

VIDEOCONFERENCE MEETING  
STATE OF CALIFORNIA  
AIR RESOURCES BOARD

ZOOM PLATFORM

THURSDAY, OCTOBER 14, 2021  
4:01 P.M.

JAMES F. PETERS, CSR  
CERTIFIED SHORTHAND REPORTER  
LICENSE NUMBER 10063

APPEARANCES

BOARD MEMBERS:

Liane Randolph, Chair

Sandra Berg, Vice Chair

John Balmes, MD

Hector De La Torre

John Eisenhut

Supervisor Nathan Fletcher

Senator Dean Florez

Davina Hurt

Gideon Kracov

Senator Connie Leyva

Tania Pacheco-Werner, PhD

Barbara Riordan

Supervisor Phil Serna

Diane Takvorian

STAFF:

Richard Corey, Executive Officer

Edie Chang, Deputy Executive Officer, Planning, Freight,  
and Toxics

Chanell Fletcher, Deputy Executive Officer, Environmental  
Justice

Annette Hebert, Deputy Executive Officer, Southern  
California Headquarters and Mobile Source Compliance

APPEARANCES CONTINUED

STAFF:

Edna Murphy, Deputy Executive Officer, Internal Operations

Rajinder Sahota, Deputy Executive Officer, Climate Change and Research

Craig Segall, Deputy Executive Officer, Mobile Sources and Incentives

Ellen Peter, Chief Counsel

Ryan Atencio, Staff Air Pollution Specialist, Environmental Justice Section, Office of Environmental Justice

Karen Buckley-Huber, Branch Chief, Community Planning Branch, Office of Community Air Protection(OCAP)

Vernon Hughes, Branch Chief, Community Assessment Branch, OCAP

GuoQuan Lim, Air Resources Engineer, Community Assessment Section OCAP

Abigail May, Attorney, Legal Office

Chandan Misra, Manager, Community Assessment Section, OCAP

Liliana Nuñez, Air Pollution Specialist, State Strategies Section, OCAP

Deldi Reyes, Division Chief, OCAP

Erika Trinidad, Air Pollution Specialist, Community Assessment Section OCAP

ALSO PRESENT:

Angela Fisch, San Diego Air Pollution Control District

David Flores, San Diego County Supervisor Nora Vargas

Brian Gordon, Navy Region Southwest

APPEARANCES CONTINUED

ALSO PRESENT:

Monserrat Hernandez, Environmental Health Coalition

Hasan Ikhata, San Diego Association of Governments

William Jacques, San Diego Air Pollution Control District

Kathleen Keehan, San Diego Air Pollution Control District

Mahiany Luther, San Diego Air Pollution Control District

Jack Monger, The Industrial Environmental Association

Mohsen Nazemi, San Diego Air Pollution Control District

Alicia Sanchez, Environmental Health Coalition

David Sodeman, San Diego Air Pollution Control District

Ashley Valentin Gonzalez, Mundo Gardens

Domingo Vigil, San Diego Air Pollution Control District

Joy Williams, Environmental Health Coalition

David Yow, Port of San Diego

| <u>INDEX</u>             | <u>PAGE</u> |
|--------------------------|-------------|
| Call to Order            | 1           |
| Roll Call                | 1           |
| Opening Remarks          | 2           |
| Item 21-10-1             |             |
| Chair Randolph           | 6           |
| Ashley Valentin Gonzalez | 8           |
| Monserrat Hernandez      | 11          |
| Domingo Vigil            | 12          |
| Staff Presentation       | 18          |
| Joy Williams             | 27          |
| Jack Monger              | 30          |
| Hasan Ikhata             | 32          |
| Brian Gordon             | 33          |
| David Flores             | 35          |
| Alicia Sanchez           | 37          |
| David Yow                | 38          |
| Board Discussion and Q&A | 40          |
| Motion                   | 49          |
| Board Discussion and Q&A | 49          |
| Vote                     | 51          |
| Public Comment           | 52          |
| Adjournment              | 53          |
| Reporter's Certificate   | 54          |

PROCEEDINGS

CHAIR RANDOLPH: All right. Good afternoon. The October 14th, 2021 public meeting of the California Air Resources Board will come to order.

Board Clerk, could you please call the roll.

BOARD CLERK ESTABROOK: Dr. Balmes?

BOARD MEMBER BALMES: Here.

BOARD CLERK ESTABROOK: Mr. De La Torre?

Mr. Eisenhut?

BOARD MEMBER EISENHUT: Here.

BOARD CLERK ESTABROOK: Supervisor Fletcher?

BOARD MEMBER FLETCHER: Fletcher here

BOARD CLERK ESTABROOK: Senator Florez?

BOARD MEMBER FLOREZ: Florez here.

BOARD CLERK ESTABROOK: Assemblymember Garcia?

Ms. Hurt?

BOARD MEMBER HURT: Present.

BOARD CLERK ESTABROOK: Mr. Kracov?

Senator Leyva?

BOARD MEMBER LEYVA: Here.

BOARD CLERK ESTABROOK: Dr. Pacheco-Werner?

BOARD MEMBER PACHECO-WERNER: Here.

BOARD CLERK ESTABROOK: Mrs. Riordan?

BOARD MEMBER RIORDAN: Here.

BOARD CLERK ESTABROOK: Supervisor Serna?

1 BOARD MEMBER SERNA: Here.

2 BOARD CLERK ESTABROOK: Professor Sperling?

3 Ms. Takvorian?

4 BOARD MEMBER TAKVORIAN: Here.

5 BOARD CLERK ESTABROOK: Vice Chair Berg?

6 VICE CHAIR BERG: Here.

7 BOARD CLERK ESTABROOK: Chair Randolph?

8 CHAIR RANDOLPH: Here.

9 BOARD CLERK ESTABROOK: Madam Chair, we have a  
10 quorum.

11 CHAIR RANDOLPH: All right. Thank you. It's  
12 great to be --

13 BOARD MEMBER KRACOV: I'm also here too.

14 CHAIR RANDOLPH: -- here with everyone today.

15 BOARD CLERK ESTABROOK: On behalf of myself and  
16 my fellow Board members, I want to thank everyone for  
17 joining us and in particular to acknowledge those of you  
18 from the Portside Environmental Justice community, which  
19 is the focus of today's meeting.

20 In accordance with Assembly Bill 361, we are  
21 conducting today's meeting remotely with Zoom. We have  
22 organized the proceedings to mirror our normal Board  
23 meeting as closely as possible, but understandably there  
24 may be some differences. We request your patience and  
25 understanding if any technical problems arise.

1           A closed caption feature has been added for those  
2 of you joining us in the Zoom environment. In order to  
3 turn on the subtitles, please look for a button labeled  
4 "CC" at the bottom of the Zoom window. As shown in the  
5 example on the screen now, I would like to take this  
6 opportunity to remind everyone to speak clearly and from a  
7 quiet location, whether you are joining us in Zoom or  
8 calling by phone.

9           Interpretation services will be provided today in  
10 Spanish. If you are joining us using Zoom, there is a  
11 button labeled "Interpretation" on the Zoom screen. Click  
12 on that interpretation button and select Spanish to hear  
13 the meeting in Spanish.

14           (Interpreter translated in Spanish)

15           CHAIR RANDOLPH: I will now ask the Board Clerk  
16 to provide more details on today's procedures.

17           BOARD CLERK ESTABROOK: Thank you, Chair.

18           Good afternoon, everyone. My name is Katie  
19 Estabrook and I am one of the Board Clerks. I will  
20 provide some information on how public participation will  
21 be organized for today's meeting.

22           If you wish to make a verbal comment on one of  
23 the Board items or if you want to make a comment during  
24 the open comment period at the end of today's meeting, you  
25 must be calling in using Zoom webinar or calling in by



1 phone. If you are currently watching the webcast on  
2 CAL-SPAN but you do wish to comment, please register for  
3 the Zoom webinar or call in. Information for both can be  
4 found on the public agenda.

5 In order to make a verbal comment, we will be  
6 using the raise-hand feature in Zoom. If you wish to  
7 speak on a Board item, please virtually raise your hand as  
8 soon as the item has begun to let us know you wish to  
9 speak. To do this, if you are using a computer or tablet,  
10 there is a raise-hand button. If you are calling in on  
11 the telephone, dial star nine to raise your hand. Even if  
12 you have previously registered and indicated which item  
13 you wish to speak on, please raise your hand at the  
14 beginning of the item you want to speak on.

