 ZEV investment plan. My  
17 name is Brenna Rivett and I represent ray EVHybridNoire, a  
18 national e-mobility advocacy non-profit organization and  
19 the nation's largest network of diverse EV drivers and  
20 enthusiasts.

21           We work with the highest levels of the federal  
22 government advising on clean transportation, climate  
23 policy, and the Justice40 Initiative. My organization has  
24 partnered with Electrify America on crucial research to  
25 help understand Black consumer attitudes toward EVs,

1 barriers to adoption, and engagement strategies. I'm here  
2 today to speak in support of Electrify America and to ask  
3 the Board to approve the plan which proposes important  
4 investments in California to support widespread and  
5 equitable adoption of zero-emission vehicles through the  
6 deployment of public EV charging infrastructure.

7           Electrify America's network is the largest  
8 network of ultrafast charging stations that is available  
9 to any EV driver that wants to drive up and get a charge.  
10 This network has supported California's rapid transition  
11 to EVs over the last several years in integral ways. The  
12 plan outlines 200 million in investments in California  
13 starting in 2024 that tackles some of the biggest  
14 challenges in the state, the need for more chargers, the  
15 need for reliable chargers, and the imperative of ensuring  
16 all Californians can participate equitably in the  
17 transition to ZEVs.

18           EVHybridNoire envisions a world where all  
19 communities are free of air pollution from cars and trucks  
20 and everyone can reap the benefits electric vehicles in  
21 multi-modal e-mobility solutions.

22           We believe that the cycle 4 California investment  
23 plan will not only create a better and clean California,  
24 but also help to lead the way toward zero-emission future  
25 for the nation. Electrify America's work supports

1 California in reaching its goal of a hundred percent new  
2 car sales being electric by 2035. EVHybridNoire works to  
3 ensure that all Americans regardless of race, ethnicity,  
4 gender, income, ability, or location can access the  
5 benefits of clean vehicle technology. And we believe this  
6 plan is crucial to realizing these goals.

7 For these reasons, I request CARB's approval of  
8 the Electrify America cycle 4 ZEV investment plan. Thank  
9 you for your time and consideration.

10 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Thank you.

11 And just a reminder the sign-ups for this item  
12 close at 12 p.m., so oh if you would like to comment,  
13 please virtually raise your hand now.

14 Leslie, I have activated your microphone. Please  
15 unmute and begin.

16 LESLIE AUSTIN: Yes. Thank you. Good morning,  
17 Chair Randolph, CARB Board, and staff. My name is Leslie  
18 Austin. I'm the Director of Let's Green CA! in Santa Cruz  
19 calling to strongly support the Electrify America cycle 4  
20 investment plan.

21 Today, I'm here not just representing a  
22 community-based organization, but to offer a voice in  
23 support of the low-income communities I personally serve  
24 across San Benito, Monterey, and Santa Cruz counties. At  
25 Let's Green CA!, our focus is on more than just the

1 environment. We're passionate about spreading ZEV  
2 education and awareness within low-income areas across our  
3 tri-county region. We've engaged thousands of Spanish  
4 speaking parish communities, people who are the heart of  
5 our region, ensuring that they are informed about clean  
6 transportation, along with an understanding of personal  
7 savings their families can achieve reduced fuel and  
8 maintenance costs. And we've been able to do this  
9 outreach and education with funding from Electrify  
10 America.

11           Electrify America's proposed cycle 4 investment  
12 plan will continue to increase the awareness of the use  
13 and availability of ZEVs, charging infrastructure. And  
14 that, coupled with purchase guidance, a robust secondary  
15 EV market, increased federal and State rebates and  
16 incentives will help boost ZEV adoption across California  
17 in the low-income communities we serve.

18           We strongly support Electrify America's C4  
19 investment plan and urge CARB to approve it. This is  
20 about both environmental justice and economic empowerment  
21 for all low-income Californians. Thank you.

22           BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Thank you.

23           Jim, I have activated your microphone. Please  
24 unmute and begin.

25           JIM O'LEARY: Good morning, CARB Board members

1 and staff, and thank you for the opportunity to speak  
2 today on Electrify America's cycle 4 investment plan. My  
3 name is Jim O'Leary, Vice President of fleet services at  
4 NFI.

5 I am here today to speak in support of Electrify  
6 America and ask the Board to approve the plan, which  
7 proposes important investments in California to support  
8 widespread adoption of zero-emission vehicles through the  
9 deployment of public EV charging infrastructure. As some  
10 you may know, my organization has partnered with Electrify  
11 America in cycle 3 of Green Cities Investment 2 on the  
12 project that is known as JETSI, the Joint Electric Truck  
13 Scaling Initiative.

14 For those that are not familiar with the project,  
15 it's one of the most progressive and envelope-pushing EV  
16 infrastructure deployments to date. NFI, with the support  
17 of our project partner such as a Electrify America who is  
18 managing all aspects of the micro-grid technology being  
19 deployed, is the deploying 38 350-kilowatt DC fast  
20 chargers, one megawatt of solar, and four megawatt hours  
21 of battery storage at one of our fleet terminals in  
22 Ontario, California.

23 This site will allows us to charge at least 50  
24 class 8 zero-emission battery electric vehicles and offset  
25 approximately 4,400 metric tons of greenhouse gas

1 emissions yearly by displacing over 350,000 gallons of  
2 diesel fuel every year in some of Southern California's  
3 most overburdened and disadvantaged communities. These  
4 are results that could not be possible without EA and the  
5 cycle 3 investment.

6           The success and commitment to this project, along  
7 with many others EA has completed, not only underscores  
8 Electrify America's ability to deliver an innovative and  
9 robust fleet charging solution that helps support the  
10 widespread adoption of zero-emission vehicles, but also  
11 their commitment to ensure an equitable and sustainable  
12 future for all Californians. For these reasons --

13           BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Thank you.

14           JIM O'LEARY: -- I request CARB's approval.

15           BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Thank you. That concludes  
16 your time.

17           After Eric, we will hear from Kaia Robinson,  
18 Jerome Mayfield, Kevin Morrison, Vanessa Rodriguez.

19           So Eric, I have activated your microphone.

20 Please unmute and begin

21           ERIC WAY: Thank you. Can you hear me?

22           BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Yes. Yes, we can.

23           ERIC WAY: Okay. Perfect. Yeah. I am Eric Way  
24 with News Coulomb, an electric vehicle news column online.  
25 I just wanted to start by saying I first purchased a ZEV



1 in California eight years ago. And within a hundred miles  
2 of my location, there were only five public charging  
3 stations and actually two of them were Tesla superchargers  
4 that are still not open to the public to this day. And  
5 the other three were 24 kilowatt plug stations. And since  
6 that time, you know, to give Electrify America a lot of  
7 credit, there are at least a half dozen now high-powered  
8 charging stations within that same geographical area.

9           Electrify America has been the reason that  
10 electrification has been able to accelerate the way that  
11 it has within California. And now that being said though,  
12 I really do agree with Board Member Florez, where I look  
13 at \$800 million being spent in California and I have to  
14 ask myself how is it there are still a number of counties  
15 within the state that have zero public fast charging and  
16 zero Electrify America charging stations. In particular,  
17 we have about 200 to 250 mile gap on a scenic highway,  
18 395, north of Reno that has zero public charging. I've  
19 requested a number of charging providers to install  
20 stations there and no one has been willing to do that.

21           I really do feel like this is something that  
22 should be in Electrify America's responsibility to do.  
23 Counties like Colusa, Tehama, Lake also do not have  
24 Electrify America stations. So I would request that CARB  
25 does not approve this until that's addressed.

1 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Thank awe.

2 Kaia, I have activated your microphone. Please  
3 unmute and begin.

4 KAIA ROBINSON: Can you hear me?

5 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Yes.

6 KAIA ROBINSON: Chair Randolph, CARB Board  
7 members and staff. Thank you for the opportunity to speak  
8 today on Electrify America's cycle 4 ZEV investment plan.  
9 My name is Kaia Robinson and I am representing the Los  
10 Angeles Cleantech Incubator, also known as LACI. LACI  
11 convenes a transportation and electrification partnership,  
12 which is public-private partnership that has set forth  
13 goals to rapidly advance transportation electrification in  
14 the LA region by the time of the 2028 Olympics in Los  
15 Angeles.

16 Electrify America is one of the key members in  
17 this partnership to help drive these goals. The \$200  
18 million in investments will tackle some of the biggest  
19 challenges in the state, the need for more chargers, the  
20 need for more reliable chargers, and the imperative of  
21 ensuring all Californians can participate equitably in the  
22 transition of zero-emission vehicles, and it continues to  
23 support education and awareness efforts for underserved  
24 communities, including sponsoring ZEV Education, STEM  
25 programming, and workforce training.

1           As a part of LACI's partnership, we aim to  
2 install 129,000 public and workplace chargers, have 30  
3 percent of vehicles on the road be battery electric  
4 vehicles, and 80 percent of all vehicles sold be EVs by  
5 2028.

6           Approving this investment plan will help us  
7 achieve these goals and ensure a better future for all  
8 Californians. For this reason, I request CARB's approval  
9 of the plan.

10           Thank you.

11           BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Thank you.

12           Jerome, I have activated your microphone. Please  
13 unmute and begin.

14           JEROME MAYFIELD: Hello

15           BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Yes, we can hear you.

16           JEROME MAYFIELD: Yes. My name is Jerome  
17 Mayfield. And I'm here to speak for Electrify America. I  
18 live in a disadvantaged community, so I am a part of the  
19 people that you guys are really talking about. And what  
20 I want -- what I want to speak about is how the clean air  
21 Valley CAN, with Tom Knox leading the program, along with  
22 Natalie, and Veronica, Jackie, and Victoria, they're in  
23 the trenches with us to try to get us into these EVs. And  
24 we're in need of having more charging stations in our  
25 area. So that's what I'm here to speak on today.

1           And then also, I don't really go to the charging  
2 stations, but I have seen them, and there are cars parked  
3 at them. And I would like to see that they get the money,  
4 because it's needed to keep all the programs like to  
5 Valley CAN and stuff like that to keep them going strong  
6 to get the EVs out to us.

7           And that's what I'd like to say today. Thank you  
8 for having me, Madam Chair and the Board. I spoke before  
9 in front of you guys some years back. And I had a stroke  
10 since then, and I haven't bought gas. I haven't bought  
11 oil, transmission fluid. I haven't had to get it smogged.  
12 You're saving may a whole lot of money. I'm so grateful  
13 for this program.

