

MEETING
STATE OF CALIFORNIA
AIR RESOURCES BOARD

ZOOM PLATFORM

CALIFORNIA ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY
BYRON SHER AUDITORIUM
1001 I STREET
SACRAMENTO, CALIFORNIA

THURSDAY, FEBRUARY 23, 2023

4:01 P.M.

JAMES F. PETERS, CSR
CERTIFIED SHORTHAND REPORTER
LICENSE NUMBER 10063

APPEARANCES

BOARD MEMBERS:

Liane Randolph, Chair

John Balmes, MD

Hector De La Torre

John Eisenhut

Senator Dean Florez

Eric Guerra

Davina Hurt

Gideon Kracov

Tania Pacheco-Werner, PhD

V. Manuel Perez

Bill Quirk, PhD

Susan Shaheen, PhD

Diane Takvorian

Supervisor Nora Vargas

STAFF:

Steve Cliff, PhD, Executive Officer

Edie Chang, Deputy Executive Officer, Planning, Freight,
and Toxics

Chanell Fletcher, Deputy Executive Officer, Environmental
Justice

Annette Hébert, Deputy Executive Officer, Southern
California Headquarters and Mobile Source Compliance

Edna Murphy, Deputy Executive Officer, Internal Operations

APPEARANCES CONTINUED

STAFF:

Rajinder Sahota, Deputy Executive Officer, Climate Change and Research

Craig Segall, Deputy Executive Officer, Mobile Sources and Incentives

Ellen Peter, Chief Counsel

Malinda Dumisani, Manager, State Strategy Section, Office of Community Air Protection (OCAP)

Andrea Juarez, Air Pollution Specialist, State Strategy Section, OCAP

Abigail May, Senior Attorney, Legal Office

Brian Moore, Manager, Community Planning Section, OCAP

Femi Olaluwoye, Branch Chief, Community Planning Branch, OCAP

David Ridley, Manager, Advanced Monitoring Techniques Section, Monitoring and Laboratory Division (MLD)

Jeremy Smith, Staff Air Pollution Specialist, Advanced Monitoring Techniques Section, MLD

Laura Zarembo-Schmidt, Staff Air Pollution Specialist, Community Planning Section, OCAP

ALSO PRESENT:

Asencion Aguayo

Eddie Ahn, Brightline Defense

Kalie Bonomo, California Air Pollution Control Officers Association

John Bottorff, CleanEarth4Kids.org

Aude, Bouagnon, PhD, Physicians for Social Responsibility

APPEARANCES CONTINUED

ALSO PRESENT:

Barry Boyd

Wesley Campbell, Environmental Justice League

Rosa Casillas-Gutierrez

Lourdes Castillo

Tim Cromartie, Environmental Justice League

Esther Cuevas

Alan De Salvio, Mojave Desert Air Quality Management District

Kamillah Ealom

Evan Edgar, Compost Coalition

Richard Falcon, United Latinos

Paula Forbis, San Diego Air Pollution Control District

Bertha Garcia

Lillian Garcia, United for Justice

Kevin Hamilton, Central California Asthma Collaborative

Madeline Harris, Leadership Counsel for Justice and Accountability

Arieann Harrison, Marie Harrison Community Foundation

Jennifer Holden

Suzanne Hume, CleanEarth4Kids.org

Mariela Loera, Leadership Counsel for Justice and Accountability

Lonnie Mason, First Generation

Josie Morales, United Latinos

APPEARANCES CONTINUED

ALSO PRESENT:

Wayne Nastri, South Coast Air Quality Management District
Guadalupe Nuñez

Mykela Patton, New Voices Are Rising

Eric Payne, The Central Valley Urban Institute

Suma Peesapati, Bay Area Air Quality Management District

Michelle Pierce, Bayview Hunters Point Community Advocates

Adrian Rehn, Valley Vision

Laura Rosenberger Haider

Sharon, Robla Park Community Association

Janice Lam Snyder, Sacramento Metropolitan Air Quality
Management District

Jeff Solomon

Kimberly Tapscott-Munson

Andrea Uribe, Leadership Counsel for Justice and
Accountability

Vincent Valdez, South Sacramento Steering Committee

Mai Vang, Sacramento City Council Member, Sacramento
Metropolitan Air Quality Management District

Trinity Vang, Brightline Defense

Kieshaun White, Environmental Justice League

LaDonna Williams, All Positives Possible

Mark Williams, Environmental Justice League

INDEX

	<u>PAGE</u>
Call to Order	1
Roll Call	1
Opening Remarks	2
Item 23-2-1	
Chair Randolph	23
Executive Officer Cliff	23
Alan De Salvio	25
Motion	26
Vote	26
Item 23-2-2	
Chair Randolph	27
Executive Officer Cliff	29
Staff Presentation	32
Mariela Loera	57
Janice Lam Snyder	59
Adrian Rehn	60
Richard Falcon	62
Arieann Harrison	64
Michelle Pierce	65
Aude Bouagnon	67
Suma Peesapati	70
Mykela Patton	73
Mai Vang	75
Wayne Nastri	79
Lillian Garcia	81
Kalie Bonomo	84
Jennifer Holden	85
Josie Morales	87
Paula Forbis	89
Jeff Solomon	92
Vincent Valdez	93
Esther Cuevas	96
Lourdes Castillo	96
Bertha Garcia	97
Rosa Casillas-Gutierrez	98
Asencion Aguayo	99
Guadalupe Nu ez	100
Andrea Uribe	101
Madeline Harris	102
LaDonna Williams	104
Trinity Vang	107
Sharon	108

INDEX CONTINUED

	<u>PAGE</u>
Item 23-2-2 (continued)	
Kamillah Ealom	110
Eddie Ahn	112
Laura Rosenberger Haider	114
Kevin Hamilton	114
Staff Response to Comments	117
Board Discussion and Q&A	121
Motion	146
Vote	147
Public Comment	
Mark Williams	149
Eric Payne	151
Kimberly Tapscott-Munson	154
Kieshaun White	156
Tim Cromartie	159
Wesley Campbell	161
Evan Edgar	163
LaDonna Williams	165
Barry Boyd	167
Suzanne Hume	169
John Bottorff	172
Lonnie Mason	174
Adjournment	176
Reporter's Certificate	177

PROCEEDINGS

1
2 CHAIR RANDOLPH: Good afternoon. The February
3 23rd, 2023 public meeting of the California Air Resources
4 Board will come to order.

5 Board Clerk, will you please call the roll.

6 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Dr. Balmes?

7 BOARD MEMBER BALMES: Here.

8 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Mr. De La Torre?

9 BOARD MEMBER DE LA TORRE: Here.

10 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Mr. Eisenhut?

11 BOARD MEMBER EISENHUT: Eisenhut here.

12 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Senator Florez?

13 BOARD MEMBER FLOREZ: Florez here.

14 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Assemblymember Garcia?
15 Mr. Guerra?

16 BOARD MEMBER GUERRA: Guerra here.

17 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Ms. Hurt?

18 BOARD MEMBER HURT: Davina present.

19 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Mr. Kracov?

20 BOARD MEMBER KRACOV: Here.

21 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Dr. Pacheco-Werner?

22 BOARD MEMBER PACHECO-WERNER: Here.

23 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Mr. Perez?

24 BOARD MEMBER PEREZ: Here.

25 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Mr. Quirk?

1 Senator Stern?

2 Dr. Shaheen?

3 BOARD MEMBERS SHAHEEN: Present.

4 CHAIR RANDOLPH: Ms. Takvorian?

5 BOARD MEMBER TAKVORIAN: Takvorian here.

6 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Supervisor Vargas?

7 Chair Randolph?

8 CHAIR RANDOLPH: Here.

9 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Madam Chair, we have a
10 quorum.

11 CHAIR RANDOLPH: All right. Thank you very much.
12 Before we launch into today's proceedings, I'd like to
13 take a few minutes to acknowledge recent changes to our
14 Board membership.

15 It is my distinct pleasure to introduce and
16 welcome the four newest members of the California Air
17 Resources Board appointed by Governor Newsom in January,
18 as well as to welcome back two colleagues.

19 Susan Shaheen was appointed as the automotive
20 member of the Board. Dr. Shaheen is a professor of civil
21 and environmental engineering at UC Berkeley with over 25
22 years of research. She has studies electrification and
23 alternative fuels, innovative mobility strategies,
24 behavioral dynamics, and public policy as it relates to
25 sustainable transportation and social equity.

1 Bill Quirk was appointed as a public member of
2 the Board. During his tenure as representative for
3 District 20 in the State Assembly, Dr. Quirk worked to
4 reduce greenhouse gases while achieving affordable and
5 reliable energy and recognized the needs of those most
6 impacted by fossil fuel pollution. He also fought to
7 protect Californians from toxic substances in consumer
8 products. Fun fact, Dr. Quirk was a pioneer in climate
9 modeling. He developed NASA's first climate model in the
10 1970s.

11 Eric Guerra was appointed as the Sacramento
12 Metropolitan Air Quality Management District member of the
13 Board. Mr. Guerra currently serves the City of Sacramento
14 as Vice Mayor and has been a City Council member since
15 2015. He has worked to equitably address the impacts of
16 climate change and protect community health, including by
17 helping to establish electric school bus fleets, charging
18 stations, electric vehicle ride share auctions, and air
19 quality monitoring systems.

20 V. Manuel Perez was appointed as the Mojave
21 Desert Air Quality Management District member of the
22 Board. Mr. Perez is the Supervisor for the Fourth
23 District of Riverside County, a post he has held since
24 2017. Prior to that, he authored legislation as a
25 California State Assembly Member on a wide variety of

1 subjects, including economic development, health care
2 access, infrastructure, renewable energy, transportation,
3 air quality, and the environment.

4 I'm pleased to welcome back Board members John
5 Eisenhut and Diane Takvorian who were reappointed to the
6 Board as the agriculture and public members respectively.
7 Welcome to you all. We're grateful to have your
8 expertise, and I look forward to working with you to serve
9 California and advance our clean air and climate goals.

10 Today, we also bid farewell to two long-serving
11 and deeply valued members of the California Air Resources
12 Board, Vice Chair Sandra Berg and Dr. Daniel Sperling.

13 Sandy Berg was appointed to the Board by Governor
14 Arnold Schwarzenegger in 2004. And in 2015, she was
15 elected by the Board to serve as Vice Chair. During her
16 time on the board, she has chaired several committees,
17 overseeing roughly a billion dollars of public emissions
18 reduction incentive funding, facilitated key policy
19 implementation groups, and helped guide the transition to
20 and opening of CARB's new Southern California Laboratory
21 in Riverside.

22 Over the course of her career, she has combined
23 her business acumen and dedication to community. As
24 President and CEO of the Berg Family Companies, Chairman
25 Emeritus of the Board of American Coatings Association,

1 past Board member of the Hollenbeck Policy Activity
2 League, and through her contributions to numerous other
3 community organizations and efforts, she has brought the
4 unique and practical perspective these experiences have
5 given to her work on the CARB Board. And her formal
6 biography does not reflect the hours and hours of
7 dedication, and hard work, and herding of cats that Vice
8 Chair Berg did in her roll on the Board. She helped
9 construct programs, such as the Clean Fuels Rewards
10 Program and worked on the working group -- the IPAD
11 Working Group with Board members Hurt and Kracov and I'm
12 sure you'll hear from both of the shortly. And just her
13 willing to roll up her sleeves and get the work done and
14 implement what we need to implement and help set the
15 policy has just been invaluable and she will be very much
16 missed.

17 Dan Sperling was appointed to the Board by Govern
18 Arnold Schwarzenegger in 2007 and reappointed by Governor
19 Edmund G. Brown, Jr. in 2011. Recognized as a leading
20 international policy expert on the technology, energy, and
21 environmental aspects of transportation, Dr. Sperling is
22 the Distinguished Blue Planet Prize Professor of Civil
23 Engineering and Environmental Science and Policy, as well
24 as founding director of the Institute of Transportation
25 Studies at the University of California, Davis.

1 He has served as chair of the California Fuel
2 Cell Partnership and of the Transportation Research Board
3 of the National Academies and has testified to the U.S.
4 Congress on alternative fuels and advanced vehicle
5 technology. Dr. Sperling has authored hundreds of
6 technical articles and 12 books, including *Two Billion*
7 *Cars* and *Three Revolutions: Steering Automated, Shared,*
8 *and Electric Vehicles to a Better Future.* His deep
9 knowledge, sense of humor, and quick wit have made the
10 Board's difficult and complex discussions both
11 scientifically rigorous and accessible to all.

12 Again, the formal bio doesn't really represent
13 Dan's incredible warmth and patience in explaining his
14 decades of work in this field to a newbie CARB Chair over
15 the last two years, which has been incredibly invaluable.
16 And his roll in convening the greatest minds in electric
17 vehicles, in zero-emission vehicles, in transportation is
18 just such a critical role for the state of California.
19 And we are so fortunate to have a world leader like him
20 here in California and working with CARB and with our
21 staff to change the world.

22 And so again, I'm going to very much miss Dan and
23 the thoughts he shares on the dais and in private, and
24 I'll miss you very much.

25 So I want to take a moment and allow space for

1 any other Board members who would like to say a few words.

2 Dr. Balmes is ready with his hand up in Zoom, so
3 I'm going to call on your first.

4 BOARD MEMBER BALMES: Thank you, Chair Randolph.
5 I wanted to go first in part because of my deep affection
6 and respect for both Dan and Sandy, but also because I
7 think I'm now the longest serving Board member after
8 the -- after Sandy and Dan have left. And I won't go on
9 and on, because I know other Board members want to speak,
10 but I'll start off with saying something that I've said
11 for a long time, Sandy without question was the hardest
12 working Board member during my tenure on the Board, which
13 is a long time now. And as Chair Randolph said, her words
14 of bio don't do justice to the contributions she's made to
15 this agency. And to say she will be missed is putting it
16 mildly. And not only that, I will miss her as a friend.

17 I mean, I hope to stay in touch socially, but
18 I'll miss her as a friend every -- I looked forward to
19 seeing Sandy every Board meeting in person, because I
20 loved to see her smile and always got that Sandy hug. And
21 I'm going to miss that as well as your major
22 contributions. Whenever I was unsure whether a proposed
23 regulation would be harmful economically in California, I
24 would turn to Sandy for her wisdom.

25 And in terms of Dan, boy, am I going to miss

1 sparring with the other professor. I mean, I think my
2 fellow Cal faculty member, Dr. Shaheen, is -- you know,
3 she will do well filling your shoes, but I don't think I
4 will be able to tease her the way I could tease you. We
5 were always in competition about who had the most former
6 graduate students serving at the agency.

7 Dan, I always turn to you, especially on
8 transportation issues for your wisdom, and I'm going to
9 really miss that. So, in fact, I will turn to you, you
10 know, for your opinion anyway, even if you're no longer on
11 the Board. I think I'm still allowed to do that.

12 So I know other people want to speak, but, you
13 know, I'm trying not to choke up, but, you know, Sandy and
14 Dan let's stay in touch. You've been great friends as
15 well as great Board members.

16 CHAIR RANDOLPH: Board Member De La Torre.

17 BOARD MEMBER DE LA TORRE: What a unique
18 situation that we have these two stellar Board members
19 that happen to be married that are here and --

20 BOARD MEMBER BALMES: I was trying to leave that
21 alone.

22 (Laughter).

23 BOARD MEMBER DE LA TORRE: It's a -- it's a
24 pretty obvious one, John.

25 (Laughter).

1 BOARD MEMBER DE LA TORRE: So this expertise
2 coming from the two areas that has been mentioned already
3 is tremendous, but I'll speak to each one. I think what
4 Liane touched on on Sandy's Jack of all Trades
5 troubleshoot -- I just think of her as a troubleshooter
6 for this Board, both with Mary and with Liane. She has --
7 Sandy has filled this role that is needed sometimes where
8 there's something that's not quite where it needs to be,
9 and, you know, we can't do it from here. The Chair is,
10 you know, obviously, you know, the leader of the
11 organization and pushing on new fronts. And then
12 sometimes there's stuff that we've left behind that hasn't
13 quite come together and it's -- and it's just kind of
14 there and we need resolution, and that was Sandy. Sandy
15 would be the one that got sent in to these not-so-great
16 situations and every time came out with a result, with
17 everyone being heard, with everyone's input being
18 respected, and just her warmth and her intelligence comes
19 through in those settings. And clearly every time she got
20 those assignments, she would deliver for us. And so we
21 didn't even have to worry about it. You know, Sandy is a
22 taking care of it and it got taken care of.

23 So it is a very underappreciated thing in an
24 organization like this, but those of us on this Board
25 absolutely appreciated you for doing it, because, A, it

1 meant we didn't have to do it, and B, it got done. And so
2 it allowed the Chairs to just keep moving forward without
3 having to look back to some messy meddling thing that was
4 out there. So thank you, Sandy, for that.

5 And then Dan, I just told him, you know, before
6 this, one on one. I came on in fall of 2011. The final
7 touches of the Obama standards -- passenger vehicle
8 standards were done and there was an agenda. You know,
9 there was a meeting like two, three months -- early 2012
10 on this massive policy, national and State policy, that I
11 had no idea of what the hell was going on. And so Dan
12 really -- I leaned on what Dan was saying leading up to
13 that, because, you know, he was a transportation guy, so
14 here you go to the expert.

15 And we also discussed just a little while ago, we
16 had no idea, even he had no idea that all the things that
17 we laid out in those 2012 standards were going to come to
18 pass and come to pass early. They all happened and ahead
19 of schedule. So that just affirmed to me, you know, that
20 it's good to listen to Dan. It's good to lean on the
21 expertise that we have on this Board. It is -- it is
22 constituted in this way on purpose, because you want to
23 have that expertise here, not just here. And so I greatly
24 appreciate it. And it wasn't just that. I mean over time
25 there were other issues, transportation issues, that Dan

1 really helped us to think about and frame what we were
2 doing.

3 And so to the both of you, thank you. You will
4 be greatly missed. The collegiality of this Board and the
5 collaboration that happens in the Board is extremely
6 important to this organization. I don't think there's
7 anything more important. And the two of you absolutely
8 contributed to that as well.

9 Thank you.

10 CHAIR RANDOLPH: Board Member Kracov.

11 BOARD MEMBER KRACOV: Thank you, Chair.

12 Dr. Balmes, I thought you were going to say you
13 had to go first because you're Durban, South Africa or
14 Perth, Australia and it's like 3 o'clock in the morning.

15 And I'm sorry that I'm on Zoom today. I'm
16 assuming that Dan and Sandy are in the room, you know,
17 listening to us say all these nice things about them. I
18 wish I could be there with you.

19 You know, just very quickly, Dan, you know,
20 there's so many great things to say about Professor Dan
21 Sperling. Of course, we all know the best thing about Dan
22 is Sandy.

23 But seriously, when we think of your leadership
24 on the Board, the thing that stands out above all others
25 is how you approach our work. You know, you've taught me,

1 you know, us, that the best science the best data are the
2 hallmarks that make CARB so special, that that's what
3 makes CARB's culture of excellence. It's the science,
4 using our reason, the best facts that have made our
5 decision-making and this agency so effective. And, of
6 course, in today's world, sometimes science, the facts are
7 under attack, but not here at CARB. You, Dan, are always
8 prepared to hold the line. Each and every Board meeting
9 us Board members rely on you, Dan, for that.

10 And we know that if we can continue to tether
11 ourselves to the best science, the best reasoning, we at
12 CARB will be okay no matter what the challenge that CARB,
13 that California, we will continue to succeed and lead the
14 world. And speaking of leading the world, look at what
15 you've accomplished as founder of the UC Davis Institute
16 Of Transportation studies. Now, you're looking to expand
17 to India, to Paris, France. Wow, what a next chapter for
18 you, Dan.

19 So thank you for that. Thank you for taking my
20 son and me on a bike tour of UC Davis when he was
21 considering colleges. You know, thank you for helping to
22 mentor and train your successor at CARB, Dr. Susan
23 Shaheen. You know, what a lesson in leadership that is.
24 So it's au revoir for now, Professor Sperling, until we
25 cross paths again. And we wish, you know, you and Sandy,

1 you know, and your family all the best.

2 And Chair, can I say a word about Sandy Berg?

3 CHAIR RANDOLPH: Yep.

4 BOARD MEMBER KRACOV: So, Sandy, you know, thanks
5 so much always for being so supportive and gracious to me.
6 We've had the opportunity to work closely and work really
7 hard together as you do on so many things, as the other
8 Board members have mentioned. But for us, particularly on
9 the mobile sources issues, the Incentive Program Advisory
10 Group with Mayor Hurt on ways to reform Carl Moyer, or
11 even more recently in our multiple all-day workshops on
12 the super critical Advanced Clean Fleet Rule. And at each
13 setting, Sandy, you're a voice for progress, a voice for
14 small business, a voice for reason, and efficiency. And
15 we and Dan, too, have become personal friends. You are
16 always there to talk to me, always there to lend a hand to
17 me.

18 But, you know, Sandy - and now I can see your
19 face - they say what matters is not always how someone
20 treats you, but how they treat others. So how does Sandy
21 treat others? Wow. Sandy is the kind of person who goes
22 around the room identifying for each and every person what
23 their special super powers are. You know that, Sandy.
24 Making people feel good, bringing out the best in them. I
25 don't care if it's Chair Randolph, Dr. Cliff, our staff,

1 the parking attendant across the street, the waiter at the
2 restaurant, your employees at Ellis Point Company, and
3 Pacific Resource Recovery Services, you have modeled for
4 all of us how to be a Board Member. You know, patient,
5 positive, empathetic leadership.

6 And this is from a person that sometimes such
7 patient leadership doesn't always come easy, but that's
8 how you lead, you know, how you've gotten things done.
9 And I and we have learned so much from you. So now it's
10 time to give all of those blessings to other pursuits, to
11 spend time with your wonderful grandkids, you know, and
12 Dan. You're truly going to be missed. You know, but know
13 that your legacy lives on in all the Board members, all
14 the staff, all the stakeholders that you have mentored in
15 so many ways, the example of excellence that you've set
16 every time, and look at the strength and vitality of CARB
17 today. It's CARB that you and Professor Sperling helped
18 to build.

19 So thanks for everything, Sandy and Dan.

20 CHAIR RANDOLPH: Dr. Pacheco-Werner.

21 BOARD MEMBER PACHECO-WERNER: Hi. Thank you so
22 much. And just want to just briefly just thank Dr.
23 Sperling for his critical thinking and always pushing us
24 towards thinking about an alternate future of California
25 that isn't just car dependent for solutions. And I think,

1 you know, I'm going to keep that with me. And in my rest
2 of the time on this Board and just really appreciate your
3 thoughtfulness and challenging questioning that you've
4 done and really consider you somebody that, you know, I
5 looked up to on this Board and will definitely think
6 about, you know, that kind of what would -- what would Dr.
7 Sperling think in this moment, what would he ask in this
8 moment as I think about my time.

9 And then also, you know, Sandy just, you know,
10 what can I say, so many nice -- you know, just I so admire
11 you. You know, thank you for your honesty, your search
12 for the truth, and most of all your compassionate approach
13 to rulemaking that always sought the biggest benefits to
14 public health, while keeping people and the importance of
15 their lives in the balance as well. And, you know, I
16 just -- I really consider you a mentor and I just will so
17 miss you greatly and just thank you. Before I get
18 emotional, I'll stop. Thanks.

19 CHAIR RANDOLPH: Board Member Takvorian.

20 BOARD MEMBER TAKVORIAN: Thank you. I really
21 wish I was there, but now I can see you on the screen, so
22 that's awesome.

23 Hi.

24 I'm going to start with Dan and say I really
25 appreciate your expertise and leadership on the transition

1 to zero-emission cars so much. I hope that you are taking
2 so much pride in knowing that you were part of crafting
3 the continuous evolution to zero-emission. You really
4 were an architect of that -- of that transition that we're
5 in now. And I hope you know that and I think the whole
6 world needs to know that, if they don't already. And I
7 guess they will in Paris, and India, and all the other
8 places that you're going.

9 But we're taking that as just the way that life
10 is now, but I know it took a whole lot of hard work and a
11 lot of bucking the system in order for that to happen.
12 And while we often disagreed, especially about transit, I
13 have to say that, just to be honest, I always learned a
14 lot from you. And I hope that your door will still be
15 open for me to come and ask you questions and tap your
16 expertise, because I want you to know how much I really
17 respect it, and respect you, and look up to you for that.
18 So thank you so much, Dan.

19 So Sandy, so much has been said that I agree
20 with. And as has been described, I really feel like
21 you're a super human. You're so smart. You're so kind.
22 You are so generous, and for me, such a beacon of
23 integrity and wisdom. But the thing I feel like we all
24 know that hasn't been said is I really respect your
25 heartfelt introspection about your own role, and your

1 industry's role, and the relationship to environmental
2 justice communities. I mean, nobody has put that out in
3 the way that you have, and been so honest about it, and so
4 clear about the introspection that you and your family
5 have done in order to recognize that and to really craft a
6 set of fair, and reasonable, and effective rules. And
7 you've really been at the forefront of that. And I know
8 that that's come from a lot of struggle, your own personal
9 struggle, and I respect that so much and I look up to you
10 so much. And hope that I can be that open about truths I
11 think are very clear in my own life. I think we all need
12 to check ourselves about what we think is true and what
13 we -- what we've grown up with. And I feel like you're
14 really a role model in that regard. And I appreciate you
15 so much and I'm going to miss you.