15 If you have -- if you do not raise your hand,  
16 your chance to speak will be skipped.

17 If you are giving your verbal comment in Spanish,  
18 please indicate so at the beginning of your testimony and  
19 our translator will assist you. During your comment,  
20 please pause after each sentence to allow for the  
21 interpreter to translate your comment into English. When  
22 the comment period starts, the order of commenters will be  
23 determined by who raises their hand first. I will call  
24 each commenter by name and then activate each commenter  
25 when it is their turn to speak. For those calling in by

1 phone, I will identify you by the last three digits of  
2 your phone number.

3 We will not show a list of commenters. However,  
4 I will be announcing the next three or so commenters in  
5 the queue, so you are ready to testify and know who is  
6 coming up next. Please note that you will not -- not  
7 appear by video during your testimony.

8 I would also like to remind everyone, commenters,  
9 Board members, and CARB staff to please state your name  
10 for the record before you speak. This is important in  
11 this remote meeting setting. It is especially important  
12 for those calling in to testify on an item. We will have  
13 a time limit for each commenter. The normal time limit is  
14 three minutes, though this could change based on the  
15 Chair's discretion. During public testimony, you will see  
16 a timer on the screen.

17 For those calling in by phone, we will run the  
18 timer and let you know when you have 30 seconds left and  
19 when your time is up. If you require Spanish translation  
20 for your comment, your time will be doubled.

21 If you wish to submit written comments today,  
22 please visit CARB's send-us-your-comments page or look at  
23 the public agenda on our webpage for links to send these  
24 documents electronically. Comments will be accepted on  
25 each item until the Chair closes the record for that item.

1 I would like to give a friendly reminder to our  
2 Board members and CARB staff to please mute yourself when  
3 you are not speaking to avoid any background noise. Also,  
4 when you do speak, please speak from a quiet location. If  
5 you experience any technical difficulties, please call  
6 (805)772-2715 and an IT person can assist you. That  
7 number is located on the public agenda.

8 Thank you. I'll turn it back to you, Chair.

9 CHAIR RANDOLPH: Thank you.

10 Today's sole agenda item is number 21-10-1, AB  
11 617 Community Air Protection Program, community emissions  
12 reduction program for the Portside Environmental Justice  
13 neighborhoods. If you wish to comment on this item,  
14 please click the raise-hand button or dial star nine now.  
15 We will call on you when we get to the public comment  
16 portion of this item.

17 For this item, we are considering the last of  
18 four community emissions reduction programs for the  
19 communities selected in 2019 and the 11th community  
20 emissions reduction program brought to our Board. The  
21 Community Air Protection Program provides a  
22 community-focused approach to improve air quality and  
23 public health in communities that have been  
24 disproportionately burdened by unhealthy levels of air  
25 pollution. The Portside Environmental Justice community

1 includes Barrio Logan, Logan Heights, Sherman Heights, and  
2 National City.

3 In 2018, this Board selected the Portside  
4 community for community air monitoring. And in 2019, the  
5 community was selected to develop an emissions reduction  
6 program.

7 Since 2018, the Air District has been working  
8 with Portside community steering committee, which is made  
9 up of local businesses, community groups, and residents to  
10 develop strategies to improve air quality in this  
11 community. The San Diego Air Pollution Control District  
12 governing board adopted the final community emissions  
13 reduction program for the Portside neighborhoods in July  
14 2021.

15 Because the heart of the Community Air Protection  
16 Program is its focus on communities, we tend to structure  
17 these Board items a little differently. We will first  
18 hear from Portside community steering committee members,  
19 then staff from the San Diego Air Pollution Control  
20 District, and finally, CARB staff regarding the community  
21 emissions reduction program for the Portside  
22 neighborhoods.

23 After CARB staff's presentation, we will then  
24 take public testimony, and the Board will vote whether to  
25 approve the community emissions reduction program for the

1 Portside Environmental Justice neighborhoods.

2 I will now turn it over to Liliana Nuñez, Air  
3 Pollution Specialist, to introduce our first featured  
4 guest. Liliana, please begin when you are ready.

5 OCAP AIR POLLUTION SPECIALIST NUÑEZ: Thank you,  
6 Chair Randolph. Our first guest speaker is Ashley  
7 Valentin Gonzalez, AB 617 Portside community steering  
8 committee member, Outreach Specialist for Mundo Gardens,  
9 alumni for Barrio Logan College Institute, volunteer for  
10 Turning Wheels, and resident of Logan Heights.

11 Ashley, thanks for being here and please begin  
12 when you're ready.

13 ASHLEY VALENTIN GONZALEZ: Thank you for having  
14 me here. Hello, everybody. I'm Ashley Valentin Gonzalez.  
15 I was born and raised in Logan Heights. And from a young  
16 age, I have experienced the detrimental effects of air  
17 pollution in Logan. There have been moments when I was  
18 growing up where I was unable to play outside because of  
19 the air pollution that was caused by the freeways, tire  
20 shops, and the trucks passing by my home. In fact, I grew  
21 up in a small apartment nearby the gas station and the  
22 recycling center.

23 Logan Heights holds a special place in my heart,  
24 especially the people that live there. Therefore, I have  
25 a passion for advocating for environmental justice. As an

1 AB 1617[SIC] Portside community steering committee member,  
2 Logan College Institute, a junior from the University of  
3 San Diego, Live Well San Diego youth leader, volunteer for  
4 the Turning Wheels project, and a 20-year old resident of  
5 Logan Heights, I am very committed to making sure that the  
6 future generations can live in a safe environment with  
7 clean air, especially in low-income communities like Logan  
8 Heights and Barrio Logan.

9 I have been part of the Portside committee for  
10 about a year and a half and I truly appreciate how the  
11 committee put the extra effort to reach out to community  
12 members while also making sure it's accessible. They  
13 provide a Spanish translator, agenda in both languages.  
14 And if you are a -- are a resident, they give a small  
15 payment for being part of this group, because they  
16 understand that a lot of times families are unable to  
17 attend to these meetings due to working a couple of jobs,  
18 school, et cetera.

19 Even though there are some fancy words that at  
20 times I do not understand, I do appreciate how it's easy  
21 to follow and there is a safe space to ask questions and  
22 have a debate. However, there is some room for  
23 improvement to ensure that all the community voices from  
24 all ages are heard and how I wish there are more  
25 opportunities or promotions about this committee, because

1 a lot of times these opportunities or about these projects  
2 are often spread by word of mouth.

3 And I do wish that the project was a bit more  
4 strict, just because there is a sense of urgency to lessen  
5 the effects of the horrible air pollution in these  
6 communities. Some community members don't live here or  
7 people that are creating these projects, but I have seen  
8 the effects and I have seen friends, family members  
9 struggle to breathe or are already experiencing these  
10 effects because of these air pollutions that have been  
11 happening for decades.

12 However, I do think that the committee is putting  
13 the effort to do so. I am very excited to see the  
14 progress of the project and to be part of this committee.

15 Thank you.

16 OCAP AIR POLLUTION SPECIALIST NUÑEZ: Ashley,  
17 thank you so much for sharing your experience with us. I  
18 really appreciate it.

19 So our next speaker is Monserrat Hernandez, AB  
20 617 Portside community steering member, community  
21 organizer for Environmental Health Coalition, and 23-year  
22 resident of Logan Heights. Monserrat will give her  
23 remarks in Spanish and I will interpret them after she's  
24 done.

25 Okay. I will translate what Monserrat said.

1           MONSERRAT HERNANDEZ (through interpreter): Good  
2 afternoon. My name is Monserrat Hernandez and I am part  
3 of the AB 617 Portside community. I have lived in Logan  
4 Heights for 23 years and I'm also a community organizer  
5 for EHC. I started participating more than two years ago,  
6 when we had meetings at Perkins Elementary School in  
7 Barrio Logan. And with the pandemic, our meeting settings  
8 changed. Now, we're meeting via Zoom, but we continued  
9 working. And soon after, I was part of the AB 617  
10 community representing my community.

11           Being part of this committee has allowed me to  
12 get involved in the development of the CERP, so that  
13 Portside communities like Barrio Logan and National City  
14 can have clean air, because the impacts of pollution have  
15 left residents with high rates of asthma and respiratory  
16 illnesses, mainly in children.

