

1 partners work together to ensure technology neutrality is
2 allowed within this policy and the subsequent regulations?
3 How will California build the infrastructure necessary at
4 scale to achieve these goals? How will California
5 overcome the regulatory and permitting barriers to achieve
6 this goal in a timely fashion?

7 As a society, we must carefully allocate our
8 resources to provide essential services to the public.
9 This includes achieving this goal and we need to balance
10 the goal with those costs.

11 Furthermore, it doesn't matter how ambitious the
12 scenario is if we cannot achieve the buildout.

13 Thank you and we look forward to following up
14 with comments.

15 BOARD CLERK ESTABROOK: Thank you.

16 Are you Enrique?

17 ENRIQUE VELEZ: Yes, ma'am.

18 BOARD CLERK ESTABROOK: Okay. Go ahead.

19 ENRIQUE VELEZ: Thank you. Good afternoon. I'm
20 Enrique Velez. And on behalf of the Latino -- Latin
21 Business Association, I'd like to convey our opposition to
22 the Scoping Plan, as it will hurt small businesses,
23 especially Latino-owned ones that are still recovering
24 from the COVID disruption. We're still living through
25 this pandemic and the economic downturn -- downturn as is

1 all too real for the companies' employees that we
2 represent.

3 Latino businesses were disproportionately
4 affected by the pandemic and were less likely to qualify
5 for government loans. Adding the Scoping Plan costs on
6 top of a likely recession is just going to force more
7 minority-owned businesses to shut their doors and lay off
8 employees.

9 The Latin Business Association is ready to work
10 with CARB to balance the needs of the community and
11 greening our future. It's disappointing that there was no
12 outreach to ethnic chambers from the CARB staff to discuss
13 how the Scoping Plan will affect communities of color.
14 Only speaking to certain groups does not give a true
15 representation of the ramifications of this Scoping Plan,
16 but rather a whitewashing of its findings. I thank you
17 for the time and may God bless you. Thank you.

18 BOARD CLERK ESTABROOK: Thank you. Teresa.

19 TERESA COOKE: Thank you. Good afternoon.
20 Teresa Cooke. Pleased to be here on behalf of the
21 California Hydrogen Coalition.

22 We want to commend the Air Resources Board on a
23 bold plan that includes hydrogen throughout industrial,
24 energy, and transportation sectors. I do, however,
25 caution you about the disconnection that exists between

1 the transportation demands of the proposals and the build
2 out of zero-emission vehicle infrastructure. The
3 availability of hydrogen fueling infrastructure must
4 proceed vehicle deployment. So let's finish the
5 development of the light- and medium-duty fueling network,
6 so automakers can div -- or deploy fuel cell vehicles with
7 confidence.

8 Weeks ago General Motors shared that they pulled
9 back the commercialization -- the commercial release of
10 their passenger fuel cell vehicle because of the lack of
11 hydrogen fueling infrastructure in California. Let's not
12 let that happen again.

13 As it relates to heavy-duty, we want to thank you
14 for and give our support to the proposed expansion of the
15 hydrogen refueling infrastructure credit to heavy-duty
16 fueling under the LCFS. The hydrogen community is ready
17 to fight alongside our frontline communities against GHG
18 and toxic air emissions. And to that end, we look forward
19 to continuing our work.

20 Thank you.

21 BOARD CLERK ESTABROOK: Thank you.

22 Jin Sung.

23 JIN SUNG: Thank you. Good afternoon, President
24 Randolph and CARB -- CARB members. My name is Jin Sung.
25 I'm the National Diversity Coalition's Board Chair. And

1 our mission really has a lot to do with bringing corporate
2 social responsibility as a top priority to all
3 corporations in the nation, and -- in terms of how we have
4 been engaging ourselves, our three million constituents
5 across the nation. We are headquartered here in
6 California and our heart and our insight to bringing some
7 of the concerns over this proposition is real.