16 Thank you.

17 CHAIR RANDOLPH: Board Member Hurt.

18 BOARD MEMBER HURT: I feel like I should just say
19 ditto, but I'll be brief, because I did reach out to them
20 earlier today and just for the public speak a little bit
21 of what I think of their amazing leadership.

22 Dan, always took my call. You were a great
23 teacher of the very technical. For me, it was like
24 drinking from a fire hose when I got on this Board. And
25 so I still appreciated how you broke things down, as the

1 Chair said, and made us all smart with all the research
2 and work that you've done.

3 You are just so grounded and easy to talk to. I
4 think folks know that. They've said that. And it was
5 funny. Someone said, have you seen him on John Stewart's
6 show. He's a celebrity. And I said what? No way. So,
7 folks, go out, check out that episode. Dan is just such a
8 silent grounded superstar. So appreciate the work that we
9 did together. And I hope in the future we'll do more work
10 together.

11 Sandy, in my short time on the Board, I made such
12 a strong connection with you. Your leadership, your
13 professionalism, your kindness, your willingness to do
14 everything you can to find the solution was such an
15 inspiration to me. You being assertive and just
16 determined and outspoken. I mean, the list can go on and
17 on. And I've learned a lot from you just on the short
18 time. And your successes were a great inspiration to me.
19 And you both will be greatly missed. But again, I hope we
20 can find time for lunch or dinner and work more together
21 in the future.

22 Thank you for your public service. Thank you.

23 CHAIR RANDOLPH: Thank you so much and thank you,
24 everyone, for taking a moment to thank you both for the
25 collective 35 years of dedication that you have provided

1 to CARB and the State of California and we will miss you.

2 (Applause).

3 CHAIR RANDOLPH: Okay. Now, we will take a
4 breath and move on to mundane housekeeping items.

5 We are conducting today's meeting in person as
6 well as offering remote options for public participation
7 both by phone and in Zoom.

8 Anyone who wishes to testify in person should
9 fill out a request to speak card available in the foyer
10 outside the auditorium. Please turn it into a Board
11 assistant prior to commencement of the item. If you are
12 participating remotely, you will raise your hand in Zoom
13 or dial star nine, if calling in by phone. The Clerk will
14 provide further details regarding how public participation
15 will work in a moment.

16 For safety reasons, please note the emergency
17 exit to the rear of the room through the foyer. In the
18 event of a fire alarm, we are required to evacuate this
19 room immediately and go down the stairs to the lobby and
20 out of the building. When the all-clear signal is given,
21 we will return to the auditorium and resume the hearing.

22 A closed captioning feature is available for
23 those of you joining us in the Zoom environment. In order
24 to turn on subtitles, please look for a button labeled
25 "CC" at the bottom of the Zoom window as shown in the

1 example on the screen now. I would like to take this
2 opportunity to remind everyone to speak clearly and from a
3 quiet location, whether you are joining us in Zoom or
4 calling in by phone.

5 Interpretation services will be provided today in
6 Spanish. If you are joining us using Zoom, there is a
7 button labeled "Interpretation" on the Zoom screen. Click
8 on that interpretation button and select Spanish to hear
9 the meeting in Spanish. If you are joining us here in
10 person and would like to listen to the meeting in Spanish,
11 please notify a Board assistant and they will provide you
12 with further instructions. I want to remind all of our
13 speakers to speak slowly and pause intermittently to allow
14 the interpreters the opportunity to accurately interpret
15 your comments.

16 (Interpreter translated in Spanish).

17 THE INTERPRETER: Thank you, Chair Randolph.
18 Back to you.

19 CHAIR RANDOLPH: Thank you. I will now ask the
20 Board Clerk to provide more details on today's procedures.

21 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Thank you.

22 Good afternoon, everyone. I will be providing
23 additional information on how public participation will be
24 organized for today's meeting.

25 We will first be calling on any in-person

1 commenters who have turned in a request-to-speak card and
2 then we will be calling on commenters who are joining us
3 remotely. If you are joining us remotely and wish to make
4 a verbal comment on one of today's Board items or during
5 the open comment period at the end of today's meeting, you
6 must be using Zoom webinar or calling in by telephone. If
7 you are currently watching the webcast on CAL-SPAN, but
8 you wish to comment remotely, please register for the Zoom
9 webinar or call in. Information for both can be found on
10 the public agenda for today's meeting.

11 To make a verbal comment, we will be using the
12 raise-hand feature in Zoom. If you wish to speak on a
13 Board item, please virtually raise your hand as soon as
14 the item has begun to let us know you wish to speak. To
15 do this, if you are using a computer or tablet, there is a
16 raise-hand button. And if you are calling in on the
17 telephone, dial star nine to raise your hand. Even if you
18 previously indicated which item you wish to speak on when
19 you registered, you must raise your hand at the beginning
20 of the item, so that you can be added to the queue.

21 If you will be giving your verbal comment in
22 Spanish and require an interpreter's assistance, please
23 indicate so at the beginning of your testimony and our
24 translator will assist you. During your comment, please
25 pause after each sentence to allow for the interpreter to

1 translate your comment into English.

2 When the comment period starts, the order of
3 commenters will be determined by who raises their hand
4 first. We will call each commenter by name and will
5 activate each commenter's audio when it is their turn to
6 speak. And for those calling in, we will identify you by
7 the last three digits of your phone number. We will not
8 show a list of remote commenters, however, we will be
9 announcing the next three or so commenters in the queue,
10 so you are ready to testify and know who is coming up
11 next. Please note, you will not appear by video during
12 your testimony. I would also like to remind everyone to
13 please state your name for the record before you speak.
14 This is especially important for those calling in by phone
15 to testify on an item.

16 We will have a time limit for each commenter and
17 we'll begin the comment period with a three-minute time
18 limit, although this could change at the Chair's
19 discretion. During public testimony, you will see a timer
20 on the screen. And for those calling in by phone, we will
21 run the timer and let you know when you have 30 seconds
22 left and then when your time is up. If you require
23 Spanish interpretation for your comment, your time will be
24 doubled.

25 If you wish to submit written comments today,

1 please visit CARB's send-us-your-comments page or look at
2 the public agenda on our webpage for links to send these
3 documents electronically. Written comments will be
4 accepted on each item until the Chair closes the record
5 for that Board item.

6 And if you experience any technical difficulties,
7 please call (805)772-2715 so that an IT person can assist.
8 This number is also noted on the public agenda.

9 Thank yo. I'll turn the microphone back to Chair
10 Randolph now.

11 CHAIR RANDOLPH: Thank you.

12 The first item on the agenda is Item number
13 23-2-1, the Western Mojave Desert 70 ppb ozone attainment
14 plan. If you are here with us in the room and wish to
15 comment on this item, please fill out a request-to-speak
16 card as soon as possible and submit it to a Board
17 assistant. If you are joining us remotely and wish to
18 comment, please click on the raise hand button or dial
19 start nine now. We call on in-person commenters first
20 followed by remote commenters when we get to the public
21 comment portion of this item.

22 Dr. Cliff, would you please summarize the item.

23 EXECUTIVE OFFICER CLIFF: Thank you, Chair
24 Randolph. Before you today is the Western Mojave Desert
25 70 ppb Ozone Attainment Plan. The Plan was jointly

1 developed by the two air districts responsible for air
2 quality planning in the region, the Mojave Desert and the
3 Antelope Valley Air Quality Management districts.

4 Over the past two decades, ozone levels in the
5 Western Mojave Desert have improved in response to
6 emission reductions, both in the non-attainment area and
7 the upwind contributor, the South Coast basin. Existing
8 CARB and District control programs coupled with reductions
9 from new measures in the 2022 State SIP Strategy and
10 emission reductions occurring in upwind areas will provide
11 the reductions needed for attainment of the 70 ppb
12 standard.

13 The Plan was adopted by the Antelope Valley
14 Management Air Quality District on January 17, 2023, and
15 by the Mojave Desert Air Quality Management District on
16 January 23rd, 2023. CARB staff concluded that the Plan,
17 along with the CARB emission reduction commitment and
18 corrected motor vehicle emissions budgets included in the
19 CARB staff report, meet -- meets the requirements of the
20 Clean Air Act.

21 Staff recommends that the Board adopt the Western
22 Mojave Desert 70 ppb Plan, the State's aggregate emission
23 reduction commitment, and the motor vehicle emissions
24 budgets appended to the CARB staff report and forward them
25 to the U.S. EPA as a revision to the California SIP.

1 This includes -- concludes my summary of the
2 item. Thank you.

3 CHAIR RANDOLPH: Thank you. We will now hear
4 from the public who signed up to speak on this item.

5 Board clerk, do we have any commenters?

6 BOARD CLERK HARRINGTON: Thank you, Madam Chair.
7 We currently have one commenter who wishes to speak on
8 this item.

9 If you wish to verbally comment on this Board
10 item, please raise your hand or dial star nine. I
11 apologize in advance if I mispronounce your name. I would
12 like to remind all commenters to please speak slowly and
13 clearly for our interpreters and court reporter. Also
14 just a friendly reminder that speaker sign-ups will close
15 30 minutes after the public comment portion of an item has
16 begun. Please keep your hand raised until you are called
17 upon.

18 The first speaker is Alan De Salvio.

19 ALAN DE SALVIO: This is Alan De Salvio, Deputy
20 Air Pollution Control Officer with the Mojave Desert AQMD.
21 I would like to thank CARB staff for their immense
22 assistance in the preparation of this Plan. It's an
23 example of collaborative cooperation which is a great
24 success. This Plan would not exist without the assistance
25 of CARB staff and South Coast AQMD staff. Thank you for

1 the opportunity to comment.

2 BOARD CLERK HARRINGTON: Thank you.

3 That concludes the commenters

4 CHAIR RANDOLPH: All right, thank you. I will
5 now close the record on this agenda item. The Board has
6 before them Resolution number 23-6. Do I have a motion to
7 approve this resolution?

8 BOARD MEMBER PEREZ: Madam Chair, being from the
9 Mojave Desert, I'd like to make the motion.

10 CHAIR RANDOLPH: Thank you, Supervisor Perez.

11 Do I have second?

12 BOARD MEMBER VARGAS: Second.

13 CHAIR RANDOLPH: All right. We have a motion and
14 a second. Clerk, will you please call the roll.

15 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Yes.

16 Dr. Balmes?

17 BOARD MEMBER BALMES: Yes.

18 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Mr. De La Torre?

19 BOARD MEMBER DE LA TORRE: Aye.

20 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Mr. Eisenhut?

21 BOARD MEMBER EISENHUT: Yes.

22 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Senator Florez?

23 BOARD MEMBER FLOREZ: Florez, aye

24 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Mr. Guerra?

25 BOARD MEMBER GUERRA: Guerra, aye.

1 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Ms. Hurt?

2 BOARD MEMBER HURT: Aye.

3 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Mr. Kracov?

4 BOARD MEMBER KRACOV: Yes.

5 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Dr. Pacheco-Werner?

6 BOARD MEMBER PACHECO-WERNER: Yes.

7 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Mr. Perez?

8 BOARD MEMBER PEREZ: Aye.

9 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Mr. Quirk?

10 BOARD MEMBER QUIRK: Aye.

11 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Dr. Shaheen?

12 BOARD MEMBERS SHAHEEN: Aye.

13 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Ms. Takvorian?

14 BOARD MEMBER TAKVORIAN: Aye.

15 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Supervisor Vargas?

16 BOARD MEMBER VARGAS: Vargas, yes.

17 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Chair Randolph?

18 CHAIR RANDOLPH: Yes.

19 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Madam Chair, the motion

20 passes.

21 CHAIR RANDOLPH: All right. Thank you. The next

22 and last item on the agenda is number 23-2-1[SIC],

23 consideration of the fifth annual community

24 recommendations and an update on the annual AB 617

25 implementation memorandum.

1 If you are here with us in the room and wish to
2 comment on this item, please fill out a request-to-speak
3 card as soon as possible and submit it to a Board
4 assistant. If you are Joining us remotely and wish to
5 comment on this item, please click the raise-hand button
6 or dial star nine now. We will first call on in-person
7 commenters followed by any remote comments when we get to
8 the public comment portion of this item.

9 Assembly Bill 617 requires community focused
10 action to reduce air pollution and improve public health
11 in communities disproportionately burdened by exposure to
12 air pollutants. In response to this statutory charge,
13 CARB established the Community Air Protection Program, or
14 Program for short. To date, the Board has selected 17
15 communities that are currently implementing the Program
16 through the development and implementation of community
17 air monitoring plans and/or community emissions reductions
18 programs. Each year, as required by AB 617, the Board
19 considers the selection of additional communities to join
20 the Program.

21 The Community Air Protection Program has come a
22 long way since 2018, when the first 10 communities were
23 selected. The Program is transforming the way in which
24 local air districts and CARB work together with community
25 residents to improve the air quality in some of the

1 state's most impacted communities. I want to thank the
2 air districts and the community steering committee for
3 their continued partnership and efforts to make this
4 Program a success.

5 Today, staff will present their recommendations
6 for adding two new communities to the Program. These two
7 communities have the support of their local air districts
8 to convene a community steering committee. The Board
9 recognizes that there are many more impacted communities
10 than those that are formally selected for the Program.
11 For this reason, staff are working to develop strategies
12 to bring benefits to more impacted communities in new
13 ways.

14 In addition to presenting the new communities for
15 selection, CARB staff will present a brief Program update
16 covering three topics: the status of revisions to the
17 Program's guidance document, known as the Program
18 Blueprint; the status of community air monitoring efforts;
19 and the opportunity for public comment on the draft
20 progress report on Program implementation.

21 This coming year, CARB is looking forward to
22 better serving California residents and to continuing to
23 improve support for communities that are currently in the
24 Program.

25 Dr. Cliff, would you please introduce the item.

1 EXECUTIVE OFFICER CLIFF: Thank you, Chair
2 Randolph.

3 Since the selection of the first communities in
4 this Program, air districts and CARB staff have been
5 working with community-based organizations and residents
6 to develop and implement plans that will reduce air
7 pollutant emissions and exposures in their communities.
8 Air districts have convened 17 community steering
9 committees that include members that live, work, or own
10 businesses in the community. In coordination with these
11 steering committees, air districts have developed 15
12 community air monitoring systems and are working to
13 implement hundreds of strategies to reduce emissions at
14 the community scale. These strategies are contained in
15 the 13 community emission reductions programs, or CERPs,
16 that have been approved by both the CARB Board and air
17 district boards.

18 Our focus today is the Board's consideration of
19 the Fifth Annual Community Air Protection Program
20 recommendation to bring two new communities into the
21 Program. Community members and air districts nominate
22 communities to CARB for Board consideration every year.
23 In developing the community recommendations you will hear
24 about today, staff considered statutory requirements,
25 community nominations received to date, prior direction

1 from the Board to prioritize consistently nominated
2 communities, as well as lessons learned from communities
3 in the Program.

4 As you mentioned, Chair Randolph, this annual
5 discussion takes place during a year of transition in the
6 AB 617 program. Last month, I shared my priorities for
7 the year ahead, emphasizing our goal of integrating racial
8 equity and environmental justice into all of the work that
9 we do. AB 617 is a tool that we have to support this goal
10 and we must apply lessons learned from its implementation
11 to bring benefits to the many more communities in need.

12 Funding levels provided by the Legislature for
13 Program implementation are another key factor that staff
14 considers in advancing community recommendations. Funding
15 for air district development and implementation of CERPs
16 and community air monitoring systems as been stagnant at
17 about 50 million for the prior five years, even with the
18 addition of new communities annually. In 2022, the
19 passage of AB 179 included a one-time additional \$10
20 million for the development of new CERPs. This means for
21 the fiscal year 2022-2023, there is a total of \$60 million
22 of funding for air districts to support and ever-growing
23 number of communities. While grateful for this one-time
24 infusion, it is critically important to ensure that there
25 are sufficient resources to support the effective

1 implementation of previously selected communities and make
2 good on our commitments to the communities we are
3 recommending today.

4 I will now ask Andrea Juarez from our Office of
5 Community Air Protection to begin the staff presentation.

6 Andrea.

7 (Thereupon a slide presentation).

8 OCAP AIR POLLUTION SPECIALIST JUAREZ: Thank you,
9 Dr. Cliff. Good afternoon, Chair Randolph and members of
10 the Board. I'm Andrea Juarez and I am a policy staff and
11 community liaison for the Office of Community Air
12 Protection, otherwise known as OCAP. I work with the
13 Imperial County, the Eastern Coachella Valley, and the
14 international border communities, and I'll be providing
15 the staff presentation for today's Board item.

16 --o0o--

17 OCAP AIR POLLUTION SPECIALIST JUAREZ: In our
18 presentation, we will update the Board on the
19 implementation of the Community Air Protection Program,
20 showcase some new tools in the Program, and share an
21 update on the AB 617 monitoring plan progress.

22 After providing those updates, I will present our
23 staff recommendations for new community selection for
24 Board consideration.

25 --o0o--

1 OCAP AIR POLLUTION SPECIALIST JUAREZ: Currently,
2 there are 17 communities across the state that have been
3 selected by this Board for action to either develop a
4 community emissions reduction program or a community air
5 monitoring plan, otherwise known as a CERP or a CAMP
6 respectively, or both. These communities have been
7 selected by the Board over the last four years and are
8 identified on the map by the orange dots.

9 These communities are all highly burdened with
10 air pollution and represent a diverse mix of urban and
11 rural communities. They vary in geographic size,
12 population, density, and air pollution concerns. Of the
13 17 communities in the Program, South Coast has the most
14 selected communities with six, Sacramento and Imperial
15 each have one community, while the others, as you can see
16 on this slide, all in between.

17 At the heart of these efforts are community
18 steering committees, also known as CSCs, which are
19 composed of residents and other local stakeholders. These
20 CSCs help inform strategy development and set the
21 priorities in these plans. We want to take a moment to
22 recognize and thank all the community members and leaders
23 across the state who give their time and commitment to
24 improving air quality in their communities. We truly
25 appreciate them for their continued participation and

1 efforts to partner with us and the air districts.

2 Most communities are working on CAMPs and CERPs.
3 However, the West Oakland and the East Oakland communities
4 were selected to work on a CERP only, while the South
5 Sacramento-Florin community was selected to develop and
6 implement a CAMP only. Thirteen of these selected
7 communities have CARB-approved CERPs, seven of which are
8 currently in their fourth year of implementation.

9 --o0o--

10 OCAP AIR POLLUTION SPECIALIST JUAREZ: Staff's
11 annual update to the Board will highlight implementation
12 of the AB 617 Community Air Protection Program over the
13 past year. The update will also include activities we
14 look forward to this year regarding the Statewide Strategy
15 update, also known as Blueprint 2.0. This update will
16 include several key elements of our Program including: the
17 community recommendation process, strategies used to
18 develop CERPs, related tools and resources for
19 communities, next steps to update the Blueprint, an update
20 on the AB 617 Consultation Group, and actions to
21 incorporate new concepts for reenvisioning the Program.

22 A draft of the annual update is available for
23 public comment as part of our Blueprint 2.0 public
24 process. It will then be finalized and provided to the
25 Board in the form of a memo from our Executive Officer.

1 --o0o--

2 OCAP AIR POLLUTION SPECIALIST JUAREZ: Each
3 selected community CERP includes a unique set of
4 strategies to reduce local emissions and reduce exposures
5 to residents. Community strategies, while unique, can be
6 generally categorized as shown in the figure here.

7 These categories include:

8 Facility risk reduction. This strategy helps to
9 support small- and medium-sized businesses to assist them
10 in their efforts to reduce their toxic emissions and risk.

11 Regulatory. This strategy includes CARB
12 regulations, Air District Indirect Source Rules, and other
13 enforceable agreements.

14 Permitting. This strategy includes use of best
15 available control technologies in developing air quality
16 permits for new and modified sources.

17 Enforcement. This strategy includes
18 community-focused enforcement, enforcement strategies,
19 enforceable agreements, and ensuring regulatory emission
20 reductions.

21 Incentives. This strategy promotes cleaner
22 equipment, connecting with communities and business with
23 funding, and promoting cleaner technology.

24 Land use. This strategy utilizes engaging with
25 local agencies to help inform emission and exposure

1 reduction strategies like alternate truck routes.

2 And lastly, mitigation. This could include
3 community-identified projects to reduce exposure, such as
4 air filtration projects and urban greening projects.

5 --o0o--

6 OCAP AIR POLLUTION SPECIALIST JUAREZ: I will now
7 go into a brief update on some of our new tools that will
8 help support our Program. One of these new tools includes
9 the Community Air Quality Viewer, known as AQview, which
10 is an innovative, cloud-based, data management system for
11 managing all community air monitoring data, including
12 those collected by the air districts, community-based
13 organizations under community air grants, CARB, and other
14 independent community monitoring efforts.

15 AQview provides visualization and easy access of
16 air quality data to community members for their own
17 community science-driven initiatives. It's designed with
18 a simple, intuitive, and mobile-friendly interface.

19 The main features of AQview include a real-time
20 PM2.5 map, which is updated hourly, a time series graphing
21 tool for analyzing recent trends at multiple sites, as
22 well as a high performance data download tool for the
23 public to access all AB 617 monitoring data. In addition
24 to PM2.5, other monitoring data currently available on
25 AQview include PM10, ozone, nitrogen oxides, sulfur

1 dioxide, black carbon, hydrogen sulfide, volatile organic
2 compounds, and particulate metals depending on the sites
3 and the communities.

4 CARB will regularly add more monitoring data to
5 AQview from new data providers, sensor networks,
6 regulatory networks, and special studies. CARB will also
7 enhance the AQview system based on the feedback from the
8 community members and others stakeholders. You can access
9 AQview on the CARB website or by scanning the QR code on
10 the slide with your phone, which will link you directly to
11 the AQview map page.

12 --o0o--

13 OCAP AIR POLLUTION SPECIALIST JUAREZ: The next
14 tool I will highlight is our video series on air quality
15 fundamentals. The video series was created with input
16 from community groups and supports our goal to provide
17 information that empowers community partners. Community
18 advocates guided CARB on their expectations and provided
19 feedback on the pilot videos. These videos are short, two
20 to three minutes, they're animated, easy to understand,
21 and available in English and Español.

22 There are a total of nine videos in the series.
23 They are being developed with extensive coordination with
24 the California Air Pollution Control Officers Association,
25 also known as CAPCOA, and across divisions within CARB.

1 We have completed the first three videos. They
2 include a series overview, emission types, and health
3 effects of air pollution. The remaining videos to be
4 developed will cover topics such as where emissions come
5 from; how air pollutant and greenhouse gas emission --
6 emissions are measured, tracked, and controlled; standards
7 for safe air quality; and how you can help make your
8 community's air cleaner. We expect these to be available
9 by early 2024.

10 --o0o--

11 OCAP AIR POLLUTION SPECIALIST JUAREZ: The last
12 tool I'm pleased to share with you is our community
13 emission inventory story maps. CARB and the air districts
14 worked collaboratively with input from community steering
15 committees to develop community-scale emission inventories
16 to support CERP development. CARB StoryMaps tool is
17 designed to present and display community-scale emission
18 inventories in a centralized location and serves as a
19 platform to assist in the review of emission inventories
20 between communities, air districts, and CARB.

21 The StoryMaps tool provides emission inventory
22 information and data in a user-friendly manner to enable
23 data transparency, accessibility, and allows CARB to
24 engage community members and stakeholders in the inventory
25 development process and advance capacity-building goals.

1 --o0o--

2 OCAP AIR POLLUTION SPECIALIST JUAREZ: Assembly
3 Bill 617 requires CARB to update the statewide strategy or
4 Program Blueprint to reduce emissions of toxic air
5 contaminants and criteria pollutants in communities
6 affected by a high cumulative exposure burden every five
7 years.

8 We have received a lot of feedback over the last
9 five years about the Program that we'd like to incorporate
10 into the new Program Blueprint. CARB staff is revising
11 the Program Blueprint with the focus on equity, a
12 community-driven process, and on expanding Program
13 benefits beyond the current annual selection model. We
14 know we need to go beyond what is in the current Blueprint
15 to support impacted communities. This means reimagining
16 the Program.

17 The process to update the Blueprint is
18 comprehensive and will be iterative. This includes
19 engaging with the communities, air districts, the public,
20 and the AB 617 Consultation Group, and, of course, the
21 input we have received and the input we will seek from our
22 stakeholders through our upcoming blueprint engagement
23 activities.

24 We also want to highlight that the People's
25 Blueprint, which was authored by a small group of

1 environmental justice leaders from the AB 617 Consultation
2 Group, will significantly inform the Program Blueprint
3 revision. Our engagement actions around the Blueprint
4 will focus on community, racial equity, and environmental
5 justice. The experiences, lessons learned, and best
6 practices of community steering committees will inform
7 Blueprint 2.0. But we also want to have meaningful
8 dialogue with representatives of communities that have not
9 yet been selected to inform the Blueprint update. This
10 will help us identify other ways to support more impacted
11 communities in need.