14           Thank you.

15           BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Thank you.

16           Kevin, I have activated your microphone. Please  
17 unmute and begin.

18           Kevin Morrison.

19           Okay. Let's move on to Vanessa Rodriguez.

20           Oh, I'm sorry. It looks like Kevin. It looks  
21 like you're there now.

22           KEVIN MORRISON: Sorry. Yeah. I'm slow on the  
23 unmute. Thank you. As a professional communications  
24 consultant, I really applaud the presentation you saw from  
25 Mr. Barrosa. It cleverly uses disinformation to distort

1 the story. For instance, when Mr. Barrosa says EA has  
2 many stations patronized at high capacity, about half of  
3 those vehicles are charging, because it's free there,  
4 because of sweetheart, possibly illegal, deals with  
5 manufacturers.

6 Also, when Mr. Barrosa said EA has provided five  
7 million sessions, that means about one million sessions  
8 have failed, according to their own metrics. I bought my  
9 first EV four years ago. I've had my share of those  
10 million failed sessions. By 2022, EA's failure was widely  
11 known. It was in the New York Times, the Washington Post,  
12 the Wall Street Journal, Newsweek, Wired, Car and Driver,  
13 the list goes on. By 2023, JD Power summed it up by  
14 saying of the four DC fast charging networks, Electrify  
15 America is ranked last for customer satisfaction.

16 EA was purpose built with public settlement funds  
17 to help increase enthusiasm for EVs. They have done the  
18 opposite. So please don't buy in to their disinformation.  
19 Please don't rubber stamp their plan for what essentially  
20 amounts to more of the same, whether it's using your  
21 statutory power or through the courts, I look forward to  
22 your urgent and necessary action starting with the  
23 rejection of this plan, developing specific metrics, and  
24 enforcing penalties, then release the funding, which will  
25 support all the providers and partners of EA that you've

1 heard from today, but not before.

2 Thank you.

3 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Thank you.

4 After Vanessa, we will hear from Emily Dilger,  
5 Piet Canin, Elena Engel, and Cameron Lind.

6 So Vanessa, I have activated your microphone.  
7 Please unmute and you can begin.

8 Vanessa Rodriguez, please unmute and you can  
9 begin.

10 VANESSA RODRIGUEZ: Hi. Can you hear me?

11 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Yes, we can.

12 VANESSA RODRIGUEZ: Hi. My name is Vanessa  
13 Rodriguez and I'm in support of Electrify America, because  
14 of the Valley CAN program. Without the Valley CAN  
15 program, I would not have been able to get a vehicle and  
16 would not have been able to afford payments for gas and  
17 things like that.

18 Through the program, I was able to get a plug-in  
19 vehicle. And without that program, I would not have been  
20 able to get one. And it was very helpful because of the  
21 in-person workshops that they would come out to  
22 disadvantaged communities like here in San Joaquin Valley,  
23 and specifically in Stockton. They come here and explain  
24 the program to us and give us all the answers that are  
25 needed. And with out Electrify America and their support

1 of Valley CAN, people like me and people like us in these  
2 disadvantaged and low-income communities wouldn't be able  
3 to get the vehicles, wouldn't be unable -- and I -- every  
4 single time I went to a charge to charge my vehicle, I've  
5 never had any problems with charging it. I've always been  
6 able to charge it with as much time as I do have and I  
7 always see cars parked at the charge. So I've never had  
8 any problems in that regard.

9           But I'm grateful for Valley CAN, the Valley CAN  
10 program, and for Electrify America supporting this  
11 program, because without it, people like myself and those  
12 of us that do live in disadvantaged communities and  
13 low-income communities wouldn't have a fighting chance to  
14 get to work and to be able to, you know, travel, I mean,  
15 in our communities.

16           So thank you.

17           BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Thank you.

18           Emily, I have activated your microphone. Please  
19 unmute and begin.

20           EMILY DILGER: Hi. My name is Emily Dilger and  
21 I'm the CEO of Ignited. I'm calling in support of  
22 Electrify America.

23           Ignited is a nonprofit partnering with Electrify  
24 America. We are on a mission to empower educators with  
25 industry connections, so that they can create cutting edge

1 curriculum that transforms their students' career  
2 trajectories. We have existed since 1985 and we are seen  
3 as a trusted source of professional development for  
4 teachers in the Bay Area for almost 40 years. In our  
5 history, we have worked with thousands of teachers and  
6 impacted four million students, 60 percent of whom are in  
7 underserved schools.

8           We see awareness of electric vehicles and careers  
9 in electric transportation as a growing opportunity that  
10 our future workforce needs to prepare for to meet  
11 tomorrow's industry needs. Our goal is to arm our  
12 teachers with models and practices that they need to best  
13 equip students, especially those in underserved  
14 communities for future success.

15           Our work helps to support a future diverse,  
16 local, and highly skilled workforce who are aware and  
17 supportive of electric vehicles. As a non-profit, Ignited  
18 is always interested in collaborating with other leaders  
19 in key technology areas to direct funds towards STEM  
20 education and our future workforce readiness. It is  
21 essential for us to prepare our students with the skill  
22 sets that they will need to prepare for and choose the  
23 dynamically changing career needs that the future  
24 requires.

25           Thank you for your time.



1 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Thank you.

2 Piet, I have activated your microphone. Please  
3 unmute and begin.

4 PIET CANIN: Good afternoon CARB Board members  
5 and staff. My name is Piet Canin with Ecology Action.  
6 Ecology Action was founded in 1970. It is a  
7 community-based non-profit implementing equitable climate  
8 solutions.

9 I am calling in today in support of Electrify  
10 America's cycle 4 investment plan. My organization has  
11 partnered with Electrify America as a recipient of their  
12 cycle 2 and cycle 3 ZEV equity education and awareness,  
13 and STEM program. Electrify America's funding has been  
14 foundational support for Ecology Action's central coast  
15 led EV equity consumer campaign, since late 2019. Ecology  
16 Action developed a regional CBO partnership of six local  
17 groups spanning six counties from Santa Cruz County to  
18 Ventura, directly assisting priority populations in such  
19 communities as Watsonville, Salinas, Santa Maria, and  
20 Oxnard, for example.

21 Are these -- our EVs pal told us EVs For Everyone  
22 is a program offered in Spanish and English with bilingual  
23 and bicultural outreach staff working with consumers in  
24 largely Hispanic, farm worker, and service industry LIC  
25 and DAC neighborhoods.

1 I just wanted to quickly address the evaluation  
2 part of our program. We work with community-based social  
3 marketing consultants and UC Davis to dig deeper into our  
4 work to -- through focus group and surveys to be able to  
5 improve our programs to make sure that we're meeting the  
6 goals set out in the Electrify America program plans. So  
7 we're continually evaluating and improving our services.

8 Thank you for taking the time to hear all the  
9 public comment.

10 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Thank you.

11 Elena I have activated your microphone. Please  
12 unmute and begin.

13 ELENA ENGEL: Elena Engel, San Francisco. I have  
14 been an EV driver for the past eight years. Recently, I  
15 drove from San Francisco to the central coast and back.  
16 My experience charging, or attempting to charge, at EA  
17 chargers was awful. One of seven chargers worked the  
18 first time. With the six others, they either didn't work  
19 at all or only worked after lengthy calls to customer  
20 service. One out of seven, 14 percent is a failing grade.

21 We should not stand for this. It was a scary  
22 experience. I was driving alone. I really did not know  
23 if I'd get stuck on the highway as I watched my range  
24 diminish mile after mile, hoping to be able to reach the  
25 next charger, hoping that it worked. For drivers who do

1 not have a place to charge at home, which mostly means  
2 lower income people, this is an even worse disaster for  
3 those everyday drivers who have no other options.

4 Presumably me you, CARB, have credited EA based  
5 upon the quantity of chargers installed, but apparently  
6 without regard to the quality. Installed chargers means  
7 nothing if they do not work reliably. You should require  
8 EA to fix these chargers on their own dime and verify to  
9 CARB that they work properly. Show CARB, the public --  
10 and the public the actual reliability numbers and force  
11 consequences for not achieving reliability targets.

12 We the people of California should not have to  
13 give up settlement money to fix the poor job done by EA.  
14 That would be cheating us once again. Do not approve this  
15 final portion of settlement money to fix shoddy work. EA  
16 should have to do this themselves. Settlement money  
17 should be used for additional chargers, verifiably  
18 reliable chargers that work every time.

19 Thank you.

20 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Thank you.

21 Cameron, I have activated your microphone.  
22 Please unmute and begin.

23 CAMERON LIND: Hi, everyone. Thanks for the time  
24 today. Good evening. My name is Cameron Lind. I've been  
25 interested in this topic for years now, EV enthusiasts,

1 also general car enthusiasts. I recently graduated from  
2 USC in LA, live in Santa Monica.

3 I think the main thing that differentiates me --  
4 differentiates me from everyone else here is I'm 23 years  
5 old. So I represent my generation and how EVs are adopted  
6 in the future. And to say the least, I've had my fair  
7 share of run-ins with charging in EA systems.

8 When coming from San Francisco to LA with my dad  
9 who has an EV, we stopped at Harris Ranch to only find  
10 five to ten percent of the chargers online and available  
11 to use. It took us around 12 hours, which is usually a  
12 six to six and a half hour trip in a normal gas vehicle.  
13 To say the least, I'm also in the car market for an EV.  
14 But where I live, there's also no readily available  
15 chargers in my building or the nearby areas.

16 So why make the switch? And I think it really  
17 just comes down to the charging infrastructure network  
18 that doesn't work. So if this is something you guys  
19 really care about, you will decline the approval of  
20 Electrify America's plan, because it simply won't be  
21 adopted by my peers due to its inability just to work.  
22 That's all that has to happen. I appreciate the time  
23 today and everyone's comments, and hopefully this is  
24 resolved in the future.

25 Thank you.

1 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Thank you.

2 Our last three commenters for this item will be  
3 William Forsythe, Michele Robinson, and Stephen Israel.

4 William, I have activated your microphone.  
5 Please unmute and you can begin.

6 WILLIAM FORSYTHE: Hi. Thank you. I want to  
7 thank the Board for having this opportunity to speak. And  
8 I just want to say, you know, the plan, and what I'm  
9 concerned is this demanding of the 35 percent of the new  
10 chargers that's going to support the disadvantaged  
11 communities, kind of undermines the Board's ability to  
12 support the Advanced Clean Fleets Regulation providing any  
13 path for fleets to comply.