8 We represent the low-to-moderate income
9 communities. And how we have been active is in the
10 California Public Utilities Commission, we are a formal
11 intervenor representing the low-to-moderate income
12 communities. This proposal brings a lot of concerns as a
13 coalition for it does not reflect the voices of those
14 people who are not able to make it here in Sacramento.
15 I'm formally requesting the Board to not only reconsider
16 amendment to the added strategy that's much needed to
17 address some of the concerns for the low-to-moderate
18 income communities, but with the onset of the pandemic, we
19 know what has happened. Perhaps what we need to really be
20 attuned to is the impact of electrification, positive and
21 negative, to our low income communities.

22 Corporations currently are focusing on corp --
23 social responsibility, but ESG when they're focusing on
24 environmental only, the social and governance element
25 unbalanced. We would love to see a balanced approached

1 to --

2 BOARD CLERK ESTABROOK: That concludes your time.

3 JIN SUNG: Thank you.

4 BOARD CLERK ESTABROOK: Thank you.

5 Kathy.

6 FAITH BAUTISTA: Good afternoon, Chairwoman.

7 Thank you so much for having us here.

8 I'm Faith Bautista with National Diversity
9 Coalition, a national Asian American coalition. I'm going
10 to continue what Jin Sung is saying. There are so many
11 people that would be affected with this policy. And I'm
12 really encouraging the Board. I know you all care about
13 low-moderate income. You care about poor and very poor.
14 You care about everybody that matters. So I'm really
15 encouraging that every -- all of us should have this
16 outreach in every city that need it the most. Coming
17 here, it takes us the whole day. It's very expensive to
18 come to Sacramento. And there's so many people that will
19 be affected on this policy.

20 So the scoping of work has to include the people
21 that it will affect the most. So I'm really encouraging
22 that you do an outreach, you go to the churches, you go to
23 the ethnic chambers of commerce, you go to the ethnic
24 supermarkets where this matters the most.

25 And I also would like to recommend have a survey.

1 You know, what does this really mean to them, how much
2 will this cost them, and do they even know CARB? Most
3 likely, they don't know what even CARB means and your
4 organ -- this agency. So there's a lot of education.
5 Though there's 40 million population here in California, I
6 would say, you know, the highest of the people only know
7 about what the scope of work would be. So I'm
8 couraging -- encouraging all of you that before you do any
9 work get the people involved. Thank you.

10 BOARD CLERK ESTABROOK: Thank you.

11 And the next four speakers will be speaking on
12 behalf of a group, so we can change the timer to three
13 minutes. And so first will be Irma.

14 IRMA LOPEZ LIZARRAGA (through interpreter):

15 Hello. My name is Irma Lopez. And I am a member
16 of Communities for a Better Environment. I live in the
17 City of Cudahy in Southeast LA. My community has been
18 fighting over the last 20 years, so that the 710 Highway,
19 which is considered a death zone for diesel, is not built
20 out. CARB should include objectives that are stronger to
21 demand that hundred percent of sales of medium- and
22 heavy-duty trucks be zero emissions by the year 2035. In
23 line with their strategy for the mobile sources, the
24 objective for that year is very weak for 2040. So this
25 puts at risk communities that live close to the highways

1 and port operations as well as warehouses.

2 The members and the organizations for a better
3 environment have been involved in this fight against
4 this -- the catastrophic events of these operations at the
5 ports and at the warehouses, and the expansions of
6 highway. CARB has not protected the environmental justice
7 communities, including the ones that live next to port
8 operations and the channels of merchandise like the ones
9 that are next to the 710 highway.

10 In conclusion, I urge CARB to prioritize the
11 health and safety of communities through more aggressive
12 means in order to safeguard current generations and our
13 future generations that live in the Southeast LA area and
14 in all of California. Thank you.

15 So I am a witness -- a reliable witness of the
16 pollution and everything that's happening in the area. I
17 have lesions on my skin from the particles -- the
18 pollution that's in the air from where I live. And this
19 is why I'm here. I am raising my voice and I'm fighting
20 for all of those communities that cannot be here in order
21 to safeguard the health of all families in California.

22 Thank you.

23 (Applause.)

