

1 communities need your help and we cannot wait. Your
2 actions save lives and billions in health care and related
3 costs. Air pollution harms nearly every cell in the body.

4 We support zero emissions as soon as possible, no
5 later than 2035, and that is 14 years from now.

6 Zero-emission credits will help expedite the process. We
7 must have yearly technology reviews. Clean air is
8 essential. The technology exists for zero-emission boats
9 and ships. We have the zero-emission ferry in San
10 Francisco Bay and San Diego's all-electric tug but in
11 2026.

12 Ships emit massive amounts of toxic air
13 pollution, black soot. But we can save lives with
14 stronger commercial aircraft[SIC] rule and stricter
15 emission standards. Please add all, all and shorter
16 idling times for in ports. Fifteen minutes is too long.
17 Every minute of idling in port endangers public health.
18 No for-profit industry should be able to harm our air,
19 water, kids, families, or seniors.

20 BOARD CLERK ESTABROOK: Thank you.

21 SUZANNE HUME: Thank you.

22 BOARD CLERK ESTABROOK: Jim Bottorff. You may
23 unmute and begin.

24 JOHN BOTTORFF: Hi. Thank you. My name is John
25 Bottorff with CleanEarth4kids.org. Please require zero

1 special needs kids fishing and raise and release juvenile
2 white seabass every year. We are over a 30-year
3 conservation fishing club.

4 Everyone wants clean air. And it is a worthy
5 goal. However, regulations that crush an entire industry
6 that provides access to fishing, whale watching, marine
7 research, and kids fishing programs must be balanced
8 against lesser restrictive regulations. The impact on an
9 entire California fishing fleet and businesses that
10 support and benefit from ecotourism, whale watching,
11 fishing is not being fairly balanced and considered
12 against the agreed need to clean air. No one has denied
13 that, every single person I've listened, and I've been on
14 this call for a long time.

15 BOARD CLERK ESTABROOK: Thank you.

16 J. JEFFERY MORRIS: The Coast Guard -- I'm done?

17 BOARD CLERK ESTABROOK: That concludes the time.

18 Our next speaker will be Sebastian Lanswik.
19 Sebastian, I have activated your microphone. You may
20 unmute and begin.

21 SEBASTIAN LANSWIK: Hello. My name is Sebastian
22 Lanswik. I'd like to address many of the arguments for
23 pro-regulation -- pro-CARB regulation. By CARB's own
24 admission, passenger boats would need to be replaced and
25 this would be 80 percent up to almost all of these boats.

1 And this would see an increase in carbon emissions via
2 steel refineries. This uses coal, which emits a lot more
3 than many of these individual boats.

4 On top of this, with the destruction of an
5 industry, which is indisputable at this point, this will
6 see a decrease in revenue from fishing licenses, which is
7 used for marine research, as well as protection. And I'd
8 like to remind everybody that along with -- along with the
9 destruction of an industry, many of these irresponsible
10 fiscal policies that go for environmental protections can
11 potentially destroy the economy as a whole, as seen by the
12 damaging effects in the California economy.

13 I'd like to remind that many low-income countries
14 are not necessarily at the forefront combating global
15 climate change. We don't want to go backwards. We want
16 to go forwards in combating climate change, but we can't
17 do that with a crippled economy. This is just an example
18 of how this could cripple our economy and affect our
19 battle against climate change. No one here is against
20 battling climate change, especially our fishermen.

21 Thank you.

22 BOARD CLERK ESTABROOK: Thank you.

23 The next speakers are Greg Hurner, And then Duane
24 Winter.

25 Greg, I've activated your microphone. You may

1 unmute and begin.

2 GREG HURNER: Thank you Chair Randolph and
3 members of the board on behalf of the sportfishing and
4 whale watching communities. First, I want to emphasize
5 that we are available to any Board member if you want a
6 tour of a vessel to learn more or would like to attend a
7 fishing and ocean science trip through one of our social
8 justice programs we support. The Clerk of the Board has
9 my cell number.