12 And although there aren't any tribal government
13 communities in any of our selected communities, some
14 tribes have benefited from receiving community air grants.
15 As part of our engagement, we want to build and improve
16 tribal relationships by having discussions with California
17 tribes on areas of collaboration and solutions to
18 cumulative exposure concerns.

19 As we engage with stakeholders to update the
20 Blueprint, we will share the progress we are seeing
21 throughout the 17 selected communities and the Program as
22 a whole. It's important that we focus on finding
23 innovative ways and new opportunities to bring more
24 benefits to communities in need throughout the state.

25 --o0o--

1 OCAP AIR POLLUTION SPECIALIST JUAREZ: The
2 Program itself has multiple milestones over the next year.
3 To meet our statutory deadline to update the blueprint, we
4 will be continuing to conduct our outreach and engagement
5 from now until September of 2023. In May of last year, we
6 shared a draft high-level outline of Blueprint 2.0 with
7 the CARB Board, while we continued to engage with the
8 Consultation Group on the People's Blueprint. As a result
9 of those discussions and in response to feedback we
10 received to date on the People's Blueprint, we expanded
11 the outline of Blueprint 2.0 and we call this our expanded
12 concepts outline.

13 We plan to release a draft of Blueprint 2.0 for
14 public comment in spring of 2023. We will provide a final
15 draft for public comment as part of this September's Board
16 hearing, where we will present the new guidance to the
17 Board for consideration of adoption.

18 Today, we are completing our fifth annual
19 community selection process and are recommending two new
20 AB 617 communities to our Board for selection. We are
21 also tracking the implementation of air district expedited
22 best available retrofit control technology schedules on
23 our webpage. Districts are expected to implement BARCT on
24 industrial sources by December 31st of 2023.

25 --o0o--

1 OCAP AIR POLLUTION SPECIALIST JUAREZ: Now, I'll
2 turn in over to Jeremy Smith from the Monitoring and
3 Laboratory Division for the AB 617 air monitoring update.

4 MLD STAFF AIR POLLUTION SPECIALIST SMITH:

5 Thanks, Andrea.

6 The next few slides will describe the
7 implementation status of CAMPs developed under AB 617.

8 --o0o--

9 MLD STAFF AIR POLLUTION SPECIALIST SMITH:

10 Community air monitoring plans, or CAMPs, are
11 documents that describe air monitoring objectives,
12 methods, and activities to meet the localized needs of
13 each community. Following selection into the Community
14 Air Protection Program each committee -- each community
15 steering committee works in partnership with their local
16 air district to developed a CAMP to guide the monitoring
17 process.

18 As we enter the fifth year of AB 617 monitoring,
19 each community is at a different stage based on their own
20 unique process and year of selection. While specific
21 monitoring objectives vary from community to community,
22 there are five general objectives commonly present across
23 CAMPs. These include conducting monitoring to
24 characterize local emission sources, determine areas in
25 the community with the highest pollutant concentration,

1 inform and track CERP progress in communities where CERPs
2 have been created, provide real-time air quality
3 information to the community in a way that is useful and
4 easy to understand, and respond to episodic emission
5 events.

6 The Community Air Protection Program broadly
7 expanded community level monitoring of key pollutants at
8 higher spatial and temporal resolutions. Across the
9 state, the pollutants measured were chosen to meet
10 objectives determined by each community in consultation
11 with the local air district.

12 The pollutants we show here are a sample of the
13 pollutants measured and are not necessarily measured in
14 every community. These include, but are not limited to:
15 toxic air contaminants such as benzene, ethylene oxide,
16 and specific high-use pesticides; volatile organic
17 compounds, including pollutants with petroleum origins;
18 criteria gases, such as ozone, nitrogen oxides, and carbon
19 monoxide; particulate matter, both PM2.5 and PM10, as well
20 as particulate bound metals; and black carbon, which is
21 often used as a surrogate for diesel particulate matter.

22 On our next slide, we will discuss the monitoring
23 technologies and tools applied to quantify these
24 pollutants.

25 --oOo--

1 MLD STAFF AIR POLLUTION SPECIALIST SMITH: The
2 selection of appropriate monitoring methods and tools is
3 critical for achieving the objectives outlined in
4 community air monitoring plans. Districts worked with
5 their communities to assess the applicability,
6 reliability, and data quality of available monitoring
7 technologies.

8 Air sensor networks have frequently been used by
9 local districts and community-based organizations since
10 the AB 617 process began to provide valuable
11 neighborhood-level, real-time air quality information.
12 Across the state, sensors have provided valuable air
13 quality information to many residents that are not near a
14 regulatory monitoring site. Several community-led air
15 sensor networks have been included in district CAMPs,
16 including the IVAN Network developed by Comite Civico del
17 Valle in Southern California and networks developed by
18 Groundwork Richmond, and Physicians, Scientists, and
19 Engineers for Healthy Energy in the Bay Area.

20 In addition, dozens of community-based
21 organizations are leveraging air sensors to support their
22 communities under the Community Air Grants Program. Many
23 established sensor networks are continuing to operate
24 years after their initial launch. Some have grown in size
25 and capabilities. New networks continue to come online

1 and some community-based organizations are developing new
2 sensor technologies for their monitoring network.

3 Many districts have increased the number of
4 stationary monitoring locations in their communities.
5 These stationary monitoring sites include a variety of
6 monitoring methods and technologies. These include
7 federal reference and federal equivalent method, FRM, FEM,
8 for criteria pollutants species, like ozone and
9 particulate matter, and also non-criteria pollutants,
10 which would be species such as black carbon and volatile
11 organic compounds. Air toxics monitoring for species such
12 as benzene, PAHs, particulate bound metals like chromium,
13 as well as ambient pesticides in communities.

14 During the last year, monitoring within AB 617
15 communities identified fugitive emissions of methyl
16 bromide around fumigation facilities. These initial
17 findings have led to more intensive monitoring to fully
18 characterize concentration -- concentrations and
19 facilitate appropriate mitigation.

20 Additionally, monitoring for an extensive
21 collection of volatile organic compounds and air toxics
22 species near oil and gas extraction has identified
23 concentrations of acrolein two times higher than regional
24 monitoring sites. These initial findings are leading to
25 the application of new monitoring technologies that will

1 allow us to fully characterize the nature of this finding
2 and potentially lead to mitigation of emissions.

3 Fence-line monitoring is also being used to
4 quantify pollutant concentrations surrounding oil and gas
5 refineries. This real-time information about air
6 pollutant concentrations is used to notify communities if
7 episodic emissions events exceed predetermined thresholds.

8 Mobile monitoring has been used extensively in
9 CAMPs across the state. Mobile monitoring has been used
10 to quantify pollutants along roadways, identify fugitive
11 emissions, help identify transient odors, characterize
12 areas with elevated pollutant concentrations, and to
13 develop snapshots of pollutant concentrations in new
14 areas. Air toxics measurements from mobile monitoring
15 platforms were used this year to direct enforcement
16 inspections and led to notices of violation in at least
17 two air districts.

18 Black carbon concentrations two times greater
19 than local background were detected through intensive
20 mobile monitoring following community complaints related
21 to truck traffic. Mobile monitoring also identified areas
22 of elevated ethylene oxide concentrations near
23 sterilization facilities. These mobile monitoring results
24 led to intensive monitoring that found cancer risk
25 exceedances, and ultimately notices of violation to

1 responsible facilities.

2 Communicating monitoring data is the final key
3 step addressed in CAMPs. Many communities and districts
4 have developed new communication pathways that allow the
5 public to access data through near real-time displays and
6 periodic reports. Each of these tools come with various
7 advantages and all messaging and graphics have been
8 designed to meet the desired needs within each specific
9 community.

10 --o0o--

11 MLD STAFF AIR POLLUTION SPECIALIST SMITH: The
12 past year of community monitoring resulted in many
13 successes. Along with those successes, the process has
14 identified some areas where improvements can be made.
15 CAMPs are detailed, complex, and specific to each
16 community. Good working relationships between community
17 residents, the community steering committee, State
18 agencies, and the local air district are essential for
19 designing and implementing effective community air
20 monitoring plans.

21 The diverse array of monitoring technologies and
22 methods utilized in AB 617 communities provides a wide
23 range of monitoring data sets with varying data quality,
24 time resolution, and spatial information. During the past
25 year, we have seen progress through the creation of many

1 new data display methods, ranging from interactive web
2 pages, full database access, and pollutant story maps, all
3 to aid in the interpretation and understanding of complex
4 air quality data.

5 The discussion of monitoring results for
6 community interpretation and understanding should be done
7 in a clear, illustrative, and accessible form to ensure
8 all community representatives can participate. Monitoring
9 data can be used to inform future CERP planning activities
10 and track air quality improvements provided by CERPs.
11 However, in some cases, the CAMP and CERP are treated as
12 separate processes. CAMPs should clearly show how
13 collected data will be used to support actions, creating a
14 more holistic and integrated community program.

15 And now, I'd like to pass it back over to Andrea.

16 --o0o--

17 OCAP AIR POLLUTION SPECIALIST JUAREZ: Thanks,
18 Jeremy.

19 Now, let's dive into the community recommendation
20 process. As a reminder, the law requires the Board to
21 annually consider the selection of additional communities
22 for CAMP and/or CERP development.

23 --o0o--

24 OCAP AIR POLLUTION SPECIALIST JUAREZ: Here, we
25 show the considerations that go into each year's community

1 recommendations. The list builds from the prior year's
2 considerations, lessons learned, and the Board's direction
3 to prioritize communities that have been recommended in
4 multiple years with support of the air district and the
5 community.

6 As shown in this figure, when selecting new
7 communities for CERPs or CAMPs, the factors considered
8 include the AB 617 statute and Program Blueprint criteria,
9 CARB Board direction, nominations received since Program
10 inception, the table of metrics, lessons learned from
11 selected communities, available resources, and community
12 and agency capacity.

13 CARB annually considers communities through the
14 process outlined in the Program Blueprint. The Program
15 Blueprint lists the criteria to assess and identify
16 locations with high exposure burdens to toxic air
17 contaminants and criteria air pollutants and to prioritize
18 sensitive receptor locations in disadvantaged communities.
19 Residents in these communities also experience high levels
20 of poverty and unemployment on top of the health related
21 effects of air pollution.

22 In the initial community selections, CARB staff
23 proposed a diverse set of communities based on factors
24 listed in the statute and the Blueprint. CARB assessed a
25 variety of data sources to describe the cumulative air

1 burdens of the communities as well as vulnerability
2 measures, such as poverty and unemployment.

3 The process has remained consistent over the last
4 several years. This year, staff updated the list of
5 communities with strong support and is referring to the
6 list as consistently nominated communities. As in prior
7 years, we also considered the continued financial support
8 needed for newly selected communities while recognizing
9 the continued need to support the existing plans with
10 resources. With this limitation in mind, CARB staff is
11 proposing to recommend two new communities this year.

12 --o0o--

13 OCAP AIR POLLUTION SPECIALIST JUAREZ: Available
14 resources play a critical role in the selection process.
15 Implementation funds pay for things like air district
16 staff, hardware and equipment purchases, third-party
17 facilitation and translation services for all public
18 meetings, stipend payments for CSC members, and
19 implementation of monitoring plans, which requires
20 substantial implementation resources. As noted on this
21 slide, funding for air district development and
22 implementation of CERPs and CAMPs has been stagnant at \$50
23 million for the past five years, even with the addition of
24 new communities annually.

25 In 2022, the passage of AB 179 included a

1 one-time additional 10 million for the development of new
2 CERPs. CARB will allocate these funds to the three
3 districts that have committed to developing new CERPs,
4 which are Bay Area, Imperial, and San Diego.

5 --o0o--

6 OCAP AIR POLLUTION SPECIALIST JUAREZ: And now
7 I'd like to go through the fifth annual air district and
8 community nominations. This year, CARB received seven
9 total nominations, four from community self-nominations
10 and three from air district nominations. The nominations
11 from the air districts include the Bay Area Air Quality
12 Management District recommendation for Bayview Hunters
13 Point, South East San Francisco for a community emissions
14 reduction plan only. The Bay Area Air District partnered
15 closely with the Bayview Hunters Point community advocates
16 and the Marie Harrison Community Foundation, two leading
17 community-based health and EJ groups that have supported
18 this nomination.

19 The Imperial County Air Pollution Control
20 District in partnership with Comite Civico del Valle, or
21 CCV has nominated the north end of Imperial every year
22 since 2019. However, the nomination was withdrawn due to
23 limited resources and the size of the area put forth in
24 the community nomination, which was well beyond the
25 community level. However, in this year's nomination, the

1 Imperial Air District with CCV modified their
2 recommendation to focus on the cities of Westmorland,
3 Brawley, and Calipatria. They have designated these
4 cities as the North Imperial Phase 1 Community. And this
5 community is being recommended for both a community
6 emissions reduction plan and a community air monitoring
7 plan.

8 The Sacramento Metropolitan Air Quality
9 Management District nominated three separate communities
10 for monitoring only, North Sacramento, Oak
11 Park/Fruitridge, and Meadowview. However, their
12 nomination is contingent on increased funding to the air
13 district.

14 Based on strong air district and community
15 support as well as the consideration summarized earlier,
16 CARB staff is recommending two communities for this year's
17 selection, Bayview Hunters Point/South East San Francisco
18 and the North Imperial Phase 1 Community. CARB staff did
19 not receive community recommendations from San Diego, San
20 Joaquin Valley, or South Coast air districts. This may be
21 an indicator that existing resources are stretched thin.
22 And as in prior years, only a select limited number of
23 communities can be recommended.

24 Any community nominations received by CARB are
25 shared with the appropriate air district for their

1 consideration in their community recommendation submittal
2 to CARB. This year, CARB received four self-nominations
3 that include Paramount, La Vina, Lost Hills, and Salton
4 City. CARB keeps a running list of self-nominations
5 received. To date, there have been over 120 distinct
6 communities nominated with some communities renominated
7 from year to year and already included on the list.

8 CARB staff is working with res -- with the
9 residents of La Vina through a U.S. EPA grant to perform
10 pesticide monitoring in the community. CARB completed
11 close to a year of intensive air monitoring around Lost
12 Hills to better characterize air quality of communities
13 near oil and gas operations. And the San Joaquin Valley
14 Air Pollution Control District is working with a local
15 community group, Clean Water Action, to develop an
16 application for a CARB community air grant.

17 These are two examples of how CARB can bring
18 resources to address specific community concerns outside
19 of the traditional selection process. And CARB staff are
20 exploring more opportunities like this through the current
21 Blueprint revision process. We also continue to see
22 progress in various forms through our community air
23 grants. These grants help support capacity building,
24 community-specific air monitoring, and emissions
25 reductions. These grants are used in needy communities

1 throughout the state, not just those selected through this
2 recommendation process.

3 --o0o--

4 OCAP AIR POLLUTION SPECIALIST JUAREZ: The first
5 new community staff recommends is the Bayview Hunters
6 Point/Southeast San Francisco community. This community
7 is recommended for a CERP only. Bay Area AQMD is
8 supporting the self-nomination of this community. The
9 community is supported by two community groups, the
10 Bayview Hunters Point Community Advocates and the Marie
11 Harrison Community Foundation. The area shown in this
12 figure is preliminary as the boundaries will be decided by
13 the community steering committee in partnership with the
14 Bay Area Air District. While the community boundary is
15 not finalized, it would likely span 60 square miles and
16 have an approximate population of 115,000.

17 --o0o--

18 OCAP AIR POLLUTION SPECIALIST JUAREZ: Community
19 air pollution concerns include elevated PM2.5 emissions,
20 truck traffic, air impacts from nearby freeways, including
21 the I-280, I-80, Bay Bridge, and Highway 101, along with
22 industrial facilities and the potential impacts from the
23 Hunters Point Naval Shipyard, which is a federally
24 designated Superfund site.

25 The CalEnviroScreen 4.0 score for the Bayview

1 Hunters Point community is in the 94th percentile. The
2 diesel particulate matter and asthma burden scores are in
3 the 99th and 96th percentiles respectively. Vulnerability
4 measures such as poverty and unemployment scores exceed
5 the 96th percentile for this community.

6 --o0o--

7 OCAP AIR POLLUTION SPECIALIST JUAREZ: The second
8 new community staff recommends the North Imperial Phase 1
9 Community. This community includes the cities of
10 Westmorland, Brawley, and Calipatria. This community is
11 being recommended for both a CERP and a CAMP. The areas
12 likely to be included as the proposed North Imperial Phase
13 1 Community in Imperial County span approximately 580
14 square miles, and has a population of 38,000 people.

15 --o0o--

16 OCAP AIR POLLUTION SPECIALIST JUAREZ: This
17 community recommendation was submitted by the Imperial
18 County Air Pollution Control District in partnership with
19 CCV. CCV has been an active partner with the Air District
20 in the District's Calexico, El Centro, and Heber
21 community. The North Imperial Phase 1 community shares
22 similar regional concerns with the Calexico, El Centro,
23 and Heber community associated with air pollution from
24 agriculture-related activity impacts like agricultural
25 equipment and pesticides. The community also has concerns

1 regarding impacts from heavy-duty vehicles, fugitive
2 emissions from unpaved roads, and the Salton Sea. The
3 CalEnviroScreen 4.0 score for the North Imperial Phase 1
4 Community is in the 91st percentile. The asthma burden
5 score is in the 99th percentile. The vulnerability
6 measures, such as poverty and unemployment scores exceed
7 the 98th percentile in this community.

8 --o0o--

9 OCAP AIR POLLUTION SPECIALIST JUAREZ: In
10 conclusion, CARB staff recommends the Board approve
11 Resolution 23-7, which includes the selection of the
12 recommended communities certifies the community
13 recommendations are exempt from CEQA, and directs air
14 districts and CARB to begin work in these communities.

15 With that, I'll conclude the presentation and
16 will be happy to answer any questions the Board may have.

17 CHAIR RANDOLPH: All right. Thank you.

18 We will now hear from public commenters on this
19 item. We will hear from those who signed up to speak in
20 person by submitting a request-to-speak card or who raised
21 their hand in Zoom. We will do in-person commenters first
22 and then the Zoom commenters.

23 I will ask the Board clerks to go ahead and call
24 for public comment.

25 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Thank you. We currently

1 have seven in-person commenters for this item. And just a
2 reminder, we will be closing the cutoff at 5:50 for this
3 item. So the first commenter will be Mariela Loera.

4 MARIELA LOERA: Thank you. Good evening, Board
5 members. My name is Mariela Loera and I'm making comment
6 on behalf of Leadership Counsel for Justice and
7 Accountability.

8 The Program has successfully brought together
9 local community members and groups and created spaces for
10 their collaboration with local air districts. However,
11 there continues to be room for the Program to ensure that
12 the Program meets its goals of addressing poor air quality
13 in overburdened communities. These include, one,
14 improving accessibility in CSC and subcommittee meetings
15 and ensuring consistent communication and transparency
16 between air districts and CSCs to ensure that the overall
17 CAPP implementation is driven by community priorities and
18 centered on local voices. We ask that CARB develop
19 guidelines on community engagement, information sharing,
20 and meeting facilitation tactics specific to CAPP
21 implementation in collaboration with communities and air
22 districts.

23 And two, the implementation of CERPs and CAMPs
24 must be improved by ensuring that CERP actions are not
25 repetitive of existing efforts and instead lead to

1 additional emission reductions. We ask that CARB ensure
2 that moving forward all CERPs are focused on efforts that
3 are unique to the Program and not duplicative of existing
4 efforts.

5 In order to ensure effective implementation,
6 collaboration with entities have -- that have the
7 necessary authority and resources must be improved. We
8 ask that CARB develops enforceable agreements with
9 agencies that have the required authority to ensure CERP
10 implementation. Additionally, we ask that there is
11 tracking of emission reductions for each of the strategies
12 being used and that CARB ensure -- ensures the CERP and
13 CAMPs are implemented in a timely manner that follows the
14 established timelines.

15 As CARB reimagines the structure of the Program
16 and works on the Blueprint 2.0, it is vital that it
17 ensures that communities who are already severely
18 overburdened by poor air quality are not then made
19 responsible for developing and implementing local CERPs,
20 as has been suggested by CARB.

21 Lastly, we continue to support the nomination of
22 South Madera as an AB 617 community with boundaries that
23 include the community of La Vina, which has nominated
24 itself for five consecutive years. Residents in La Vina
25 continue to express interest and capacity to engage in the

1 Program in an effort to address impacts to public health
2 and quality of life. Thank you for your consideration.

3 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Thank you.

4 Janice Lam Snyder.

5 JANICE LAM SNYDER: Good evening, Chair Randolph
6 and members of the Board. My name is Janice Lam Snyder.
7 And I am a Senior Manager with the Sacramento Metropolitan
8 Air Quality Management District and the staff lead on our
9 efforts for AB 617 South Sacramento/Florin community.

10 We are proud of what we have accomplished thus
11 far working with the steering committee, our Board, and
12 our stakeholders. We continue though to struggle to
13 fulfill the promise of AB 617, given that the State has
14 not provided the necessary resources. State funding has
15 remained flat from the inception, even as new communities
16 have been added, and Sacramento has been at the bottom of
17 that list for implementation and incentive funding.

18 We support the efforts to expand AB 617 across
19 the state, but adequate resources must be made available.
20 As we stated in our submittal to CARB on October 28th of
21 last year, additional deserving communities in Sacramento
22 include Meadowview, Oak Park/Fruitridge, and North
23 Sacramento. But today, we are to -- we have here to raise
24 a concern about South Sacramento/Florin, a CAMP-only
25 community.

1 The community has been patiently and methodically
2 going through the process to develop and implement a plan
3 that will help inform a CERP process. We anticipate to be
4 ready to transition to a CERP in 18 to 20 months once the
5 CAMP work has been completed. So we are disappointed that
6 we are not included in the allocation of the new \$10
7 million in-state funding.

8 Today -- today's action is effectively leaving
9 our community behind with no clear path forward. We need
10 funding commitments that are reliable from year to year,
11 so that we can adequately staff and prepare for the
12 necessary work. As one of the first communities selected
13 to be a part of the Program, South Sacramento/Florin
14 should remain a top priority for a State-supported CERP.

15 Thank you for your time and we look forward to
16 working with CARB to move this Program forward.

17 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Thank you.

18 Adrian Rehn.

19 ADRIAN REHN: Thank you, Chair and Board. And
20 welcome to the new members, including Director Guerra, who
21 represents the Sacramento region. Very excited to work
22 with you all. My name is Adrian Rehn. I work for Valley
23 Vision. Valley Vision is a non-profit located in
24 Sacramento's Oak Park community and we're actually a
25 two-time community air grantee here in Sacramento. And

1 our work is really focused on helping the North Sacramento
2 and the Oak Park/Fruitridge areas, both of whom are those
3 continuously supported communities, monitor their air,
4 advance educational efforts, as well as workforce
5 development and even participatory budgeting efforts. So
6 they're very much in line with the Blueprint 2.0
7 conversation that's happening.

8 But really what I'm here today to do is to
9 advocate for the selection of additional communities in
10 Sacramento for AB 617 for the formal designation,
11 including North Sacramento, Oak Park/Fruitridge, and
12 Meadowview, in addition, you know, asking for sufficient
13 implementation resources for that selection.

14 Unfortunately, Sacramento, as mentioned by
15 Janice, has been at the bottom of a lot of these funding
16 scenarios. And I understand there's this -- there's this
17 \$10 million where -- that we're not being considered for
18 and that's a -- that's problematic. And I'll add that,
19 you know, the Community Air Grant Program is often
20 elevated as a solution. And there's just simply not
21 enough money there for us to really meaningfully address a
22 lot of these issues.

23 You know, we are the only grantee that has
24 been -- from the Sacramento region that's been awarded
25 community air grants. Of the 96 awards, two have been to

1 the Sacramento region, both to us. So it just -- there's
2 not a lot coming to Sacramento right now. And we've
3 advocated for the -- you know, the Program ceiling to be
4 raised from three to five hundred thousand bucks, so we
5 can do more. And that unfortunately hasn't happened. So
6 I continue to advocate for that.

7 But I'll close my comment just saying that, you
8 know, while 617 is underfunded and it's imperfect, an
9 additional benefit to community selection is just
10 validating community concerns. We have a lot of community
11 members who have been saying for decades that their
12 communities are polluted. And just that selection brings
13 so much validation and acknowledgement that these things
14 are actually happening to community members. So again,
15 thank you for your time and don't forget about Sacramento.

16 Thanks.

17 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Thank you.

18 Richard Falcon.

19 RICHARD FALCON: Good evening, everyone. My name
20 is Richard Falcon. I'm a community organizer with United
21 Latinos. Thank you for allowing me time to be here with
22 you and welcome to the new members, especially to you
23 Señor Guerra. We look forward to working with you here on
24 so many issues related to the disadvantaged communities
25 that are here within California, but especially here

1 within Sacramento.

2 I come here speaking from the heart today.
3 United Latinos has been honored to receive a number of
4 opportunities to provide community-based air monitoring
5 here within Sacramento. We were one of the first
6 non-governmental -- non-government agencies to actually
7 start doing air monitoring in the South Sacramento/Florin
8 areas.