17           As a community organizer, I've been engaging and  
18 informing residents about the committee and its work.  
19 Some other community members are also part of the  
20 Committee and it's very important, because I consider  
21 their participation and opinions as very relevant, since  
22 only those who live in these communities know more than  
23 anyone what it takes to have an environment free of  
24 toxics. The community members know what impacts them the  
25 most: the industries near their homes, the diesel trucks



1 coming out of the port, the proximity to freeways, et  
2 cetera. There are a lot of cumulative impacts.

3 And it has taken us over two years to develop the  
4 CERP and has required the involvement of the City of San  
5 Diego, National City, and the entities such as the Port,  
6 SANDAG, and other environmental justice organizations,  
7 such as EHC. We've had to break into subcommittee and  
8 analyze many documents in order to come up with ideas to  
9 reduce emissions -- to reduce toxic emissions.

10 And so today I want to ask you to approve this  
11 document and support this effort, so that the policies we  
12 are proposing can be implemented. The work is not  
13 finished. We will continue to ensure that the CERP is  
14 fulfilled and thank you for listening.

15 OCAP AIR POLLUTION SPECIALIST NUÑEZ: So that  
16 concludes Monserrat's remarks.

17 And now Domingo Vigil, Deputy Director at the San  
18 Diego Air Pollution Control District, will give an  
19 overview of the community emissions reduction program.

20 Domingo, whenever you're ready.

21 DOMINGO VIGIL: Thank you, Liliana. If I could  
22 ask staff to please --

23 (Thereupon a slide presentation.)

24 DOMINGO VIGIL: Yes. Thank you very much.

25 Good afternoon, Chair Randolph, members of the

1 Board and members of the public. I'm honored to present  
2 to you today on behalf of APCD and the Portside community  
3 steering committee the Portside CERP. This CERP is a  
4 result of many months of collaborative work among  
5 community residents, community-based organizations,  
6 industry members, and partner agencies that came together  
7 with one goal in mind, improve air quality for the  
8 Portside community. In the next few slides, I will share  
9 with you some highlights from the Portside CERP.

10 Next slide, please.

11 --o0o--

12 DOMINGO VIGIL: This slide shows a planning  
13 timeline for the CERP. The Portside community was  
14 nominated for the Community Air Protection Program by APCD  
15 and was selected by CARB to participate in December of  
16 2019. Since then, the APCD has been working with CARB and  
17 the Portside community steering committee to develop the  
18 CERP.

19 The steering committee includes residents and  
20 community leaders, representatives from public entities,  
21 such as SANDAG, the City of San Diego, National City, the  
22 Navy and the Port of San Diego, business groups such as  
23 the Industrial Environmental Association, and  
24 community-based organizations such as the Environmental  
25 Health Coalition.

1           Last November, the Air Pollution Control Board  
2 approved phase one of the CERP, which included a set of  
3 early actions that are currently being implemented. After  
4 November of last year, APCD staff continued working with  
5 the community steering committee to finalize phase two  
6 following CARB's blueprint under AB 617. A final proposed  
7 CERP was approved by the community steering committee in  
8 June of this year and by the APCD Board in July. Today,  
9 we are seeking your Board's approval for this  
10 community-developed plan.

11           Throughout this process, APCD has worked to  
12 engage the community through regular community meetings,  
13 workshops, as well as email, printed, and social media  
14 outreach. The CERP before you is a product of months of  
15 hard work from Portside community steering committee, our  
16 partner agencies, and our colleagues at CARB.

17           Next slide, please.

18                           --o0o--

19           DOMINGO VIGIL: The CERP includes aspirational  
20 goals intended to guide the community members, businesses,  
21 organizations, and government agencies partnering in the  
22 implementation of the CERP to support health and  
23 environmental justice in the Portside community. The  
24 overall goals identify the direction in which the  
25 community wants to go to achieve emission reductions

1 beyond regulatory requirements.

2           Moreover, the CERP contains a list of actions  
3 developed by the steering committee and community members  
4 to help improve air quality in the community and/or reduce  
5 pollution exposure. Partner agencies with implementing  
6 roles are also identified as well as a set of metrics to  
7 track progress.

8           The CERP is a living document and as we learn  
9 more about air quality in the community, we will make any  
10 necessary updates to the data, community priorities or  
11 actions based on the best data available. Following are  
12 some examples of the actions included in the CERP.

13           Next slide, please.

14                               --o0o--

15           DOMINGO VIGIL: The collaborative effort of  
16 partner agencies, such as San Diego APCD, CARB, the Port,  
17 the Cities of San Diego and National City, SANDAG,  
18 Caltrans, the Navy, shipyards, SDG&E and other partners  
19 will result in the implementation of actions under the  
20 categories you see on the slide.

21           Some examples include the following:

22           Developing rules for stationary sources that will  
23 result in emission reductions for the region of  
24 approximately 0.4 tons of VOCs per day and 0.4 tons of NOx  
25 per day; advancing the deployment of heavy-duty on-road

1 electric trucks to demonstrate operational visibility and  
2 reduce emissions within the Portside community; supporting  
3 dedicated truck routes to avoid truck impacts to local  
4 community; supporting land uses that serve as a buffer  
5 between industrial and residential uses in the Portside  
6 community; reducing exposure to air pollution by  
7 incentivizing indoor filtration systems; improving  
8 transportation efficiencies; reducing diesel emissions  
9 from cargo handling equipment; collaborating with partner  
10 agencies to reduce emissions from shipyards -- from ships  
11 at berth and harbor craft; promoting the adoption of  
12 zero-emission technologies; and advocating to support  
13 actions by other agencies and decision-making bodies that  
14 will improve air quality in the community.

15           Next slide, please.

16                               --o0o--

17           DOMINGO VIGIL: The collaboration of our partners  
18 has led to important early successes of phase one of the  
19 CERP, which include the following:

20           Under our incentive strategies, we are employing  
21 participatory budgeting strategies to prioritize the  
22 funding of projects that are of most importance to the  
23 community. We are developing a program to provide air  
24 filtration systems to households within the Portside  
25 community, and we have funded projects in the Portside

1 community, which include cleaner school buses and an  
2 electric tug boat. Phase one also included early  
3 commitments from other entities such as a port district,  
4 shipyards, and the Navy.

5 As part of this -- of these commitments, the Port  
6 has deployed a total of five zero-emission trucks in two  
7 marine terminals within the Portside community and is  
8 currently working on achieving additional emission  
9 reductions from replacing older cargo handling equipment,  
10 and from a number of additional projects.

11 The shipyards have implemented policies requiring  
12 air compressors to be powered by zero-emission technology  
13 or Tier 4 engines.

14 And the Navy is operating in-port ships on shore  
15 power to the fullest extent practical when ported at the  
16 base.

17 These early commitments and results reflect the  
18 collaborative approach of CERP partners and reflect the  
19 value of community input in informing air quality  
20 priorities in the Portside community. APCD staff will  
21 continue to work with these entities to track the  
22 completion of additional projects and commitments included  
23 in the CERP.

24 Finally, APCD staff would like to acknowledge the  
25 work and dedication of community members, partner

1 agencies, and CARB staff towards the development of the  
2 CERP. This level of collaboration is unprecedented and we  
3 look forward to continue collaborating throughout the  
4 five-year implementation phase of the CERP and beyond.

5 Thank you very much. Liliana, I'll turn it over  
6 back to you.

7 OCAP AIR POLLUTION SPECIALIST NUÑEZ: Thank you,  
8 Domingo for that overview. So Chair Randolph and members  
9 of the Board, before I begin -- I begin my presentation, I  
10 just want to express my gratitude to both Ashley and  
11 Monserrat for providing valuable insights as residents and  
12 steering committee members.

13 (Thereupon a slide presentation.)

14 OCAP AIR POLLUTION SPECIALIST NUÑEZ: And a  
15 special thanks to the steering committee as a whole, and  
16 the San Diego Air Pollution Control District staff for all  
17 their efforts in developing the Portside Environmental  
18 Justice community emissions reduction program with --  
19 which is the result of extensive collaboration and we  
20 commend them for their work.

