AB 32 Environmental Justice Advisory Committee ("EJAC") June 12, 2025, Meeting Minutes¹

Meeting Attendance (*notes virtual attendance)

Committee Member Attendees:

- 1. Martha Dina Argüello*
- 2. Thomas Helme*
- 3. Matt Holmes
- 4. Luis Olmedo*
- 5. Jill Sherman-Warne*
- 6. Kevin Hamilton*
- 7. Juan Flores*
- 8. Rey Leon*

Committee Members not in Attendance:

- John Harriel Jr.
- John Kevin Jefferson III.
- Dr. Catherine Garoupa

CARB Attendees:

- Chanell Fletcher, Deputy Executive Officer for Equity, Communities and Environmental Justice
- Radhika Majhail, Branch Chief, Environmental Justice and Equity Branch
- Ashley Georgiou, Manager, Office of Environmental Justice, Tribal Affairs, and Border Relations
- Christabel Ukomadu, Equity Analyst, Office of Environmental Justice, Tribal Affairs and Border Relations
- Karina Jhaj, Air Pollution Specialist, Office of Environmental Justice, Tribal Affairs and Border Relations
- Donielle Jackson, Senate Bill (SB) 1137 Implementation Team, CARB
- Linda Echegaray, Senior Attorney, Legal Office, CARB

Other Attendees:

• Jane Harrington, Leading Resources (Facilitator)

¹ These minutes serve as a high-level summary of the meeting. They are not a verbatim transcript. Instead, they capture key topics, decisions, and directional insights from the discussion. To hear the full conversation in participants' own words, please see the meeting recording, available at <u>AB 32 Environmental Justice Advisory Committee Meeting | California Air Resources Board.</u>

Meeting Minutes

Agenda Item #1: Housekeeping and Logistics

A quorum of EJAC members was reached at 1:05 pm and the public meeting began. The facilitator made housekeeping announcements.

Agenda Item #2: EJAC Member Roll Call

The facilitator conducted EJAC member roll call. Seven EJAC members were present; four were absent. One member joined virtually during the committee discussion of Agenda Item #8 regarding the Natural and Working Lands Draft Resolution.

Agenda Item #3: Introductions and Opening Remarks

Opening remarks from EJAC Co-Chairs, including ground rules, meeting agreements, agenda overview.

EJAC Co-Chair Martha Dina Argüello reviewed the meeting agenda, changing the order of agenda items so that Agenda Item #8 would precede Agenda Item #7. She then reviewed the meeting agreements.

Welcome from CARB and acknowledgement of CARB participation.

Chanell Fletcher provided opening remarks. She noted that EJAC is a Bagley-Keene Open Meeting Act advisory body, working to adhere to Bagley-Keene requirements. CARB welcomes public comments, particularly as they relate to CARB programs and policies. EJAC meetings are intended to be respectful and at no time should there be comments that result in attacks on EJAC members, CARB staff, CARB board members, the chair, or public commenters.

Chanell also clarified in reference to the Draft Building Decarbonization Resolution and discussion in the May 2025 EJAC meeting that CARB's Zero Emission Space and Water Heating Standards are greenhouse gas emission reduction standards, not an energy efficiency standard, as had been noted in the draft resolution.

The updated Cap-and-Trade Program resolution will be discussed at the July 2025 EJAC meeting, and a vote will be facilitated at the August 2025 meeting.

In response to requests made by committee members at the April and May 2025 meetings, CARB acknowledged the commitment to seeking opportunities for codesigning policies on the AB 32-related programs, provided that the programs are at an early enough stage to allow co-design and development.

At the July 24, 2025, meeting, CARB will present its annual Assembly Bill 617 Program progress update to the Board, highlighting substantial emission reductions, innovative strategies, significant enforcement actions, and statewide mobile monitoring efforts. Kevin Olp, Branch Chief of the Office of Community Air Protection, will be on hand to answer questions.

EJAC Co-Chair Martha Dina Argüello continued with opening remarks:

Martha Dina Argüello stated that the purpose of this meeting was to review and revise the resolutions that will be voted on at the July 2025 meeting.

Agenda Item #4: April 17, 2025, EJAC Public Meeting Minutes

The facilitator, Leading Resources, introduced the topic and asked for discussion from the Committee.