14 Just based on today's testimony and concerns  
15 stated from the Board, it's obviously right now that  
16 technology and the infrastructure is not reliable or going  
17 to be available to support this new regulation. I would  
18 like CARB to reject the plan and to spend that \$400  
19 million towards the national infrastructure to help  
20 support the long-haul trucks or just abandon the Clean  
21 Fleets Regulation until a national highway infrastructure  
22 is in place where 98 percent of working chargers are in a  
23 five mile radius, and match the current time to fill a  
24 Class 8 truck.

25 Otherwise, contributing to the regulation will

1 just increase the cost of all interstate trucking  
2 industries due to the loss of the production and  
3 availability. And these costs will ultimately be passed  
4 over, mostly to the disadvantaged or the low-income  
5 communities that cannot already afford any higher cost of  
6 living in California.

7 Thank you.

8 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Thank you.

9 Michele, I have activated your microphone.

10 Please unmute and begin.

11 MICHELE ROBINSON: Hi. My name is Michele Rob --  
12 can you hear me?

13 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Yes, we can.

14 MICHELE ROBINSON: Oh, thank you. Okay. My name  
15 is Michele Robinson. And I fall in the category of low  
16 income community. I'm giving my kudos to Valley CAN, the  
17 staff that runs Valley CAN, and what it brings to me as a  
18 foster parent traveling back and forth with my kids to  
19 this event, that event, this gaming thing, school. And it  
20 takes the dollars out of -- keeps the dollars in my  
21 pocket. It keeps -- the maintenance on it is very low.  
22 The -- there's barely -- there's no gas at all charges. I  
23 appreciate the rebate from PG&E. I love my little -- my  
24 low monthly payments, my savings, because of the low  
25 monthly payments.

1           They do have to work a little bit on chose  
2 charging stations, but kudos to Electrify America. Kudos  
3 to Valley CAN. And I appreciate everything you guys are  
4 doing to clean up the air and the environment on my  
5 planet. Thank you.

6           BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Thank you.

7           Stephen, I have activated your microphone.  
8 Please unmute and begin.

9           Stephen Israel.

10          STEPHEN ISRAEL: Sorry. Can you hear me now?

11          BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Yes, we can.

12          STEPHEN ISRAEL: Thank you. CARB Board members  
13 and staff, thank you for allowing me to speak in support  
14 of Electrify America's cycle 4 investment. My name is  
15 Stephen Israel, Senior Director of Product Management at  
16 BTC Power.

17                 This plan highlights the critical investment  
18 needed for reliable EV charging in California. Electrify  
19 America, with partners such as BTC, have pushed the  
20 innovation and investment in critical technologies that  
21 are widely seen today in the EV charging ecosystem,  
22 technologies like high voltage charging, high power  
23 charging at rates up to 350 kilowatts, liquid cool  
24 charging, plug in charge using ISO 15118. All of these  
25 would be available without EA's investment, but would

1 likely have taken far longer to take hold. Many of these  
2 technologies that we discussed are now part of the FHWA  
3 NEVI requirements. This is because EA and other partners  
4 have proven that these are possible.

5           Through our collaboration, we have achieved  
6 significant strides in technology development,  
7 particularly in scalability, reliability, and customer  
8 experience. The latest iteration of gen 4 technology also  
9 has market-leading availability, which was described and  
10 is proven in cycle 3 investment. For these reasons, I  
11 request CARB's approval for Electrify America's cycle 4  
12 investment plan.

13           Thank you.

14           BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Thank you.

15           And that concludes the commenters for this item.

16           CHAIR RANDOLPH: Okay. Thank you very much.

17 Now, I think we are ready for Board discussion, even  
18 though we've had a lot of discussion already.

19           Dr. Shaheen.

20           BOARD MEMBER SHAHEEN: Thanks so much, Chair  
21 Randolph. I really appreciated today's discussion and  
22 learned so much from the conversation among our Board  
23 members, the emphasis on disadvantaged communities and  
24 reliability, and response time, I think, are so deeply  
25 important. I really would like to support the plan, but



1 feel a need to ask staff to work with Electrify America on  
2 modifying the maintenance plan requirements of this cycle  
3 4 initiative in three core -- three key areas, including  
4 explicit reliability metrics for the chargers, so striving  
5 isn't quite enough.

6 We've heard a commitment to achieving a 97  
7 percent NEVI uptime standard for new chargers and actually  
8 legacy chargers. So I'm intrigued by that. I'd like to  
9 know whether or not that stands true for all of the 700  
10 legacy chargers that will not be upgraded.

11 Second, improving response time for key component  
12 parts, so that we can get a handle on what the appropriate  
13 metrics are and data are to resolve these issues in a  
14 timely fashion. Expanding reporting to the staff on these  
15 specific explicit metrics and supporting data at the  
16 appropriate levels of disaggregation, which is very  
17 important in achieving metrics. I'd like to see that on a  
18 quarterly and an annual basis.

19 And I'd like to underscore the importance of  
20 transparency in data. I understand this is a private  
21 business and it's a competitive business space, but I  
22 think we need to think carefully about how to preserve and  
23 protect business information and keep it confidential, but  
24 also get the level -- to the right levels of data and  
25 disaggregate data, so that we can monitor performance on

1 that quarterly basis and that annual basis.

2 So I hope -- I hope staff will be able to work  
3 with Electrify America on that.

4 Thank you.

5 CHAIR RANDOLPH: Can I ask staff to respond to  
6 that, because as we talked about earlier, you know,  
7 several Board members have asked about, you know, can we  
8 make the maintenance plan a little more robust, but also  
9 wanting to move forward, get the money out the door,  
10 approve the plan. So do we have -- as you all have been  
11 listening to this discussion, do you have suggested  
12 solutions to those problems we've articulated? And I also  
13 want to hear a follow-up on requests that Member Florez  
14 and Takvorian made around more information as it relates  
15 to deployment of chargers in disadvantaged communities.

16 EXECUTIVE OFFICER CLIFF: Yes, Chair. So we've  
17 been busily working since we've heard all these --

18 CHAIR RANDOLPH: I've been watching you huddle  
19 over there.

20 (Laughter).

21 EXECUTIVE OFFICER CLIFF: Yes. As you can see,  
22 lots of activity over here. And we have some language  
23 that we would suggest to add to the draft resolution that  
24 was posted on the website.

25 So I will read that and it includes both items,

1 both the information that Dr. Shaheen just mentioned with  
2 those three particular things - I think we've captured  
3 that - as well as the language that Dean and Diane were  
4 working on and had read that into the record. So I think  
5 we've captured both of those. But let me go ahead and  
6 read this and then we'll see how you respond.

7           So at the end of the current draft resolution, we  
8 would add -- and I should say, we will also delete earlier  
9 this "strive for" language. There's a paragraph about a  
10 page up that says, you know, "strive for these NEVI  
11 standards." So we would strike that and add, "Be it  
12 further resolved, that the Board directs the Executive  
13 Officer to work with Electrify America to build upon the  
14 maintenance requirements of section 5.8 of the cycle 4  
15 plan as publicly released on October 20, 2023 to further  
16 address station reliability challenges. This work shall  
17 include the addition of reliability metrics, including  
18 station uptime performance, repair response time to  
19 resolve issues, and expanded reporting to CARB staff on  
20 the additional reliability metrics in the quarterly and  
21 annual reports.

22           "Station uptime performance metrics for new  
23 stations specifically shall be consistent with the state  
24 of the industry, such as those defined by the port uptime  
25 performance threshold in the National Electric Vehicle

1 Infrastructure, NEVI, Program. CARB staff shall work with  
2 Electrify America to include reliability metrics for  
3 existing stations as appropriate and then approve and  
4 publicly release the enhanced maintenance requirements of  
5 the cycle 4 plan."

6           And then finally, "Be it further resolved, that  
7 the Board directs the Executive Officer to include  
8 information on CARB's website concerning the Electrify  
9 America charging stations located in low-income and  
10 disadvantaged communities as defined by the State of  
11 California. This information should provide specific  
12 details on the number of stations in these areas  
13 accompanied by maps illustrating their locations.

14           CHAIR RANDOLPH: So to summarize the direction in  
15 the resolution would be that staff would work with  
16 Electrify America to address in the maintenance plan  
17 station reliability challenges. And that would include  
18 reliability metrics, response time, expanded reporting,  
19 and then separately adding the detailed information  
20 regarding charging locations in disadvantaged and  
21 low-income communities.

22           EXECUTIVE OFFICER CLIFF: That's correct.

23           CHAIR RANDOLPH: Okay. Thank you.

24           Any comments from other Board members?

25           Board Member Kracov.

1           BOARD MEMBER KRACOV: I'm hopeful that that  
2 addresses the concerns from the other Board members today.  
3 And I really want to thank particularly all of you, but  
4 the Chair, Dr. Shaheen, and Board Member Florez for your  
5 comments today in helping to shape what we're going to be  
6 considering here. And to me, it sounds like a good -- a  
7 good way forward, Chair.

8           I just wanted to speak maybe a little more  
9 broadly than just the Electrify America piece. You know,  
10 I think that there are things that we're learning more  
11 broadly for the zero-emissions, you know, project that  
12 we're all embarked on. And, you know, we as a Board have  
13 done so much work in trying to push forward that project,  
14 push forward that mission over the past few years. And  
15 what we do is we pass regulations and the regulations have  
16 certain milestones and timelines. And a lot of it does  
17 depend on industry and depends on our partners in State  
18 government, the Energy Commission, the Public Utilities  
19 Commission for the infrastructure, which is so important  
20 to really making all of this work.

21           And I want to thank all the stakeholders who  
22 spoke today about the challenges that we have on  
23 infrastructure. You know, it truly is the work of our  
24 lifetimes. So we as a Board, you know, adopt these  
25 regulations and sort of send it out into the ether. What

1 I'm curious about is something to think about. I know Dr.  
2 Cliff is going to present his 2024 priorities. But for  
3 Analisa Bevan and our Board and our executive team to  
4 think about, you know, what is the Board's role as we  
5 switch now to execution, as we switch to implementation of  
6 these rules that we've spent so much time and so much  
7 deliberation trying to get right?

8           You know, we are not the agency that tracks the  
9 installation of all the infrastructure. We don't set the  
10 rates for the utilities. What is the Board's role? And I  
11 mean that in the Big B way, but of course working with our  
12 staff, in tracking how we're doing? Is there a role for  
13 us, you know, beyond just -- beyond just adopting the  
14 regulations. But as we now transition to this very  
15 important phase of implementation and execution, I think  
16 what is the Board's role, if any, in monitoring, in  
17 evaluating, in making recommendations to ensure that we  
18 get this project right?