10 Let's clarify something, staff were very specific
11 in crafting the commercial fishing rule to only require
12 Tier 2, not because staff support Tier 2 as they clearly
13 don't. And it is not possible to purchase a new Tier 2
14 engine. What it does is preserves commercial fishing's
15 access to the Carl Moyer Program. We want the same
16 access. If engine and DPF salespeople get an approved
17 solution that can be retrofitted and is safe, it would
18 become the best available technology under Carl Moyer.

19 Many sportfishing vessels have used Carl Moyer to
20 upgrade twice and they don't plan to stop, because they
21 are committed to clean air as well. What's sportfishing
22 vessel owners have offered is using the best available
23 technology to retrofit existing boats and working with our
24 elected State and federal champions to help transition to
25 reach our 2045 goals.

1 This is a fair balance between the contributions
2 from our fleet with the State's goals for social justice
3 by providing equitable access to our natural resources.
4 We stand ready to work collaboratively with the Board and
5 the Legislature.

6 Thank you for your time this evening.

7 BOARD CLERK ESTABROOK: Thank you.

8 Our next speaker will be Duane Winter. Duane,
9 you can unmute yourself and begin.

10 DUANE WINTER: Hello. Can you hear me?

11 BOARD CLERK ESTABROOK: Yes, we can.

12 DUANE WINTER: Hi. This is Captain Duane Winter.
13 I operate a boat called Mooch out of Half Moon Bay,
14 California.

15 The first thing I want to say is you're saying
16 that one charter boat emits as much pollutants as 162
17 school buses. That's preposterous. I mean, first of all,
18 you're saying that an 800 horsepower motor running a
19 hundred percent against school buses. I have 400
20 horsepower power and I run at less than 50 percent. And I
21 run most of my time outside of State waters, and most of
22 that time is either drifting or idling.

23 So all of your stuff that you're proposing how
24 many people are dying and all of this is preposterous.
25 It's just not accurate. There are no Tier 4 motors that

1 will work in my boat or many of the boats in our fleet.
2 There's not a single boat in Half Moon Bay that can put
3 after Tier 4 motor in their boat and operate. It doesn't
4 exist. I've talked to all the manufacturers.

5 To go to a Tier 3 motor in my boat, I've got
6 quotes at \$196,000. This is money I cannot recoup in the
7 rest of my lifetime, let alone a Tier 4 motor that doesn't
8 even exist.

9 All I'm asking -- you know everybody wants clean
10 air. The people that are for this proposal want clean
11 air, so do we. Just make it possible so that we can
12 achieve this. Put us back in with the commercial boats,
13 give us the time. Let technology catch up to us. We'd be
14 happy to comply. Don't make it impossible.

15 BOARD CLERK ESTABROOK: Thank you.

16 I will try Greg Kelly again. We weren't able to
17 hear from you earlier. Greg, I have activated your
18 microphone. You can unmute and begin.

19 Okay. Our next comments will be Denise De Cock,
20 Kenny Allen, Kimberly Bennink.

21 Denis, I have activated your microphone. You may
22 unmute and begin.

23 Denise, are you there?

24 Okay. We will go to Kenny Allen. Kenny, you can
25 unmute and begin.

1 KENNY ALLEN: Hello. My name is Kenny Allen. I
2 am a resident of Long Beach. I live about a mile from the
3 port. I'm calling tonight to ask CARB to support a
4 stronger Commercial Harbor Craft Rule and vote for
5 stricter emissions standard for tugboats, ferries, barges,
6 and dredges.

7 Emissions from harbor crafts are not only an
8 environmental and climate issue. It is an ongoing public
9 health crisis that needs to be addressed now. If ARB is
10 not going to add more zero-emission vessels target in this
11 rule, I join other community members in asking that the
12 Board direct staff to explore using contingency measures
13 to achieve more zero emissions in harbor craft.

14 I also join other community members in asking
15 that staff be required to conduct a technology review
16 every year, not every three years, with the mandate to
17 further strengthen the rule based on findings of each
18 year's technology review.