EJAC member Matt Holmes stated that after reviewing Agenda #8 of the April meeting minutes EJAC Discussion on Assembly Bill 1757 Natural and Working Lands there should be a note reflecting his request for a formal response from either the California Natural Resources Agency or CARB regarding the advice provided by the Assembly Bill 1757 Expert Advisory Committee.

Agenda Item #5: Public Comment

Public comment was held on Agenda Item #4. No members of the public provided comments.

Agenda Item #6: EJAC Motion to Approve the April 17, 2025, EJAC Public Meeting Minutes

Matt Holmes added an edit to the minutes on Agenda #4, reading it into the record before the motion to approve.

EJAC member Jill Sherman-Warne motioned to approve the minutes. Kevin Hamilton seconded the motion. Voting members who were present voted to approve the motion. Seven members voted yes; four members were absent. The motion passed.

Agenda Item #8: EJAC Guest Speaker Presentation and Discussion on the Natural and Working Lands Draft Resolution (held out-of-order)

The guest speakers were not in attendance, so Matt Holmes led the discussion. He explained that the objective was to find alignment with the State's other strategic planning documents, allowing the State to fulfill multiple commitments with its climate investments and to protect people and places while hitting its carbon targets.

Matt Holmes stated that there are many co-benefits that the State is struggling to center in its dialogues with the experiences of disadvantaged communities across the State.

Martha Dina Argüello explained that they will be collaborating with experts from various organizations who can provide technical assistance and expertise about what to include in the resolution. She emphasized the importance of choosing regenerative methods that provide multiple co-benefits to communities over carbon capture and sequestration.

EJAC member Kevin Hamilton suggested that "State waters" be changed to "waters" or "water systems" in the first clause of the resolution. Matt Holmes explained that using "State waters" puts the onus on the State.

EJAC member Juan Flores suggested that the wording clearly states that natural carbon reduction methods are preferable to industrial carbon capture. He agreed with Matt Holmes' suggestion to add a separate clause that defines nature-based solutions.

Kevin Hamilton suggested that "naturally, effectively, and efficiently absorb and store carbon" be added to the first clause.

Matt Holmes suggested adding language about the continuity of natural systems and to the first clause. He suggested revising the third clause to add a social science attribution for its benefits to forest dependent communities. For the fourth clause, he recommended adding the need for fuel reduction measures.

Kevin Hamilton suggested adding forest management and fuel reduction to the fourth clause.

Matt Holmes recommended adding a clause about the need for forest specific management procedures that take local ecology into account.

Jill Sherman-Warne suggested that a clause be added to the resolution which acknowledges and incorporates traditional tribal practices for forest fire management. Matt suggested that he and Jill work together to draft a standalone clause to incorporate tribal practices including fire management practices and fuel reduction practices.

Martha Dina Argüello suggested that the value of recapturing tribal practices in addressing climate change could be added to the preamble.

Kevin Hamilton suggested changing the word "may" to "can" or "will" in the fourth clause.

Matt Holmes asked that committee members submit additional comments by June 20, 2025. He committed to coordinating two accelerated groups to draft two additional clauses related to tribal and borderland commitments.

Agenda Item #7: EJAC Discussion on the Building Decarbonization Draft Resolution

Martha Dina Argüello began the discussion by explaining that she had consulted with the Building Energy Equity and Power Coalition (BEEP) on the drafting of this resolution. She noted that it was designed specifically to include renters.

Radhika Majhail, Chief of CARB's Environmental Justice and Equity Branch, clarified Chanell's statement in Opening Remarks that CARB is working on Zero Emission Space and Water Heating Standards, not an appliance efficiency standard.

Martha Dina Argüello stated that her edited version of the draft resolution begins by thanking the CARB staff for having been inclusive and collaborative as they worked with environmental justice groups throughout California on equitable building decarbonization, as well as for its willingness to hear and to incorporate recommendations. She reiterated the importance of including renters in building decarbonization policies for maximum benefit.

Martha Dina Argüello also acknowledged a change in the document that adds a recommendation for CARB to coordinate with the California Public Utilities Commission (CPUC) and the California Energy Commission (CEC). A second recommendation is that CARB develop a guidance document to assist municipalities with issues related to rental housing evictions and displacement.