19           And so I want us to sort of think about that  
20 really more broadly than this EA issue, which we spent so  
21 much time on directly today and which does come back to us  
22 as a Board, but the other stuff doesn't come back to us in  
23 the same way. So just something for us to think about, if  
24 there's a constructive way for the Board to continue to  
25 participate in this. It's the work over many, many years,

1 and decade perhaps, and wanted us to think about that, not  
2 only the lessons we learned from Electrify America today,  
3 but the lessons we can learn for our overall project that  
4 is core to this Board's mission.

5 CHAIR RANDOLPH: Okay. That's a great point.  
6 Thank you.

7 Dr. Pacheco-Werner.

8 And I -- and I do want to -- I haven't forgotten  
9 Mr. Eisenhut's question. So maybe as you guys respond to  
10 some of the lessons learned, you could also add some  
11 thoughts about implementation going forward and the  
12 Board's role in that.

13 BOARD MEMBER PACHECO-WERNER: Yeah. I just  
14 wanted to learn a little bit more about what the  
15 implications would be given the language about posting the  
16 number of stations on the website that are in  
17 disadvantaged communities. I mean, I think information is  
18 important, but I mean what's the -- then what? Are we  
19 asking also or does it need to be in the language that  
20 we're also asking that those stations be at parity with  
21 the rest of the charging network in terms of, you know,  
22 workability? I just would hate to leave it just like put  
23 something on the website because --

24 CHAIR RANDOLPH: Right. Yeah. And I mean I  
25 think -- I think this goes along with all of the other

1 guidance we've discussed about, you know, working more  
2 with CBOs, working more with communities. And, you know,  
3 the members who proposed that language might also want to  
4 make suggestions. But I think the goal was to provide  
5 some clear, easy-to-identify transparency that would then  
6 help communities know where to engage and kind of say, oh,  
7 you know, we're not seeing chargers here, reaching out,  
8 and working with Electrify America and their partners to  
9 more effectively deploy chargers. So staff, I don't know  
10 if you want to add anything to that?

11 STCD CHIEF GRESS: So to the question about the  
12 implications of the reporting, you know, stations, I think  
13 the main thing is really public transparency in holding --  
14 in holding Electrify America accountable for its  
15 commitment. That's the main thing. I think we do want to  
16 do some additional analysis of that data and make sure we  
17 really understand kind of what parts of the community are  
18 being affected versus -- you know, per another Board  
19 Member Takvorian's comment. But I think that's the real  
20 impact here is just being clear with the public about what  
21 these investments are and where they're located.

22 BOARD MEMBER PACHECO-WERNER: So if not in the  
23 language, which is fine, I mean, I really wanted to  
24 feel -- you know, for me voting for this and this  
25 additional language, I really want there to be that



1 attention to the parity of the functionality of these  
2 chargers, that that's the intent in terms of that  
3 transparency from the staff when you're looking at these  
4 reports and when you're looking at this data.

5 EXECUTIVE OFFICER CLIFF: Yes, absolutely.

6 CHAIR RANDOLPH: Okay. Board Member De La Torre.

7 BOARD MEMBER DE LA TORRE: Thank you. It's been  
8 a long time that we've been doing this, not just today,  
9 over the years. I was here when we started this whole  
10 exercise. And in the early years, we were a little more  
11 experimental. We were -- nothing like this had ever  
12 happened. It was a nascent industry. So we were just  
13 kind of open to lots of ideas. I know I pushed some.  
14 Probably forgot half the things I asked for in the  
15 beginning.

16 But here we are at the end, the last tranche of  
17 money, and it really is about legacy at this point. What  
18 is the legacy of these four tranches over it feels like a  
19 decade? And so this batch is the simplest batch we've  
20 ever done, because it's about that charging infrastructure  
21 going forward. We don't have bells and whistles like  
22 we've had in other cycles.

23 I loved some of the stuff that we've done in the  
24 past. You know, I would have liked to have seen some of  
25 it here, but I get where we are, right? Some of that

1 early technology isn't today's technology. The  
2 reliability issues that my colleagues have raised  
3 absolutely vital, that this system on it's way out the  
4 door -- or, you know, at the end of this process, is as  
5 good as it can be to support the vehicles that are out  
6 there. And we're now getting those sales figures, right?  
7 We're now getting that volume of vehicles that need the  
8 charging that we could only dream of a few years ago. So  
9 we're there. And so our obligation now is to make sure  
10 that this infrastructure is as good as it can be going  
11 forward. And that's what -- that's the gist of what  
12 everyone is saying and I'm absolutely supportive of it.

13           For us, for the Board, beyond EA, there is  
14 another issue, another question, and I've raised it  
15 before. We need to be the consumer protection for all  
16 charging infrastructure. Obviously, we have this unique  
17 dynamic, but it goes beyond EA. And, you know, when I'm  
18 getting calls from Congress members who have EVs  
19 complaining about the reliability of this infrastructure -  
20 again, I'm not saying EA - that's a problem. You know,  
21 and I jokingly responded if only you had some authority  
22 and power, Mr. Congressman.

23           So here we are. We know it's needed. We're the  
24 ones who are pushing this technology on a myriad of  
25 programs, a myriad of funding mechanisms. We're the ones

1 pushing it, so we need to make sure it works. That's on  
2 us. I know we have partners in government that we need to  
3 collaborate with, but -- we've done it in other areas, in  
4 other sectors, and I think we need to do it in this one.

5 So my takeaway here is going -- on the  
6 going-forward basis, how does CARB engage to protect the  
7 consumers with this infrastructure, because it is bigger  
8 than the EA, and we need to make sure that as this is  
9 growing, it is as robust and effective as it can be.  
10 That's my bottom line.

11 So I'm going to be supportive today, again  
12 because it's at the end of the road and we are doing what  
13 we need to do in this cycle. But going forward, we have  
14 some homework to do and some talking to do with some of  
15 our partner agencies to make sure that function is being  
16 carried out.

17 Thank you.

18 CHAIR RANDOLPH: I'm going to kick it over to  
19 staff to kind of respond to a few of the big picture  
20 things, you know, lessons learned, implementation, how our  
21 role in helping to protect consumers.

22 EXECUTIVE OFFICER CLIFF: Thank you, Chair.

23 And I'm going to -- I will turn it to staff in a  
24 minute, but I will offer a few high level thoughts here.

25 First of all, to Board Member Eisenhut's question

1 about what have we learned, I will just offer that I think  
2 one thing we've learned is that it's not simply enough to  
3 get the infrastructure out there. That's an important  
4 part of it and more is certainly going to be better. Part  
5 of the uptime and frustration that consumers feel is that  
6 they're waiting in line. And especially if one of four  
7 chargers is down, then they're waiting even longer. And  
8 so having more infrastructure is actually going to help  
9 alleviate that problem. And I know that's something that  
10 the State is really actively working on, the Feds are  
11 actively working on as well. So that additional  
12 infrastructure is really critical.

13           There were sort of multiple questions around the  
14 Board's role in continuing to protect consumers and how we  
15 ensure that going forward that we're making our rules and  
16 policies that we put in place successful. And in large  
17 part, the State has -- you know, there are always silos.  
18 We have different agencies that are working on different  
19 pieces of this. But we do have a really close working  
20 relationship with our partners at the Energy Commission  
21 and the -- and the PUC.

22           And the Energy Commission in particular is really  
23 actively working on those types of metrics that will  
24 ensure that consumers are experiencing the -- what they  
25 expect, which is chargers to work when they show up and

1 that they can fuel this vehicle that they spent hard  
2 earned money on. So that is something that the federal  
3 government through NEVI, which we've already talked about,  
4 as well as the State is working on. So we have a role in  
5 working really closely with our partners, sharing  
6 information to the extent that we have it, and trying to  
7 help devise those right kinds of policies so that  
8 consumers are encouraged to continue to drive electric  
9 vehicles and that we see the growth in that market.

10 But I'd like to turn it to Dr. Jen Gress to maybe  
11 offer a little bit more from her and her staff's  
12 perspective on what they've learned in working with  
13 Electrify America and implementing this appendix C over  
14 all these years. I'm sure there's many thoughts there and  
15 I'm interested to hear what they have to say.

16 STCD CHIEF GRESS: Thanks, Dr. Cliff.

17 Well, I love those questions those -- sort of  
18 those big thought questions. You know, I think lesson  
19 number one, as we were briefing the Board members in  
20 preparation for this Board hearing, is simply that you  
21 can't predict the future or that it's difficult to predict  
22 the future. We got a lot of questions about why weren't  
23 reliability metrics in the consent decree? You know,  
24 eight years ago when the consent decree was being crafted,  
25 relia -- the industry was really new and it wasn't the

1 number one thing we were all worried about. Certainly, we  
2 did anticipate the need for maintenance and upgrades. But  
3 at the time, we were a little bit more focused on  
4 utilization. Would the stations even be utilized?

5           And I think that the fact that it is hard to  
6 predict the future, means that when you craft your own  
7 work and you craft agreements, you have to build in some  
8 flexibility for change. I think that that also speaks to  
9 the importance of metrics, so that you are able to track  
10 change over time, knowing that there's going to be change  
11 and instituting those early.

12           I think a third lesson is just how important  
13 relationships are. Throughout this investment, we've  
14 learned a lot working with Electrify America. And we have  
15 developed a trusting relationship, where they do share a  
16 lot of information with us that they do not share with the  
17 public. And that's important for us, because we learn as  
18 we go as well and we're able to kind of have a forthcoming  
19 dialogue. This is also true with the auto manufacturers  
20 and our car regs, it's really important that you have  
21 those trusting relationship, so that you -- both  
22 government, and industry, and other stakeholders can  
23 learn, and grow, and innovate together.

24           I think, you know, the -- I think that the --  
25 sort of this fourth lesson is really there's always going

1 to be technological innovation. Early technology is never  
2 going to be as good as later technology. And I think that  
3 actually speaks to the importance of metrics. And we see  
4 that it -- Rob Barrosa of Electrify America spoke to that,  
5 right, that, you know, the early industry wasn't so great.  
6 The suppliers were new. The technology was not as robust.  
7 I think that's always going to be try no matter what the  
8 issue is. And so being patient and making sure that you  
9 have kind of both the metrics, the flexibility, and place  
10 to kind of track that and guide it over time is important.  
11 So those are some of the lessons learned that came to mind  
12 when Board Member Eisenhut raised the question.