21 So as Chair Randolph mentioned earlier, the Board  
22 is acting on the 11th community emissions reduction  
23 program. And today's action by the Board continues the  
24 effort statewide to improve air quality in  
25 disproportionately burdened communities. I will present

1 CARB staff's review and our recommendations on this  
2 community's emission reduction program, or CERPs, as  
3 they're widely known -- can you click?

4 --o0o--

5 OCAP AIR POLLUTION SPECIALIST NUÑEZ: Thank you.

6 Okay -- so CERPs as they're widely know. And as  
7 we've done for other CERPs already approved by the Board,  
8 CARB staff compared the plan to statutory requirements and  
9 blueprint criteria. We also considered the comments we  
10 heard during steering committee meetings and other  
11 outreach events including the virtual community workshop  
12 hosted by CARB in August.

13 --o0o--

14 OCAP AIR POLLUTION SPECIALIST NUÑEZ: Before  
15 going into the CERP's key strengths, I just want to  
16 illustrate the neighborhoods that make up the Portside  
17 community. These are Barrio Logan, Logan Heights, Sherman  
18 Heights, and the western part of National City.

19 In staff's review of CERPs, we identify best  
20 practices or key strengths that can be applied to other  
21 communities to help expand the statewide Community Air  
22 Protection Program. This CERP was well prepared by the  
23 steering committee and the Air District. And on this  
24 slide, I'll go over a few of its strengths.

25 Initially, when the stay-at-home orders came into



1 effect, the Air District was able to successfully  
2 transition to virtual meetings quickly and efficiently to  
3 support the development of the CERP. A key contributor to  
4 that success is Environmental Health Coalition, a local  
5 environmental justice community group. They provided  
6 tablets and hot spots to residents to help bridge that  
7 technological gap that was created by the transition to  
8 the virtual environment.

9           Also, the formation of four different  
10 subcommittees provided highly collaborative and fruitful  
11 setting -- settings for the development of many strategies  
12 in the CERP. Implementing entities like the Port of San  
13 Diego, Caltrans, the San Diego Association of Governments,  
14 and San Diego Gas and Electric all worked closely with CSC  
15 members in these subcommittees to include their  
16 commitments in the CERP.

17           The land use subcommittee, which was mostly  
18 composed of residents reviewed and prioritized over a  
19 hundred proposals. Land-use strategies to reduce exposure  
20 to air pollution in the CERP include improved community  
21 planning and transportation efficiencies, increased  
22 community green space, stronger enforcement of existing  
23 truck routes, and consideration for sensitive receptors  
24 within 500 feet of pollution sources.

25           Another strength is the District's participatory

1 budget -- budgeting exercises that Domingo just detailed.  
2 They use this to identify the steering committees'  
3 incentives priorities and they've been doing this since  
4 late 2019. Establishment of these practices early on are  
5 highly beneficial as the community begins to develop the  
6 community-identified projects that are available through  
7 AB 617 air protection incentives.

8 And finally, as again detailed by Domingo, the  
9 CERP has bold overarching goals and they'll help guide  
10 CERP implementation towards achieving the community health  
11 envisioned for Portside. Examples of the goals include  
12 significantly reducing ambient diesel PM by 80 percent and  
13 transitioning to a hundred percent zero-emission trucks  
14 servicing the community five years ahead of State  
15 requirements.

16 Environmental Health Coalition proposed the goals  
17 and the steering committee worked together to refine the  
18 goals and include them as aspirational goals for the CERP.

19 Next I'll highlight for the Board some of the  
20 actions CARB has committed to in this CERP.

21 --o0o--

22 OCAP AIR POLLUTION SPECIALIST NUÑEZ: This first  
23 commitment listed here supports the CERP goals. CARB  
24 staff -- CARB staff will estimate the Portside communities  
25 cumulative cancer risk for toxic air contaminants. The

1 community will then use the results of the modeling to  
2 help set goals for cancer risk reduction in the Portside  
3 community.

4 Secondly, CARB is committed to assist the  
5 District with air monitoring of hexavalent chromium and  
6 provide -- by providing equipment as well as lab and data  
7 analysis.

8 CARB also assisted the Air District in their  
9 efforts to gather and analyze data from automatic license  
10 plates readers to better characterize mobile source  
11 traffic and emissions in the Portside community. And  
12 lastly, statewide CARB regulation -- regulatory actions  
13 will bring emission reductions right in the Portside  
14 community through cleaner truck -- cars, trucks, and  
15 marine vessels.

16 In the upcoming slides, I'll introduce staff's  
17 recommended measures for strengthening the CERP during  
18 implementation.

19 --o0o--

20 OCAP AIR POLLUTION SPECIALIST NUÑEZ: The  
21 District and steering committee members have put  
22 significant effort into developing the CERP. And we  
23 recognize that the CERP is a culmination of an extensive  
24 amount of work within aggressive deadlines that were  
25 further exacerbated by the stay-at-home orders.

1 Additionally, we have seen ongoing progress in  
2 implementing phase one action since November 2020.

3           However, we did hear concerns during the  
4 development process, and in response, we've identified  
5 areas for the CARB -- for CARB, the District, and the  
6 steering committee to work together in the categories of  
7 community emissions inventory and community air monitoring  
8 efforts.

9           The following recommended actions will not only  
10 benefit the community, but also impacted the communities  
11 statewide.

12                           --o0o--

13           OCAP AIR POLLUTION SPECIALIST NUÑEZ: The first  
14 recommended action is related to community-level emissions  
15 inventory. Though the current CERP inventory represents  
16 the best available data at the present time, CARB will  
17 work with the District and steering committee to improve  
18 community-level emissions inventory, as new methodologies  
19 become available.

20           CARB staff found and quickly corrected errors in  
21 the community emissions inventory for estimations of  
22 hexavalent chromium emissions. And a few members of the  
23 steering committee expressed they did not have ample time  
24 to review and understand the corrections before the  
25 steer -- the steering committee was set to vote on

1 approving the CERP. Nevertheless, the steering committee  
2 approved the CERP by a vote of 22 to 2.

3 CARB staff has met with interested members to  
4 explain the emissions inventory methodologies in detail.  
5 And as new methodologies for estimating hexavalent  
6 chromium emissions become available, we will work with the  
7 steering committee and the Air District to improve  
8 community emissions inventory, while ensuring the  
9 transparent process for providing inventory updates with  
10 sufficient time for steering committee review.

11 --o0o--

12 OCAP AIR POLLUTION SPECIALIST NUÑEZ: The second  
13 recommendation is related to the community-level air  
14 monitoring efforts. The District has worked with the  
15 steering committee to understand their air monitoring  
16 priorities and develop a Community Air Monitoring Plan,  
17 since 2018.

18 However, the District has faced difficulties with  
19 contracts and the procurement of -- and siting of  
20 equipment. CARB understands these setbacks and is looking  
21 forward to the addition of an air monitoring station at  
22 the Naval base in San Diego and other locations in the  
23 Portside community as indicated in the monitoring plan.

24 A common theme we've heard around the air  
25 monitoring efforts is a desire to better understand the

1 data that is being presented. The community steering  
2 committee does have new members that may require more  
3 background information, but we've heard this comment from  
4 land-standing members as well.

5 Therefore, we recommend the District work with  
6 the steering committee to make air monitoring information  
7 more understandable and accessible to members of the  
8 community.

9 Also, as more data becomes available from the  
10 community air monitoring plan, the District should work  
11 with the steering committee to leverage the monitoring  
12 data to track progress of CERP implementation where  
13 possible.

14 --o0o--

15 OCAP AIR POLLUTION SPECIALIST NUÑEZ: The final  
16 items I'd like to share with you today are additional  
17 commitments that resulted from ongoing conversations with  
18 steering committee members, the District, and CARB staff.  
19 In this community, CARB has been and will continue to work  
20 closely with the District to provide technical assistance  
21 in support of CERP strategies.

22 Accordingly, CARB staff should improve  
23 communication with steering committee members and be more  
24 proactive in offering expertise and accessible technical  
25 information to support and oversee implementation.

1           Additionally, across the state, we've heard about  
2 the desire for steering committees to connect with each  
3 other to share lessons learned and best practices. And  
4 CARB staff will be proactive in supporting exchanges  
5 across AB 617 communities.