19 The technology exists for zero-emissions boats
20 and ships. Just like cars and trucks, boats and ships
21 must transition off of fossil fuel propulsion. The time
22 is now to electrify everything. No industry should get a
23 free pass at the price of our frontline communities and
24 the environment.

25 Thank you for your support.

1 BOARD CLERK ESTABROOK: Thank you.

2 Our next speaker will be Jonathon Smith. After
3 Jonathon we will have Kimberly Bennink and then Jamie
4 Diamond.

5 Jonathon, you can unmute yourself and begin.

6 JONATHON SMITH: Yeah. Hi. My name is Jonathon.
7 I run the -- I run the charter boat Happy Hooker in
8 Berkeley. I've been on this call for a long time now.
9 And, you know, I agree with people saying that, you
10 know -- we want to help out emissions too, but it's got to
11 be at a better pace. This is impossible for us to do,
12 especially in, you know, the eight to 13 period you
13 guys -- year period you guys are talking about.

14 Nobody can afford -- nobody that's a small
15 business owner like me will be able to afford any kind of
16 new boats like that. And the technology just does not
17 exist to put in these vessel. It's crazy to think as a
18 business owner that, you know, I might be even faced with
19 this decision sometime in my life of having to give up or
20 sell out of state for pennies on the dollar, you know, but
21 if you guys could just come up with something that would
22 help us out down the road where it was possible once the
23 technology catches up.

24 The proposed regulations are just crazy,
25 especially with the -- with the very little data on CPFVs

1 that you guys have provided. Our boat, we've got a Tier 2
2 and we have Tier 3 scheduled for install for year 2023 and
3 2022.

4 BOARD CLERK ESTABROOK: Thank you.

5 Thank you. That concludes your time.

6 Or next speaker is Kimberly Bennink. Kimberly,
7 you may unmute yourself and begin.

8 Kimberly, are you there?

9 Okay. We will go to Jamie Diamond.

10 JAMIE DIAMOND: Good evening, Chair Randolph and
11 everybody else here. It's been a long day. I've been on
12 the -- on this Zoom since 9 a.m. waiting for this moment.
13 I just would like to say I own CPFVs, charter passenger
14 fishing vessels. I operate out of Santa Barbara. And we
15 are not against getting better cleaner engines. We are
16 asking for a path forward that allows us to do it. Help
17 us help you. Help us help California. Help us help our
18 communities. Put us back in with commercial fishing
19 vessels, so that we can get to compliance with the
20 technology as it becomes available that we don't have to
21 rebuild entire new boats out of steel. It just doesn't
22 make sense.

23 I use my vessels for more than just fishing. We
24 are a research platform for University California Santa
25 Barbara students to conduct marine fisheries research. We

1 take kids from Title 1 schools on floating marine labs.
2 We are their first ocean interaction, and for some of
3 them, their only, till adulthood. These are kids that
4 live within miles of the ocean, but yet don't have the
5 means to get there, if it wasn't for our programs.

6 We put food on the table for families and we
7 offer a recreation -- a safe recreation activity in a time
8 of COVID. We were one of the first allowed recreational
9 activities during COVID, because we could safely do so.
10 We're outside in clean air. Clean air. We provide this
11 amazing opportunity for so many people to explore the
12 biggest wilderness, which is the ocean. Please let us
13 continue to do so with a path that allows us to achieve
14 compliance

15 BOARD CLERK ESTABROOK: Thank you.

16 JAMIE DIAMOND: We're not fighting the goal.
17 Thank you.

18 BOARD CLERK ESTABROOK: Thank you. That
19 concludes your time.

20 Our next speaker is Leon Benham. Leon, you can
21 unmute yourself and begin.

22 Okay. Kimberly, let's try you one more time.
23 Are you able to unmute?

24 LEON BENHAM: Yeah, this is Leon Benham.

25 KIMBERLY BENNINK: Can you hear me?