24 BOARD CLERK ESTABROOK: Ashley.

25 Ashley.

1 ASHLEY PHUTHAMA: Hello. My name is Ashley. I'm
2 a youth intern from Asian Pacific Environmental Network.
3 I have been waiting here all day to speak. I'm the second
4 community speaker after 16 straight industry speakers.
5 Communities should be treated just as well and as heard
6 just as much as industries.

7 I live in West Contra Costa County my whole life.
8 My parents are refugees from Laos. They moved here to
9 give me and my family a safer life, but it was not as safe
10 as we thought.

11 Living near the five Bay Area refineries, I've
12 experienced refinery incidents my whole life. A couple
13 years ago in my Freshman year of high school, as I was
14 leaving school, my school would not let us out of the
15 building, and they did not tell us why. After five
16 minutes of staying there, when we got out, we saw smoke
17 everywhere. Everyone was covering their mouth and
18 couldn't breathe. The sky was really foggy. We were
19 stuck in traffic and could not see the road. I thought
20 the air quality was going to get better when I went home,
21 but the smoke got even worse because I was closer to the
22 Phillips 66 Refinery that exploded.

23 I closed all the doors and windows. I was
24 confused on what happened, but everyone helped my
25 understand it. It was the refinery's fault. I couldn't

1 imagine how people who were unaware or unable to get
2 access of information felt. I was angry and sad and too
3 afraid to breathe, because every time I would, I would
4 feel nauseous and tired.

5 Lucky for me, I am young and have a strong Immune
6 system and lungs, but older people with medical conditions
7 and -- do not have these benefits, making it even harder
8 for them to breathe. I don't ever want to feel this way
9 again, but especially I don't want anyone else around me
10 to ever have this experience. I'm here today to call on
11 you to protect our future and make a plan for a full
12 phaseout of fossil fuels by 2045. I've lived in the Bay
13 Area my whole life. It's my home, my community, my
14 family. It should be my safe space. I want to stop
15 Chevron, Phillips 66, and other polluting corporations
16 from polluting my safe place.

17 (Applause.)

18 CHAIR RANDOLPH: So could we use the ASL for sign
19 for applause, so that people can continue moving for and
20 begin speaking.

21 BOARD CLERK ESTABROOK: Is this next speaker,
22 Debbie?

23 THE INTERPRETER: So our member will speak in
24 Cantonese. After she finish, I will do an English
25 interpretation for her.

1 DONG HUA CHEN(DEBBIE): Okay. Hello. My name is
2 Debbie. So I'm the resident of Oakland. I'm here to
3 provide my comments about the CARB plan.

4 So I have been living in Oakland for nine years,
5 but because of the air pollution in recent years my -- I
6 lost high immunity. I got allergy. And then some of my
7 friends getting worse on asthma. So why not the climate
8 change bring a lot of damage and risk to either healthy
9 people or not healthy people. So me and APEN here
10 represent the voice of hundreds of Asian working class and
11 refugee family. And we really care about pollution in our
12 life. And then we hope that CARB can really make a real
13 plan to reduce emission. And then we wanted to stop oil
14 extraction in 2035 and then shutting down the refinery on
15 2045, so that we have the opportunity to own a clean
16 future.

17 Please treat the healthiness of the -- of our
18 community as your first priority, so that -- just once
19 again, we wanted to stop have the fossil fuel extraction
20 on 2035. And then 2045, we're closing the refinery. And
21 then we wanted to have clean and more public transit in
22 our community.

23 Thank you.

24 (Applause.)

25 BOARD CLERK ESTABROOK: Thank you.

1 And the last speaker with the -- for a group that
2 will be three minutes also is going to be Christopher
3 Soriano.

4 VICE CHAIR BERG: So, ma'am, there is a button on
5 that -- on that table. You could lower, if that makes it
6 more comfortable for them.

7 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Hi. My name is
8 (inaudible). I'm 13 years old and I'm a resident of
9 Oakland, California. I'm speaking on the CARB Scoping
10 Plan for people living with asthma. I'm here today
11 because I want those kids who live out there to have a
12 better future. The reason why I care so much about this
13 issue is because the lives of people are in danger. My
14 life is in danger. Your lives are in danger. You guys
15 don't realize how important a life can be. You guys
16 can't -- are showing us that you don't care about your
17 community. You can't buy a life, but what you can do is
18 save a life. We won't give up on this issue, not right
19 now. If only you had been in our position, if only you
20 would be here with us helping one another to have a better
21 tomorrow.