6                               --o0o--

7           OCAP AIR POLLUTION SPECIALIST NUÑEZ: Considering  
8 the recommended action -- actions these -- the recommended  
9 actions to strengthen implementation and the steering  
10 committee support for the final CERP, staff recommend that  
11 the Board approve the community emissions reduction  
12 program for the Portside Environmental Justice  
13 neighborhoods and direct staff and the Air District to  
14 work with the steering committee to implement the  
15 recommendations presented today and the out -- and  
16 outlined in the CARB staff report, and in Resolution  
17 21-23.

18           Finally, we're also recommending the Board direct  
19 the District to provide updates on the measurable progress  
20 made towards these actions in the annual reports that are  
21 required by AB 617. This concludes today's presentation  
22 and I'd love to just thank our guest speakers once again  
23 for their time and their commitment to the Portside  
24 community. Chair Randolph, I'll turn it back to you.

25           CHAIR RANDOLPH: Thank you very much.

1           We will now hear from the public who raised their  
2 hand to speak on this item. Will the Board Clerk please  
3 call the first few commenters.

4           BOARD CLERK ESTABROOK: Thank you, Chair.

5           We currently have five people with their hands  
6 raised who wish to speak. If you want to verbally comment  
7 on this Board item, please raise your hand or dial star  
8 nine now. I apologize in advance if I mispronounce any  
9 names.

10           The first three speakers will be Joy Williams,  
11 Jack Monger, and Hasan Ikhrata.

12           Joy, I have activated your microphone. You can  
13 unmute yourself and begin your comment.

14           JOY WILLIAMS: Good afternoon. Can you hear me?

15           BOARD CLERK ESTABROOK: Yes, we can.

16           JOY WILLIAMS: Okay. Thank you. Good afternoon.  
17 I am Joy Williams. I represent Environmental Health  
18 Coalition. I'm the AB 617 steering committee. EHC has  
19 participated with AB 617 from the beginning. We submitted  
20 a nomination for Portside to be selected for AB 617. We  
21 supported APCD's nomination of San Ysidro as well, and  
22 continue to hope this community will be selected in the  
23 future. We have participated on the steering committee  
24 for its entire existence.

25           EHC supports the CERP and we urge you to vote



1 today to approve it. The CERP was developed over a  
2 three-year process that drew on the experience, wisdom,  
3 creativity, and concern for health equity of community  
4 residents and a wide variety of other participants to  
5 create new opportunities for environmental justice in the  
6 Portside communities.

7 In many ways, this is a model CERP. It includes  
8 aspirational goals, as you heard, to explain the community  
9 vision for the plan outcomes. It also reflects the effort  
10 to develop actions and strategies that are measurable, of  
11 timelines, and have commitments from agencies to implement  
12 them.

13 The many approaches to improving air quality  
14 include both mobile and stationary sources, new rules,  
15 enforcement of existing rules, land-use planning  
16 strategies, new green spaces, a major push to electrify  
17 diesel emission sources at the port and throughout the  
18 communities, attention to the need for charging  
19 infrastructure and truck parking on a regional scale, and  
20 a commitment to fairness for truck drivers.

21 If implemented effectively, the CERP has the  
22 potential to directly reduce emissions of harmful  
23 pollutants such as diesel exhaust, as well as to move the  
24 region faster towards electrification of diesel equipment  
25 and away from carbon-based fuels. Planning efforts to

1 mitigate impacts of pollution and increase the  
2 environmental health of the Portside communities are  
3 included in measures that are strongly supported by the  
4 community residents, and that includes more green space,  
5 air filters for schools, greater tree canopy, routing of  
6 truck traffic around the community, and grade separation  
7 of streets from train tracks.

8           The CERP also provides information on sources and  
9 health impacts of air pollution and we thank CARB staff  
10 for their continuing efforts to quantify the cumulative  
11 health impacts of air pollution in Portside. I want to  
12 thank everyone who contributed to the development of the  
13 CERP, starting with the community members who have given  
14 so many hours of their time to engage in the process. I  
15 thank APCD staff, including those leading the meetings and  
16 developing the CERP, as well as the staff engaged in air  
17 monitoring enforcement and incentives programs.

18           The Port District cities of San Diego and  
19 National City, SANDAG and Caltrans also have contributed  
20 time and made commitments to CERP measures.

21           We look forward to CARB's continued involvement.  
22 At the same time, I would like to take the opportunity to  
23 note that CERP implementation is not guaranteed. We and  
24 our allies in EJ communities throughout California are  
25 still looking for emission reduction mandates with

1 regulatory force in CERPs.

2 Thank you for your time today and for your  
3 approval of the Portside CERP.

4 BOARD CLERK ESTABROOK: Thank you.

5 Jack Monger, I have activated your microphone.  
6 You may unmute yourself and begin.

7 JACK MONGER: Thank you. Can you hear me okay?

8 BOARD CLERK ESTABROOK: Yes, we can.

9 JACK MONGER: Thank you.

10 Good afternoon, Chair Randolph, members of the  
11 Board. My name is Jack Monger. I'm the CEO of the  
12 Industrial Environmental Association, and have also been a  
13 member of the steering committee for the Portside  
14 community for the past almost three years.

15 First, I want to offer compliments to our San  
16 Diego APCD staff who managed the shift from in person  
17 meetings to virtual meetings as all of us have had to go  
18 through. But it posed, as you can imagine, a lot of  
19 additional challenges to the process for community  
20 members, for participants, for steering committee members.  
21 And I think they did an amazing job. I also think special  
22 notice needs to be given to APD -- APCD staff members who  
23 stepped up to guide this process after the retirement of  
24 four of the District's most senior leaders in the first  
25 year, so...

1           But because IEA and our members support the AB  
2 617 process and are hopeful that the end result is  
3 something that benefits the community, we would like to  
4 suggest that it would have been helpful for CARB to grant  
5 the steering committee's request for more time to work  
6 through the CERP, in light of the COVID's impact on the AB  
7 617 process for a large portion of 2020.

8           As a result, we wound up working at breakneck  
9 speed trying to accomplish a great deal of work in two  
10 hours of meetings. It was a very expedited process and I  
11 don't believe there was enough time spent helping steering  
12 committee members, as well as other members of the  
13 community understand exactly what emissions were present  
14 in the community, the extent of the health risk associated  
15 with those emissions, what the source of, or sources of,  
16 those emissions was, and what measures should be taken to  
17 reduce or eliminate the priority emissions in the future.

18           I think a more thorough understanding of those  
19 factors would have helped the community develop a CERP  
20 with prioritized actions that would contribute the most to  
21 tangible, measurable, health benefits at the end of the  
22 five-year period.

23           Nevertheless, IEA appreciates the opportunity to  
24 work with the community throughout this process and we are  
25 hopeful that the implementation period will provide an

1 opportunity for us to address these shortcomings. We  
2 truly believe this would result in a more effective CERP  
3 and an enhanced quality of life for the Portside  
4 community.

5 Thank you very much.

6 BOARD CLERK ESTABROOK: Thank you.

7 Our next speaker will be Hasan Ikhata. After  
8 Hasan will be Brian Gordon, David Flores, and Alicia  
9 Sanchez.

10 And just a reminder that if you will be giving a  
11 comment in Spanish to please indicate so at the beginning  
12 of your testimony.

13 Hasan, I have activated your microphone. You can  
14 unmute yourself and begin.

15 HASAN IKHRATA: Thank you very much and good  
16 afternoon, Chair Randolph, Directors of Air Resources  
17 Board. I am Hasan Ikhata, the CEO of SANDAG, San Diego  
18 Association of Governments.

19 It is important for me to be here today to  
20 express my support for the approval of the AB 617 Portside  
21 communities emission reduction program. Working together,  
22 our agencies have the opportunity to address air pollution  
23 in our region and be it a focus in the Portside  
24 communities.

25 We all know transportation is a big contributor

1 to poor air quality. Through our regional plan and 5 Big  
2 Moves, SANDAG is working hard to do its part to ensure we  
3 have faster, fairer, and clearer transportation system.  
4 We look forward to implementing the CERP strategies with  
5 the San Diego Air Resources Pollution Control District,  
6 community members through our partnership of the AB 617  
7 Program. We have great strategies for how to do this in  
8 the draft 2021 Regional Transportation Plan.