13 To Board Member Kracov's question about the role  
14 of the Board, I think Dr. Cliff addressed it well. I  
15 would just add a little specificity and also one  
16 perspective from where I sit, which is I think the great  
17 thing about the State of California is that we really have  
18 a whole-of-government approach when it comes to advancing  
19 zero-emission vehicles. And that is also true on  
20 infrastructure. There are a lot of agencies that work on  
21 this and we do work pretty closely. This is not a big B,  
22 a big Board -- a big B Board issue is like behind the  
23 scenes staff talking a lot of the times. But the State of  
24 California has put a lot of effort over the years into  
25 making sure that there are processes in place for State

1 agencies to coordinate and work together on all kinds of  
2 issues related to ZEVs, but on charging infrastructure in  
3 particular.

4           Some of the things that we do at CARB are we do  
5 some work on education and outreach, especially on kind of  
6 vehicles that are, you know, like teaching folks about  
7 like what the benefit of ZEVs can be and what the models  
8 are that are available. Certainly, we're partnering with  
9 agencies like CEC on their reliability work, because that  
10 is so important as we've been hearing about.

11           And one thing we're going to be working on in the  
12 future here and we'll see a -- you'll see a proposed rule  
13 up in 2025 time frame as we amend ACC II, but one of the  
14 issue we're going to be working on is interoperability  
15 between the vehicles and the chargers. And that's really  
16 kind of more where some of the Board's work is focused on  
17 is like the vehicle side. And I think there is more work  
18 that we can do on the vehicle side to improve the  
19 communication between vehicles and chargers. And that  
20 will have an impact on reliability and the consumer  
21 experience across the board.

22           CHAIR RANDOLPH: Thank you. Appreciate that.

23           Okay. I need to close the record on this agenda  
24 item, so I am closing the record.

25           Board members, do you have any other questions or



1 comments?

2 I will call for a motion, but I just want to be  
3 really clear about what the motion is. It's to approve  
4 Resolution number 24-7 with the language changes as  
5 identified by Dr. Cliff. If the details of the revisions  
6 to the maintenance plan are not completed, as with any  
7 Board action, staff can bring it back to the Board and  
8 say, hey, you know, this is -- this is an issue. We need  
9 some more Board guidance. So recognizing that, I will ask  
10 for a motion and a second.

11 BOARD MEMBER GUERRA: So moved.

12 BOARD MEMBER DE LA TORRE: Second.

13 CHAIR RANDOLPH: All right. Board Clerk, please  
14 call the roll.

15 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Dr. Balmes?

16 BOARD MEMBER BALMES: Yes.

17 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Mr. De La Torre?

18 BOARD MEMBER DE LA TORRE: Yes.

19 BOARD MEMBER GARCIA: Mr. Eisenhut?

20 BOARD MEMBER EISENHUT: Yes.

21 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Senator Florez?

22 BOARD MEMBER FLOREZ: Yes.

23 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Mr. Guerra?

24 BOARD MEMBER GUERRA: Aye.

25 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Ms. Hurt?

1 BOARD MEMBER HURT: Aye.

2 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Mr. Kracov?

3 BOARD MEMBER KRACOV: Yes.

4 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Dr. Pacheco-Werner?

5 BOARD MEMBER PACHECO-WERNER: Yes.

6 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Mr. Perez?

7 BOARD MEMBER PEREZ: Aye.

8 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Mr. Rechtschaffen?

9 BOARD MEMBER RECHTSCHAFFEN: Yes.

10 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Dr. Shaheen?

11 BOARD MEMBER SHAHEEN: Aye.

12 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Ms. Takvorian?

13 BOARD MEMBER TAKVORIAN: Aye.

14 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Supervisor Vargas?

15 BOARD MEMBER VARGAS: Vargas yes.

16 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Chair Randolph?

17 CHAIR RANDOLPH: Yes. And I also neglected to  
18 note that once the maintenance plan is revised, it will be  
19 posted publicly so folks know.

20 Sorry.

21 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Okay. Madam Chair, the  
22 motion passes.

23 CHAIR RANDOLPH: Thank you very much.

24 Okay. We are now going to break for closed  
25 session, as indicated in the public notice for today's

1 meeting. And so in about 45 minutes after closed session,  
2 we'll be reconvening for our next open agenda item.

3 So we will be back in about 45 minutes.

4 (Off record: 12:49 p.m.)

5 (Thereupon the meeting recessed  
6 into closed session.)

7 (Thereupon a lunch break was taken.)

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25



1 pollution and climate warming emissions from the  
2 combustion of fossil fuels and protecting public health in  
3 all the communities across our state. This progress is  
4 born from tremendous staff work and Board actions across  
5 our many programs.

6 We know there's more to be done. We have to  
7 continue to ensure that the many programs that the Board  
8 administer align with our unprecedented plans and  
9 directives to clean the air and address climate change,  
10 and importantly, with our Board resolution on social  
11 justice and racial equity. We will lead -- need to leave  
12 no stone unturned in looking for ways to ensure alignment  
13 of our programs with these principles. And this will  
14 require rigorous, consistent, equity-focused work that we  
15 know that we can deliver here at CARB.

16 We also know we will continue to need to work  
17 with a wide range of partners, not only within the  
18 administration, but within our communities, industry, the  
19 academic community, as well as our federal and regional  
20 partners. This is absolutely an all-hands-on-deck effort  
21 now and through the years to come.

22 So with that, I am please to turn this over to  
23 Dr. Steven Cliff for an overview of what this year holds  
24 for CARB and the people of California

25 Dr. Cliff, would you please present the item.

1 (Thereupon a slide presentation).

2 EXECUTIVE OFFICER CLIFF: Thank you, Chair  
3 Randolph.

4 I'm glad to have the chance to share and discuss  
5 CARB's priorities for the year ahead. As Chair Randolph  
6 remarked, CARB achieved some major milestones last year.  
7 I'd like to share a short video looking back on what we  
8 accomplished in 2023 and then share a short presentation  
9 of high level priorities for 2024, including actions that  
10 will come before you, CARB's key efforts to implement  
11 clean air and climate policy, and our internal efforts to  
12 make CARB an equitable, inclusive, and rewarding place to  
13 work for all employees.

14 Let's look back on 2023.

15 (Thereupon a video was played.)

16 (Applause).

17 EXECUTIVE OFFICER CLIFF: Yeah. What a great  
18 video, huh?

19 Exactly.

20 As we start to think about our priorities for  
21 this year, we're driven by achieving CARB's mission and  
22 the design -- desire for a clean air future.

23 --o0o--

24 EXECUTIVE OFFICER CLIFF: But what does achieving  
25 a clean air future look like for people of California? It

1 means that we're working to ensure that no matter your  
2 income, race, or zip code, you are breathing clean air.  
3 Meeting our carbon neutrality and greenhouse gas emission  
4 reduction mandates means better health, reduced health  
5 care costs, and fewer missed days of work or school for  
6 people across the state.

7           Achieving these targets also means new jobs and  
8 career paths that support a clean energy economy, and puts  
9 California on the leading edge of technological  
10 innovation. Achieving a clean air future means creating  
11 more vibrant communities where everyone has access to a  
12 variety of sustainable transportation options like  
13 walking, biking, and public transit, and where people can  
14 travel easily from their home to key destinations without  
15 having to depend on cars.

16   --o0o--

17           EXECUTIVE OFFICER CLIFF: It means that we can  
18 take pride that in the face of an existential threat like  
19 climate change, we can come together to develop solutions  
20 to provide a cleaner more sustainable environment and a  
21 thriving economy for future generations.

22           We have made substantial progress towards our  
23 greenhouse gas reduction goals. The GHG inventory data  
24 show that emissions significantly decreased in 2020 when  
25 the global pandemic slowed economic activity. They

1 increased in 2021 as the economy recovered, but are  
2 projected to decrease again in 2022. Achieving a clean  
3 air future will require consistent and diligent  
4 implementation of our existing programs, creativity and  
5 innovation, equitable investments in communities, and a  
6 commitment to continually improve internal operations at  
7 CARB.

8 --o0o--

9 EXECUTIVE OFFICER CLIFF: As you heard in the  
10 video and know from your own experience, CARB made great  
11 strides last year to adopt new regulations and policies  
12 and we continue implementation of many existing efforts to  
13 support the goals laid out in our guiding policy  
14 documents, such as the Scoping Plan, the Mobile Source  
15 Strategy, the Blueprint 2.0, and the State Implementation  
16 Plans.

17 This year, implementation will be an even greater  
18 focus. Staff will also propose several regulatory and  
19 program updates to implement our climate and clean air  
20 plans and will take action to implement newly adopted  
21 legislation.

22 --o0o--

23 EXECUTIVE OFFICER CLIFF: In 2024, we will  
24 continue development of the next phase of light-duty  
25 vehicle greenhouse gas standards along with amendments to



1 Advanced Clean Cars II. We will also update Advanced  
2 Clean Trucks to address issues raised during early  
3 implementation.

4           The Low Carbon Fuel Standard is a key part of a  
5 comprehensive set of programs in California to cut  
6 greenhouse gas emissions and other smog-forming and toxic  
7 air pollutants by improving vehicle technology, reducing  
8 fuel consumption, and increasing transportation and  
9 mobility options. It is designed to decrease the carbon  
10 intensity of California's transportation fuels and provide  
11 an increasing range of low carbon and renewable  
12 alternatives, which reduce petroleum dependency and  
13 achieve air quality benefits.

14           The Board will also hear proposed updates to the  
15 Cap-and-Trade Program later this year. The Cap-and-Trade  
16 regulation establishes a declining limit on major sources  
17 of greenhouse gas emissions throughout California and  
18 creates a powerful economic incentive for significant  
19 investments in cleaner, more efficient technologies. CARB  
20 is making stringency updates to align the program with new  
21 GHG emission reduction targets of 85 percent by 2045.

22                           --o0o--

23           EXECUTIVE OFFICER CLIFF: CARB will continue to  
24 forge relationships with community partners to more fully  
25 understand the unique challenges faced by communities

1 across the state and work collaboratively with those  
2 communities to develop solutions. For example, CARB will  
3 continue to work alongside community members and air  
4 districts in both AB 617 communities and consistently  
5 nominated communities to reduce exposure to those most  
6 impacted by air pollution.

7 CARB has been developing a community engagement  
8 model through our partnerships with communities to develop  
9 a consistent and more equitable approach to our outreach  
10 and engagement. It is imperative that this model is built  
11 on the knowledge and expertise of communities throughout  
12 the state. Our goal is to ensure more equitable outcomes  
13 through a more equitable process.