22 You should know how dangerous this is. Let me
23 ask you something, do you only care about your profit and
24 the lives of the seven generations? You don't care about
25 those? Because you're basically showing us the exact same

1 thing you don't, you know that, right?

2 Treat the world like how you want to be treated.

3 And I'm going to ask you something. Why should I have
4 this? (Holding up inhaler) Why? Am I supposed to be
5 having this for the rest of my life? Am I supposed to?
6 Why do I have this?

7 I see kids here. Who knows what health problems
8 they have. Are they going to keep having that? Tell me,
9 yes, no? You should put yourself in our position. If
10 only you guys would have this. And if you have it, then
11 you should know how it feels. People shouldn't be having
12 this and living their whole lives with this.

13 Thank you.

14 (Applause.)

15 CHRISTOPHER SORIANO: Hey, everybody. My name is
16 Christopher. And I'm just here to tell all of you guys on
17 that stage that we -- you guys are in a power of -- in a
18 position of power where you guys have to listen to us and
19 opinions, my opinion, my fellow youth over here opinions,
20 everyone here in the room opinions, and everyone outside
21 of the building's opinions. You are here to represent us
22 and our future. And it feels like you aren't even
23 respecting and listening to our voice, because we are here
24 today to tell you that our lives matter and that our lives
25 are important.

1 I am tired and I am mad that I have to spend my
2 time, that my life is important -- that my life is -- my
3 life is important.

4 (Applause.)

5 CHRISTOPHER SORIANO: I'm here to tell you that
6 you should listen to our voices, each of the society.

7 Thank you.

8 (Applause.)

9 BOARD CLERK ESTABROOK: Next will Ariel.

10 ARIEL McCARTY: Hello. My name is Ariel Bautista
11 McCarty. I'm here to represent the Asian-American Pacific
12 Islander community and on behalf of the National Diversity
13 Coalition.

14 As a small business owner myself, businesses need
15 certainty to grow and invest in jobs. Yet, every scenario
16 in the Scoping Plan will have us facing an unpredictable
17 and unreliable electric grid. It seems this Board feels
18 free to make it worse by driving up energy and
19 transportation costs even higher, which is especially hard
20 for small businesses like myself to shoulder as we face
21 high inflation and energy costs. Please go back to the
22 drawing board. Thank you.

23 BOARD CLERK ESTABROOK: Thank you.

24 Bob.

25 BOB ROSE: Hello. I'm Bob Rose, also here on

1 behalf of National Diversity Coalition.

2 We are very concerned about the impact of bad
3 policy and its effect on small businesses, its
4 discriminatory approach. We think it will deepen
5 inequality. Farmers will suffer. The advantaged will
6 suffer. Basically, it's environmental discrimination.
7 Small businesses will get hurt by this.

8 So what I'm asking, because we all care about the
9 climate, is to make sure that you are looking at this
10 properly from a global perspective with the very best
11 answers and solutions that we can muster as a society.

12 There are many environmentalists around the world
13 that are far more advanced in addressing issues of global
14 warming than we are. And taking a shot like this is
15 narrow, meaning electric -- forcing electric on everybody.
16 The problem is that you're actually going to be increasing
17 the problem rather than decreasing the problem.

18 All electric does not dissolve -- does not solve
19 the problem that's in front of us.

20 Thank you.

21 BOARD CLERK ESTABROOK: Jinky Dolar.

22 JINKY DOLAR: Good afternoon. My name is Jinky
23 Dolar. I'm here to represent the Asian Pacific American
24 Advocates and also the community.

25 I urge this Board not to make the California

1 leader in climate change policy that hurts the low income
2 community the most. Thank you for your time.