9 Our regional electric vehicle incentive project,  
10 the recent California Energy Commission grant for SANDAG  
11 to develop a blueprint for zero-emission trucks and  
12 transit vehicles, continuing to promote the SANDAG  
13 iCommute Program for Naval base, San Diego employees, the  
14 Blue Line Trolley Grade Separation, and the innovative  
15 Harbor Drive 2.0 project.

16 I look forward to working with all of you to make  
17 sure this becomes a reality. I ask you to approve the  
18 item in front of you today.

19 Thank you very much for allowing SANDAG to be  
20 part of the discussion.

21 BOARD CLERK ESTABROOK: Thank you.

22 Brian, I have activated your microphone. You may  
23 unmute and begin.

24 BRIAN GORDON: Yeah. Just sound check. Can you  
25 hear me?

1 BOARD CLERK ESTABROOK: Yes, we can.

2 BRIAN GORDON: Great. Thank you.

3 Good afternoon, Chair Randolph, Board members.  
4 My name is Brian Gordon. I'm the Environmental Program  
5 Manager for Navy Regional Southwest. And I'm speaking to  
6 you on behalf of the Navy.

7 Our Regional Commander, Rear Admiral Barnett,  
8 submitted a comment letter expressing the Navy's support  
9 for AB 617 process in general and an endorsement of this  
10 CERP in particular. The letter highlighted our active  
11 participation in the Portside steering committee and our  
12 contributions towards improving air quality monitoring and  
13 reducing emissions as expressed in the CERP.

14 We recognize the importance of implementing the  
15 CERP as soon as possible to reduce pollution impact in  
16 this community and fully support the Board approving it  
17 today. We participate -- we appreciate your staff taking  
18 the time to meet with us to discuss our concerns with  
19 regard to emissions inventory in the CERP, and in  
20 particular for hexavalent chromium.

21 We're pleased to see their recommendation is  
22 in -- in the staff report to update the emissions  
23 inventory as relevant new information becomes available  
24 and to improve the process for presenting the inventory  
25 updates.

1           We request the Board support this effort to  
2 ensure the plan -- the data in the plan is as accurate and  
3 current as possible to inform decisions going forward that  
4 will result in significant improvement to air quality for  
5 this community. I want to thank you for your time. We  
6 look forward to moving to the next step, implementation of  
7 the plan. Thank you very much.

8           BOARD CLERK ESTABROOK: Thank you.

9           David Flores, I have activated your mic. You can  
10 unmute yourself and begin.

11           DAVID FLORES: Good afternoon, CARB Chair and  
12 Board members. My name is David Flores. I am Senior  
13 Policy Advisor for Land Use and Environmental Justice for  
14 the Office of Vice Chair Supervisor Nora Vargas  
15 representing the First District, which includes the  
16 Portside communities.

17           On behalf of Vice Chair Vargas, who also sits as  
18 the Chair of the San Diego Air Pollution Control District  
19 with a new board, we want to thank CARB staff, the  
20 Portside Community AB 617 community steering committee,  
21 the residents of Barrio Logan, Logan Heights, Sherman, and  
22 National City for their tremendous work in uplifting the  
23 importance of this program to reduce emissions for  
24 Portside.

25           Many agencies have provided also time and support



1 for getting the plan before you today. We wanted to also  
2 thank CARB for allowing during the pandemic an adjustment  
3 of the request for time to complete the Portside CERP,  
4 which we believe elevates the importance of  
5 cross-jurisdictional work with community in a very complex  
6 environment, and the need to continue to collaborate  
7 across jurisdictions, agencies, in order to elevate the  
8 community voice.

9 Supervisor Vargas will continue to champion  
10 emissions reductions with this CERP for the Portside  
11 communities, and as she continuously does, elevating  
12 strategies, actions, and advocating for funding at the  
13 local, State, and federal levels to address emissions  
14 reductions and air quality improvements for our most  
15 impacted communities.

16 District 1 also holds the border communities and  
17 we look forward to continuing the collaboration with CARB  
18 to expand the community emissions reduction program into  
19 those communities.

20 We want to thank Supervisor Nathan Fletcher that  
21 sits on our APCD governing board as a representative to  
22 this Board, and thank the Environmental Health Coalition  
23 for their continuous work in identifying gaps, the need  
24 for additional data, analysis, questioning, to inform  
25 decision making for the San Diego region, and for their

1 tremendous uplifting of the need of the Portside  
2 environmental justice community for decades.

3 Thank you. Thank you, Board Member Diane  
4 Takvorian, for what you do for the San Diego region.

5 BOARD CLERK ESTABROOK: Thank you.

6 Our next speaker will be Alicia Sanchez. After  
7 Alicia, the last person with their hand raised is David  
8 Yow. If you would like to speak on this item, please  
9 raise your hand or dial star nine in Zoom.

10 Alicia, I have activated your microphone. You  
11 can unmute yourself and begin.

12 ALICIA SANCHEZ: (Spoke in Spanish)

13 BOARD CLERK ESTABROOK: Liliana, are you going to  
14 interpret for her?

15 OCAP AIR POLLUTION SPECIALIST NUÑEZ: Yes,  
16 please.

17 Alicia.

18 ALICIA SANCHEZ: (Spoke in Spanish)

19 (Liliana Nuñez and Alicia Sanchez conversed  
20 in Spanish.)

21 OCAP AIR POLLUTION SPECIALIST NUÑEZ: So I am  
22 going to translate what Alicia is saying. And so far, she  
23 said, "Hi. I am Alicia Sanchez. I'm a 20-year resident  
24 of --

25 (Liliana Nuñez and Alicia Sanchez conversed

1           in Spanish.)

2           ALICIA SANCHEZ (through interpreter): Hi. My  
3 name is Alicia Sanchez. I am a 20-year resident of  
4 National City. I'm a promoter for EH -- a community  
5 organizer for EHC and I am also on the AB 617 CSC.

6           Okay. I'm asking you to approve the CERP,  
7 because we want cleaner air in National City, because we  
8 have a high rate of asthma in our area. So here in  
9 this -- in this community, we have a lot of car shops  
10 mixed in with residences. And we're really asking you to  
11 approve the policies, so that we can get cleaner air and  
12 zero-emission trucks. So that's really my comment is to  
13 approve the CERP and thanks for hearing us.

14          BOARD CLERK ESTABROOK: Thank you, Alicia.

15          Our last speaker will be David Yow.

16          David, I have activated your microphone. You can  
17 unmute yourself and begin your comment.

18          DAVID YOW: Thank you so much. David Yow, right,  
19 with the Port of San Diego. And first and foremost, we  
20 have to thank CARB, all the work that the steering  
21 committee put into this, and APCD staff. This CERP shows  
22 what you can do with advancing local decision-making. And  
23 what we're happy about is seeing a multi-jurisdictional  
24 plan that includes us and our other partners, has a  
25 Portside community focus, and is going to accelerate new

1 actions beyond existing programs. But the timing is  
2 really key here, because the Port of San Diego is also  
3 pursuing a complementary strategy. Many of you are  
4 familiar with the Maritime Clean Air Strategy, or the  
5 MCAS. And there is a specific focus on health environment  
6 in maritime operations.

7 And what's interesting is the goals of this CERP  
8 today and the objectives of the MCAS are aligned and  
9 complementary, especially on cargo handling equipment,  
10 commercial harbor craft, shipyards, heavy-duty trucks,  
11 ocean-going vessels, other overlapping areas.

12 And the other -- the other thing I need to add is  
13 a shout-out to the APCD. You know, it's hard to do this,  
14 I think. But to do a community-driven process major kudos  
15 to them. We're happy to track alongside with that at the  
16 Port. We led three well-attended subcommittees over the  
17 last couple of years to also identify goals, actions, and  
18 strategies for both the CERP and the MCAS. Just a quick  
19 quell, you know, the -- look at the CERP, the goals,  
20 strategies, and actions are based on feedback. You're  
21 hearing from some of the -- some of the folks today about  
22 that, residents, environmental leaders, within the  
23 community. There is a goal of a hundred percent  
24 zero-emission medium- and heavy-duty trucks five years  
25 ahead of California, and another actions and strategies to

1 get us there.

2 Similarly, the Port of San Diego's MCAS  
3 identifies transitioning to 100 percent zero-emission  
4 trucks and cargo handling equipment by 2030, five years  
5 ahead of the State's goals.