14 --o0o--

15 EXECUTIVE OFFICER CLIFF: We will also continue  
16 our efforts to build partnerships with other states. As  
17 of December 2023, 17 states have adopted at least one of  
18 California's light- or heavy-duty motor vehicle  
19 regulations. Twelve of these states have already adopted  
20 Advanced Clean Cars II and 10 states have adopted Advanced  
21 Clean Trucks. To achieve our clean air and climate goals,  
22 we must also ask our federal partners to help address  
23 emissions generated from new interstate trucks,  
24 locomotives, and ocean-going vessels. We will continue to  
25 urge our federal partners to coordinate with us and take

1 action to limit emissions from these sources.

2 --o0o--

3 EXECUTIVE OFFICER CLIFF: Our work will also  
4 continue beyond California's borders. CARB and CalEPA  
5 entered into a critical memorandum of understanding with  
6 our border region partners, including the Government of  
7 the State of Baja California, and Secretariat for the  
8 Environment and Sustainable Development of Baja California  
9 to enhance cooperation on environmental protection. We  
10 will also continue our efforts to engage on a global  
11 scale. Last month at COP28, Chair Randolph kicked off our  
12 international climate initiative to reduce methane  
13 emissions with commitments from 15 signatories.

14 --o0o--

15 EXECUTIVE OFFICER CLIFF: This year, CARB will  
16 continue to innovate and build on the momentum we have  
17 already achieved to explore new frontiers through  
18 programs, regulations, and policies to better protect  
19 California communities.

20 --o0o--

21 EXECUTIVE OFFICER CLIFF: We will continue to  
22 push for pollution reductions from the off-road sector  
23 with development of programs to encourage cleaner  
24 equipment and technologies throughout the sector.

25 --o0o--

1 EXECUTIVE OFFICER CLIFF: We will also continue  
2 the momentum we have built to reduce emissions from  
3 freight to ensure cleaner air in communities near freight  
4 facilities and reduce the effect of climate -- effects of  
5 climate change.

6 --o0o--

7 EXECUTIVE OFFICER CLIFF: We will look at the  
8 buildings in which we live, work, and play to explore ways  
9 to reduce sources of emissions, including greenhouse gas  
10 emissions within buildings that impact our ambient air to  
11 ensure consumer products and appliances are not adversely  
12 impacting our health or our climate goals. Following the  
13 direction of recent legislation, CARB will work to develop  
14 the nation's first mandatory program to measure and reduce  
15 the embodied carbon in building materials and new  
16 buildings.

17 --o0o--

18 EXECUTIVE OFFICER CLIFF: As you know,  
19 transportation is the largest source of emissions in the  
20 state and even with the Advanced Clean Cars II Regulation,  
21 we are not yet on track to achieve carbon neutrality by  
22 2045. With zero-emission technologies -- excuse me, with  
23 zero-emission technologies alone.

24 We also need reductions in vehicle miles traveled  
25 to reduce emissions associated with transportation to get

1 us there. We will continue to work with State, local, and  
2 regional government partners to develop the creative and  
3 innovative land use and transportation strategies needed  
4 to support sustainable, equitable communities that reduce  
5 VMT in ways that meet the needs of historically  
6 marginalized communities and align with California's  
7 climate goals.

8 --o0o--

9 EXECUTIVE OFFICER CLIFF: We will continue  
10 pioneering our innovate research programs. This year, we  
11 plan to launch phase one of our methane satellites through  
12 public-private partnerships, providing CARB with plume  
13 images detected from space and working with program to  
14 find and fix potential leaks.

15 --o0o--

16 EXECUTIVE OFFICER CLIFF: CARB has been investing  
17 in clean air and zero-emissions technologies for quite  
18 some time now. CARB's first incentive program, the Carl  
19 Moyer Memorial Air Quality Standards Attainment Program,  
20 is celebrating its 25th anniversary this year. And as we  
21 celebrate that milestone by modernizing the program, we  
22 are also exploring new ways CARB's incentive programs can  
23 prioritize funding for low-income individuals and  
24 families, and support communities' zero-emission and VMT  
25 reduction goals, while continuing to promote innovation.

1                   --o0o--

2                   EXECUTIVE OFFICER CLIFF: Given the State  
3 deficit, the Governor recently -- recent budget proposal  
4 delays additional funding for many of our zero-emission  
5 vehicle and equipment incentive programs. However, we  
6 will still expect to receive funding for several of our  
7 programs, including the Carl Moyer Program that I just  
8 mentioned, the Community Air Protection Program, the Air  
9 Quality Improvement Program, and for zero-emission school  
10 buses. While we will likely see limited new funding  
11 coming this year, several of our other existing programs  
12 still have funds available that can support the deployment  
13 of zero-emission vehicles and equipment and community  
14 mobility projects.

15                   This year, we will also begin distributing funds  
16 for the new F-Gas Reduction Program, which offers \$65  
17 million to increase adoption of climate-friendly  
18 refrigerant technologies.

19                   --o0o--

20                   EXECUTIVE OFFICER CLIFF: California climate  
21 investments continues to support our transition to a  
22 carbon neutral economy by funding projects that build  
23 transit-oriented affordable housing, increasing mobility  
24 through transit, advanced zero-emission technologies, and  
25 much, much more. In the nearly 10 years since the first

1 appropriations to California climate investments programs  
2 were made in 2014, over half a million projects supported  
3 by \$9.8 billion of Cap-and-Trade auction proceeds are  
4 expected to reduce an estimated 98 million metric tons of  
5 CO2 equivalent with 74 percent of project funds benefiting  
6 priority populations.

7 --o0o--

8 EXECUTIVE OFFICER CLIFF: Are we off by a slide,  
9 I think we are.

10 Sorry.

11 CARB will continue looking for opportunities to  
12 leverage federal funding programs and utilize private  
13 partnerships to reduce costs to Californians. Last year,  
14 California was awarded 1.2 billion from the Department of  
15 Energy to advance our hydrogen roadmap through the  
16 Alliance for Renewable Clean Hydrogen Energy Systems  
17 public-private partnership. We expect to submit multiple  
18 applications for federal funding this year and will  
19 continue to explore all available opportunities as we seek  
20 to increase the impact of California's investments.

21 --o0o--

22 EXECUTIVE OFFICER CLIFF: Given the magnitude of  
23 the work needed to achieve a clean air future, we must  
24 ensure that CARB is operating as a highly efficient  
25 organization and improve internal operations to support

1 our organizational needs. This year, we will continue  
2 efforts to streamline our organization wherever possible,  
3 seeking improvements to better support our HR needs, as  
4 well as processing grants. We will continue to conduct  
5 the research and monitoring needed to guide future policy  
6 development and prepare for future regulations.

7 We will also explore ways to harness big data to  
8 better target and streamline enforcement efforts and  
9 refine our emissions inventories.

10 --o0o--

11 EXECUTIVE OFFICER CLIFF: Finally, we will  
12 continue to focus on equity, both internally and at our  
13 organization, as well as how we operationalize equity  
14 within our programs, policies, regulations, and actions.

15 --o0o--

16 EXECUTIVE OFFICER CLIFF: Embedding equity  
17 throughout CARB will be critical to build and inclusive,  
18 supportive, and diverse workforce that mirror's the  
19 diversity in the communities we serve and ensures we  
20 address long-standing inequities.

21 This year, through our Office of Racial Equity,  
22 we will conduct an entity inventory of all of CARB's  
23 programs, policies, and regulations. This inventory will  
24 provide valuable data to help us better understand how  
25 equity is currently being operationalized in our programs,



1 policies, regulations, and actions. We're also planning  
2 on sharing the findings from the pilot use of our racial  
3 equity lens, which will be an invaluable tool to ensure we  
4 embed racial equity in all that we do. We will continue  
5 to work to establish improved procedures for hiring and  
6 recruitment, with an eye towards building diversity  
7 throughout all levels of CARB. And our Diversity and  
8 Racial Equity Task Force known as DaER will continue to  
9 organize high quality trainings and activities to  
10 normalize conversations and actions that advance  
11 diversity, equity, and inclusion and belonging across the  
12 agency.

13 --o0o--

14 EXECUTIVE OFFICER CLIFF: There is substantial  
15 work to be done, but I'm confident that we will be able to  
16 rise to the challenge. The work that we have already done  
17 is paving the way for a healthier more equitable  
18 California. We will continue to build on that progress  
19 and make strides toward achieving California's clean air  
20 future in 2024 and beyond.

21 Thank you.

22 CHAIR RANDOLPH: All right. Thank you.

23 And a special shout-out to Margaret Sanchez and  
24 our amazing communications team who put together that  
25 lovely video.

1           So lets hear from the public who signed up to  
2 speak on this item and then we will have Board discussion.

3           BOARD CLERK LEVRINI: Thank you, Chair. We have  
4 one in-person commenter today. That is Julia Levin.

5           JULIA LEVIN: There we go. Try again.

6           Good afternoon, Board members and Chair Randolph.  
7 We -- Julia Levin with the Bioenergy Association of  
8 California.

9           We strongly support all of the 2024 priorities  
10 that Dr. Cliff presented, but the presentation omitted one  
11 really critical priority for both the climate an public  
12 health. And that is the reduction of short-live climate  
13 pollutants. Climate scientists around the world agree  
14 that that is the most urgent thing that we can do for the  
15 climate. It's is also the only measure that begins to  
16 cool the climate off right away or even for the next  
17 several decades, and it is required by State law. So we  
18 urge the staff and the Board to reprioritize the reduction  
19 of short-lived climate pollutants for 2024 and beyond.

20           On two related notes, we also urge the Air Board  
21 to move forward on implementation of the Advanced Clean  
22 Fleet resolution that you adopted last year, specifically  
23 the last paragraph that recognized the need and directed  
24 staff to come back to you, the Board, by 2025 with  
25 proposals for creating new multiple reliable markets for

1 biomethane, which is a critical part of the State's  
2 short-lived climate pollutant reduction strategy. And so  
3 we also urge you to include follow-up on that resolution  
4 as part of your 2024 priorities. This really needs to be  
5 done quickly, because it is slowing progress on the  
6 reduction of methane and other short-lived climate  
7 pollutants.