3 BOARD CLERK ESTABROOK: Thank you.

4 Jack Miranda.

5 JACK MIRANDA: Good afternoon, Board. Pastor
6 Jack Miranda representing the faith community. God Bless
7 you. It's daunting -- a daunting task. You hear the zeal
8 of young people and you hear the impact of business what
9 it would have on business. And so there's a lot to
10 consider. And I'm hearing a phrase, go back to the
11 drawing board. So easy for us to say.

12 But please consider what you're hearing, all
13 these distinct voices, these distinct groups, and please
14 consider the impact it will have on the low-moderate
15 income community in our -- just the time frame. We're
16 concerned -- I also volunteer the network of churches and
17 faith communities that can be your information
18 distributors. And we would welcome that, that a
19 knowledgeable constituency is the best one.

20 And so God bless you. We welcome you. Remember,
21 the Good Books says zeal without knowledge is not good.
22 And so I'm hearing a lot of zeal and I hope you can help
23 us with that knowledge.

24 God bless.

25 RICHARD PALAY: Good afternoon, ladies and

1 gentlemen of CARB. That says Richard Griffen. It
2 actually should be Richard Palay with the National
3 Diversity Council. And I'm here speaking on behalf of the
4 EV program that's going to be imposed on the L, and
5 particularly of LMI, L being low-income community members.
6 I'm speaking on their behalf. I'm the voice of one crying
7 out on behalf of the voice of the many whose voices will
8 not be heard unless someone in an organization like ours
9 comes to speak on their behalf to you.

10 I want to remind you of the consideration that is
11 needed for those that are in the low and low-income
12 communities. These community members of color will be
13 negatively impacted by the imposition of electronic
14 vehicles. Who's going to pay for those community members
15 to be able to purchase those vehicles. If they can't
16 purchase those vehicles, who's going to pay for them to
17 have to change their lives by buying a bicycle. Who's
18 going to help these community members understand how will
19 I navigate my children to school, myself to the
20 shopping -- to the grocery store, myself to community
21 events, myself to church on Sunday? Who's going to help
22 them navigate that challenge?

23 So we'd like you to just take the time to
24 reconsider this what you're speaking about and come and
25 hear the voices of the community members. Let's just not

1 push this forward. I'm here to simply say slow down and
2 let's talk.

3 Thank you.

4 ANDRE CHAPPLE: To the Committee and Chair Lady,
5 Pastor Andre Chapple from the Faith Church, Los Angeles
6 and part of the National Diversity Coalition.

7 Great to be a part of something like this. I
8 know you guys have daunting task ahead of you. And it was
9 also great to see so many people represented. But the
10 disappointment that I have is that I can't bring my 100
11 people all the way up here to Sacramento to share on the
12 agenda that we think works best for us.

13 I, too, serve the low, low-income communities,
14 the hard to reach -- the hard to reach communities that
15 literally nobody knows anything that we're talking about
16 today. We need some more transparency is my hope, that
17 maybe we can partner with some of you all, get you all to
18 come down to our communities and explain to them, you
19 know, things like when brought to the Governor how is this
20 going to affect the poor people, and the quote that I saw
21 was that they can use the new bike lanes or the new bus
22 routes. That's sad. That's unfortunate.

23 We would like to see this -- every -- if anybody
24 lives in California does not want clean air, they need to
25 go see a medical professional or something. We all want

1 that. But there has to be a way that we do it that makes
2 sense, that's considerate of the time that it's going to
3 take, that will be effective, because we don't want to be
4 embarrassed in front of the rest of America. Thank you
5 for your time.

6 BOARD CLERK ESTABROOK: Thank you.

7 Alex Anderson.

8 All right. Then we can go ahead to Magali
9 Torres.

10 MAGALI TORRES: Good afternoon, everyone. My
11 name is Magali Torres and I'm speaking as a resident of
12 Merced County and as a representative of the Merced County
13 Hispanic Chambers of Commerce.

14 As a recent graduate and as a minority, I want to
15 urge the Board to reconsider how inequitable the Scoping
16 Plan is for rural communities and the underserved
17 communities. People that live in Merced and Tracy are
18 commuting hours to the Bay Area for their work. And if
19 any of these scenarios are chosen, they will not afford to
20 do so, whether they need to plug in or use gas for their
21 fuel.