Martha Dina Argüello and Kevin Hamilton will collaborate on further editing the resolution which will be sent to CARB staff and then to committee members to review before the next meeting.

Agenda Item #9: Public Comment

Public comment was held on Agenda Items #8 and #7. No members of the public provided comments.

Agenda Item #10: CARB Presentation on Senate Bill 1137: Development of Performance Standards for Emission Detection Systems

Donielle Jackson of CARB's SB 1137 Implementation Team presented an overview of the work on developing performance standards for emission detection systems near oil and gas production wells and production facilities.

Martha Dina Argüello invited the speaker to share this presentation with the Stand LA Coalition and other environmental justice groups in the Los Angeles area. She raised concerns about the ability of testing equipment to detect chemical odorants that are toxic endocrine disruptors.

Kevin Hamilton asked how the sampling data that has already been collected and reported to the California Geologic Energy Management Division (CalGEM) can be connected to the emissions data related to SB 1137. He expressed concern that long-term site monitoring would be required for successful mitigation. He questioned the oil and gas industry's five-year timeline for implementation, expressing frustration with delays affecting community health. Linda Echegaray explained that the five-year deadline was set by the legislature and that CARB, as a regulatory agency, is required to implement that deadline.

Matt Holmes expressed concern that these operators will still be responsible for doing their own monitoring. He asked why remote sensing data from the methane satellite project is not currently being provided to the public. He suggested that there be public outreach to communities that are most encumbered with abandoned orphaned wells. Linda Echegaray, Senior Attorney in CARB's legal office, explained

that the satellite methane program is part of CARB's Oil and Gas Methane Regulation, not a part of SB 1137. Some raw data is now being collected and analyzed to determine the source, type, and location of the plumes with the results being sent to the operator and the district.

Matt Holmes stated that raw data should be available to the public. He asked if the individuals who had been injured because of the referendum delay had any legal recourse. Linda Echegaray explained that there is no law in place that would allow for that. She suggested continued discourse with local legislators who can change the laws.

Kevin Hamilton appreciated Linda Echegaray's presence at the meeting in her role as attorney but stated that experts should be on hand to answer the committee's questions when technical topics are presented. He also emphasized the need for raw data to be available to the public.

Martha Dina Argüello responded to Kevin Hamilton's request for a meeting with technical advisors regarding the satellite program by committing to organizing a meeting with technical experts, health experts, and community members to discuss the topic.

Linda Echegaray explained that once SB 1137 is implemented, data will be available from continuous detection systems, but that will not happen for at least five years.

Agenda Item #11: Public Comment

Public comment was held on Agenda Item #10. One member of the public provided comments.

Agenda Item #12: CARB Announcements

CARB provided reminders of upcoming meetings and events as they relate to AB 32 program implementation.

Christabel Ukomadu, Equity Analyst and EJAC staff in CARB's Office of Environmental Justice, Tribal Affairs, and Border Relations, presented upcoming meetings and events in June and July 2025. She stated that this list will be emailed to all EJAC members following the meeting.

Agenda Item #13: Next Steps and Closing Remarks

Martha Dina Argüello stated that the work groups would be finalizing both the Building Decarbonization and the Natural and Working Lands EJAC resolutions for the July 2025 meeting. She will organize a meeting with the SB 1137 team, community and technical experts, and other individuals who have worked on some of the reporting occurring through South Coast around chemicals that are used at drilling, to provide feedback on CARB's presentation on SB 1137.

Ashley Georgiou, Manager of CARB's Office of Environmental Justice, Tribal Affairs, and Border Relations, announced that Dr. Catherine Garoupa had provided a draft of the Cap-and-Trade Program resolution for the subgroup to complete review before the July 2025 meeting. She reminded the Committee that comments regarding the Natural and Working Lands resolution were due by June 20, 2025.

Matt Holmes invited the CARB staff to provide their technical expertise in the proposed resolutions.

Jane Harrington apologized for the technical difficulties that had occurred during the meeting and expressed her appreciation to the virtual attendees for their understanding.

The meeting was adjourned at 3:14 PM.