9 As we have grown, we have been able to partner
10 with the air quality management district, with SMUD, with
11 CARB, with so many organizations and shared data that we
12 have provided. And with that, we value those partnerships
13 so much. But it pains me to hear that the work that we
14 have been doing to try to expand the reach for our
15 communities still goes unheard. There are many reasons.
16 Some may provide rationale that goes beyond data, but to
17 just real feelings from the people, but those feelings are
18 real.

19 It pains me that we cannot get the money to --
20 and the resources needed to advance the good work that has
21 been being done for so many years. But we won't give up.
22 We will keep trying. One of my heroes Cesar Chavez,
23 Dolores Huerta as they Si Se Puede. We will. And
24 eventually, we will win and we will see benefit for the
25 community. But we're going to be here and continue to

1 fight along with our partners here in Sacramento.

2 The hardest part for me, and I'm going to close,
3 is that it pains me that once again I am to compete with
4 my brothers in the East Bay, in Hunters Point, in Imperial
5 Valley. How can there not be enough resources and funding
6 for all of the communities that are suffering as a result
7 of this pandemic called air quality.

8 I thank you for our time and we hope that you
9 will not forget Sacramento again.

10 Thank you.

11 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Thank you.

12 Arieann Harrison.

13 ARIEANN HARRISON: Good evening. My name -- my
14 name is Arieann Harrison. I am the founder and ED of
15 Marie Harrison Community Foundation, Inc., for social and
16 environmental justice, also a decades-long Bayview Hunters
17 Point resident. I live there and I work there. And I'm
18 so excited about the response from the community that we
19 are actually getting here.

20 We're getting here and we -- we are known for
21 advocating for our community. We go -- we go hard or go
22 home, for real, because we are looking at our children and
23 we're seeing the high rates of respiratory lung disease
24 and cancer is astronomical in the southeast sector of San
25 Francisco. And I think that this is a good start. And I

1 really am grateful that you guys are considered --
2 considering us for this process. I wish that my mother
3 Marie Harrison was to see this. This has been in place --
4 this Assembly Bill has been in place since 2017.

5 And the right question to ask is this is that
6 once we get started with this process and hearing all the
7 challenges that our brethrens are actually having, it
8 gives us something to think about and to expect that
9 there's going to be stumbling blocks along the way. But
10 due to our process, we've talked to other shoreline
11 communities about their process. So we're hoping to make
12 a model that can be emulated and mimicked across the
13 country.

14 Thank you very much for having us here. My name
15 is Ariann Harrison. I'm from Marie Harrison Community
16 Foundation, Inc., canwelve.org. And I look forward to
17 hearing your vote.

18 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Thank you.

19 Michelle Pierce.

20 MICHELLE PIERCE: Thank you, guys. My name is
21 Michelle Pierce. I am the Executive Director of the
22 Bayview Hunters Point Community Advocates. And I promised
23 my co-leads and my community that I was only going to come
24 up here and be in support of your process.

25 It's been a long time coming. And we have been

1 really working hard just to get our community ready. But
2 I do have to say just in hearing the presentation and the
3 responses that preceded me that I am very disappointed in
4 this process. Saying that communities can self-nominate,
5 it sounds very disingenuous. If you guys are sitting on a
6 hundred community list, and in order for us to
7 self-nominate, in fact, as you guys have stated, our air
8 district had to nominate us. What about the communities
9 that are less well funded, that have less political clout,
10 and access to glamour, and power, and TV cameras, that
11 this Air Resources Board decided that they needed to
12 determine the geography of the community for North
13 Imperial Valley is offensive to me, that La Vina has
14 self-nominated four times, is on their filth
15 self-nomination, and we can't get that through. That's
16 disheartening to me. It says that the reason this
17 legislation was created to empower the communities to
18 develop their voice and step into their own advocacy is
19 being denied to us. This process the very un-EJ, if we
20 can't get those smaller communities through.

21 I am -- I am thrilled to be up here. I am
22 thrilled to be in the company of the 17 other communities
23 that are doing this work. I'm also thrilled to be in
24 community with all the other communities that have spoken
25 up right now. The ones who are not funded, we have to fix

1 this. The main reason this legislation was created was in
2 order for those really small communities that always end
3 up getting dumped on, such as ours - you've seen the
4 statistics - to be able to step up and address these
5 issues. And it seems like the very people who are
6 supposed to be holding our hands through this process are
7 actually gate-keeping and denying us.

8 We have to fix this. I realize the funding issue
9 is a Governor's office and legislation issue in terms of
10 budget, but we have to find a stronger way to work with
11 you guys to get that through, because this is
12 unacceptable. And I do appreciate our nomination. We're
13 going to do it. I want to help all the other communities
14 as well. Thank you guys very much for your time.

15 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Thank you.

16 And lastly, we will hear from -- apologies if I
17 mispronounce your name, Dr. Aude Bouagnon.

18 DR. AUDE BOUAGNON: Hi, everyone. My name is Dr.
19 Aude Bouagnon and I'm a PhD trainer assigned to and
20 trained to become a doctor. And I sit on the board of
21 directors of the San Francisco Chapter of Physicians for
22 Social Responsibility.

23 I'm here to voice my strong support of Bayview
24 Hunters Point's Nomination to implement AB 617. When I
25 was in the sixth grade, I toured the lab of a

1 world-renowned doctor and scientist who devoted his life
2 to addressing childhood cancer. He split his time between
3 the clinic and the lab working to understand mechanisms
4 that drive cells to go malignant. And I decided that day
5 that I wanted to become a scientist and learn how to
6 combine the power of science and medicine to save lives
7 and address diseases.

8 My own research centers around neuroscience and
9 understanding the environment between -- the relationship
10 between environment and our brain health. And I sought to
11 translate these findings into practice and learn how to
12 address -- translate research into action and started
13 medical training. And really early on in my training
14 started working with doctors and front-line advocates in
15 Bayview Hunters Point to understand the root causes of
16 preventable suffering and untimely death in the community.

17 The pandemic hit just a few months into my
18 training for their exact health disparities and exposing
19 deep fractures in all of our systems. We quickly saw how
20 low-income and communities of color were more likely to
21 become sick and die of COVID-19 for a complex array of
22 reasons stemming from lack of access to health care
23 systems, structural racism, poverty, and most critical to
24 our work here today being disproportionately exposed to
25 toxic industrial chemicals, pollutants, poison heavy

1 metals, and radioactive compounds.

2 You all do this work today or just in general
3 because you know how air pollution is one of the greatest
4 contributors to global morbidity and mortality. Recent
5 studies suggest that particulate matter and chemicals in
6 our air contribute to 19 percent of cardiovascular deaths
7 worldwide, 21 percent of strokes, and 23 percent of lung
8 cancers.

9 The brain, the organ I'm most passionate about,
10 is particularly sensitive to particulate matters. A
11 recent study showed that even acute exposures to PM2.5 can
12 lead to inflammation in the brain and contribute to the
13 development of neurodegenerative, neurologic, and mental
14 health conditions.

15 And so now I'm a couple more years into my
16 medical career and what I've learned is that science and
17 medicine alone cannot solve our most critical health
18 problems. The system onslaught of toxic exposures and
19 pollution causes irreparable harm to millions of people
20 across our state and country tragically cutting lives
21 short, robbing children of their vitality, and causing
22 preventable suffering and unnecessarily burdening our
23 health care system.

24 Heal professionals and government officials must
25 continue to uphold our oath as public servants and

1 organize side by side with communities to prevent disease
2 and address the upstream social, economic, and
3 environmental determinants of health. With the decisions,
4 budgets, and policies you set in this room, you can
5 protect more lives than I can from within the walls of a
6 clinic. I am honored to be able to work with the Marie
7 Harrison Community Foundation and the Bayview Hunters
8 Point Community Advocates to help bring academic, medical,
9 and scientific experts to support this process.

10 At the heart of this work as so many have said
11 earlier is ensuring that every Californian has the right
12 to a safe, clean --

13 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Thank you. That concludes
14 your time.

15 AUDE BOUAGNON: Thank you.

16 BOARD CLERK HARRINGTON: We currently have 22
17 commenters who wish to speak on this item in Zoom.

18 And the first five are Suma Peesapati, Mykela
19 Patton, Mai Vang, Kathryn Higgins, Lillian Garcia.

20 Suma, I have activated your microphone. Please
21 unmute yourself and you can begin.

22 SUMA PEESAPATI: Thank you so much and good
23 evening, Madam Chair and members of the CARB board.
24 Really appreciate the opportunity to address the Board
25 today. As was mentioned, my name is Suma Peesapati. I am

1 the Environmental Justice and Community Engagement Officer
2 at the Bay Area Air Quality Management District and I
3 oversee the District's AB 617 work.

4 I'm here to respectfully request that CARB join
5 the Bay Area Air District in supporting one of the Bay
6 Area's most vibrant, culturally rich, and historically
7 significant communities, Bayview Hunters Point and
8 Southeast San Francisco. In October of 2022, Bayview
9 Hunters Point Community Advocates and Marie Harrison
10 Community Foundation, two well-recognized EJ groups
11 working in Southeastern San Francisco, remem --
12 recommended that Bayview Hunters Point and Southeast San
13 Francisco be selected for a community emissions reduction
14 plan under AB 617. The Air District's Board of Directors
15 unanimously voted to support that self-nomination on
16 November 2nd of 2022.

17 By way of geography, the proposed Bayview Hunters
18 Point Southeast SF area extends along and east of
19 Interstate 101 to the San Francisco Bay from South Potrero
20 Hill to Visitacion Valley and to the San Francisco City
21 boundary.

22 Community members in Southeast SF have long been
23 fighting for environmental justice, due to the numerous
24 sources and types of pollution in the area. The community
25 includes heavy industrial uses, a port, and the former

1 Hunters Point Naval Shipyard intermixed with diverse
2 low-income residential neighborhoods. The community is
3 bisected by the commercial-oriented Third Street Corridor
4 and straddles two busy freeways that bring freight trucks
5 and high volumes of commuter traffic between the peninsula
6 and downtown San Francisco.

7 Let me offer a few stats. Approximately 35,000
8 people live in the Bayview Southeast San Francisco area.
9 It is a community of color with more than 90 percent of
10 the population being either Black, Asian and/or Latino.
11 The area is also low income with 20 percent of the
12 population living below the poverty line. The area has
13 been a long-standing air district community of concern to
14 which we have focused resources to address localized air
15 pollution impacts.

16 I want to thank all of those involved in working
17 on the nomination, including Arieann Harrison of the Marie
18 Harrison Community Foundation, Michelle Pierce of Bayview
19 Hunters Point Community Advocates, CARB staff, Air
20 District Director Shamann Walton, Davina Hurt, and Tyrone
21 Jue, and of -- and all the Air District staff for working
22 tirelessly on this effort.

23 We offer our full support to the proposed
24 designation of the area.

25 BOARD CLERK HARRINGTON: Thank you. That

1 concludes your time.

2 SUMA PEESAPATI: Thank you.

3 BOARD CLERK HARRINGTON: Next, we have Mykela
4 Patton. I have activated your microphone. You can unmute
5 yourself and begin.

6 MYKELA PATTON: Hi, everyone. My name is Mykela
7 Patton and I'm the --

8 BOARD CLERK ESTABROOK: Just a moment Mykela.
9 We're going to get you back online.

10 MYKELA PATTON: Okay. Can you all hear me?

11 BOARD CLERK ESTABROOK: Yes.

12 BOARD MEMBER PATRICK: Okay. Thank you.

13 Hi, everyone. My name is Mykela Patton and I'm
14 the Associate Director of the New Voices are Rising
15 program. New Voices are Rising is a youth program of the
16 Rose Foundation for communities and the environment and
17 has been a grantee of CARB over the last few years doing
18 youth education in Oakland, Bayview Hunters Point, and
19 Contra Costa County around air quality work.

20 I want to express my support and recommend
21 Bayview Hunters Point for nomination and selection for the
22 next AB 617 community. As someone who's worked
23 extensively in the East Oakland process, I know how
24 important it is for these communities, especially
25 communities that are predominantly Black, indigenous, and

1 people of color to be selected for AB 617, because it can
2 really put communities on an equal playing field as
3 industry and government that has been like neglecting them
4 for so long, and also give communities the ability to
5 advocate and also implement things like more grocery
6 stores, more parks, increased accessible transit to green
7 spaces, but also tangible things like air filtration
8 systems, and community centers, or in schools.

9 I also know that Bayview Hunters Point, as you
10 all said, is experiencing a lot of toxic contamination
11 that's directly linked to government neglect and just a
12 really terrible history of intentional lying, and dodging,
13 and just kind of like neglect of communities of color over
14 the years. I also do want to echo the note around
15 sustainability of the program. I do think that has been a
16 downside of AB 617 since inception.

17 And although it is a really, really great program
18 with a lot of really amazing benefits, it is really
19 crucial -- really, really crucial to make sure that you
20 have the funds and resources for communities, because
21 there's so many times where really great programs or
22 initiatives come into our communities and then all of a
23 sudden they just disappear and folks are still doing the
24 work, folks are still, you know, unfortunately dying
25 because of air quality pollution. So the impacts aren't

1 stopping just because the money isn't there.

2 So I would definitely advocate and I know it's,
3 you know, a little bit more extensive and it ties to a lot
4 of other things, but definitely would advocate for
5 increased funding and resources, and also just want to
6 make a note how each year this process kind of pits
7 communities of color against each other and having to kind
8 of fight and really just beg for like resources and
9 funding from CARB.

10 And obviously, it's very complicated, but we're
11 all really fighting for the same thing and really just
12 trying to fight for like a right to live, and a right to
13 live and breathe clean air on like a daily basis.

14 So I just want to echo my support for Bayview
15 Hunters Point in the selection process, but also want to
16 encourage CARB to look for other resources, so other
17 communities can be supported.

18 Thank you.

19 BOARD CLERK HARRINGTON: Thank you.

20 Next, we have Mai Vang. I have activated your
21 microphone. Please unmute yourself and you can begin.

22 SACRAMENTO CITY COUNCIL MEMBER VANG: Good
23 evening. Can you hear me?

24 BOARD CLERK ESTABROOK: Yes, we can.

25 Mai, you need to unmute again.

1 SACRAMENTO CITY COUNCIL MEMBER VANG: Hello. Can
2 you hear me?

3 BOARD CLERK ESTABROOK: Yes. Thank you.

4 SACRAMENTO CITY COUNCIL MEMBER VANG: Thank you
5 so much.

6 First, I just want to take this moment to thank
7 you for your service on behalf of all Californians. My
8 name is Mai Vang and I serve as a Council Member in the
9 City of Sacramento and also a member of our Sacramento
10 Metropolitan Air Quality Management Board.

11 I happen to represent one of the 17 AB 617
12 communities. That is South Sacramento/Florin community, a
13 community where I grew up in, a community that raised me.
14 I also represent Meadowview, one of the communities that
15 was on your nomination list, but was not recommended.

16 As many of you know, many low income communities
17 of color are systemically exposed to higher levels of air
18 pollution, and especially South Sacramento, Florin, and
19 Meadowview. It's one of those communities that have been
20 historically impacted and continues to be shaped by
21 historical harms resulting in systemic environmental
22 exposure. It's really important that we continue to fight
23 for increased funding for all of our communities across
24 California impacted by air pollution, but especially our
25 AB 617 communities.

1 And I say that because right here in our State's
2 Capital's backyard, neighborhoods like Meadowview, Valley
3 Hi that I represent continues to suffer from structural
4 racism and health inequities. As this Board think about
5 your Blueprint, your 2.0 update, I want to urge you to
6 stay the course with our AB 617 communities to ensure that
7 we truly stay true to the intent of AB 617 while you all
8 expand. I do want to say I really appreciate the work and
9 investment that have been made thus far for our AB 16[SIC]
10 communities, but we have seen that much of that State
11 funding has really remained flat since the beginning of
12 this program.

13 While new communities are being added, which is
14 great, we have not had the resources to really keep up to
15 implement this Program. And in particular, South
16 Sacramento has been one of the lowest for AB 617 funding
17 in both implementation and also incentives. Many members
18 of the South Sacramento/Florin community have worked
19 incredibly hard to develop a community air monitoring
20 plan. And I want to share with all of you that we
21 actually need additional support from CARB to ensure we
22 can transition them into the next phase to reduce the
23 impact of air pollution. They should remain a top
24 priority community.

25 You know, as many community members in South Sac

1 and part of South Sac and part of the South Sac/Florin
2 have shared with me, while they appreciate the work we've
3 done to collectively create a plan on air monitoring, for
4 them it's really about ensuring we have a plan to reduce
5 emissions. The community already knows we have poor air
6 quality. We they are demanding from government entities,
7 and myself, and the State is to continue to have
8 investment so that we have actionable, tangible items to
9 reduce emission.

10 Again, I hope CARB will reconsider and not forget
11 get Sacramento neighborhoods, especially those on the
12 nomination list, Meadowview being one of them. And please
13 don't forget us. We're right here in the backyard of the
14 State Capital. And thank you so much for your service and
15 I look forward to working with all of you to ensure that
16 we can create healthier neighborhoods and improve public
17 health outcomes for all residents in California.

18 Thank you so much.

19 BOARD CLERK HARRINGTON: Thank you. And I would
20 just like to mention that speaker sign-ups are now closed.

21 Our next speaker is Wayne Nastri. I have unmuted
22 your microphone. And please unmute yourself and you can
23 begin.

24 WAYNE NASTRI: Hi. Can you hear me?

25 Hello.

1 BOARD CLERK ESTABROOK: Yes, we can.

2 WAYNE NASTRI: Great. Thank you so much.

3 Thanks, Chair Randolph and members of the Board
4 for this opportunity to be before you today. I want to
5 extend our appreciation to all the previous Board members
6 for all their service and wish all the best to the new
7 Board members. I've previously testified before this
8 Board regarding AB 617 and welcome this opportunity to
9 address you as you consider your staff's recommendations
10 to select two new AB 617 communities. As you heard, we
11 have perhaps the most experience with implementation of
12 this program with six communities.

13 And although it's been difficult, I believe we've
14 made good progress with our communities in building
15 relationships with the community members and in achieving
16 emission reductions as well as exposure reductions as a
17 direct result of this Program. And these accomplishments
18 have been realized despite funding shortfalls, high
19 learning curves associated with co-leading and governance,
20 as well as the unforeseen challenges associated with
21 COVID.

22 But increased statewide funding is critical for
23 the success of this Program. And at the District level,
24 we're managing a myriad of lessons learned and best
25 practices and a growing pipeline of communities that have

1 self-nominated to be adopted into the Program -- Program.

2 Excuse me.

3 Without additional funding though, air districts
4 will not be able to adopt additional communities in the
5 foreseeable future. And I speak from direct experience
6 regarding taking on new communities without additional
7 funding, because that's exactly what we did with we took
8 on South LA.

9 And considering the staff resources required to
10 onboard a new community, while simultaneously implementing
11 existing CERPs and CAMPs, my staff's capacity to absorb
12 more of this work is exhausted. We simply cannot adopt
13 another community at this point without additional
14 resources. And AB 617 established the expectation that
15 impacted communities would be phased into the Program.
16 And you've heard that today from communities hoping to be
17 selected. And while funding shortfalls threaten the
18 viability of the pro -- of the program - excuse me - we've
19 not given up our efforts to secure additional funding and
20 have attempted to do so each year since Program inception,
21 working both with CARB and through the Governor's office
22 and the Legislature.

23 We're also actively seeking federal funding
24 opportunities through our other sources such as grants
25 that can be used with our 617 communities. As an example,

1 we worked with our congressional leaders and other State
2 partners to secure funding to address East Coachella
3 Valley concerns about the Salton Sea.

4 And I urge you to recognize the limitations and
5 pressures on communities and staff implement more work
6 without additional resources and the negative impact it
7 has on community selection and the actual work that can be
8 done to improve public health in our communities. And, of
9 course, you need to do this with the understanding of
10 federal efforts and environmental justice. I urge you to
11 do all you can to secure sufficient funding and long-term
12 sustained funding for this Program.

13 And thank you and that concludes my remarks.

14 BOARD CLERK HARRINGTON: Thank you.

15 Next, we will hear from Lillian Garcia followed
16 Kalie Bonomo, Jennifer Holden, and a phone number ending
17 in 036.

18 Lillian, I have activated your microphone.
19 Please unmute yourself and you can begin.

20 LILLIAN GARCIA: Hi. Good evening, everyone. I
21 don't know if you guys can hear me.

22 BOARD CLERK HARRINGTON: Yes, we can.

23 LILLIAN GARCIA: Okay. Good evening, Madam Chair
24 Randolph, Board members, and CARB staff. First of all, we
25 were going to be out there, but unfortunately due to high

1 winds, 70 poles are down in our area, so we have no
2 electricity still, so I'm going to -- I did -- I did send
3 in a letter and I'm going to go ahead and read it right
4 now.

5 United for Justice, Inc. and 146 signatures of
6 community residents/advocates are requesting to consider
7 the community of Salton City, Imperial County for Assembly
8 Bill 617 Program. We feel that the community of Salton
9 City should be desig -- designated an Assembly Bill 617
10 community under the CAPP, with its own community air
11 monitoring plan and community emissions reduction program
12 plan on February 23rd. The CARB staff report that was
13 provided on December 6th, 2022, salton City is one of the
14 three communities that is listed as a community
15 self-nomination. If funding is limited, we would like to
16 suggest if we would at least be considered for the
17 communities emissions reduction program plan.

18 Sadly, the community of Salton City has not been
19 protected form harmful effects of air pollution or any
20 type of action to fight climate change by any local,
21 State, or federal government entity. Our challenges are
22 one of a kind and critical within the entire County of
23 Imperial, as we are prox -- at proximity to the Salton
24 Sea.

25 The Salton Sea is recognized as an impaired body

1 of water by the U.S. EPA and California and is the largest
2 inland body of water in California. It is impaired by
3 many -- by many constituents. A few are arsenic,
4 chlordane, DDD, DDE, and DDT and many more. As the Salton
5 Sea decays, the community has been and will continue to be
6 exposed to high levels of toxic air contaminants. Also,
7 hydrogen sulfide has impacted the community for some time
8 now, which penetrates the homes, schools, vehicles and
9 other places of unity. It is inhumane for our community
10 to continue to be exposed to such.

11 Salton City is the closest to the formal Salton
12 Sea Test Base, known as the Naval Test Base, and the U.S.
13 Border Patrol checkpoint. According to government
14 documents, unexploded ordinance is exposed on the
15 shoreline. Salton City is exposed to high winds, traffic
16 from down south, idling at the border patrol checkpoint,
17 off-road vehicles, lack of proper roads, sidewalks, a park
18 with no grass or trees, lack of green spaces throughout
19 the entire community, lack of funding for indoor air
20 purifiers, public resources, and no regulatory monitoring.

21 And I would lastly just want to mention this is
22 that the three communities that the Imperial County Air
23 Pollution Control District are recommending, those
24 communities are -- will be receiving funding for the
25 lithium, and those communities do have proper roads. I

1 would suggest for CARB staff to go out to the communities
2 next time to visually see how these communities are not
3 really impacted the way Salton City community is. I
4 would -- I would also -- please try and reconsider Salton
5 City to be selected tonight.

6 Thank you very much.

7 BOARD CLERK HARRINGTON: Thank you.

8 Next we have Kalie Bonomo. I have un -- or I
9 have activated your microphone. Please unmute yourself
10 and you can begin.

11 KALIE BONOMO: Thank you. Good evening, Chair
12 Randolph and Board members. My name is Kalie Bonomo and I
13 am with the California Air Pollution Control Officers
14 Association, or CAPCOA.

15 I would like to thank CARB staff for their hard
16 work and for partnering with the air districts and
17 communities implement the AB 617 Program. We look forward
18 to continuing to work with them and with our community
19 partners. As many of us will agree, AB 617 is a worthy
20 community-focused Program that will improve the lives of
21 people disproportionately impacted by severe air
22 pollution.

23 While we should applaud our progress, I would
24 also like to take a moment to emphasize the Program's
25 continued funding and resources challenge. Progress is

1 severely hampered because the AB 617 Program has
2 essentially remained flat and been chronically underfunded
3 since its inception. Fortunately, in last year's budget,
4 AB 179 provided an additional 10 million in implementation
5 funds. CAPCOA notes that without this added funding, it
6 would be extremely difficult to consider the additional
7 communities that we are considering today.

8 CAPCOA respectfully asks members of the CARB
9 Board to assist the air districts and the communities that
10 we serve to advocate for sufficient and ongoing funding
11 for this critically important Program.

12 Thank you.

13 BOARD CLERK HARRINGTON: Thank you.

14 Next, we have Jennifer Holden. I have activated
15 your microphone. Please unmute yourself and you can
16 begin.

17 JENNIFER HOLDEN: Good evening Chair Randolph
18 Board -- CARB Board members. Thank you for this
19 opportunity to speak with you. And hello, Eric Guerra.
20 Good to see you on the Board.

21 I am a resident of Sacramento and I live just
22 south of Fruitridge Road in what is a possible CAMP area
23 in Sacramento, just north of our old airport, Executive
24 Airport. So I've been working with United Latinos, and
25 that includes Richard Falcon, in getting some air quality

1 monitoring in the area. We have had problems with lead
2 toxicity in our soil and we also picked up some lead in
3 some air monitoring this summer, possibly from our
4 proximity to the airport. These are not good things. So
5 there are definitely concerns and an interest to have this
6 area studied more and in depth.