8           And finally, on the Low Carbon Fuel Standard, we  
9 were very happy to see the staff proposals and the  
10 workshops presented last year that would phase out  
11 undelivered biomethane, also known as book and claim, but  
12 the 45-day language that is out for public comment now  
13 does not do that. It never phases out undelivered  
14 biomethane for projects built before 2030. And for  
15 projects build after 2030, it doesn't phase it out until  
16 2040 or later and not very effectively with a lot of  
17 vagueness even then. This puts in-state projects at a  
18 severe disadvantage. It is also impeding our efforts to  
19 reduce short-lived climate pollutants.

20           Thank you.

21           BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Thank you. That concludes  
22 our in-person commenters. It looks like we have four  
23 people with their hands up in Zoom. So we'll hear from  
24 Sarah Deslauriers, David Rothbart, Steve Jepsen, and Susan  
25 Smith.

1           So Sarah, I have activated your microphone.  
2 Please unmute and you can begin.

3           SARAH DESLAURIERS: Excellent. Thank you. Can  
4 you hear me okay?

5           BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Yes, we can.

6           SARAH DESLAURIERS: Excellent. Thank you.

7           Good afternoon, Chair Randolph, Board, and staff.  
8 This is Sarah Deslauriers. I'm Climate Change Program  
9 Manager for the California Association of Sanitation  
10 Agencies and we represent over 90 percent of the sewered  
11 population of California.

12           We appreciate the opportunity to comment today on  
13 staff's 2024 priorities and support the State in its  
14 efforts to mitigate climate change. We also support, or I  
15 support, the comments that will be made by members today  
16 following me, as well as Julia Levin has made.

17           We note recognition of the need to focus on  
18 implementation of previously adopted programs to mitigate  
19 climate change, but also note the little mention of  
20 efforts toward short-lived climate pollutants or methane  
21 reduction in the priorities for 2024. During workshops  
22 and public hearings for the development of the 2022  
23 Scoping Plan update and the -- most recently the Advanced  
24 Clean Fleets regulations, our members expressed our sector  
25 does not have a long-term viable home for renewable

1 non-fossil fuel biogas generated from the sewage we all  
2 flush.

3           Even more so, when considering Senate Bill 1383,  
4 it requires food waste be diverted from landfills to waste  
5 water treatment plants. The addition of food waste could  
6 exponentially increase the amount of renewable fuel  
7 generated. And not all of this renewable fuel can be  
8 injected into a pipeline. Therefore, we need a variety of  
9 sustainable options for utilizing this by-product  
10 treatment process. Without options, wastewater treatment  
11 plants cannot accept the food waste and Senate Bill 1383  
12 will not be achieved, and we'll see landfill methane  
13 continue to be emitted.

14           So as part of the -- adopting the ACF Regulation  
15 in the response to our concerns, the Board adopted its  
16 Resolution 23-13. And the last paragraph requests  
17 coordination of meetings with various State agencies and  
18 stakeholders including CASA. We respectfully request the  
19 last paragraph for the resolution be included in your 2024  
20 priorities. Thank you again for your time and  
21 consideration and we look forward to working together.

22           BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Thank you.

23           David, I've activated your microphone. Please  
24 unmute and begin.

25           DAVID ROTHBART: Good afternoon. I'm David

1 Rothbart and I'm the Air Quality Committee Chair for Clean  
2 Water SoCal. We represent the public wastewater treatment  
3 sector in Southern California and we are members of CASA  
4 and support the comments provided by Sarah Deslauriers and  
5 Julia Levin. As our members expressed during the Advanced  
6 Clean Fleets hearings, we have a problem. When people  
7 flush their toilets, the treatment process generates a  
8 renewable non-fossil fuel. The problem is we don't have a  
9 long-term viable home for this renewable fuel, especially  
10 when SB 1383 requires food waste to be diverted from  
11 landfills to wastewater treatment plants.

12 SB 1383 could exponentially increase the amount  
13 of renewable fuel generated from our treatment plants. It  
14 is important to remember that all of this renewable fuel  
15 cannot go into the natural gas pipeline. We need a  
16 variety of reliable options for managing this by-product  
17 of the wastewater treatment process. Without such  
18 options, SB 1383 will not achieve the landfill methane  
19 emission reductions needed to address climate change.

20 Based upon these concerns, the Board adopted the  
21 last paragraph in Resolution 23-13 to coordinate meetings  
22 between various State agencies and stakeholders, such as  
23 CASA, to find a reliable home for this renewable resource.  
24 A significant amount of work is needed to resolve  
25 roadblocks for the use of this non-fossil renewable fuel.

1 Thus far, no meetings have been scheduled with our  
2 stakeholders as specified in the resolution. We  
3 respectfully request that the last paragraph in the  
4 resolution 23-13 be included in your 2024 -- excuse me --  
5 2024 priorities.

6 Thank you very much for your consideration.

7 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Thank you.

8 Steve, I have activated your microphone. Please  
9 unmute and begin.

10 STEVE JEPSEN: Hello, Chair Randolph and Board  
11 members. This is Steve Jepsen, Executive Director for  
12 Clean Water SoCal. We are a non-profit organization  
13 representing 80 public water, wastewater agencies in  
14 Southern California. My comments are focused on the need  
15 for follow through on the Advanced Clean Fleet Resolution  
16 23-13. I support the comments from Sarah Deslauriers with  
17 CASA, and David Rothbart, and Julia Levin with BAC.

18 The public wastewater sector is uniquely  
19 positioned to provide infrastructure and operations beyond  
20 our core wastewater treatment activities on greenhouse gas  
21 reduction projects, such as food waste diversion in  
22 support of SB 1383. Unfortunately, without multiple  
23 reliable pathways for our biogas, which cannot be turned  
24 off, it will be challenging for our agencies to help.  
25 This reality was the driver for the last paragraph in

1 Resolution 23-13, which has not been acted on.

2 SB 1440 can help some wastewater agencies, but  
3 pipeline injection is not a possible solution for all  
4 wastewater treatment plants, and pipeline injection does  
5 not provide all important resiliency. This is not a  
6 one-size-fits-all solution.

7 We heard about reliability issues with EV  
8 chargers earlier today. While not being able to charge  
9 your vehicle is certainly an inconvenience, imagine what  
10 happens when sewage cannot be collected and treated 100  
11 percent of the time. That's our requirement in all  
12 communities. When our sector communicates with CARB about  
13 the challenges, it is important to remember our interest  
14 is also to protect public health and the environment using  
15 public funds.

16 Based on the importance of maintaining reliable  
17 public services, we respectfully request prompt action on  
18 the last paragraph of Resolution 23-13 in year 2024.

19 Thanks for the opportunity to comment today.

20 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Thank you.

21 Susan I have activated your microphone. Please  
22 unmute and begin.

23 SUSAN SMITH: Good afternoon.

24 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: We can hear you.

25 SUSAN SMITH: Oh, sorry. Good afternoon,



1 Chairman and Board members. My name is Sue Smith and I'm  
2 with SeaHold, LLC. SeaHold is a strategic business  
3 development firm. Our focus is on renewable energy,  
4 specifically the conversion of organics to biomethane. We  
5 have been working in this arena for the last 25 years. We  
6 have seen many policy developments and the acceptance of  
7 biomethane into the larger state energy structures.

8           The 2024 priorities of the California Air  
9 Resources Board do not address short-term climate  
10 pollutants and how renewable biomethane will help reduce  
11 these. Biomass based renewable biomethane provides  
12 readily available fuels, which augment the existing fossil  
13 fuel contributions to the transportation sector.  
14 Renewable biomethane addresses reducing short-lived  
15 climate pollutants and greenhouse gas reductions and  
16 enables meeting the aggressive and doable goals the State  
17 has set forth via Senate Bill 1383.

18           We ask that the Board consider making clear and  
19 transparent policy decisions to implement solid market  
20 pathways for biomethane that do not make the producers  
21 guess where the fuels will be going.

22           Thank you for time and consideration.

23           BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Thank you.

24           And lastly, we have a phone number ending in 528.  
25 Oh, I believe they have disconnected, so that concludes

1 our commenters for this item.

2 CHAIR RANDOLPH: Okay. Thank you.

3 Staff, are there any issues raised in the  
4 comments that you want to address?

5 EXECUTIVE OFFICER CLIFF: No, but I wonder if I  
6 could take this opportunity to just thank a couple of the  
7 staff that helped me with the presentation. So as you see  
8 here, Caitlin Greenway and Andrea Morgan were instrumental  
9 in pulling together the presentation and script. And you  
10 already noted Margaret Sanchez who isn't here today -  
11 she's heading out on a much deserved vacation soon - who  
12 was the narrator for the video and helped pull that video  
13 together. So I just wanted to note them and thank them  
14 for their hard work. And, of course, all the staff that  
15 helped produce the material that ultimately goes into  
16 these presentations.

17 CHAIR RANDOLPH: Okay. Great. And I appreciate  
18 the comments on the resolution language and I will circle  
19 back with staff and see where we are in that process.

20 Okay. Now, it is -- we -- this is an  
21 informational item, so we don't have a record to close.  
22 So let's bring it to the Board for discussion.

23 Board Member De La Torre, I think raised his hand  
24 first.

25 BOARD MEMBER DE LA TORRE: It's not really about

1 2024, but it is about what we do here. Since this is our  
2 first meeting since COP, I wanted to highlight that  
3 nations at COP28 in Dubai a couple months ago -- last  
4 month, whenever it was, they approved a roadmap for  
5 transitioning away from fossil fuels. We did that in the  
6 Scoping Plan in the end of 2022. And so I just wanted  
7 to -- when I saw that headline, I thought they're running  
8 behind us as usual, and that that work is underway. I get  
9 questions about it a lot. The CEC is doing some baseline  
10 work, as I understand it, and then we will weigh in after  
11 they're done with whatever baseline work they're doing.

12 But it is underway. We are having the  
13 discussions about what does this transition look like.  
14 And again, we're way ahead of everybody else. And, you  
15 know, I think that that's something we should talk about  
16 more as we let people know what we do around here.

17 Thank you.

18 CHAIR RANDOLPH: Yeah. That's a great point. We  
19 are working with our sister agencies to kick off that  
20 working your process for the next step in that work.

21 Board Member Guerra.

22 BOARD MEMBER GUERRA: Thank you. Thank you,  
23 Madam Chair.

24 First, I wanted to just thank the staff for just  
25 an enormous amount of work that's being done. It's very

1 laudable, and exciting, and innovative. And I think to  
2 Board Member De La Torre's comments, we're leading the  
3 pack here and it's exciting to be part of that.