22 They do so because they cannot afford to live
23 near where they work. And that will not change given the
24 State of California's current housing market. There are
25 destructive economic consequences of acting fast to be

1 first. Consumers and industries are being left behind,
2 which slows down the goal of a healthier future. These
3 demands and mandates hold no accountability. There needs
4 to be a diversified plan that doesn't force high cost
5 supplies. The plan is narrowly focused on one technology
6 rather than allowing for the flexibility of other
7 available lower cost carbon options.

8 These regulations are a big step backwards for
9 the working families and small businesses on behalf of the
10 Merced County Hispanic Chamber of Commerce. Policies like
11 this will push people further away from ever being able to
12 afford not to commute hours to work or school. Reaching
13 our climate goals is not a one-way path.

14 Thank you.

15 BOARD CLERK ESTABROOK: Thank you.

16 Andre Thompson.

17 ANDRE THOMPSON: Good afternoon. My name is
18 Andre Thompson. I'm out of Los Angeles, California. And
19 my charter bus company is National Charter, Inc. And I'm
20 also with the Hispanic Chamber of Commerce.

21 I'm here today because your regulations and your
22 mandates, as far as charter buses, have -- the finish line
23 has kept moving. First, you ask us to put filters on
24 buses. Then after filters, you ask us to go to the DPF
25 program. And from going to the DPF program, I can attest

1 that 25 companies in the Los Angeles area alone that had
2 either a combination 66 buses that they had to either sit
3 down or -- and can't sell because of your regulations.
4 You can't sell them in California, so they're worth
5 nothing because of the mandates that you guys have set
6 forth. And then also it goes to now you want us to build
7 a DPF and then from DPF eventually electric.

8 Buses as it's set now, 500,000. So what do you
9 think an all-electric bus is going to go, a million?
10 People would rather buy homes than put in -- you know, a
11 million dollars into a vehicle. I'm self-employed. I've
12 been fortunate to be able to take over a company from my
13 dad. I've seen it grow and seen it sustained. But you
14 guys are hurting all the minority companies that are here
15 representing that can't or the ones -- the mom and pop
16 with the one bus that couldn't afford the 16 to 18
17 thousand dollars to put a filter on. Then when they did
18 get the money to put a filter on, you moved the finish
19 line again and now they're out of business.

20 So I hope you guys do something at least take
21 into consideration what the industry means to all of you.

22 BOARD CLERK ESTABROOK: Thank you.

23 Next is Elaine Borgon, and then the next three
24 that we'll -- we'll call on those then we will go to Zoom
25 for a few.

1 ELAINE BORGON CONWAY: My name is Elaine Borgon
2 Conway. I'm from Dinuba, California, Central California.

3 I'm here to invite all of you and the Governor to
4 come to Dinuba, bring your bicycles. Let's go from field,
5 to field, to field starting at 4 o'clock in the morning
6 and see how easy it's going to be or to bring a ladder
7 with your bicycles to climb the trees. You're not going
8 to do any work, but you're just going to go from field, to
9 field, to field.

10 We feed the country and we want to have a green
11 world. I'm bad asthmatic. I have to have oxygen. I -- I
12 want this for my kids. I want to get a new car, but I
13 couldn't afford it. I can't walk to the store. What is
14 good is that we want the best for our coming children and
15 grandchildren. But we can't do this, because this is too
16 much of a hurry. You have to take more time. It's good
17 in a puzzle. It looks good, but separate it, it doesn't
18 make sense, you know.

19 But if you could come to our town and see that we
20 don't have transportation, we don't have buses to take us
21 anywhere, and we're just out in nowhere. But we are the
22 working back of the United States and other countries with
23 our fruit and vegetables that we give out. So this is not
24 practical for us at all nor can we afford it. If they
25 could afford it, they could live in their car, because

1 they can't afford anything else.