7 Also, to kind of comment on other Sacramento
8 areas, the North Sacramento area is very close to some air
9 monitoring that's already in place from the county
10 supervisor for that area, so there is extra monitoring
11 there. And I have been fortunate enough to work with
12 United Latinos in getting some air quality monitoring in
13 this area.

14 So I actually would like to also throw my support
15 towards the Meadowview study area, if there are two areas
16 to be considered. Meadowview has -- we just can't get
17 adequate air quality monitoring into the Meadowview air.
18 It's been a black hole for a long time. There isn't much
19 that's publicly reported about it. It's a historically
20 industrial area, historically -- historic area that's
21 multi-ethnic.

22 Looking at the staff presentation for North
23 Imperial which measured poverty, unem -- poverty and
24 unemployment, the Meadowview area is in the 89th
25 percentile for poverty and the 96th percentile for

1 unemployment. It also has an asthma score of 94 and
2 there's -- there hasn't been any publicly reported
3 monitoring there that I know of.

4 So I'm -- I ask that you consider the Meadowview
5 as one of the areas. They need the support. They need
6 the help. There is a compressed natural gas fueling
7 station, which was just finished on Meadowview Road that
8 had no Environmental Impact Report done before
9 construction began and that still has no publicly
10 recognized Hazard Mitigation Plan.

11 So there's a -- it kind of feels like it's an
12 area that's got a lot going on in it that we aren't being
13 told about. So please keep Sacramento in mind for a study
14 air, especially the Meadowview area, and thank you for
15 this opportunity to speak with you.

16 BOARD CLERK HARRINGTON: Thank you. Next, we
17 will hear from a phone number ending in 036 followed by
18 Paula Forbis, Jeff Solomon, Vincent Valdez, and Madeline
19 Harris.

20 Phone number ending in 036, I have activated your
21 microphone. Please unmute yourself and you can begin.

22 JOSIE MORALES: Hello. Thank you very much. My
23 name is Josie Morales and I'm the past vice president of
24 United Latinos. I wanted to recognize our City Council
25 Member Guerra for being on this Board. It's very

1 important for you to be there and we greatly appreciate
2 your time and your service that you have taken on.

3 I just wanted to urge the selection of a
4 Sacramento community for AB 617, the designation paired
5 with sufficient implementation resources. North
6 Sacramento, Oak Park/Fruitridge, and Meadowview have all
7 been continuously nominated by our local air quality
8 regulator. Despite being at the intersection of four
9 major highways and having challenging geography, the
10 Sacramento region has only one AB 6170 -- 17 community,
11 which is South Sacramento/Florin, which was designated in
12 2018.

13 Sacramento has been at the bottom of all of the
14 funding allocations implementation and incentives. We're
15 concerned that our region's only formal community, South
16 Sacramento/Florin, is being left behind, as it's not
17 included in the latest \$10 million State funding
18 allocation to help communities advance emission
19 reductions.

20 Several environmental justice programs, including
21 United Latinos, Valley Vision, local governments and
22 jurisdiction, along with neighborhood groups have
23 recognized this is very vital and much needed
24 consideration.

25 Transportation is responsible for 50 percent of

1 greenhouse gas emissions and 80 percent of air pollutants
2 in California. These numbers are even higher in the
3 Sacramento Region as previous speakers from Sacramento
4 have explained to you all. The AB 617 Program is
5 underfunded and imperfect, but it is important in
6 validating the concerns that have been elevated by
7 community members for years. We hope for additional
8 funding to help implement projects to improve quality of
9 life in our communities.

10 I also want to recognize that there is desperate
11 need for all of the other communities your previous --

12 BOARD CLERK HARRINGTON: Thirty seconds
13 remaining.

14 JOSIE MORALES: Thank you -- especially Bay Area.
15 I have very well loved comrades that live in the Bay Area
16 and I want them to have healthy lives and clean air just
17 like we do here in Sacramento, but urge the Board to
18 please do not leave the Sacramento areas, as I mentioned,
19 behind.

20 Thank you for your time.

21 BOARD CLERK HARRINGTON: Thank you.

22 Next is Paula Forbis. I have activated your
23 microphone. Please unmute yourself and you can begin.

24 PAULA FORBIS: Thank you. And good evening,
25 Chair Randolph and CARB Board members for this opportunity

1 to speak. My name is a Paula Forbis and I'm the APCO for
2 the San Diego County Air Pollution Control District. I
3 would like to thank CARB staff and Board members for their
4 ongoing efforts and support of the AB 617 Community Air
5 Protection Program. San Diego APCD is poised to move
6 forward with an environmental justice centered agenda.
7 We've begun this work through the development and board
8 approval of our Office of Environmental Justice Framework
9 that serves to guide our work in partnership with
10 environmental justice communities throughout our region.
11 Our work in two local designated AB 617 communities is
12 integral to these efforts.

13 Last February, your Board selected the
14 International Border Community for development of a
15 community air monitoring plan and a community emission
16 reduction program. Program funding, however, remained the
17 same for all districts. San Diego APCD has thus had to
18 split resources between our two selected communities,
19 making it more challenging to implement the Program.

20 Consequently, this year, we were not able to look
21 for opportunities to expand the Program into other local
22 communities facing environmental justice issues. Since
23 the selection of International Border Community, San Diego
24 APCD has look additional funding opportunities to support
25 Program implementation. Recently, EPA awarded us a small

1 grant that will support part of our engagement efforts in
2 the International Border Community as well as monitoring
3 in the Tijuana River Valley, which was a priority need
4 identified by the community steering committee for the
5 area. We're also pursuing additional grant funding
6 through EPA's IRA funding opportunities to support and
7 expand our current efforts.

8 The additional one-time AB 617 funding recently
9 allocated to San Diego by CARB will make it possible for
10 us to pursue development of the CERP for the International
11 Border Community, while freeing up other funds for our
12 CAPP implementation Portside Community. Absent this
13 funding, we would not have the capacity to do this work
14 fully and in a manner that rises to the level of need. We
15 appreciate the additional one-time funding, but want to
16 emphasize that local air districts across the state need
17 CARB's continued commitment and support to identify
18 adequate ongoing funding streams for Program
19 implementation, as you've heard from many speakers
20 tonight. This funding is needed to support existing
21 communities identified under the Program and we urge you
22 to support expansion of this funding in order to support
23 expansion of the Program to new communities, like the ones
24 you've heard from tonight.

25 We thank you for your continued leadership on

1 these issues and commitment to these programs and to
2 environmental justice throughout the state.

3 Thank you.

4 BOARD CLERK HARRINGTON: Next, we have Jeff
5 Solomon. I have activated your microphone. Please unmute
6 yourself and you can begin.

7 JEFF SOLOMON: Thank you very much. Can you hear
8 me?

9 BOARD CLERK HARRINGTON: Yes, we can.

10 JEFF SOLOMON: Great. Okay. Well, Chairman
11 Randolph and Board, my name is Jeff Solomon. I am a
12 community leader in the Meadowview -- in the Meadowview
13 area of South Sacramento. And I would like to thank
14 Janice Lam Snyder, great to see her, and great to see
15 Richard Falcon, and great to hear from my Councilmember
16 Mai Vang and Jennifer Holder in supporting my community,
17 Meadowview, to get the resources that we need to improve
18 our air quality.

19 They've said most of what I was going say, so I
20 will be -- I won't take my three minutes. I will mention
21 two things. I thought I heard in the discussion that the
22 Sacramento air that currently has attention does have a
23 community air monitoring program, but does not have a
24 community emissions reduction program. If that
25 understanding is true, I don't understand how improvements

1 can possibly be made if there's no program for remediation
2 in dealing with all the data and I'll -- I'm going to
3 contact my local people offline obviously to get more
4 information on that, if that's true.

5 The other thing I wanted to mention is that, as
6 has been said, our area is lacking in environmental
7 justice because of historical reasons and I'm encouraged
8 that your Blueprint 2.0 is going to be addressing this to
9 help our areas get a bet -- a better start and a better
10 shake out of the pie. I'm hoping that Meadowview can
11 actually get more -- a little more help before the
12 Blueprint is finalized and activated, whenever that will
13 be. But if your Blueprint does not improve that situation
14 for communities around California, I think you should be
15 considering that as you're building it, because that would
16 mean a failure of the Blueprint if it doesn't make it
17 easier for -- and easier ride for communities than we've
18 had in Meadowview and other areas.

19 Thank you for your time -- my time. Thank you.

20 BOARD CLERK HARRINGTON: Thank you.

21 Next, we have Vincent Valdez. I have activated
22 your microphone. Please unmute yourself and you can
23 begin.

24 Vincent?

25 VINCENT VALDEZ: Can you hear me?

1 BOARD CLERK HARRINGTON: Yes, we can.

2 VINCENT VALDEZ: Okay. My name is Vincent
3 Valdez. I am the co-lead of the AB 617 South Sacramento
4 community steering committee. And it hurts me to hear how
5 many people have not been selected again this year for
6 access to the funds from the AB 617, as well as our
7 community -- speaking just on my community, we've learned
8 the highest cancer clusters, we've learned where the air
9 quality is the worst in our community, but we're not going
10 to be -- we didn't get any funding to do anything for the
11 emission reductions program. And so it's a little
12 disheartening to know that we didn't get any funding for
13 emissions reductions when we've been doing all this work,
14 just like the gentleman just stated. We've done all this
15 work, but we're not going to be able to move forward with
16 our progress.

17 Along the lines of -- I just have to step back
18 and say I am so proud of my community for stepping up
19 today and being a part of this CARB Board meeting. I
20 asked as many people as I could to come up and show up.
21 And I've listened to everybody like I've asked. And my
22 friends have showed up and people who are working hard in
23 our community to get air quality monitoring done, and not
24 just our steering committee, but throughout the City of
25 Sacramento. And this is a community led movement that is

1 coming from Sacramento and I'm just proud of all my
2 friends and every -- all the hard work we're doing.

3 But the community emissions reduction plan is
4 something that I've been asking for for a long time and
5 we've learned that there isn't just enough funding to do
6 some of that. And so I just don't understand how, as a
7 community, we have worked -- the funding is not being
8 allocated for Sacramento, which -- and we're in the
9 backyard of CARB, the headquarters, where everybody is
10 meeting today. And so I just want -- I just want to work
11 harder and get the community engagement process going a
12 little more farther.

13 That being said, we're not giving up and we're
14 going to keep back coming stronger and get more support so
15 we can try to get some more resources for our community.
16 Thank you.

17 BOARD CLERK HARRINGTON: Thank you.

18 Next, will Madeline Harris. And then after that
19 will be followed by LaDonna Williams, Trinity, the user
20 known as "S" and Kamillah Ealom.

21 Madeline, I have activated your microphone.
22 Please unmute yourself and you can begin.

23 MADELINE HARRIS: Good evening. I'm here in the
24 community of La Vina with six residents and there are
25 eight speakers here, six of whom will be speaking in

1 Spanish. I will organize pause for presentation as
2 needed. So the first speaker will begin now.

3 (Translator communicated with witness
4 in Spanish).

5 ESTHER CUEVAS (through interpreter): Hello. My
6 name is Esther Cuevas. I'm a resident of La Vina. And
7 we'd like to ask for your support please so that you can
8 help us in air monitoring our area of La Vina. There are
9 so many illnesses here. We see a lot of asthma. We see a
10 lot of pneumonia and that's why we're asking you please
11 for your help. We would like to be able to see air
12 monitoring in our area. There's so many illnesses that
13 are coming up here. There's other illnesses that arise
14 too, for example, even allergies. When I get allergies
15 I'm affected by swelling, by itchiness. All this comes
16 because of our contaminated air. And so we would like
17 your help, please. We would like your support. Please
18 don't put us aside. Don't set us aside. Don't ignore us.
19 That's not right. And that's all for now.

20 Thank you.

21 MADELINE HARRIS: And we have another speaker
22 next here in the room.

23 THE INTERPRETER: Thank you. This is the
24 interpreter. May we ask them to state their name, please.

25 LOURDES CASTILLO (through interpreter): Yes. My

1 name is Lourdes Castillo. We'd like to ask you for your
2 support, please. There's so much even spraying that goes
3 on. For example, my home it's right next to a field.
4 Sometimes they come and they spray. They don't even tell
5 us before they do it. And we'd like to ask you please do
6 something about it. Let us get some air monitors, please.
7 Our air is horrible. It's dirty. We need to do something
8 about it. And that's why we'd like to ask you for your
9 support, please. Listen. Please do something if you can
10 help us. We're asking. Please. Even the fields, they're
11 right next to our home. Sometimes the vines themselves
12 are so close that when they spray, it comes into our
13 property on our home. The plane comes, it sprays, and
14 then it just disappears. And then too when they come --
15 when they come for the harvest, sometimes the machines
16 they're so huge. They come so close to the house my house
17 shakes and shakes. My house is old. It has solar panels.
18 The solar panels don't even work any more because those
19 machines shake my house so much. And that's all for me.
20 Thank you. I hope you can help us.

21 MADELINE HARRIS: Okay. And our next speaker is
22 coming up.

23 (Translator communicated with witness
24 in Spanish).

25 BERTHA GARCIA (through interpreter): Good

1 afternoon, my name is Bertha Garcia. So I'm here asking
2 the same thing, please, your support, your help for air
3 monitoring in our area. We live right next to the fields.
4 They come. They spray. They do their pesticides. It
5 affects us. I have allergies. I suffer with allergies.
6 My son has asthma. He has a little one, has the same
7 thing. These pesticides are affecting us so badly. Our
8 air quality is very bad. And we've been here in this area
9 of La Vina for 25 years now. We've been struggling for
10 years, years, asking for help, your support to see what
11 can be done to help us monitor our area. Our air is so
12 bad. There's so many contaminants because of the
13 pesticides that are used. And I'd like to reiterate the
14 same way. We have so many people that are afflicted by
15 illness as we have so many deaths, cancer, asthma, so many
16 people are affected by this, not just us. My home, as was
17 mentioned by the previous speaker, is right next to a
18 field. We all feel it, so we're here to ask you, please,
19 please help us. We appreciate any support you can give
20 us.

21 (Translator communicated with witness
22 in Spanish).

23 ROSA CASILLAS-GUTIERREZ (through interpreter):

24 Good afternoon. I am Rosa Casillas-Gutierrez.
25 Thank you. We're here also to ask the same thing, if you

1 can help, if you can support us with, what are those
2 called, air monitors, please, especially in the area of La
3 Vina. We're all very deeply affected by it. I have
4 allergies. And I get sick for a long time. It starts.
5 Come February, here come the allergies and it goes all the
6 way through May, that whole time for months, I have
7 headaches. I can't breathe. It's because of these
8 allergies. Or if it gets windy, of course, we get sick
9 then too. Why? Because we have planes coming by overhead
10 and they're spraying the pesticides. And if it gets
11 windy, of course, that comes into your home. You breathe
12 it in, and then you get sick from allergies or something
13 else because of these pesticides. And so again, I'm here
14 to ask you, please help us with these air monitors. If
15 you can put -- install some here with us, because again
16 our air quality here in La Vina is so, so bad.

17 And that's all. Thank you.

18 (Translator communicated with witness
19 in Spanish).

20 ASECION AGUAYO (through interpreter): Good
21 afternoon. My name is Asencion Aguayo. And I've been a
22 resident here of La Vina for 30 years. And this who time
23 the air has been contaminated and nothing has been done
24 about it during that entire time. There's times maybe you
25 could even be asleep and then you hear the planes

1 overhead. They come and they spray the pesticides. They
2 don't even tell us when. We have no idea what they're
3 spraying, what kind of poison we're breathing in. And
4 that's why we're all here. We're just asking you for
5 help, please, with this contamination, pollution of our
6 air. It's so polluted. We hope you'll take us into
7 account and you can help us. Thank you. That's all.

8 (Translator communicated with witness
9 in Spanish).

10 GUADALUPE NUÑEZ (through interpreter): Good
11 afternoon. My name is Guadalupe Nuñez. And we're here to
12 ask you please for help with air monitors. So many of us
13 get sick. I suffer from allergies, my family, asthma. In
14 fact, my father-in-law died of cancer and that's because
15 of the contamination, the air pollution that we have in
16 our area. And maybe we can get some practical help, for
17 example, create some safe zones or barriers. There's the
18 rows of trees or those grooves, right, when they come and
19 they spray. It affects our homes. My mom's house is
20 right next to -- right next to a field where they come and
21 they spray the trees. It comes right into her yard, into
22 her garden, into her home. Maybe that's something that
23 can be done is create a little bit of a safe distance
24 between our homes and these -- and the fields.

25 Of if we could be helped with some type of

1 barriers or some type of protection, so that when they
2 spray or they fumigate. You know, this doesn't come into
3 the families' homes, into our yards. It doesn't affect
4 the family as much, those who are living so close. And
5 we're here to ask if you can help, please. I've been here
6 26 years. Air quality is so, so bad. If there's anything
7 that can be done to help us improve our air quality. And
8 we hope you'll listen. You'll hear us, please.

9 Thank you.

10 (Translator communicated with witness
11 in Spanish).

12 MADELINE HARRIS: We have two more commenters.

13 ANDREA URIBE: Hello.

14 THE INTERPRETER: Yes. Thank you. May we ask
15 the next commenter to state their name for the record,
16 please.

17 ANDREA URIBE: Andrea Uribe

18 (Translator communicated with witness
19 in Spanish).

20 ANDREA URIBE: Good afternoon. My name is Andrea
21 Uribe and I'm speaking as a policy advocate on behalf of
22 Leadership Counsel among with the community members here
23 at La Vina.

24 THE INTERPRETER: Thank you. This is the
25 interpreter. You can continue to giving your comment all

1 in English.

2 Thank you.

3 ANDREA URIBE: I'm imploring that you choose --
4 I'm imploring that you choose the community of La Vina for
5 (inaudible). The residential zones of La Vina are
6 surrounded by various agricultural crops. However, this
7 results in a plethora of negative, environmental effects
8 from the heavy pesticides. This has impacts of the
9 community's everyday needs, including their ability to
10 breathe. This has resulted in high and disproportionate
11 rates of asthma and cancer throughout the community, among
12 many other things. La Vina residents have been working
13 for years in order to be selected for this program.
14 However, they have been suffering from poor air quality
15 and negative environmental impacts for even longer.

16 They can't wait any longer to have this
17 addressed. Please allow this community to benefit from
18 the program that was created for communities like them.
19 And all (inaudible) the community of La Vina, we also
20 uplift the nomination with South Madera and other
21 communities in Madera. And thank you.

22 MADELINE HARRIS: And we have one more commenter,
23 which is me. My name is Madeline Harris. I'm also with
24 Leadership Counsel. I've been working here in La Vina for
25 the past four years and this is the fifth consecutive year

1 that La Vina is nominating themselves to be part of this
2 program and have yet to be selected. And we acknowledge
3 that CARB worked with DPR and the community on getting an
4 EPA grant for air monitoring, but residents are requesting
5 an update on that air monitoring grant, now that it's been
6 approved and would like to see that grant, you know, get
7 implemented, so that they can start trying to protect
8 themselves from the contamination in the community.

9 And then the other thing I want to say is whether
10 La Vina is or is not selected for 617 this year, the lack
11 of local, regional, and State level regulation on
12 agriculture in this community is costing people their
13 lives. However, the course of the time that I've been
14 working here, several people have been diagnosed with and
15 passed away from Cancer. Every single household it seems
16 like is impacted from asthma. And so the community is
17 asking once again for the fifth time to be col -- to be
18 selected for AB 617, but I want to remind CARB of your
19 duty to ensure that all Californians have clean air to
20 breathe and to improve and advance public health.

21 So outside of 617, this is still your job, and
22 residents are still asking you to work with them. And
23 then the other thing I want to say is, you know, using 617
24 as a limitation to act in communities based on lack of
25 available funding is unacceptable for communities that are

1 experiencing these impacts. It would be free or very low
2 cost for CARB to work with DPR and for staff to work with
3 Board members on directing local ag commissioners to
4 notify residents of pesticide spray or to direct them to
5 stop approving notices and this could save lives. So
6 again, we're asking for La Vina to be selected. And
7 regardless of this Program, CARB needs to step up and
8 protect public health and air quality and environmental
9 (inaudible).

10 Thank you.

11 THE INTERPRETER: And this is the interpreter.
12 May I ask once more. Is there any other Spanish speaking
13 commenter at that location

14 MADELINE HARRIS: No. This is everyone on our
15 end. Thank you so much.

16 THE INTERPRETER: Thank you.

17 BOARD CLERK HARRINGTON: Thank you.

18 Next is LaDonna Williams. I have activated your
19 microphone. Please unmute yourself and you can begin.

20 LaDONNA WILLIAMS: Yes. I would like though to
21 pause the clock for a minute, because I have a question.
22 I sate here and I waited patiently like everyone else for
23 them to speak, and yet you have called me after one
24 person. And then with that one person, she was allowed to
25 slide in, I don't know how many people, 8 to 10 or 12, or

1 whatever it was, under the needing an interpreter.

2 How is this fair? I need somebody and top brass
3 from CARB to call me later and explain to me why was this
4 allowed to happen, because if that's the case, then us
5 English speakers should be able to bring in our community
6 folks, get in line, and then slide in everybody else to
7 make their comment. This is further environmental racism
8 and injustice.

9 You knew my name was there. What you should have
10 done was you should have called those folks at the end
11 afterwards, with all due respect to be fair to other
12 commenters. This should not have been allowed to happen
13 under the guise of non-English speakers. It is unfair to
14 those of us that are English speakers and are natives in
15 this country. This is unfair.

16 And what I want to also say is -- now, you can
17 run the clock. I'm asking for my full three minutes back,
18 because what occurred here was an injustice. I have said
19 time and time again that this process of AB 617 will fail
20 our EJ communities. And this is playing out as we speak.
21 The fact that Hunters Point, a historically disadvantaged
22 long-term expose with high rates of Cancer and death have
23 to come and beg to be nominated and then selected in a
24 process that you all receive billions of dollars to
25 supposedly support communities through this process that

1 you're claiming is a community-led process is really a
2 misnomer. This is agency driven, it is agency designed,
3 and it has not benefited our communities. As you see
4 community after community that are impacted heavily by
5 high rates of cancer, death, and other illnesses are
6 coming before you and pleading for you to help them.

7 We should not -- it is not our responsibility to
8 even have to come to you all. You are supposed to be
9 pollution emission agencies to reduce pollution in our
10 communities, our water, our air, our soil, whatever it is.
11 Yet, we've got to come and beg you to do your job. You
12 have more than enough data that shows all of our
13 communities here need the help and should have been
14 designated. You originally designated 20 communities.
15 You reduced it down to 10 initially. And out of that 10,
16 only one community was Black, which was West Oakland. And
17 now you have fed in some of these others, yet Black folks
18 have the highest rate of every negative health effect
19 there is and the lowest numbers of any positive areas of
20 support or funding. So black communities should be a
21 priority.

22 However, all of the communities that are coming
23 before you that are begging and pleading for your help
24 should have been funded from day one. There is no reason
25 in 2023 that we should be having to come and plead to you

1 all to please nominate us and select us for you to come in
2 and reduce pollution and death in our communities. How
3 care you all.

4 But I want somebody to call me, if 23 not
5 tonight, tomorrow. And I guarantee you, if they don't, we
6 will have a gang, an army of folks and the news press
7 coming at you. Somebody better call me.

8 Thank you.

9 BOARD CLERK HARRINGTON: Thank you.

10 Next, we have Trinity. I have activated your
11 microphone. Please unmute yourself and you can begin.

12 TRINITY VANG: Hi. Can you hear me?

13 BOARD CLERK HARRINGTON: Yes, we can.

14 TRINITY VANG: Okay. Hi. My name is Trinity
15 Vang. And I am Air Quality Organizer for Brightline
16 Defense. We're an environmental justice non-profit that
17 serves Eastern San Francisco neighborhoods. Brightline
18 first started its environmental justice work in 2006
19 alongside community leaders, such as Dr. Espanola Jackson
20 and Bayview Hunters Point. And today, we work with
21 priority populations through coalition Building, policy
22 advocacy, and environmental justice programming.

23 For example, the Brightline air quality
24 monitoring sensor network is a community-driven air
25 quality monitoring network that brings free local air

1 quality data to communities, like SoMa, the Tenderloin,
2 Chinatown, and Bayview Hunters Point.

3 We are calling in support of Bayview Hunters
4 Point being selected for the next cycle of a community
5 emissions reduction plan pursuant to AB 617. Brightline
6 has witnessed the environmental disparities that the
7 Bayview has faced, especially with access to air quality
8 and monitoring resources. We believe that a community
9 emissions reduction act plan can aid in closing these Gaps
10 of environmental disparities and we're excited to see this
11 plan be head by community based organizations, such as the
12 Bayview Hunters Point Community Advocates, and the Marie
13 Harrison Community Foundation.

14 And for these reasons, we are again in support of
15 Bayview Hunters Point being selected for the 2023 cycle of
16 community reductions plans.

17 Thank you and I yield the rest of my time.

18 BOARD CLERK HARRINGTON: Thank you.

19 Next, we have the user known as "S". I have
20 activated your microphone. Please unmute yourself and you
21 can begin.