6 So it -- collaboration is very valuable. And  
7 just thank you again for having me here, supporting our  
8 port, supporting the community, and the decision-making  
9 process that will prioritize important reductions and look  
10 forward to seeing this move forward.

11 Thank you.

12 BOARD CLERK ESTABROOK: Thank you.

13 Chair, that concludes the commenters for this  
14 item.

15 CHAIR RANDOLPH: All right. Thank you.

16 I will now close the record on this agenda item  
17 and bring this matter to the Board. I know we have  
18 Supervisor Fletcher and then also Board Member Takvorian  
19 both from that area. So we'll start with Supervisor  
20 Fletcher.

21 BOARD MEMBER FLETCHER: Thank you. Thank you,  
22 Madam Chair, and thank you to all the public commenters.  
23 The members of the public that have weighed in have worked  
24 so incredibly hard to get us to this point. A special  
25 thank you to our staff at the Air Pollution Control

1 District. I know we just wrapped up our APCD meeting  
2 earlier today. I appreciate all you're doing. And, of  
3 course, the engagement of work of all of the CARB staff  
4 and Air Resources Board staff.

5 I am -- I am really excited and thrilled that we  
6 are at the point of considering the adoption of the CERP  
7 for our Portside environmental justice communities. This  
8 is a significant step forward for San Diego and a  
9 significant step forward for our communities that are most  
10 impacted by air pollution.

11 You know, we all know that we have twin  
12 challenges. We've got one around our global economy. We  
13 also have one around the very real impacts of pollution on  
14 our most vulnerable communities. And in San Diego, like  
15 all portside communities, we are a global economy. We  
16 know that our ports are necessary to the movement of  
17 goods, products, all of the food that we rely on, so much  
18 of what we do. And with the backlogs that we're seeing  
19 around the ports of LA and Long Beach, you know, we're all  
20 getting a lesson in real time just how integral our ports  
21 are to the functioning of our global economy and our local  
22 economies.

23 And without these ports operating, there are  
24 major breakdowns in manufacturing, product distribution  
25 that has impacts up and down the supply chain, which can

1 have a very real impact on not just the national economy,  
2 but the local economy.

3 In San Diego, our port is also vital and integral  
4 to the functioning of the U.S. Military, in particular the  
5 Navy. It is the single largest driver of the San Diego  
6 economy is the Navy and the Marine Corps. And so we know  
7 how important it is, both the port and the capacity around  
8 them to that functioning as well.

9 We also know that these ports are a significant  
10 source of pollution. Our Portside environmental justice  
11 community in San Diego is in the 95th percentile statewide  
12 for asthma rates and very high for poverty. The  
13 environmental justice -- injustice that happens in these  
14 areas is very real. It's diesel exhaust. It's air  
15 pollution. All of the components here are the stark  
16 reminder of the very real environmental justice challenges  
17 we face. And our communities here have been struggling,  
18 both with pollution and poverty for decades.

19 Environmental -- historic environmental racism  
20 has created tragic and stark disparities. A child in  
21 Barrio Logan, in our environmental justice community, is  
22 eight times more likely to have asthma than a child just a  
23 few miles up the road La Jolla, both within the City of  
24 San Diego. And so that challenge before us is how do we  
25 align these two different things which we have to do?

1           We have to continue to support economic growth at  
2 our ports, but we know we have to transition to zero  
3 emission and reduce the impacts on communities. And that  
4 is why this community emission reduction plan is so  
5 important and will put us on a path to doing this. This  
6 plan is going to help us tackle diesel PM, transition from  
7 medium- and heavy-duty trucks, install charging  
8 infrastructure, tackle toxic emissions, reduce cancer  
9 risk, increase tree canopy, and park and green space.

10           It is also a good time that we are moving  
11 forward. Earlier this week, the Port of San Diego  
12 approved their maritime clean air strategy, which will  
13 align with the implementation of the CERP. This includes  
14 100 percent zero-emission vehicles by 2030, as was  
15 mentioned earlier, five years ahead of the State targets.

16           And we know that we've got a long road ahead of  
17 us. It's been quite the journey to get where we are and  
18 we know we have a long way to go to fulfilling the  
19 commitment around clean air, healthy lungs, and  
20 environmental justice.

21           And as we move forward, I'm very committed to  
22 continuing to work to advance the solutions to continue to  
23 be a resource to our AB 617 steering committee, to  
24 overcome obstacles or hurdles that may arise. And I know  
25 that we have heard concerns about data accuracy. And I



1 want all the stakeholders to know that we strive to have  
2 access to the most accurate data. And as we obtain new  
3 data and information in the future, those will be  
4 incorporated into subsequent iterations of the CERP.

5 But again, thank you to everyone who has led us  
6 to this position today. And I am very grateful and  
7 pleased to see this moving forward and look forward to the  
8 work ahead for its implementation.

9 CHAIR RANDOLPH: Thank you.

10 Board Member Takvorian.

11 BOARD MEMBER TAKVORIAN: Thank you, Chair.

12 It's a great day and I want to congratulate  
13 everyone who's been involved in this now three-year effort  
14 that's really a monumental effort to address environmental  
15 racism and achieve environmental justice. And I really  
16 have to start with the community members who have been  
17 part of the community steering committee. Most of these  
18 community members are not new to air pollution issues.  
19 They've been working to improve community health for many,  
20 many years.

21 And this effort, this opportunity came along and  
22 gave them the opportunity to really focus their attention  
23 into the CERP. So this is really represent --  
24 representative of decades of work that community members  
25 have been doing.

1           And I just want to take a minute to say that the  
2 pandemic really significantly impacted our communities in  
3 very significant ways with high infection rates and  
4 mortality rates. And so working through the physically  
5 and emotionally stressful time was very, very difficult,  
6 but their dedication and persistence were critical factors  
7 that led both of the selection of the Portside communities  
8 as a participant in this program and to the development of  
9 the CERP ultimately.

10           And I do want to give a shout-out to Monserrat  
11 Hernandez who spoke today. She's a neighborhood resident  
12 and a community organizer who has dedicated her life to  
13 empowering community members and seeking to achieve  
14 environmental justice. And we thank you to Ashley  
15 Valentin Gonzalez, young but so wise, and more involved  
16 than many, many people twice her age.

17           I would be remiss if I didn't shout-out our own  
18 Joy Williams, who has worked with the Environmental Health  
19 Coalition for many years, and as many of you know was a  
20 Haagen-Smit awardee in 2020. And she continued after her  
21 retirement to be the representative to the steering  
22 committee. And her dedication and expertise are really  
23 unparalleled. And her participation was really critical,  
24 I think, to the CERP's development.

25           APCD really deserves a special shout-out for

1 their persistence and flexibility honestly during this  
2 very difficult period. Everyone might not know that the  
3 San Diego Air Pollution Control District Board was  
4 completely transformed in March of 2021, as a result of  
5 the adoption of AB 423 in 2019. So in addition to the  
6 requirements -- to responding to the requirements of the  
7 Community Air Protection Program as a participant, the  
8 District staff were also tasked with transitioning their  
9 entire operation from the County of San Diego to an  
10 independent district, and all of this during the pandemic.

11 In March of 2021, an entirely new board, except  
12 for Board Member Fletcher, took their places and began  
13 work. County Supervisor Nora Vargas, as you heard from  
14 David Flores, assumed the Chair. And there was a  
15 transition also to a new Interim Air Pollution Control  
16 Officer, Paula Forbis. So we congratulate her and Nora  
17 and we wish both of them lots of luck and we look forward  
18 to working with both of them.

19 The CERP itself really is a model in a lot of  
20 ways. I think the District stepped up to the challenge of  
21 both the monitoring project and the CERP, and they created  
22 a process that was responsive to community requests for  
23 interpretations, for stipends, professional facilitation.  
24 And I want to thank Daniela Simunovic for her facilitation  
25 and to all of the District staff, particularly Domingo

1 Vigil, who managed the process so very well.

2           The CERP is far reaching, as you've heard, from  
3 land use, to transportation, to green space. And I want  
4 to point out that I think that these goals are somewhat  
5 unique, in that they're very focused on health metrics and  
6 have established cancer risk reduction goals for both  
7 individual stationary sources and cumulative risks for the  
8 Portside communities taken together.