2 BOARD CLERK ESTABROOK: Thank you.

3 Sherry.

4 SHERRY CHAVIRRA: Hello. I'm Sherry Chavirra.
5 I'm Chair for the Dinuba Democratic Club and part of Si Se
6 Puede.

7 The most current State statistics indicate over
8 39 million people live in California. Our State has 13.1
9 million households and over 14.2 million registered
10 vehicles. There are also many -- also millions of other
11 gas powered machines that are used daily throughout the
12 state. Those staggering numbers are the reason
13 Californians experience rolling blackouts every year in
14 the heat of the summer.

15 We live in Tulare County. I -- with Elaine that
16 just spoke, and there's many people who have swamp coolers
17 still and coolers. And we've already had two blackouts,
18 okay -- or brownouts and blackouts. So what's going to
19 happen when we have all these electric-powered cars.
20 Okay. Simply put, the State electric grid cannot generate
21 enough electric power to sustain our enormous demand
22 currently in these summers and we aren't even to July yet.

23 So the question is, if the grid does not provide
24 enough electrical power now, what will happen when
25 California switches to electric-powered vehicles and other

1 electric-driven equipment that will constantly need
2 charging? That is why more time is needed to transform to
3 the grid, perhaps 10 to 15 to 20 years. Till then, no
4 sense is -- in talking about Scoping Plan and driving
5 around electric cars and riding bicycles to work in 108
6 degrees. Thank you for your time.

7 Thank you. And I believe Kristen is not here, so
8 Estella.

9 ESTELLA KESSLER: Good afternoon, Board. My name
10 is Estella Kessler. I'm from Selma, California,
11 representing Si Se Puede. Selma is in the heart of the
12 Central Valley.

13 A popular piece of advice states that you don't
14 cutoff your nose to get rid of a pimple on your nose.
15 That means do not overreact when pressing problems can be
16 solved in a sensible manner. That applies to the Scoping
17 Plan. We want clean air, not policies that will eliminate
18 over 85,000 jobs in our state. We need clean air, not
19 loss of over \$22 billion to the state's economy.

20 The goal is clean air, but we still need to fix
21 bad roads and old infrastructure that will not be fixed,
22 if billions of dollars are wasted on thoughtless policies.
23 CARB's highly paid staff should be capable of finding
24 sensible ways to give us clean air and not hurt
25 California's economy in doing it.

1 And my question to you, why aren't these hearings
2 being held throughout the State? Because when I speak to
3 people in my area, they have not heard of this. They
4 have -- they don't have a clue what your recommendation
5 is. Not until it comes to them in front of them, that's
6 when they'll realize, hey, how come we didn't know about
7 this. So my recommendation is you take the advice of
8 Elaine and go down to the Central Valley and ride a bike.

9 Thank you.

10 (Applause.)

11 BOARD CLERK ESTABROOK: All right. And now we
12 will transition to some commenters from Zoom.

13 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Thank you.

14 And the first five speakers that I will be
15 calling on in Zoom are Alex Kizer, Nora Brown, Theo Pahos,
16 Will Barrett, and Stuart Walderman[SIC]. And I apologize
17 in advance if I mispronounce your name.

18 So Alex, I have activated your microphone.
19 Please unmute and you can begin.

20 ALEX KIZER: Thank you. My name is Alex Kizer.
21 I'm the Senior Vice President for Research at the Energy
22 Futures Initiative, a clean energy think tank founded by
23 Ernest Moniz former U.S. Secretary of Energy.

24 California is a global leader in clean energy and
25 what happens there matters for the rest of the country and

1 the world. In 2019, we published a report that identified
2 33 technologies needed to meet California's near-term
3 climate goals, led by energy efficiency, fuel switching,
4 and carbon capture and sequestration. California will
5 need additional solutions such as carbon dioxide removal,
6 lithium recycling, and clean hydrogen to reach net zero.
7 Deep decarbonization depends on a lot of options.

8 In 2020, we coauthored a report with Stanford
9 University on the policy needs for CCS, as we see CCS as
10 one of the most valuable decarbonization solutions for the
11 country and especially for the state. CCS addresses
12 difficult to abate emissions in multiple sectors in
13 California. And using a CCS hub model minimizes its
14 geographic footprint, supports local air quality concerns,
15 and regional economic benefits. Our study found that CCS
16 can rapidly and cost effectively help California remove up
17 to 15 percent of its emissions in the near term.