22 SHARON: Yes. Hi. My name is Sharon and I
23 represent the Robla Park Community Association. I support
24 the AB 617, including North Sacramento. Although, North
25 Sacramento has been nominated, I believe that it is

1 important to understand the geographical landscape of the
2 north area. Using a broad brush to identify the needs of
3 North Sacramento has often left out the most needy
4 sections.

5 I want to draw your attention to north of
6 Interstate 80, an incredibly busy highway. The former
7 McClellan Air Force Base to the city limits and North
8 Natomas. This North Sacramento area is home to more than
9 25,000 residents of diverse cultures and socioeconomic
10 status. Many retire -- are retirees, and it is home to
11 five elementary schools that are intertwined in
12 long-standing and existing, including a fast-growing
13 trucking, manufacturing, and industrial facilities. These
14 facilities with little to no oversight are suffocating our
15 neighborhoods. Residents often listen to idling trucks
16 adjacent to their homes for 24 hours. We share unimproved
17 narrow roads, no green spaces, and no plan for smart
18 growth for infill development to accommodate these
19 deficiencies.

20 As I comment today, projects are still being
21 approved for more trucking facilities and -- north of
22 Interstate 80.

23 Inclusion. We were left out and have been often
24 left out with many other things because of where we're
25 located of the most recent monitoring stations, which were

1 installed south of Interstate 80. We have no sidewalks.
2 We have no road improvements. We have crumbling
3 infrastructure, and the air quality is absolutely
4 unreasonable.

5 So I ask that you please include North Sacramento
6 and make sure that the organizations and those advocating
7 for this area are working closely with those that have --
8 that are more familiar with the areas that have the very
9 wide, vast, diverse geographical coverage of North
10 Sacramento.

11 Thank you.

12 BOARD CLERK HARRINGTON: Thank you.

13 Next, we have Kamillah Ealom. I have activated
14 your microphone. You can unmute yourself and begin.

15 KAMILLAH EALOM: Good evening. My name is
16 Kamillah Ealom. I am a Bayview Hunters Point native, born
17 asthmatic, long-time and current resident, and community
18 organizer. I want to emphasize that Bayview Hunters Point
19 is surrounded by some of the largest standing sources of
20 pollution in the country. Not only the radioactive toxic
21 waste buried at the Hunters Point Naval Shipyard Superfund
22 site, but Darling Ingredients animal rendering plant, the
23 wastewater treatment facility, direct exposure from
24 industrialized sources, and diesel idling from trucks
25 operating within a five block radius from the newly built

1 housing development, such as Alice Griffith where I
2 currently reside.

3 We are gravely overwhelmed with diesel truck
4 idling in Bayview Hunters Point. We are all suffering
5 from asthma, respiratory lung diseases, and dying from
6 Cancer. According to CARB's considered factors, Bayview
7 Hunters Point check off all boxes for both the CERP and
8 the CAMP programs.

9 As we are grateful for the Air District and its
10 partnership with our existing air monitoring program, we
11 need support to add more standing monitor sites through
12 the IVAN network in Bayview Hunters Point. As we provide
13 portable air monitors to residents and train them on how
14 to read, interpret, and share the data at our monthly EJ
15 task force meetings with the Marie Harrison Foundation, we
16 need support to provide more portable air monitors
17 throughout our community. We also need support to
18 continue our climate justice youth and adult academy,
19 where we educate and engage with our community residents
20 as they learn to understand the CalEnviroScreen and have
21 adequate knowledge regarding the different pollutants that
22 surround us in the Bayview Hunters Point also being a
23 shoreline community and its direct impacts. Could you
24 imagine living and losing 15 years off your life? Well,
25 that's our reality.

1 I want to thank you in advance for supporting
2 and -- the existing and future lives of my community by
3 considering Bayview Hunters Point as an AB 617 community.
4 I look forward to continue working with and collaborating
5 with all the core community partners in Bayview Hunters
6 Point.

7 Thank you.

8 BOARD CLERK HARRINGTON: Thank you.

9 Next, we will have Eddie Ahn. And after that, it
10 will be followed by Laura Rosenberger Haider and phone
11 number ending in 373, and then Kevin Hamilton.

12 Eddie, I have activated your microphone. Please
13 unmute yourself and you can begin.

14 EDDIE AHN: Hi. I'll be brief. Eddie Ahn,
15 Executive Director Brightline. And just, you know, would
16 like to recognize the State of California for coming such
17 a long way in terms of designating Bayview Hunters Point
18 as a, you know, environmental justice community, which was
19 not the case, back in 2015, 2016, and, for instance, very
20 early versions of CalEnviroScreen. There was a lot of
21 early resistance at the State level to recognize it as an
22 EJ community. So we're really pleased today that CARB is
23 designating it in this way.

24 And, you know, for us at the end of the day, we'd
25 like to recognize CARB for two things really in addition

1 to designating Bayview Hunters Point. One, you know, the
2 priority populations definition has been really important
3 to make sure that CalEnviroScreen is an important tool
4 itself, but ensuring that it's inclusive when we talk
5 about air quality monitoring, because there are a lot of
6 different factors that go into determining an EJ
7 community. And it's just -- sometimes it's lonely work
8 to, you know, work on these really wonkish policy issues,
9 but it is important. Essentially, it recognizes a
10 community, helps organize a community, and ultimately get
11 resources for the community as well.

12 And then second is just recognizing the political
13 leadership of CARB in this as well. You know, one key
14 instance is where Chair, you know, Randolph actually came
15 out to San Francisco Chinatown, I remember, in the wake of
16 visible anti-Asian hate incidents and talked to Chinatown
17 community members about environmental justice issues
18 affecting that community. And I think it's just one small
19 probably example to the Chair, but it is very, you know,
20 meaningful to the community. And I hope that relationship
21 can continue in many other communities as well.

22 So generally, we're very supportive of Bayview
23 Hunters Point Community Advocates and the Marie Harrison
24 Community Foundation and the work they're doing for
25 Bayview Hunters Point and look forward to hopefully

1 collaborating more in the future.

2 Thank you.

3 BOARD CLERK HARRINGTON: Next is Laura
4 Rosenberger Haider. I have activated your microphone.
5 Please unmute yourself and you can begin.

6 LAURA ROSENBERGER HAIDER: Oh, this year we
7 should air monitor communities where the new oil wells are
8 being drilled -- or they plan to be drilled. Probably two
9 years from now there won't be any more oil wells drilled
10 near sensitive populations. This research is needed to
11 help the public to decide whether or not to vote for the
12 referendum on SB 1137. But also I like Bay -- the Bayview
13 Hunters Point is a good choice for a CERP too, because
14 when you monitor there, be sure to measure radioactive
15 PM2.5 to see if the cleanup of radioactive waste is
16 working.

17 All right. Thanks.

18 BOARD CLERK HARRINGTON: Thank you.

19 Next, we have Kevin Hamilton. I have activated
20 your microphone. Please unmute yourself and you can
21 begin.

22 KEVIN HAMILTON: Thank you. And good evening,
23 members of the Board and welcome to the new members. And
24 here we are again for some of us the fifth year of this
25 same meeting sadly making the same kinds of choices. I

1 can't imagine what it's like for Board members to have to
2 hear these tragic stories that are repeated again, and
3 again, and again, and realize that apparently it's not as
4 important to our Governor and to the folks who put money
5 forward to fund these kinds of things.

6 But I have to hold back completely on blame there
7 and consider the fact that the air agency that can
8 actually solve many of these pollution problems has moved
9 quite slowly and continues to move at almost glacial
10 place -- pace to create solution for all of us that works
11 for these communities.

12 For far too long, we continue to see air
13 pollution from major sources on the mobile side. We've
14 dribbled along on trucks and cars over almost 20 years
15 coming up on since the first big truck regulation, you
16 know, with a lot of nonsense about the economy will fall
17 apart and this and that. This is the sixth largest
18 economy in the world. It's highly unlikely it's going to
19 fall apart because we move a little more quickly in
20 adopting electric vehicles at reducing the number of pumps
21 that are run by diesel engines or the other equipment that
22 is run every day off-road and off-license without any kind
23 of emission control at all, because it doesn't quite meet
24 the level of horsepower under the existing regulations.

25 So I really would feel that this Board -- I do

1 feel strongly this Board needs to make a new stand, put
2 the message out even more strongly than ever that this is
3 over. It's time for these emission sources to be scaled
4 back and eliminated quickly. People are literally dying.
5 They're certainly severely ill. We're seeing unbelievable
6 rates of asthma on the rise in our communities, other
7 chronic illnesses. It's very difficult to watch this and
8 realize there's a potential solution and yet there doesn't
9 seem to be the political will to implement those solutions
10 in a timely fashion.

11 My last comment really goes out to the commenters
12 tonight. Really need everybody to lineup in this same
13 fashion in front of the Governor's office and say these
14 same things and ask why there isn't adequate funding at
15 this agency to select all of these communities that need
16 this. So if you look at CalEnviroScreen, you get an idea
17 of how many are being left behind and it's just
18 intolerable.

19 Thank you very much for your time tonight.

20 BOARD CLERK HARRINGTON: Thank you. This
21 concludes our commenters.

22 CHAIR RANDOLPH: Thank you.

23 Staff, are there any issues raised in the
24 comments that you want to address before I close the
25 record on this item and bring the discussion to the Board?

1 OCAP COMMUNITY PLANNING BRANCH CHIEF OLALUWOYE:

2 Yes, Madam Chair. I did just -- I did just want
3 to make a few comments.

4 First, I want to appreciate the comments and the
5 candor from the public who have made comments today. It's
6 really -- it's really appreciated the points. They're
7 well made and well taken.

8 One, I want to say we look forward to working
9 with the EJ groups and communities and ensuring that these
10 programs do meet the needs of communities, particularly
11 the monitoring plans and the emission reduction programs.

12 We also want to echo support for additional
13 funding. As you know, this is legislative issue. But in
14 the interim, we are looking at alternative ways of trying
15 to address some of the issues that we hear about today, an
16 example being what Madeline -- what Madeline mentioned
17 today, the American Rescue Plan grant that has -- that
18 we're using to provide monitoring and for pesticides in
19 the living area. They'll also be used to provide
20 monitoring for metals in the Vernon, Maywood area. So
21 we are -- we are looking actually at having a public
22 process for that, so that our -- we are internally working
23 with our Department of Pesticide Regulation, our Office of
24 Environmental Hazard and Health Assessment to actually put
25 together a community engagement plan that we will be

1 releasing in a -- providing soon.

2 I also want to mention community air grants,
3 which are an option for communities to get involved and
4 provide opportunities for additional community-led
5 monitoring, community -- local community steering
6 committees, also the opportunity for local community
7 emission reduction programs that we think -- do think are
8 another way that communities can provide leadership in
9 ways that can drive districts to help implement programs
10 that -- and strategies aligned with those types of
11 programs.

12 So I mention -- I mention these types of
13 opportunities, because I do want to also try to, in
14 meetings like this, disentangle this process from the
15 perception that only communities that are selected are
16 served by this Program. I do think we want to -- we need
17 to recognize that there are alternative ways that this
18 Program will help provide support in communities that are
19 not selected, including looking at additional grant
20 opportunities, including providing additional help towards
21 the air grants that we're talking about, but just in any
22 ways that we can provide that type of support. We want to
23 also -- we actually will also be lifting up that idea and
24 that concept as part of our Blueprint Process that we
25 talked about earlier in our presentation.

1 As we talk about the reimagining of this Program,
2 we want to look at how do we provide additional support
3 externally through our process, enhancing our -- reach of
4 our program, but also internally in trying to facilitate
5 our program and maybe streamline some of the areas that we
6 can't. So there are many ways that we are trying to look
7 at really refining our process and taking lessons learned
8 from over the past five years of this Program.

9 I want to also speak to the -- to the Sacramento
10 nomination. I think one of the things we also really
11 wanted to do as part of our process is really try to move
12 that particular CSC, or that particular community - I'll
13 say the South Sac community, to an emission reduction
14 program. So we did talk about with their District for
15 several months actually looking at this additional money
16 that we did get and really trying to use that to prompt
17 them to move forward in a faster pace. We understood the
18 District was not ready to move forward. They really want
19 to look at the additional monitoring that they're doing in
20 moving forward.

21 But we do have examples of other districts that
22 have moved forward at a faster pace, that we are looking
23 forward to continuing to work with the District to get
24 them into an emission reduction program sooner than later.
25 So looking forward to having additional discussions on

1 that point as well.

2 Lastly, I want to say -- I want to -- I want to
3 speak to LaDonna's comment. Although I am not leadership,
4 but I do want to speak to that point, because I think it
5 was so well made. And I think it actually illustrates
6 some of the challenges of this Program. When we talk
7 about what equity means, often it looks like providing
8 other opportunities to folks that have different needs.
9 But equity without explanation looks like unfairness. I
10 think it really helps to provide context about what
11 happened there and really was us trying to prevent -- or
12 sorry, I should say trying to provide an opportunity to
13 folks that do have additional limitations or speak another
14 language that it would need -- it would need additional
15 service or additional help with that and provide that
16 opportunity.

17 Also, there's a technol -- technology issue
18 there, so we did want to provide again an opportunity for
19 folks to speak to their community, speak to this Program
20 that didn't necessarily align with what we already have as
21 part of our process, but that's part of how we learn to do
22 this process, part of how we learn to do this Program. It
23 doesn't always look elegant. It sometimes looks, you
24 know, a little haphazard or sometimes, or sometimes it
25 just doesn't look exactly like other folks would think it

1 should, but it is us trying to provide and create space
2 for those who don't necessarily always feel like they have
3 it.

4 So again, I appreciate all the comments that have
5 been made today. Really look forward to discussion with
6 the Board on this, but I wanted to just provide that
7 context as well. Thank you.

8 CHAIR RANDOLPH: Thank you, Femi. I really
9 appreciate that additional clarity and your comments.

10 I will now close the record on this agenda item
11 and bring the discussion to the Board. So to -- would
12 Board members like to begin the conversation.

13 Board Member Guerra.

14 BOARD MEMBER GUERRA: Well, thank you, Chair.
15 And, you know, at the risk of being a new Board member and
16 being the first to speak, I apologize if I go off course
17 here. And I want to first thank you, and Board members
18 here, and all the CARB staff for great work in this staff
19 report, and -- you know, and to staff the comment that
20 it's elegant, I understand that. I -- you know, I've
21 worked as a -- both in a lab and then as a policy advisor
22 beforehand. And you do the best with the information you
23 have. So I don't think there's unnecessary -- a necessity
24 to say, you know, that it's not elegant. I appreciate the
25 hard work that you've done to get the information in a

1 very diverse state to where it's at today. And I do
2 appreciate the staff in their briefing in preparation for
3 this.

4 I also want to congratulate the communities
5 and -- that are being selected here today, the two
6 communities that worked really hard with their technical
7 staff at the -- their local air district, along with the
8 organizing work that's gone there. And I know that
9 firsthand as chairing an air quality management district
10 here locally and being at the Oak Park Community Center
11 and educating and working with the community about how an
12 air monitor works and going to -- you know, to where
13 people are to find -- to have them understand and learn to
14 be able to have an air monitor in their own community.
15 And having grown up as an immigrant, I understand that
16 sometimes there are fears to that.

17 So the pride that I see that came here today to
18 talk about where those communities that are moving on to
19 the CERP process, it's impactful. And that pride I saw
20 that today this morning, because I spent the morning with
21 the Meadowview community celebrating a federal grant that
22 is going to retrofit the Pannell Community Center for --
23 to improve the air filtration, because in Sacramento and
24 much of the basin here has suffered from the smoke from
25 our neighboring counties.

1 And many of these communities, their homes and
2 their apartments were built at a time where the filtration
3 system isn't even safe in their own home. And so having a
4 place to go, a place where the young kids can recreate in
5 these emergency situations was a proud day. But as
6 everyone was leaving and walking outside, they recognized
7 that they were walking out into the ambient air. And
8 therein lies the challenge I think.

9 There's a lot of pride in the AB 617 recognition.
10 I was -- when CARB -- thank you to the members at the time
11 and thank you to Dan and Sandy for your support in this,
12 you know, to get a AB 617 zone in South Sacramento, but
13 there was a lot of recognition about, you know, where
14 we -- where that community is today and how it was left
15 behind, and the challenges -- the financial challenges.
16 Thank you to the staff, I think, outlining where the
17 financial challenges have consisted. As more areas have
18 been selected, the funding has been stagnant.

19 So therein lies I think the concern that I have
20 in not setting up communities for a false promise. One of
21 the benefits of the air monitoring was that it gave us
22 better data. It even prompted our other neighboring
23 cities and jurisdictions to put their own general fund
24 dollars into increasing air monitoring. The City of
25 Rancho Cordova, the City of Sacramento County. United

1 Latinos, I appreciate them for going out and saying we
2 need to do our part in figuring how do we find resources.
3 Yet, with all of that combined effort, my understanding,
4 and maybe I'm wrong at this, is that, you know, if
5 there -- that -- if there isn't ongoing commitment of
6 funding, communities are required to accept and move into
7 the CERP process with one-time money. And for some of us
8 that have been around to watch ups and downs in the budget
9 cycle, that's a -- that's a concerning process and an
10 uncertain one for a community too.

11 So I guess the question that I do have for our
12 staff is, you know -- you know, what is staff's
13 recommendation or long-term plan to support communities
14 like South Sacramento and North Sac to move into the CERP
15 process, and after they've been recognized through the
16 CAMP process. And Sacramento, while it's still a small
17 district compared to some of our larger ones in the state,
18 I -- it has more resources than some of our other adjacent
19 ones, and small farming communities like Yolo County, who
20 even have a larger challenge and would say -- would not
21 even approach the process because of it.

22 So I guess that's -- and that's maybe a very big
23 question. And, you know, Femi, I appreciate you saying
24 that you're, you know, going to reach out and work with
25 those staffs on that process to move them forward, but

1 that is the -- I guess, the question here is what is that
2 long-term plan to support the communities to move into the
3 CERP process, where we actually address emission
4 reductions, because today, this morning, it was, you know,
5 not planned that way, but that was all I heard this
6 morning, a very proud community saying we're excited to
7 join in this effort. But what we really need now is
8 emission reductions.

9 OCAP COMMUNITY PLANNING BRANCH CHIEF OLALUWOYE:

10 Thank you, Board Member Guerra. It's an
11 excellent question. And I think it's actually one that
12 we're looking to tackle as part of our Blueprint 2.0
13 process. When we -- when we talk about what does it take
14 to move a community to -- from a monitoring plan to an
15 emission reduction program, we talk about taking the
16 lessons learned from the communities that have been done
17 so to really understanding what are the things that
18 they've done well, what are the things that have worked,
19 maybe things that have not worked, what are the things
20 that we have to take into account when we talk about a 10
21 to 12 year commitment that is an emission reduction
22 program.

23 So as we -- as we think about that and we develop
24 these ideas, and these concepts, and these pathways for
25 that, I think it is -- you know, we will be coming back to

1 you in September with this plan. We'll actually highlight
2 some of those -- some of those concerns and highlight some
3 of those pathways that we have discovered. Again, we are
4 having a lot of conversations with community members, with
5 the air districts, with EJ groups, and really trying to
6 understand what have they found that has really worked.
7 And I think that, in a sense, will inform the types of
8 advice and guidance that we will be giving in our -- in
9 our next version of the Blueprint.

10 BOARD MEMBER GUERRA: Well, I appreciate that and
11 I have a lot of hope. And I -- you know, I -- one,
12 there's a -- I know there -- here in the -- you know, in
13 the CARB staff and the folks who work here in this agency,
14 this is -- this is their home, so I know that there is a
15 lot of heart and interest as well in this. And I do hope
16 that they'll continue to work with the community to find
17 that path forward from CAMP into CERP.

18 And I do also want to again, you know,
19 congratulate those communities that are moving into that
20 process, because when I was looking at the staff report,
21 and Chair, you know, Randolph, I want to again thank the
22 good work that you have led in this. One of the things in
23 the Bay Hunters Viewpoint[SIC] that I noticed was how many
24 child care facilities were adjacent to a industrial area.
25 And if there's anything we know and we've experienced here

1 is how young -- how our young kids are impacted in their
2 lung development at that age. And so anything we can do
3 to immediately address that. The fact that the community
4 has engaged in that I think is critical.

5 And so I'm excited to support the staff
6 recommendation for those that are moving forward, but I
7 would like to work with staff directly to figure out a
8 process to make sure that Meadowview South Sac is not
9 forgotten and that we move and look at these other
10 communities out there.

11 Lastly. (Spoke in Spanish.)

12 And thank you very much, Chair Randolph.

13 CHAIR RANDOLPH: Thank you.

14 Board Member Hurt.

15 BOARD MEMBER HURT: Thank you, Chair.

16 I want to thank all the public speakers for
17 sharing their lived experiences and the real need that
18 they have in their communities. I think it's really
19 important in these public spaces that we don't shy away
20 from the fact that over the past 50 years, the air quality
21 and health improvements we've seen have not been shared by
22 all. Nearly a third of Californians, predominantly people
23 of color, live in the over 400 California communities that
24 have disproportionately dirty air.

25 And so AB 617 is an essential program. It's

1 targeting support to those communities most in need. And
2 as was stated, there are many people waiting. And it is
3 hard to not be able to meet everyone's needs. And so I
4 think it will be important, if not in this meeting in a
5 coming meeting, to hear what are the goalposts that we're
6 setting for ourselves in this reimagining process that we
7 can share with the community, so they can feel assured
8 that we do mean what we say and that we're trying our best
9 to work through a very difficult environment.

10 Clearly, revisions are in need. And it
11 definitely requires some additional solutions, so that
12 everybody can get on the path. And I know we have many
13 different community groups that can help us think about
14 that. And I definitely think we're all open to hearing
15 from the community what do you think the solution is,
16 because it is a complex hard thing and I think we're all
17 hope to figuring out how we can support these many
18 communities.

19 And I think especially because the community
20 engagement part, and someone said this earlier, it's not
21 easy and it's not inexpensive. It's time intensive and
22 sometimes takes even longer to manage because of the very
23 complex issues, the various stakeholders, and the trust
24 building that needs to occur.

25 So Bayview Hunters Point is in my district, my

1 area. I'm very excited that they have come together and
2 nominated themselves. They're ready to move forward. All
3 the folks that came to speak to uplift Bayview Hunters
4 Point, I want to thank you all. I know you're making a
5 big investment in the work that you're doing. It's a
6 great sacrifice of your time, and your family, and
7 responsibilities. But as we all know, it's an extremely
8 important investment to clean the air, and just Build Back
9 Better for the community.

10 I want to also thank the BAAQMD team, Suma
11 Peesapati for being here with us and speaking a little bit
12 and working through the difficult discussions that have
13 been happening in Bayview Hunters Point, because it's not
14 as if it's a unified community. Everybody comes at it
15 with different needs. And so it's complex. And I know
16 the BAAQMD team is working really hard with numerous
17 stakeholders, and bringing them to the table for the
18 discussion.

19 But this community is more than ready to start a
20 CERP and they have community members already making
21 progress. And as the Air District grows and gets better,
22 we will help them do that. It is community led, which I
23 think is extremely important, but we are there to help in
24 the navigation of things.

25 So I just say to my fellow Board members, I hope

1 you all can pass this AB 617 community forward. And
2 again, we do need to figure out a way to get all those 400
3 communities on the road to cleaner air.

4 Thank you, Chair.

5 CHAIR RANDOLPH: Thank you.

6 Dr. Pacheco-Werner.

7 BOARD MEMBER PACHECO-WERNER: Yeah. Thank you
8 Chair. You know, I really appreciate all the commenters
9 and all the presenters, including the air districts for
10 continuing to try to seek ways to incorporate communities
11 into this work.

12 I'll definitely just echo on the -- on the
13 funding, you know, aspect, that, you know, we just really
14 need to continue to ask for increased funding for this
15 type of work. And I also feel like we do have an
16 opportunity with the Blueprint to really think about what
17 additional ways and, you know, really have a way to
18 respond to some of the comments that have been made today
19 about, you know, the selection process being -- feeling
20 heavily district led. And it's -- you know, and so having
21 that ongoing -- you know, maybe thinking creatively about
22 how we can see the role of additional funding, the role of
23 match funding, so that we can have something more to weigh
24 other than, you know -- or the districts themselves can
25 have something more to weigh in terms of the readiness for

1 a community to move to the next level, other than just the
2 funding that we have available for this Program. And so I
3 hope that there's -- exists that opportunity for more
4 creative discussions on that front.

5 I did want to speak a little bit also to -- I
6 think that -- on that, you know, sort of like on the road
7 to equity. I know we talk about that -- that word a lot,
8 but I do feel like perhaps there also needs to exist this
9 space for in this process to have conversations and tough
10 conversations across the 617 communities that deal with
11 the racial tensions that have happened as a result of this
12 ongoing historical inequities, where communities of color
13 have had to fight for resources among each other.

14 And so I do think that, you know, while we aren't
15 a program that -- you know, this isn't a program that's
16 designed to do all and heal all, I do think that I would
17 be remiss to say that I -- that I do think that that space
18 is necessary to really have those conversations about
19 Black and Brown racial tensions and visibility of Asian
20 communities, right, some of the -- some of those
21 conversations that are part of that sort of on-the-road to
22 equity piece.