4 One area though where I'd like to engage much  
5 more and would like to follow up with the staff is from  
6 the comments on both wastewater treatment and also when it  
7 relates to other biomethane and biomass projects. And so  
8 I'd like to, you know, at least -- Chair, I don't know the  
9 appropriate way to do it, but I bring some attention to  
10 that point. And I know in the City of Sacramento, the  
11 region here, we have our bi-county regional solid waste  
12 authorities already looking at a hydrogen project with  
13 biomethane. And we'd like to figure out how we support  
14 that, so that those efforts -- so that there is a true  
15 market, there is a true approach of looking at how do we  
16 maximize this.

17 Along with that, the neighboring industry in  
18 agriculture here -- most of the Sacramento River basin is  
19 primarily agriculture, is also looking at bioresources as  
20 a way for the future. And I'd like to make sure that we  
21 take some staff time this year to really address those  
22 points, particularly for those -- as we see the federal  
23 government reducing the and tightening the PM numbers that  
24 are going to be out there. So it will impact burning  
25 for -- when it comes to -- you know, at least after the

1 harvest and all the pruning is done, that's going to  
2 impact it. We have to have an alternative to that. And I  
3 think this -- there's an -- there's an opportunity here  
4 for success in that.

5           So it's building on the work we've been doing and  
6 it's all, I think, connected towards the last paragraph of  
7 that resolution that we had, but it does mean multiple  
8 agencies have to be involved in this. And so I'd like to  
9 take that approach here, Madam Chair. And I'm not sure  
10 how best to do it, but I'd like to highlight that effort.

11           CHAIR RANDOLPH: Okay. Staff, did you want to  
12 respond at all or -- because it wasn't a specific  
13 question. I think it was just kind of highlighting an  
14 important issue.

15           EXECUTIVE OFFICER CLIFF: Yeah. Absolutely. And  
16 I'll just note I know we have an upcoming chance to sit  
17 down and chat. And so I look forward to learning more and  
18 seeing how we can help.

19           CHAIR RANDOLPH: Great. Okay.

20           Commissioner Rechtschaffen.

21           BOARD MEMBER RECHTSCHAFFEN: I have a question  
22 about the equity inventory. Who's going to conduct it,  
23 what will it consist of, and then what are the action  
24 items that will result from it? And maybe that's  
25 premature, but is it being done by our internal folks or

1 are we hiring some outside person, and do we have a  
2 template for that? Could you give us some more details,  
3 Steve.

4 EXECUTIVE OFFICER CLIFF: I'm wondering if  
5 Chanell is on, if you can speak more to the equity  
6 inventory question.

7 DEPUTY EXECUTIVE OFFICER FLETCHER: Sure. Happy  
8 to speak more to this. And Apologies that I couldn't be  
9 there in person. At this point, we are all sick, so that  
10 is why my camera is off. So for the equity inventory, we  
11 are in the middle of the process for this. So what I will  
12 say is that this is not something that I think we at CARB  
13 are going to be doing internally. We're actually con --  
14 hoping to contract with somebody externally to do this for  
15 us.

16 I think it will be -- honestly, it will be like  
17 a -- you know, a three-year, four-year process, because  
18 what we want to do with them is make sure that we do it  
19 right by really kind of making sure that they have time to  
20 gather information and data on who we are, really help us  
21 think about what kind of frameworks and rubrics that we  
22 want to set up, start doing some pilot programs to really  
23 think about like what does this look like, how do we try  
24 this out and see, and then I think actually kind of go  
25 forward in terms of looking at and doing that kind of full

1 assessment.

2           Once we're kind of in the place where we actually  
3 are kind of like entering into the contract and doing some  
4 of those things, we will be coming back to the Board  
5 through a memo to share more information on this effort,  
6 as well as other equity efforts that we talked about. But  
7 I'm always happy to kind of meet offline if folks want to  
8 hear a little bit more detail on this.

9           So hopefully that was helpful and that answered  
10 any questions, and happy to answer any other ones as well.

11           BOARD MEMBER RECHTSCHAFFEN: Thank you. I think  
12 it would be helpful -- (coughing) excuse me -- when you  
13 have more details in terms of what you're doing to come  
14 back and brief the Board on it. I think that -- we'd  
15 welcome that.

16           CHAIR RANDOLPH: Dr. Shaheen.

17           BOARD MEMBER SHAHEEN: Thanks so much for the  
18 really inspiring video - that was great - and the  
19 presentation. I was really excited to hear that, you  
20 know, these satellites are coming on board. And I just  
21 was curious what the plan might be to start to integrate  
22 data coming from the satellites, particularly in the area  
23 of methane tracking and plumes?

24           EXECUTIVE OFFICER CLIFF: Yeah. So one  
25 regulation that the Board heard last year -- it was

1 actually the first that will actually include methane data  
2 as a way to understand whether leaks need to be addressed  
3 and then including in the regu -- included in that  
4 regulation, this is our oil and gas reg that we updated  
5 last year was a requirement that if data had been  
6 identified via remote sensing, including satellites, that  
7 that -- there would then be a requirement for the operator  
8 to address those leaks, so that's one opportunity.

9           We're really looking forward to having this,  
10 because once you have the data, then you can go out and  
11 fix it, so it will actually help operators as well, but it  
12 will be a good transparency opportunity for us.

13           CHAIR RANDOLPH: Board Member Kracov.

14           BOARD MEMBER KRACOV: Yeah. Just following up on  
15 Board Member Rechtschaffen's comments. I also note that  
16 the -- that we're preparing a strategic plan for the DaRE  
17 operations, the internal operations, at the agency, and  
18 that that was circulated to the Board members recently.  
19 And I think as well as, you know, external efforts and  
20 internal efforts on these equity pieces. I know the Board  
21 is interested in the internal equity work. And when -- if  
22 there's opportunities for the Board to participate in the  
23 DaER strategic plan, or when it's finalized, but would  
24 love to see the results of that, and again find ways for  
25 the Board to keep tabs on that and support that work.



1 EXECUTIVE OFFICER CLIFF: Thank you. Appreciate  
2 that.

3 CHAIR RANDOLPH: All right.

4 Any other questions or comments?

5 Well, thank you Steve and team. It's going to be  
6 another busy year, so appreciate all that work.

7 And then I think the last item on our agenda is  
8 open public comment. So this is open comment for those  
9 who wish to provide a comment regarding an item of  
10 interest within the jurisdiction of the Board that is not  
11 on today's agenda.

12 The clerk will call on those who have submitted a  
13 request-to-speak card. And if you are joining us remotely  
14 and wish to comment, please click the raise-hand button or  
15 dial star nine now.

16 Clerk, will you please call the commenters?

17 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Yes. It looks like we have  
18 two remote commenters, a phone number ending 528 and then  
19 Sean Edgar.

20 So for the phone number ending in 528, you will  
21 hear a prompt when I activate your microphone, and please  
22 state your name for the record and you can go ahead and  
23 begin.

24 You can probably pushing star six, phone number  
25 ending in 528.

1           Okay. We'll try again, but let's move on to Sean  
2 Edgar. Sean, I have activated your microphone. Please  
3 unmute and begin.

4           SEAN EDGAR: Hi. Good afternoon. How is my  
5 volume?

6           BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Sounds good.

7           SEAN EDGAR: Great. Thank you. Good afternoon.  
8 This is Sean Edgar with Cleanfleets.net.

9           Before you today for a time-sensitive request,  
10 for an Advanced Clean Fleet reporting extension for high  
11 priority fleets. The data is due next week into the state  
12 TRUCRS system. And the request that I'm asking for is  
13 consistent with the extension that the Board granted in  
14 the initial reporting phase of the Truck and Bus  
15 Regulation. The reason I mention that is that based on  
16 the 2021 large entity reports that were summarized by  
17 Board staff when you -- when the Board adopted Advanced  
18 Clean Fleets, there are over 386,000 vehicles operated by  
19 more than 1,800 fleets, many of whom that were never  
20 previously required to report into the TRUCRS system.

21           Today there are thousands of vehicle records that  
22 are owned by hundreds of fleets that are already in the  
23 TRUCRS system that need manual updating in the next week,  
24 unless an extension is granted. There are hundreds of  
25 fleets that need to report from the -- for the first time.

1 And there are upload problems that staff has been  
2 troubleshooting nad been very accessible, but have not  
3 been resolved to date.

4           The December 28th enforcement notice that came  
5 out on Advanced Clean Fleets may give some relief to some  
6 fleet owners, but it really doesn't fix the problem. And  
7 what I mean by that is that both cities/counties, big box  
8 retailers that commonly ask our clients for reporting  
9 information each January in the form of a TRUCRS  
10 certificate, that can only be obtained through accurate  
11 reporting, which is impeded by the ongoing TRUCRS data  
12 receiving problems.

13           So staff has been very accessible, but not able  
14 to troubleshoot the issues for the successful reporting by  
15 affected fleets. For high priority fleets only, we're  
16 asking that you delay the initial reporting to April 1st  
17 to align with the State and local fleets deadline, and  
18 notice that those fleets also have to have an upload  
19 system that's operating flawlessly.

20           Dr. Vergis, has a much more detailed submittal,  
21 and we would ask that you look to give an extension,  
22 because there are only four more days until the reporting  
23 deadline. Thank you.

24           BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Thank you.

25           So we'll try the phone number ending in 528 one

1 more time. I've activated your microphone. You should be  
2 able to push star six.

3 Oh, it looks like you were unmuted for a second.  
4 It looks like you're back on mute, but if you could push  
5 star six.

6 There you go.

7 LAURA ROSENBERGER HAIDER: This is Laura  
8 Rosenberger Haider. Can you hear me?

9 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Yes, we can.

10 LAURA ROSENBERGER HAIDER: I think that the  
11 bicycle idea was a really great idea. Bicycles for  
12 everybody. Some -- a lot of people don't have money for  
13 cars at all and they have to get to work. And second of  
14 all, I think the -- you can't store carbon dioxide in the  
15 ground, because it will eventually leak like everything  
16 else, like all the methane gas leaks that we're having,  
17 because it actually brings -- when you put carbon dioxide  
18 into like oil wells -- abandoned oil wells into the  
19 ground -- I heard in New York State some company was going  
20 to use it as -- carbon dioxide storage underground as like  
21 a means of squeezing out methane gas. So that would just  
22 make more leaks and it won't store. The carbon dioxide  
23 would probably come out too.

24 All right. Thanks.

25 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Thank you.

1           And that concludes the commenters for this item.

2           CHAIR RANDOLPH: All right. Thank you.

3           This meeting is adjourned. Thank you so much.

4           (Thereupon the Air Resources Board meeting  
5           adjourned at 2:24 p.m.)

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