18 To make this happen, California needs to make
19 long-term commitments to CCS removing barriers to
20 investability. State permitting could be improved to
21 include clearer timelines and appointing a lead agency.
22 It's really important that some of these early projects be
23 supported, so they can show how CCS projects should be
24 designed, built, and paid for.

25 Thank you so much for your time, and your work,

1 and we hope to see California's leadership continue to
2 grow.

3 Thanks.

4 BOARD CLERK GARCIA: Thank you.

5 CHAIR RANDOLPH: Can we -- I'm going to interrupt
6 the cadence of speakers for a moment, because Senator
7 Leyva needs to leave and wanted to say a few words before
8 she has to get back to her duties.

9 SENATOR LEYVA: Thank you very much Madam Chair
10 and Board members for accommodating my little bit of a
11 crazy schedule. First, I just want to say thank you to
12 everyone. I want to say thank you to CARB staff. I know
13 how hard you've worked on this. I know you've had many
14 conversations with myself and our colleagues. I want to
15 say thank you to the EJAC folks because they have -- we've
16 had many meetings with myself and my staff. But I mostly
17 want to say thank you to everyone who traveled up here,
18 especially I see people from CCAEJ, which is in my
19 district, and also from the Inland Empire. I know it's
20 six and a half hour drive or an hour and 10 minute flight.
21 So thank you for being able to be here today.

22 When I was elected in 2014, the very first thing
23 I did in January of 2015 was go on something called the
24 toxic tour put on by CCAEJ. And that helped me develop my
25 love for the environment. We started in Pomona, went out

1 to San Bernardino, and we went through every community in
2 my district that was being disadvantaged because of
3 pollution. I think that was transformative for me and has
4 certainly helped me define the work that I've done in the
5 eight years in the Senate.

6 The Scoping Plan, I know we have a little time
7 and I think there -- there's more that we can do. I would
8 really like to see us review, and I've shared this with
9 the staff already, carbon capture storage. I'm really
10 worried that that's something that's untested. It's going
11 to take a very long time to get it up and running, and I'm
12 not sure it's going to get us what when we need.

13 And gas fire plants, I'm very worried that we are
14 asking to build 10 more gigawatts of new natural gas
15 generating capacity. I just -- I know we have to make
16 sure the grid is reliable. We've heard a lot of people
17 talk about that, but I really worry that we are just
18 postponing a bigger problem, so I'd like us to take a look
19 at that.

20 I'd also like us to take a look at a more robust
21 transportation sector and those targets. We know that the
22 transportation sector, big rigs, remains the largest
23 source of greenhouse gas emissions in California. We did,
24 on this Board just last year, authorize SB 210, a bill I
25 did to make sure that our big trucks have to have a smog

1 renewable electricity, and the only outputs are fuel and
2 oxygen. More information about our company is available
3 at PrometheusFuels.com.

4 Regarding direct air capture technology, the
5 Scoping Plan focuses mostly on carbon removal and
6 sequestration. The Scoping Plan can do more to highlight
7 the benefits of carbon utilization. Burying CO2
8 underground has no economic value and cannot lead to a
9 broader consumption -- broader consumer adoption of
10 renewable fuel over fossil fuel. Rather, the Prometheus
11 model of utilizing the captured CO2 to create a cost
12 competitive alternative to fossil fuel can lead to a
13 broader consumer adoption of a fossil alternative.

14 For example, a 2021 techno-economic analysis --
15 techno-economic analysis and life-cycle assessment of the
16 Prometheus process done by Ramboll shows that our energy
17 efficiency is high with a carbon intensity score close to
18 zero and conservatively estimates that our cost to capture
19 carbon is \$36 per ton. The Ramboll report also confirmed
20 the maturity of Prometheus's technology and it's ability to
21 deliver carbon neutral fuel at a price that competes with
22 legacy fossil fuels.

23 Beyond that, Prometheus manufacturing would help
24 California reach the greenhouse gas reductions it is
25 looking to achieve. Prometheus reiterates its support for