23 Lastly, I do want to say that -- you know, and
24 this is more -- a couple of comments and then also
25 questions. When it comes to La Vina, which I know -- you

1 know, I really appreciate the speakers today on -- that
2 came from that community. I believe that we had given
3 grants in the past to do air monitoring in that community.
4 So please correct me if I'm wrong and, you know, just kind
5 of -- it feels like, you know -- and this is part of -- I
6 talked to Femi about this in the -- in the briefing,
7 right, you know, that sort of like how are communities --
8 you know, how are we investing in communities and what are
9 we seeing from that investment? So I -- please correct me
10 if I'm wrong here.

11 And then also, I was under the impression that
12 that community is also currently engaging with the
13 Department of Conservation to address some of what the
14 commenters talked about around the buffer zones and was
15 wondering if CARB, you know, has a role in terms of
16 involvement and support of the creation of those buffer
17 zones as we have become involved in other -- with other
18 agencies around supporting communities, as I know that the
19 staff has been heavily involved with the DPR process on
20 pesticides.

21 So thank you so much. (Spoke in Spanish).

22 And also to those in the Black community that
23 feel that their work -- their communities have not been
24 prioritized. I'm also hearing that and seeing how we can
25 continue to seek opportunities to do that as well.

1 Thank you.

2 CHAIR RANDOLPH: So my understanding of the
3 status of the buffer zone legislation is that it has been
4 referended. So at this point, I don't know what work is
5 happening on the ground in terms of implementation. So we
6 can ask staff to get that information and get back to you,
7 Dr. Pacheco-Werner.

8 Femi, did you want to add anything more about the
9 air monitoring question in La Vina.

10 OCAP COMMUNITY PLANNING BRANCH CHIEF OLALUWOYE:
11 Yeah. Thank you for that, Chair. I think I'll
12 actually ask our monitoring folks to tell them a little
13 bit about how we're doing the air monitoring in that area
14 and also maybe touch on a little bit of how monitoring
15 provides that bridge to how emission reductions programs
16 are designed and developed. So Dave, if you could speak
17 to that.

18 OCAP ADVANCED MONITORING TECHNIQUES SECTION
19 MANAGER RIDLEY: Hi. David Ridley in the Monitoring
20 and Laboratory Division.

21 Yeah, so the ARP grant that we applied for
22 funding from EPA for and received that -- we now have that
23 funding, but we're working out the process. There's going
24 to be a phased approach to the monitoring. And so there's
25 going to be discussion with community partners and there's

1 a large piece of community engagement to begin that. And
2 we are able to deploy -- the plan is to deploy sensors in
3 those communities which can happen more rapidly. And then
4 there will be pesticides monitoring undertaken in La Vina
5 as part of that contract as well.

6 So we've been looking for other avenues and --
7 that we can support. Communities that are not part of
8 617, not selected into 617, one of which is something like
9 the ARP grant. Other things are like the SNAPS Program,
10 the Study of Neighborhood Air near Petroleum Sources and
11 monitoring around communities looking at air quality near
12 oil and gas facilities, but looking at -- looking at
13 general air quality impacts in those communities as well.

14 So we have those studies also. And we have also
15 performed other monitoring kind of in different regions.
16 There's black carbon measurements that are taking place in
17 San Ysidro. Border community is part of another EPA
18 grant. We've been looking at odor complaint
19 investigations near landfills in Laytonville, diesel
20 particulate emissions in Marysville.

21 So we're always kind of looking for different
22 ways that we can support these communities that have
23 concerns but aren't part of the 617 process.

24 CHAIR RANDOLPH: Okay. Thank you.

25 Board Member De La Torre.

1 BOARD MEMBER DE LA TORRE: Thank you. Thank you,
2 staff. I know clearly from all the comments we've heard
3 today how difficult this process is. And every time we
4 select 617 communities, there's some that are not selected
5 and we have this same discussion each time.

6 I want to be really, really clear. This Program
7 was never meant to be statewide as 617. It was never
8 meant to be that. I've talked about it from the beginning
9 as a sampler platter of California. It's there are rural
10 communities, there are port communities, there are goods
11 movement communities. It's a little bit of everything in
12 California that's polluted.

13 And we are learning -- it's only been five years.
14 In government time, that's nothing, but we are learning
15 things. And off the top of my head, I can think of two.
16 Pesticides, that came from 617. Our involvement in
17 pesticides came from 617. We were down in the Central
18 Valley and the community came to us and said we need you
19 to do something about pesticides. CARB doesn't do
20 pesticides. There's an agency that does that. But
21 because of that 617 community, we, in our Scoping Plan,
22 have a component that is addressing pesticides.

23 That is incredible progress. And that's exactly
24 what this 617 process is supposed to be doing. It's
25 supposed to be flagging issues in a community that

1 reflects other communities that are similar to that one,
2 so all the rural communities. And guess what, beyond the
3 Scoping Plan, DPR right now is doing a pilot in a number
4 of counties statewide on pesticide notification. That was
5 driven by that 617 community. That is an incredible
6 accomplishment, because there was nothing like that
7 happening before. The 617 community told us about it. We
8 listened and we pushed ourselves. We nudged our way into
9 that discussion and partnering with DPR are now moving
10 that along. So that's a big one.

11 Another one is trucks. Lots of goods movement
12 corridors in 617 communities. So we now have our
13 Enforcement Division that is very much attuned to the 617
14 community and others like them. There are idling
15 ordinances that local governments can pass where they can
16 enforce them at the local level in these very communities,
17 617 or not, that can reduce emissions in those
18 communities. There are truck corridors that came out of
19 this that we can implement in these communities, whether
20 they're 617 or not.

21 And that -- and I'm sure -- and I know staff
22 knows a bunch more, but those are the two that come to
23 mind. And that's just -- you know, that was in the first
24 three years that we came up with those. And there are
25 more coming along, because we are learning constantly, oh,

1 in these kinds of settings, this kind of -- this kind of
2 pollution is happening that's impacting people. What can
3 we do there? It's not just for that 617 community. It's
4 for every like community statewide. So this is a
5 laboratory that we're doing here in these communities that
6 need it. And we are taking action in every single one.

7 In terms of the not-getting-selected thing, many
8 of you will remember the first batch of 617 communities
9 initially included my community, the community I live in,
10 the community that I represented in the State Legislature
11 that very much should have been on that list, but because
12 it was a goods movement community that has multiple
13 sources of other pollution as well, that's -- was similar
14 to other communities, staff proposed to take it out, not
15 because it didn't deserve it. It very much was one of the
16 top 10 most polluted communities in the state of
17 California. But because it was duplicative of other
18 communities, they proposed to take it out and I supported
19 them. I supported them taking my community out, because I
20 knew what the big picture was of this Program. And I will
21 continue to be supportive of what we're doing and how
22 we're doing it.

23 That being said, staff is doing 2.0 and they're
24 going to propose some adjustments and whatnot. And at
25 that time, we will hear about all of the learnings that

1 we've had that we are going to apply in other communities,
2 not just the two I mentioned, because those were the two I
3 just remembered. But we will have a full accounting of
4 those, because we want to make sure that we are moving the
5 needle not just in some community in some part of
6 California, but in all communities that are like that.
7 That is the great benefit of this.

8 And then I'll close with this, there is nothing
9 like AB 617 at this granular community level on the
10 planet. No one else in any state, in any country is doing
11 anything remotely close to this. So I'm very proud of it.
12 We are absolutely doing the right thing and we are
13 following through. If that ever stops to be the case,
14 then I will say it. But the evidence is piling up that we
15 are learning from these communities things that work, that
16 we can apply to others, and that was the purpose of 617.
17 I was very much involved in lobbying to make it happen.

18 So it's happening. It's happening pretty much
19 how we expected. I understand the hurt feelings. I
20 understand the concern from communities. I understand
21 that at the local level maybe doors have been closed to
22 them. And so they come to us and we're yet another one --
23 another government entity that's saying no.

24 But what I'm saying to you, and I'll speak to La
25 Vina in a second, is we're not saying no. We're saying

1 there's another way and we will work with you to identify
2 those.

3 La Vina is a perfect example. They have applied
4 for 617 multiple times, but a couple of the things that
5 they've raised, pesticides, what we just talked about
6 monitoring, it's not part of -- I mean, notification.
7 It's not part of the DPR pilot project. That county is
8 not, because that county was reluctant to participate, but
9 we'll get there. So that's one part of this.

10 And then the other part is monitoring, which Femi
11 just mentioned. They did get a grant. We're working on
12 getting those monitors to that community. So they are
13 benefiting by bringing those issues to our attention and
14 now we're finding other ways to help outside of the 617
15 process. (Spoke in Spanish).

16 So I just said, you know, that they're going to
17 get, at some point, pesticide notification through DPR,
18 and from us, the monitors that Femi alluded to earlier.

19 So again, it -- you know, it has limited
20 resources. It's tough with what -- we're working with
21 what we've got, but we are also identifying other
22 opportunities to help all like communities statewide.

23 Thank you.

24 CHAIR RANDOLPH: Thank you.

25 Board Member Takvorian.

1 BOARD MEMBER TAKVORIAN: Thank you, Chair.

2 I have four areas that I just wanted to comment
3 on. And I know it's getting late for folks, but I think
4 it's important that we look at this Program in distinct
5 ways. So I just want to kind of segregate my comments a
6 bit. First, I wanted to just say on the report itself,
7 that staff have given -- I want to give huge appreciation
8 to the OCAP staff for not only the report, but for the
9 incredible work that the staff have done with the
10 community members, and the many community steering
11 committees members, and community members who have
12 participated in the Program and contributed to this body
13 of knowledge that's ever-growing. And it's only because
14 of the success of those efforts that this Program is seen
15 as a viable option for solving some of these problems.

16 And I really want to emphasize that there's a lot
17 to like about the report and comment on. But the one
18 thing I really wanted to say is that I really appreciated
19 the emphasis on the seven strategic categories, which I
20 think is slide 5, that really emphasizes the multi-pronged
21 approach that's required in any community to repair the
22 damage and try to attain a higher quality of life, because
23 it's critically important that we understand how
24 complicated this is.

25 And I think that slide, as simple as it may seem,

1 really embodies that and it really points to why this
2 costs a lot of money, why it's complicated, and why it
3 requires a community-driven approach that's in concert
4 with not only the districts but the other local and
5 regional agencies that can make it happen. And I want to
6 come back to that, but that to me is one of the core
7 elements of the Program that we all need to remember. And
8 I'm most familiar with the San Diego Portside community
9 and that effort that's been going on for three years now,
10 four years now.

11 And I know that all of those categories are
12 included. It's become this really trusted space for
13 processing issues that are related to and sometimes beyond
14 the CERP that's been developed. There's involvement in
15 local, regional, and State rulemaking, including
16 rulemaking that CARB is doing. And folks might not have
17 been involved in that prior. So I'll say that I think
18 it's been really, really successful in that way. And it
19 goes way beyond what we may think a CSC does, and maybe
20 that kind of supports what Femi was saying as well. It's
21 complicated. It's not elegant. Sometimes it's messy and
22 contentious, but that's where our communities are.

23 So the second point is that in regards to these
24 new communities, there's no question that these two
25 communities are deserving. I mean Bayview Hunters Point,

1 I know though there's not unity necessarily related to all
2 of the issues there, but Bayview Hunters Point has been a
3 community that's been impacted from -- for decades, and
4 one that absolutely needs to be addressed. So I have no
5 question about their appropriateness for this Program.

6 The same for the North Imperial County
7 communities. They were reduced the last time because of a
8 lack of funding. I'm really grateful that there is this
9 extra funding that allows for them to come in and allows
10 for the border communities that were adopted last year to
11 have some resources so that they can actually do the work
12 that they need to do, but that's my third area.

13 These -- there's so many communities that are in
14 need of this intervention. And while this may be the way
15 some envisioned the AB 617 Program to go, I had the
16 privilege of chairing the first Environmental Justice
17 Advisory Committee for CalEPA nearly 20 years ago. And
18 these are the same communities that were in that process.
19 These are the same communities that were asking for relief
20 then. So for them, this is a long process. This isn't
21 five years. This is decades. So we really need to figure
22 out -- and I want to say, I feel like staff really
23 understand that and I'm really -- I'm so grateful to them
24 for the patience and the understanding that they give to
25 the communities, because I know it's got to be incredibly

1 hard to be on the ground and not being able to resolve
2 some of these -- many of these issues, so we have to
3 resolve the funding situation.

4 And so clearly we need more funding, as many
5 people have said. Again, gratitude for the one-time
6 funding, but that is only giving us a tiny breather. It
7 really doesn't solve the long-term sustainability. So
8 we -- you know, we need to band together to convince the
9 Legislature and the Governor that this -- these programs
10 work and that they need to be applied across the state. I
11 honestly don't think of this as a laboratory. These are
12 peoples' lives and we have the ability, because of some of
13 the successes to help solve those problems. So I think
14 it's on us to really look at that.

15 And the Blueprint I believe is a place that can
16 help to look at what we've learned and look at new ways of
17 resolve these issues, but I really want to make sure that
18 we're not saying, well, we need to figure out, you know,
19 ten more ways to spend the same amount of money. That's
20 not going to work. We actually need more money, but we
21 also need to be more equitable in how -- in the way in
22 which those dollars are allocated. The current funding
23 stream is -- allocation is not equitable. It's not fair
24 across the communities. And I think the Board needs to
25 take that back and begin looking at what that allocation

1 would be. And I really look forward to that opportunity
2 as part of the Blueprint.

3 So I'd love to hear more from staff and perhaps
4 from our Executive Officer about ways in which we can help
5 with the funding and ways in which we can help with
6 identifying the criteria for allocation in order to ensure
7 that it's equitable across the communities. And perhaps
8 we can do more with what we've got and I'm really excited
9 about the opportunity to do that.

10 And the last thing I want to say is I'm really
11 excited that tribal involvement is getting more serious
12 consideration and we're looking at ways to do that. I
13 think it's critically important for the tribes to be
14 involved and to -- to get this resource as well.

15 So thank you. And I look forward to hearing ways
16 that the Board can be more helpful on the funding stream.

17 CHAIR RANDOLPH: All right. Thank you.

18 Dr. Balmes.

19 BOARD MEMBER BALMES: Thank you, Chair Randolph,
20 and thank you to all the community members that testified
21 today. You know, as many of my Board member -- fellow
22 Board members have said, this is a difficult process.
23 Can't make everybody happy, but we are listening and
24 trying to make the Program better.

25 And to that end, I really also want to show my

1 appreciation for the OCAP staff. You know, I work fairly
2 closely with them on AB 617 implementation and Ms.
3 Takvorian said it well, the Program has evolved I think
4 very strongly and a lot of lessons have been learned. A
5 lot more will need to be done, but I look forward to
6 continuing to work with staff and with communities to make
7 this transformative program a success. As Mr. De La Torre
8 rightly said, this is -- you know, we're the only ones
9 doing this and so we have to do it well, and it's hard to
10 do.

11 I'm not going to repeat what my fellow Board
12 members have said at this point, because it's late. But I
13 do want to highlight my support for the Bayview Hunters
14 Point designation as an AB 617 community, because I
15 practice at San Francisco General Hospital, which is the
16 primary hospital that serves the Bayview Hunters Point
17 community for, you know 36, 7 years. And I've been
18 through multiple environmental problems -- trying to help
19 the community with multiple environmental problems. There
20 was a PG&E power plant that was dirty. There was asbestos
21 dust -- natural asbestos dust generated when the Naval
22 Shipyard was first being developed for housing. And then
23 most recently, the problems with radioactive -- radiation
24 contamination in the shipyard that was unfortunately
25 poorly handled by both the Navy and contractors, so that,

1 you know, there was actually fraud about the radiation
2 measurement.

3 So the community, to say that they were angry
4 about the years of exposure to multiple environmental
5 hazards, and the cumulative risk from that to their
6 health, and quality of life, and well-being, you know, I
7 appreciate that anger. And I think that the fact that the
8 community came together enough, even though as several
9 people have suggested, it's not a entirely unified
10 community about what's the best way to go forward to
11 rectify the problems I just mentioned. But I appreciate
12 the Bay Area Air Quality Management District working with
13 community groups to get this AB 617 designation to the
14 finish line.

15 And so I strongly support it. And if there are
16 no other Board members that want to make comments, I would
17 actually move to accept staff recommendation to approve
18 both the Imperial Valley -- north Imperial Valley Phase 1
19 designation and the Bayview Hunters Point Designation as
20 AB 617 communities.

21 CHAIR RANDOLPH: All right. Thank you. Do I
22 have a second?

23 BOARD MEMBER DE LA TORRE: Second.

24 BOARD MEMBER HURT: Second. Oh.

25 (Laughter).

1 BOARD MEMBER DE LA TORRE: Davina.

2 CHAIR RANDOLPH: All right. Board Member Hurt
3 seconded. And I just wanted to let the clerks know that
4 Supervisor Vargas is participating on Zoom, but she can't
5 speak, so I have her here on my phone. So when you call
6 her, I will put her up to the microphone so that she can
7 vote.

8 BOARD MEMBER DE LA TORRE: Is that acceptable?
9 (Laughter).

10 CHAIR RANDOLPH: Okay. All right. So we have a
11 motion and a second. Clerk, will you please call the
12 role.

13 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Yes.

14 Dr. Balmes?

15 BOARD MEMBER BALMES: Yes.

16 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Mr. De La torre?

17 BOARD MEMBER DE LA TORRE: Aye.

18 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Mr. Eisenhut?

19 BOARD MEMBER EISENHUT: Yes.

20 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Senator Florez?

21 BOARD MEMBER FLOREZ: Florez, aye.

22 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Mr. Guerra?

23 BOARD MEMBER GUERRA: Guerra, aye.

24 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Mr. Hurt?

25 BOARD MEMBER HURT: Aye.

1 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Mr. Kracov?

2 BOARD MEMBER KRACOV: Yes.

3 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Dr. Pacheco-Werner?

4 Dr. Pacheco-Werner?

5 BOARD MEMBER PACHECO-WERNER: Yes.

6 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Thank you.

7 Mr. Perez?

8 Dr. Quirk?

9 BOARD MEMBER QUIRK: Aye.

10 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Dr. Shaheen?

11 BOARD MEMBERS SHAHEEN: Aye.

12 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Ms. Takvorian?

13 BOARD MEMBER TAKVORIAN: Aye.

14 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Supervisor Vargas?

15 CHAIR RANDOLPH: Did you hear that?

16 BOARD MEMBER VARGAS: Oh. Vargas, yes.

17 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Got it.

18 CHAIR RANDOLPH: Thank you.

19 (Laughter).

20 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Chair Randolph?

21 CHAIR RANDOLPH: Yes.

22 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Madam Chair, the motion
23 passes.

24 CHAIR RANDOLPH: All right. Thank you very much

25 And I just want to echo the other Board members'

1 appreciation of staff for all the amazing work on this and
2 the continued engagement and I think all my Board members
3 had great things to say. So thank you again for your
4 work.

5 And we will now move on to open public comment.
6 Open public comment is for items regarding an area -- an
7 item of interest within the jurisdiction of the Board that
8 is not on today's agenda. The clerk will call those who
9 have submitted a request to speak card. And if you are
10 joining us remotely and wish to comment, please click the
11 raise hand button, or dial star nine now.

12 All right. Clerks, will you please call the
13 commenters.

14 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: First, we will hear from
15 Mark Williams.

16 MARK WILLIAMS: Good evening, Board. Thank you
17 to those who -- Board members who are returning and those
18 new Boards, especially, for Assemblymember Bill Quirk who
19 is my former Assembly Member. I actually used to serve on
20 the AC Transit Board of Directors, so I'm used to late
21 nights on board meetings. So I have empathy for everyone
22 sitting up there at the dais and all those staff members.

23 I wanted to make a public comment about the
24 advanced clean fuel rule. I have been -- I went -- I've
25 been to a past meeting where staff was having a technical

1 conversation. Also, there was a meeting where I had -- I
2 turned to people out to get public comment, but before
3 they could, public comment was shut down. And I know that
4 you've done a lot of outreach, heard a lot of comments
5 from staff from Board meetings about the importance of
6 equity, making sure we're getting to compute --
7 communities of color, especially Black communities.

8 I'm from Oakland. I drove all the way here today
9 just to make public comment. I have to go back home. So
10 anything we can do to make sure that these meetings are
11 more accessible. It's great to see that people are coming
12 in on Zoom. People are calling in. I saw people -- other
13 people here from the Bay, but it's really important that
14 we try to make the process as open as possible.

15 And the AB 617, I didn't even know anything about
16 that. I'm glad I was actually able to sit and hear about
17 all the different things you're doing in the communities.
18 And, you know, equity being more inclusive have helped --
19 kept coming up. And anything that the environmental
20 justice we can do - I have some other colleagues here - we
21 would love to be a part of that process.

22 As far as the Advanced Clean Rule, want to see
23 more emphasis on other alternatives just to electric. I
24 know how important that is. We're trying to meet
25 environmental standards. We're trying to get there as

1 soon as possible, but there's other opportune -- options,
2 like CNG or hydrogen fuel cell. When I was at AC Transit,
3 we were a big proponent and CARB was very supportive of
4 our hydrogen fuel cell project, which has been a great
5 alleviator of pollution along the corridors that we have
6 in the AC Transit service areas.

7 People mentioned about the asthma, the diabetes,
8 heart, all of the different health elements that people
9 face. My father, he grew up in West Oakland. His whole
10 family had asthma. So anything we can do to alleviate
11 that is a positive. And if that means we need to look at
12 other alternatives like CNG, like hydrogen, let's look at
13 that. I don't see that as being a problem in this
14 process. I just want to make sure that we're looking at
15 that.

16 And anything we can do to further do more
17 outreach, I'm really supportive of that. I live in
18 Oakland. I would love to see you guys come out in person.
19 I heard someone mention that they can't come out to San
20 Francisco. Please come out to Oakland. If you've been
21 there, thank you. I applaud you for doing that. If we
22 can have these meetings more in person there, I would
23 appreciate it. So thank you for your time and looking
24 forward to working with you guys in the future.

25 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Thank you.

1 Eric Payne.

2 ERIC PAYNE: Good evening. My name is Eric
3 Payne. I'm a resident of Fresno, California. By way of
4 background, I'm a resident committee members of the AB 617
5 San Joaquin Valley Air District steering committee. I'm a
6 federally trained microbiologist and non-profit
7 administrator.

8 I came here today to share a few concerns I and a
9 growing number of Black Californians have about CARB and
10 how it operates. We've developed a specific focus on the
11 Advanced Clean Fleets Rule's impact on our communities.
12 From a public health perspective, Black people are so ill
13 in these small corridors that CARB could justly justify
14 setting up a Black advisory panel on air pollution,
15 environmental justice, and climate resilience. It's that
16 bad.

17 Despite the preventable health disparities in
18 California's most Black areas by population density, CARB,
19 and more specifically its staff, appear to not be
20 interested in listening to our voices, which I find to be
21 deeply concerning. Let me be clear, we don't want to
22 suffer premature death, cancer, and cardiovascular disease
23 and we don't have another 25 years to wait for the
24 possibility of an all electric fleet. I strongly support
25 electrification. That's a noteworthy goal.

1 We need things that will reduce smog today.
2 Governor Newsom made a campaign promise to remove diesel
3 trucks from our roads by 2030 when he ran for Governor.
4 We've not forgotten this promise and we support and expect
5 him to fulfill it. Your staff's dismissive response to us
6 during last week's workshop are extremely troubling and
7 heartbreaking, because we've been misled and lied to on
8 the public record. I guess we should not be surprised
9 based on the history of this organization. And while the
10 assumption may be we will just sit down and accept it, we
11 are here to say we will not accept this no more.

12 We strongly encourage clean air and the urgency
13 is now, not later. Will you take our lungs into -- we
14 will take our lungs into our own hands and go to the
15 Legislature with the request to protect our lungs if your
16 agency is incapable of doing so. We need cleaner air for
17 our communities. We greatly appreciate CARB's call for a
18 zero-emission future throughout California and support it.

19 That said, what happens when these plants fall
20 short? CARB hands out exemptions allowing commercial
21 fleets to purchase internal combustion engines, because
22 zero-emission technology is not ready and the
23 infrastructure is not available. We need clean air
24 thousand. We can't wait longer to protect -- any longer
25 to protect our health.

1 My final comments. For more than three decades,
2 California has listed diesel exhaust as a toxic air
3 contaminant known to cause cancer and reproductive harm.
4 Public health organizations listed diesel to be extremely
5 harmful --

6 BOARD MEMBER GARCIA: Thank you. That concludes
7 your time.

8 ERIC PAYNE: -- for health -- for our health and
9 it is the largest and dominant --

10 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Thank you. That concludes
11 your time.

12 ERIC PAYNE: Okay. Thank you so much.

13 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Kimberly Tapscott-Munson.

14 And I also just wanted to note for those watching
15 on Zoom, our camera in the room is frozen right now and
16 we're working to fix that.