9           And diesel PM is an important target, very, very  
10 focused on in the CERP, given the proximity of these  
11 communities to the Port of San Diego's two marine  
12 terminals, thus the name Portside. The CERP sets  
13 aspirational goals of reducing PM through the transition  
14 of trucks, ships, cargo handling equipment. And as you've  
15 heard already, I just want to add my voice to the --  
16 shout-out to the Port of San Diego, who just this week  
17 adopted a new Maritime Clean Air Strategy with the goal of  
18 transitioning a hundred percent of trucks servicing the  
19 port to ZEV by 2030, five years ahead of the Governor's  
20 Executive Order.

21           That's really a community victory. This has been  
22 the subject of community debate, discussion, demand. And  
23 it is -- it's coming forward now and what a good week it's  
24 turning out to be. So this action is really critical to  
25 enabling the CERP to be successful. And I think it's

1 really with clear eyes that the Port adopts this goal  
2 knowing that it will be challenging, but worth the effort.

3           So I also want to appreciate CARB and there's way  
4 too many staff to name off, but really express my  
5 appreciation to Liliana Nuñez and Karen Buckley, Vernon  
6 Hughes, Veronica Eady, and Andre Freeman who all really  
7 did a lot to bring this CERP to fruition. And I  
8 appreciate the extension that was granted by CARB. Thanks  
9 to Richard for granting that extension to San Diego APCD,  
10 given all of the transitions and the pandemic. I honestly  
11 believe that it's a much better product than it would have  
12 been, if it had been submitted a year ago.

13           So there's a lot to like in this plan. It's  
14 ambitious. It's innovative, but it won't mean anything if  
15 we don't stay focused and do the tough work that's ahead  
16 of us. And like every other CERP that's come forward,  
17 achieving these goals means reducing emissions, which will  
18 mean adopting new rules, accessing new technology,  
19 facilitating partner agreements, and ensuring that we're  
20 providing targeted assistance where it's needed the most.

21           As Monserrat said, we all know that the work  
22 isn't over. Today is just the beginning. So with that, I  
23 would be really honored to move the approval of the staff  
24 recommended resolution.

25           CHAIR RANDOLPH: Thank you.

1 Dr. Balmes.

2 BOARD MEMBER BALMES: Well, I just want to thank  
3 everyone involved in all the hard work that was put  
4 forward with regard to this CERP. And as someone who's  
5 been very interested in seeing AB 617 be successfully  
6 implemented, and no offense to any other CERP, or CSC,  
7 this CERP may be, you know, really benefited from that  
8 extra year.

9 I think many CERPs have been time challenged, but  
10 the degree of cooperation between community advocates,  
11 people in the air pollution control district, newly  
12 formed, you know, leaders like Supervisor Fletcher and  
13 Diane Takvorian, I'm just -- and the Port, as Diane has  
14 mentioned, playing, you know, a key partnership role, I'm  
15 in -- I'm tremendously impressed, both with the apparent  
16 cooperation among stakeholders and the product. You know,  
17 that -- I think that CERP is really tight. I know there's  
18 going to be a lot of hard work ahead to implement it, but  
19 I think it's achievable. It's aspirational, but  
20 achievable. And I really like the fact that it's tied to  
21 a health metric in terms of cancer reduction.

22 That's something that many community groups  
23 involved in other CERPs, you know, have wanted. And, you  
24 know, here, Portside is putting it to the test.

25 So I'm very happy to second Board Member

1 Takvorian's putting forward this resolution for adoption  
2 and really a hearty congratulations to all.

3 CHAIR RANDOLPH: Thank you.

4 Dr. Pacheco-Werner.

5 BOARD MEMBER PACHECO-WERNER: Yeah. Just a --  
6 just a really quick. (Spoke in Spanish)

7 You know, one of the -- one of the comments or  
8 things that I'm thinking about in this one in particular,  
9 just because it is -- it does involve communities that  
10 have been struggling very openly with gentrification, how  
11 we think about these plans in terms of how they intersect  
12 with that issue. And really, you know, there have been  
13 some past early studies about gentrification and  
14 emissions, but also more broadly just really how do we  
15 think about in the process of improving the emissions for  
16 these communities, that we're also thinking about the  
17 impacts of gentrification as well.

18 Thank you.

19 CHAIR RANDOLPH: Thank you.

20 Any other Board member comments?

21 Okay. I, too, want to thank everyone who worked  
22 on this plan. I am -- had the opportunity to steal  
23 Daniela Simunovic out of the private sector and bring her  
24 to my office here at CARB. And she has shared with me how  
25 much she appreciated all of the work of the community,

1 Domingo, and others who really put so much time and effort  
2 into this plan and the work of the different agencies that  
3 really helped build this.

4 So I appreciate that and I very much appreciate  
5 the points about implementation, and follow up, and making  
6 sure that we are taking a look at the annual reports, and  
7 doing what we can to ensure that there are implementation  
8 steps that are operationalized going forward. So I look  
9 forward to that effort.

10 So I believe we have a motion from Board Member  
11 Takvorian. And a second from Dr. Balmes.

12 Okay. The Board Clerk, will you please call the  
13 roll.

14 BOARD CLERK ESTABROOK: Dr. Balmes?

15 BOARD MEMBER BALMES: An enthusiastic aye.

16 BOARD CLERK ESTABROOK: Mr. De La Torre?

17 BOARD MEMBER DE LA TORRE: Aye.

18 BOARD CLERK ESTABROOK: Mr. Eisenhut?

19 BOARD MEMBER EISENHUT: Aye.

20 BOARD CLERK ESTABROOK: Supervisor Fletcher?

21 BOARD MEMBER FLETCHER: Fletcher, aye.

22 BOARD CLERK ESTABROOK: Senator Florez?

23 BOARD MEMBER FLOREZ: Florez, aye

24 BOARD CLERK ESTABROOK: Ms. Hurt?

25 BOARD MEMBER HURT: Aye.



1 BOARD CLERK ESTABROOK: Mr. Kracov?

2 BOARD MEMBER KRACOV: Great things happening in  
3 San Diego. Yes.

4 BOARD CLERK ESTABROOK: Dr. Pacheco-Werner?

5 BOARD MEMBER PACHECO-WERNER: Yes.

6 BOARD CLERK ESTABROOK: Mrs. Riordan?

7 BOARD MEMBER RIORDAN: Aye.

8 BOARD CLERK ESTABROOK: Supervisor Serna?

9 BOARD MEMBER SERNA: Aye.

10 BOARD CLERK ESTABROOK: Professor Sperling?

11 Ms. Takvorian?

12 BOARD MEMBER TAKVORIAN: Happily, aye. Thank  
13 you.

14 BOARD CLERK ESTABROOK: Vice Chair Berg?

15 VICE CHAIR BERG: A congratulatory aye.

16 BOARD CLERK ESTABROOK: Chair Randolph?

17 CHAIR RANDOLPH: Yes.

18 BOARD CLERK ESTABROOK: Madam Chair, the motion  
19 passes.

20 CHAIR RANDOLPH: All right. Thank you.

21 We will now move to open public comment. If you  
22 wish to provide a comment regarding an item of interest  
23 within the jurisdiction of the Board, but that is not on  
24 today's agenda, please raise your hand in Zoom or dial  
25 star nine, if you are on the phone.

1 Board Clerk.

2 BOARD CLERK ESTABROOK: We do not have anyone  
3 with their hands raised in Zoom currently, Chair.

4 CHAIR RANDOLPH: Okay.

5 Well, thank you.

6 That means that the October 14th, 2021 CARB Board  
7 meeting is now adjourned. Thank you all for your  
8 participation.

9 (Thereupon the Air Resources Board meeting  
10 adjourned at 5:14 p.m.)

CERTIFICATE OF REPORTER

I, JAMES F. PETERS, a Certified Shorthand Reporter of the State of California, do hereby certify:

That I am a disinterested person herein; that the foregoing California Air Resources Board meeting was reported in shorthand by me, James F. Peters, a Certified Shorthand Reporter of the State of California, and was thereafter transcribed, under my direction, by computer-assisted transcription;

I further certify that I am not of counsel or attorney for any of the parties to said meeting nor in any way interested in the outcome of said meeting.

IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set my hand this 17th day of October, 2021.



JAMES F. PETERS, CSR  
Certified Shorthand Reporter  
License No. 10063