17 KIMBERLY TAPSCOTT-MUNSON: Good evening, CARB
18 Board. I am speaking on behalf of the Environmental
19 Justice League. I'm a resident of Fresno and previously
20 spoke to your staff about the West Fresno Black
21 communities' efforts to get your attention on the pressing
22 matters of air quality.

23 Before continuing this discussion, I must
24 highlight the inconvenience of this Board and its staff
25 with three dozen of my constituents and I came to the

1 workshop meeting Monday before last. We were told we
2 could not come into the building by your security and we
3 were sent away and we were redirected to a different
4 location. This is unacceptable and disrespectful.

5 We traveled from Oakland, Fresno, and Los
6 Angeles. We came together with a movement asking for you
7 to listen to our stories. I am an elected official at the
8 local level and understanding all of the rules and
9 restrictions by which public institutions must adhere. I
10 am also aware of the common courtesy extended to taxpayers
11 who attend public meetings.

12 This organization has failed the basic customer
13 service test for taking and treating Black people who are
14 fighting for our health and decency. I object to the
15 workshop meetings on the Advanced Clean Fleets group being
16 held during hours which the public finds inconvenient to
17 participate. I am very concerned that this Board has
18 ignored Black voices in much of its work and appears to
19 not value the communities most impacted by smog and in the
20 goods movement corridor.

21 Monday morning and Friday mornings all day long,
22 meetings held in Sacramento that arbitrarily cut off
23 public comment do not work. We've been here since this
24 morning, 10:30 a.m. waiting to speak to you. Virtual
25 public comments without guarantees of being heard don't

1 work for us. This Board and its staff seriously
2 misunderstands the purpose of public engagement and
3 inclusion.

4 I came here today as a representative of a
5 growing movement of Black people across the state who have
6 seen that CARB thinks it will accept dirty air just
7 because we live in lower income neighborhoods. The day of
8 you ignoring us are over and we want clean air now.
9 Number 25 year exception that will increase asthma and
10 lung disease. Clean air now.

11 I did have more to say, but my time is up. I
12 really did have more to say, but I will respect your time.
13 But I will say that I had asked the question --

14 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Thank you. That concludes
15 your time.

16 KIMBERLY TAPSCOTT-MUNSON: Okay. I will save
17 that, but we want you to hear our voices. And if you
18 would like to collaborate with us, we will be willing to
19 help you with that. And thank you for your time and your
20 service.

21 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Thank you.

22 Kieshaun White.

23 KIESHAUN WHITE: Good evening, CARB Board -- or
24 CARB Board. My name is Kieshaun White. I am an
25 environmental justice advocate from Fresno, California. I

1 have spent more than six years studying air quality in the
2 most polluted zip code in California. I flew my drones to
3 monitor TVOC, CO2, and other PMs and cancer causing
4 pollutants.

5 When I was in high school, I followed the Obama
6 administration to push a better -- for better air and
7 water, and wanted to make my contribution to make -- to
8 pretty much make everything better. I don't like that my
9 relatives, and neighbors, and schoolmates don't know that
10 they're suffering from poor air quality that leads to
11 early death and poor health. I have tried on my own with
12 resources of friends and family to monitor and build
13 contemporary tools to improve air quality. The best thing
14 to do, in my opinion, is to improve the engines that are
15 in these trucks that move across the valley in the state.

16 It was nice to see several electric fleets being
17 marketed recently. The cost however is around \$500,000
18 for the most publicly popular company that sells electric
19 trucks. There are a few other fleets that are mark --
20 making news. But the reality is that the local electrical
21 grid cannot handle the increased need for fleet size
22 electrical capacity. Even during periods of prolonged
23 sunshine, the grid is not -- is not built to the capacity
24 needs for an electrical fleet.

25 So as an environmental justice advocate, as

1 someone who is trying to make in my own way without the
2 benefit of any funding, CARB allocates to big businesses.
3 And I ask that you consider the Environmental Justice
4 League's position to make the air clean now. We can
5 reduce pollutants known to the State to cause cancer and
6 early death by changing the engines that fuel truck fleets
7 today in working towards electrification of all fleets. I
8 am willing to monitor the before and after air quality,
9 once you have made that decision. We could make a huge
10 difference.

11 I wish I had known about CARB when I started my
12 business. Maybe I would be further along. This Board
13 should know there are a lot of young people who are
14 willing to -- and able to make a difference within their
15 communities. For those of us who are Black and you need
16 to speak to us in our community with trusted voices.
17 Often, it's only me and a few civil rights leaders who pay
18 attention to these things. I like leading on air quality,
19 but I wish I had more help.

20 If you make the decision to help Fresno, I'll
21 work with you on reaching the goals for a better air
22 education, neighborhoods, and for building California
23 businesses. Thank you for listening to me. Thank you for
24 your work and your time.

25 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Thank you.

1 Tim Cromartie.

2 TIM CROMARTIE: Good evening, Madam Chair,
3 members of the Board. Señor Guerra, pleasure to see you.
4 I like to see a former colleague on the -- on the dais. I
5 am Tim Cromartie, Policy Director for the Environmental
6 Justice League.

7 For several weeks now, we have urged via a series
8 of letters and statements at public meetings that they
9 need vehicles purchased under the Advanced Clean Fleets
10 Rule represent the cleanest commercially available engine
11 technology, if sufficient electric vehicles are not ready
12 when needed. CARB staff maintain that this concern is
13 addressed by the requirement that newly purchased vehicles
14 beginning in 2024 meet a California certified standard
15 establishing maximum allowable nitrous oxide emissions out
16 of the Omnibus Rule, but the details of this standard tell
17 a different story. The

18 The California certified standard allows a
19 variety of different engines and emission levels, which
20 are valid for a single operator so long as that operator's
21 newly purchased vehicles collectively meet a particular
22 average emissions level. It follows that some of these
23 vehicles can fall below that standard if the operator
24 would still be in technical compliance with State
25 emissions requirements. Vehicles purchased under this

1 standard won't necessarily represent the best commercially
2 available engine technology in terms of short-terms
3 emissions reductions.

4 Truck fleet operators who get exemptions could
5 purchase and operate diesel trucks if unable to buy
6 electric trucks. It's a cheaper option for them, even if
7 cleaner internal combustion engines opt -- engine options
8 are available. So the incentive to continue to buy diesel
9 as long as they can legally do so is going to be very
10 strong.

11 This means that communities living next to ports,
12 major highways, refineries, and other transportation
13 corridors who are disproportionately people of color will
14 continue to breathe diesel fumes, which are among those
15 harmful emissions and have been linked to high rates of
16 asthma and cancer in the affected communities.

17 For these reasons, we respectfully request that
18 the Board revisit and scrutinize this issue pertaining to
19 the California certified standard and whether it I does,
20 in fact, represent the cleanest available engine
21 technology, which we do not believe that it does, with a
22 view to ensuring the adoption of a true cleanest
23 commercially available engine technology standard, the
24 respiratory health of the communities on the front lines
25 who often have no voice and who live in the worst air

1 quality areas depends upon it. We need clean emissions
2 now.

3 Thank you.

4 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Thank you.

5 Wesley Campbell.

6 WESLEY CAMPBELL: Good evening, Board. My name
7 is Wesley Campbell and I'm here from Los Angeles. I came
8 to support the sentiments of the Environmental Justice
9 League. And I've long been committed to environmental
10 justice and the impact of the decisions that it's had on
11 various people.

12 CARB is following a well-worn path of
13 disadvantaging the most vulnerable residents of this state
14 for the sake of expediency. I've been to several of these
15 workshop meetings and -- as an observer, and I began
16 making public comment. Maybe you all should have come to
17 their meetings of the full Board because your staff does
18 not listen. Consistently, the Environmental Justice
19 League has been the exclusive voice on Black engagement on
20 this issue. Yet, staff have only said that they've
21 already done everything that we've asked.

22 What's the rush? Why don't staff listen to
23 people who are using practical judgment and science to
24 improve their health concerns. What about Black
25 Californians saying we need better standards eludes the

1 staff of this body?

2 Board members, your staff project an indifference
3 that can only -- that I can only hope is not reflective
4 upon you. Unless you direct clearly that there should be
5 a solution to the grievances raised by the Environmental
6 Justice League, you risk sanctioning decisions that amount
7 to targeting a community.

8 I doubt you have been fully aware your staff's
9 disrespect of the Black community. Use this moment as a
10 challenge to a better -- to better -- use this moment as a
11 challenge of better way -- to better your way of doing
12 business, CARB.

13 The port complex in Los Angeles faces so many
14 difficulties. Black trucking firms are just trying to get
15 their footing. CARB regulations ignore them as well. We
16 can help small businesses, the chief engine to building
17 well and improve air quality. You have the awesome powers
18 in your hands. You can save the lungs of the next genius
19 who will develop the technology to efficiently reach
20 electrified fleets and a well managed grid.

21 It's not hard to do what we ask. I hope you
22 appreciate that if more people come here, they would. My
23 opinion is widely held by people who live in the smoggiest
24 region of this country.

25 Thank you for your consideration.

1 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Thank you.

2 Evan Edgar.

3 EVAN EDGAR: Board member, my name is Evan Edgar,
4 Edgar Associates, representing the California Compost
5 Coalition and independent organic waste haulers. I've
6 been in front of this Board for 20 years and we're going
7 to miss Sperling and Berg, because they were for RNG
8 forever.

9 We do lot as organic waste haulers with the
10 circular economy with carbon negative fuel now that's near
11 zero NOx trucks now. And we have net zero greenhouse gas
12 facilities now certified by the Climate Registry with zero
13 waste making organic compost. We don't use pesticides.
14 We are the zero heroes, but that's not good enough for
15 CARB, because they want disrupt their circular economy
16 now. We're doing this now in order to get us off -- get
17 us off RNG to go towards ZEVs. The industry I represent,
18 the independent haulers, are forced to stay on diesel for
19 the next 13 to 18 years.

20 Everything you hear from my Fresno friends here
21 is true, because the fact you're forcing us into ZEVs
22 sooner that later. It's not ready. We are forced into
23 diesel. Half our industry is off RNG -- off diesel now.
24 We're getting of landfills. And it's important we get
25 near zero NOx now with the Cummins Westport engine.

1 And the Scoping Opening plan and the ACF, you
2 know, with a \$9 billion ZEV investment by the Governor had
3 no conditions. No conditions. And I've been testified in
4 front of EJAC and the Scoping Plan for over a year on
5 this. One of the conditions we agreed upon that we need
6 to have end-of-life recycling for these ZEV batteries.
7 EJAC endorsed that and so do I. We also urged EJAC to
8 support the lifecycle assessment for ZEV batteries. Now,
9 I did the math on it. My engineering firm, if you look at
10 the lifecycle assessment of ZEV batteries, it's 62 to 90
11 on the carbon scale, grams per CO2 megajoule. This is
12 base upon European studies. So EJAC wanted it. I believe
13 that California is leaking our greenhouse gas out of the
14 country by having manufacturing in China and mining in
15 Africa. And that's not right.

16 So I'll be at EJAC on Monday. Only one person
17 has listened to me about the last issue about sourcing it.
18 The kids in the Congo. You know, we can't mine our way
19 out of climate change by digging up cobalt. The first
20 nations of Canada and nickel, and the lithium in South
21 America. But the Hoopa Nation, Jill Sherman-Warne, the
22 only tribal person listening to this.

23 So I've been for a year now giving testimony at
24 CARB, EJAC. No response on the carbon life-cycle analysis
25 of ZEVs. They are not zero emissions. It's a big lie and

1 the public is being lied to. You have the tailpipe
2 mentality, but the life cycle is 62 to 90. So I en --
3 I've been urging EJAC to support the European Battery
4 Directive. They -- all they issues, they adopted in March
5 of 2022. So we need to do that. And CARB and EJAC needs
6 to support environmental justice for all, not just in
7 California, but Africa, Canada. What is the life cycle of
8 a kid in the Congo at slave labor at two bucks an hour --
9 I mean, two bucks a day.

10 We cannot mine our way out of climate change.

11 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Thank you.

12 That concludes the in-person commenters. I will
13 hand it over to Krista for the Zoom commenters.

14 BOARD CLERK HARRINGTON: Thank you. We currently
15 have five commenters. The first one will be LaDonna
16 Williams, followed by Barry F. Boyd, then Suzanne Hume,
17 John Bottorff, and Lonnie Mason.

18 LaDonna, I have activated your microphone.
19 Please unmute yourself and you can begin.

20 LaDONNA WILLIAMS: Yes. Good evening again.
21 LaDonnaa Williams with All Positives Possible.

22 I wanted to speak directly to Femi, who I really
23 respect and appreciate his work and responsiveness to
24 community issues. We've worked with Femi and will to do
25 that.

1 But I want to send a strong message to you, Femi,
2 and to CARB. You all will not put Black faces in front of
3 us and continue to give excuses and justify what happened
4 tonight, because tonight not only did I experience this
5 injustice, you know, in the name of folks who have special
6 needs. We all do, but we all must also respect an order
7 of fairness. And continually, this anti-Blackness that
8 puts Black folks at the bottom of the barrel or in the
9 back of the line is not going to be tolerated. And they
10 are not going to use any Black face -- and unfortunately
11 for you, Femi, you're the collateral damage tonight
12 because you stepped in them shoes or in that pile and
13 decided to justify what occurred tonight.

14 We're always -- when I say we, I'm talking about
15 American Blacks in this process, is always getting the
16 shortest hand of the stick or the shortest end of whatever
17 it is when it comes to CARB, whether it's your employees
18 on the inside, Black communities on the outside
19 Advocating, Black truckers. There was a period of time in
20 what 2012, 2013 when we came to advocate for Black
21 truckers to get their fairness, we were treated like a
22 lynch mob by many of those folks that you continually give
23 funding to that didn't want Black voices to be heard.

24 We're not going to do that any more. You are
25 going to respect us. You are going to include us. And

1 when we address these difficult, as you guys keep saying,
2 issues that we bring up about anti-Blackness, if you blow
3 us off, you're going to feel the wrath. It's not about
4 Black anger. This is justifiable justice that has eluded
5 us.

6 I was on the Committee back in 2003, as one of
7 your Board Members, Diane Takvorian, spoke of. She was on
8 that board so was I. And we are talking about the same
9 communities. And even then, the Latino communities, or
10 Southern Cal, got priority over many of our Black
11 communities, either up here or even in Fresno areas. It's
12 always the same. Black folks are expected to sit back and
13 accept this disrespect in the name of agency processes.
14 Well, you all better come and reimagine and start this
15 process over and start prioritizing Black folks. And I'm
16 talking about our historically Black communities that are
17 continually coming before you to beg for fairness,
18 inclusion, and justice. More than on paper, we need it to
19 be an actuality. So I want to last say Chanell, thank you
20 for responding promptly and I will follow up with you, but
21 I do appreciate the prompt response tonight.

22 Thank you.

23 BOARD CLERK HARRINGTON: Thank you. Next is
24 Barry Boyd. I have activated your microphone. You can
25 unmute and begin.

1 BARRY BOYD: Thank you and good afternoon to all.
2 I do appreciate this opportunity. I have -- I had to step
3 away from the meeting earlier in regards to -- excuse me,
4 just a little scrambled here.

5 I had stepped away from this meeting earlier to
6 attend another meeting, my City of Sacramento Planning and
7 Design Commission meeting, to which I am one of the City
8 Planning Commissioners. And to that point, the engagement
9 that has been spoken about from a few of the previous
10 public commenters has been to, what I would say -- I don't
11 want to say shoddy, but not as robust as it could.

12 I am well engaged. I am, as -- just -- as I just
13 state a City Commissioner. I also sit on a board for the
14 City of Sacramento's Housing Code Advisory and Appeals
15 Board. I am a community leader. I am a partner with the
16 Sacramento Environmental Justice Coalition. I do pay
17 attention on what's going on and I was befuddled to find
18 out that there were four -- three or four previous
19 meetings leading up to this one over the last few months.

20 The engagement process that CARB is doing I would
21 say expand that, so when there's -- don't rely on website.
22 It has to be put in folks hands, especially the folks who
23 aren't so adept with the social media aspect and/or
24 electronic devices. But my point being the Community of
25 Meadowview, which was brought up earlier, as one of the

1 neighborhoods sought as the addition, I would have
2 supported that motion, because of the high lead content
3 that blows around our neighborhood from the Sacramento
4 Executive Airport, which is just a mile down the street,
5 and also the surrounding neighborhoods of Woodbine and
6 Golf Course Terrace.

7 To that, I would appreciate further engagement,
8 so that the citizens here in Sacramento would come out,
9 apply, and so we could establish the steering -- steering
10 committee, but the ambassador committee here in Sacramento
11 in two designated areas. Right now, I am the applicant
12 for Sacramento Environmental Justice Coalition, as a --
13 from the CBO. But as we have been told, community members
14 just haven't signed up, which part of the AB 617 is half
15 of the committee needs to be residents.

16 So please continue to expand your engagement so
17 folks will know what is going on and how to be a part of
18 it. Thank you.

19 BOARD CLERK HARRINGTON: Thank you.

20 Next, we have Suzanne Hume. I have activated
21 your microphone. You can unmute and begin.

22 SUZANNE HUME: Good evening, Chair Randolph, CARB
23 Board, and to all working for clean air, public health,
24 education, environmental protection, regulations, and
25 justice. My name is Suzanne Hume. I am the Educational

1 Director and Founder of CleanEarth4Kids.org to save the
2 lives of children and families in California,
3 CleanEarth4Kids.org asks CARB to work to stop pesticides
4 and pesticide drift and reduce all sources of air
5 pollution, including stopping the sale, use, and storage
6 of leaded aviation fuel at all airports in California and
7 stop the burning of fossil fuels, the burning of wood and
8 biomass, and to not invest in false solutions like direct
9 air capture, which creates more air pollution And
10 emissions than it takes in.

11 Clean air saves lives. Air pollution harms
12 nearly ever cell in the body and organ in the body.
13 California must lead and set the example.

14 CleanEarth4Kids.org asks CARB to adopt and set for
15 California a PM2.5 standard of 5 or less annually and a
16 24-hour standard and asks CARB to petition EPA now during
17 the open comment period to set a PM2.5 standard of five or
18 less micrograms per cubic meter of air annually and the
19 24-hour standard.

20 PM2.5 tiny bits of air pollution breathed in and
21 it's so small it passes through the blood-brain barrier,
22 inflames and harms the brain, increases rates of dementia,
23 Alzheimer's, and other brain, heart, and lung conditions
24 and cancers. It harms the body and immune system and
25 significantly increases the rate of stillbirth pre-birth,

1 and low birth weight babies. Please see the research
2 slides and videos by Dr. Paul Fowler of the University of
3 Aberdeen, and Bruce Bekkar's article in JAMA, other
4 doctors and scientists and experts, and videos by youth,
5 like Judith on CleanEarth4Kids Team 3 Clean Air Saves
6 Lives and No Wood Smoke page.

7 Wood smoke is a major contributor to PM2.5 and
8 PM10 air pollution. Wood smoke fills California
9 neighborhoods and is a major, major problem. CARB --
10 CleanEarth4Kids asks CARB to tell cities that the public
11 has a right to clean air and access to public lands, and
12 to stop allowing wood fires on beaches and public lands,
13 and to stop the installation of wood burning fires and
14 wood burning -- and wood burners like the City of London
15 is doing to reduce air pollution. Fires are not cozy.
16 Fires aggravate our lungs, cause increased bronchitis and
17 asthma, increase hospital admissions, and respiratory
18 problems. Asthma is the third leading reasons why
19 children under 15 are hospitalized and the number one
20 reason why children miss school.

21 Please protect our lungs and our lives. Stop
22 wood smoke, pesticide drift. Stop the use, sale, and
23 storage of leaded aviation fuel, and adopt a PM2.5
24 standard of 5 or less. Thank you from
25 CleanEarth4Kids.org.

1 BOARD CLERK HARRINGTON: Thank you. Next is John
2 Bottorff. I have activated your microphone. You can
3 unmute yourself and begin.

4 JOHN BOTTORFF: Thank you so much. Good evening.
5 My name is John Bottorff with CleanEarth4Kids.org.

6 It is critical we reduce our particulate matter
7 levels. We ask CARB to adopt the world health
8 organization recommended standard of 5 micrograms per
9 cubic meter or less annual average. Particulate matter is
10 incredibly small particles in our air. PM2.5 is 2.5
11 microns or smaller. By comparison, the average human hair
12 is 50 microns wide. PM2.5 gets into the lungs and blood
13 stream and can cross the blood-brain barrier.

14 Particulate matter not only irritates the lungs,
15 but research clearly shows it increases the risk of
16 serious health outcomes. And because it cross the
17 blood-brain barrier, it can cause brain conditions like
18 Alzheimer's, Parkinson's, and dementia. Particulate
19 matter from things like wood smoke hurts both our indoor
20 and outdoor air quality.

21 A study by Dr. Fowler from the University of
22 Aberdeen showed particulate matter can get into the brain,
23 lungs, and liver of our unborn babies. Exposure to air
24 pollution during pregnancy increases rates of stillbirth,
25 preterm birth, low weight babies, and brain development

1 problems. Residential wood burning is a major source of
2 particulate pollution in California. Here in San Diego
3 County, it is tied with construction as the main source of
4 PM2.5. Wood burning dumps almost three and a half tons of
5 particulate matter into San Diego County air every day.
6 Other counties in California have much higher levels of
7 residential denial wood burning.

8 Along with particulates wood smoke also contains
9 nitrogen oxides, carbon monoxide, methane, carbon dioxide,
10 and many cancer-causing pollutants. Residential wood
11 burning has to stop. CARB needs to have programs and
12 incentives to remove existing wood burning fireplaces and
13 stoves, and to work with cities, counties, and other
14 agencies to stop wood fireplaces and stoves in new
15 construction.

16 We also ask you to educate the public that wood
17 smoke is a health hazard and to work on stopping
18 recreational wood fires on all public lands, like beaches
19 and parks, to protect clean air and our health. People
20 with lung problems need to be able to go -- safely go to
21 beaches parks and even just to go outside. It is not fair
22 that any child must risk an asthma attack just to go
23 outside. We need to greatly reduce particulate matter
24 levels in our state and stopping wood burning is a great
25 way to do that.

1 Thank you from CleanEarth4Kids.org.

2 BOARD CLERK HARRINGTON: Thank you.

3 And our final commenter is Lonnie Mason.

4 Lonnie, I have activated your microphone. You
5 can unmute and begin.

6 LONNIE MASON: Good afternoon. My name is Lonnie
7 Mason. And I am the executive Director of First
8 Generation, an environmental health and economic
9 development based in the Bayview Hunters Point community.

10 I don't want to be redundant. I heard what Ms.
11 Williams said. And this is egregious how this has -- you
12 know, the process has been going on. CARB should
13 understand. You know, there's been so many things said,
14 you know, about their production, especially when it comes
15 to the Black community. It seems like we're the lowest on
16 the totem pole when it comes to anything. You know, look
17 at the number of people who spoke today about the issues
18 at hand.

19 I'm sure, you know, after being audited and
20 hearing that term "poverty pimps", that, you know, CARB
21 would like to do something about that and make things
22 right when it comes to the Black community. We're not
23 dissing the other communities and their issue, but it's
24 just that we as African Americans small grassroot
25 organizations are put on the lowest totem pole.

1 We just held a tour, but it took over two years
2 to get this tour. Every other community from Southern
3 California all the way up here to Northern California was
4 put ahead of First Generation, when we asked for this tour
5 a long time ago. That doesn't make any sense and it's
6 been going on for years, and years, and years. And this
7 is why the audit took place and this is why they were
8 called poverty pimps.

9 We've got to do something about that. I know you
10 guys want to remove that name from above your head, but we
11 did our best to try to get people to come out to see our
12 community to see what's going on to see what's happening.
13 And it's sad that it takes so long for you to come and see
14 what the problem is in our community, you know, like the
15 homeless shelter. How is it that we have -- we was able
16 to invite DTSC, the water company, CARB and BAAQMD, all of
17 these individuals on this tour and they still don't see
18 that there's a problem in the Bayview Hunters Point
19 community. I don't get it.

20 But I do like to say thank you and I appreciate
21 Trish Johnson. She really helped First Generation assist
22 us in getting this process taken care of, when it should
23 have been taken care of a long time ago. She stepped in
24 and she did what was necessary. But we have to do
25 something about this. We had too many Black organizations

1 come and speak today. That tells you there is a problem
2 in the Black community. We're not getting the support
3 that we need to be able to do the work in our communities.

4 Thank you.

5 CHAIR RANDOLPH: Thank you.

6 BOARD CLERK HARRINGTON: Thank you. That
7 concludes the commenters.

8 CHAIR RANDOLPH: Thank you so much.

9 Dr. Pacheco-Werner wanted to say a few words.

10 BOARD MEMBER PACHECO-WERNER: Yeah. Thank you
11 and thank you for the public comment. You know, I just
12 wanted to reach out to Kieshaun. Thank you for speaking.
13 And I know that we've worked on housing stuffy together
14 last year. So please reach out and I'm happy to talk
15 more. Thank you.

16 CHAIR RANDOLPH: All right. Thank you.

17 The February 23rd CARB Board meeting is now
18 adjourned. Good evening.

19 (Thereupon the Air Resources Board meeting
20 adjourned at 8:22 p.m.)

21

22

23

24

25

