

September 3, 2024

Russell Brady  
Senior Associate  
Riverside County  
4080 Lemon Street, 12<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Riverside, California 92501  
[rbrady@rivco.org](mailto:rbrady@rivco.org)

*Sent via email*

Russell Brady:

Thank you for providing the California Air Resources Board (CARB) with the opportunity to comment on the Cajalco Commerce Center (Project) Draft Environmental Impact Report (DEIR), State Clearinghouse No. 2023060799. The Project proposes the construction and operation of 1,003,510 square feet of warehouse space and 13.33 acres of public park space. Approximately 150,526 square feet of the development would be used as cold storage. Once fully built out, the proposed Project would result in up to 2,886 daily vehicle trips along local roadways, including 438 daily truck trips.<sup>1</sup> The Project is proposed within Riverside County (County), California, which is the lead agency for California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) purposes.

CARB is concerned that the Project will expose nearby residential communities to elevated levels of air pollution beyond the existing baseline emissions at the Project site. Residences are located to the north, west, and southeast of the Project site, with the closest residence located within 150 feet north of the Project site. These residences are located near existing toxic diesel particulate matter (diesel PM) emission sources, which include existing industrial facilities, aircraft traffic from the March Reserve Base, rail traffic along existing rail lines, and vehicular traffic along Interstate 215.

The State of California has placed additional emphasis on protecting local communities from the harmful effects of air pollution through the passage of Assembly Bill 617 (AB 617) (Garcia, Chapter 136, Statutes of 2017). AB 617 is a significant piece of air quality legislation that highlights the need for further emission reductions in communities with high exposure burdens, like those in which the Project is located. Diesel PM emissions generated during the construction and operation of the Project would negatively impact neighboring communities.

---

<sup>1</sup> Riverside County. Cajalco Commerce Center Draft Environmental Impact Report. Page 4.3-48. Accessible at [https://ceqanet.opr.ca.gov/2023060799/2/Attachment/kC2R\\_V](https://ceqanet.opr.ca.gov/2023060799/2/Attachment/kC2R_V)

Through its authority under Health and Safety Code section 39711, the California Environmental Protection Agency (CalEPA) is charged with the duty to identify disadvantaged communities. CalEPA bases its identification of these communities on geographic, socioeconomic, public health, and environmental hazard criteria (Health and Safety Code, section 39711, subsection (a)); In this capacity, CalEPA currently defines a disadvantaged community, from an environmental hazard and socioeconomic standpoint, as a community that scores within the top 25% of the census tracts as analyzed by the California Communities Environmental Health Screening Tool Version 4.0 (CalEnviroScreen). CalEnviroScreen uses a screening methodology to help identify California communities currently disproportionately burdened by multiple sources of pollution. The census tract containing the Project is within the top 20% for Pollution Burden and is considered a disadvantaged community. The County must ensure that the Project does not adversely impact neighboring disadvantaged communities.

Industrial facilities, like the facilities described in the Project, can result in high volumes of heavy-duty diesel truck traffic, and operation of on-site equipment (e.g., forklifts and yard tractors) that emit toxic diesel emissions, and contribute to regional air pollution and global climate change.<sup>2</sup> To better address regional air pollution and global climate change, Governor Gavin Newsom signed Executive Order N-79-20 on September 23, 2020. The Executive Order states: "It shall be a goal of the State that 100% of in-state sales of new passenger cars and trucks will be zero-emission by 2035. It shall be a further goal of the State that 100% of medium and heavy-duty vehicles in the State be zero-emission by 2045 for all operations where feasible and by 2035 for drayage trucks. It shall be further a goal of the State to transition to 100% zero-emission off-road vehicles and equipment by 2035 where feasible." The Executive Order further directs the development of regulations to help meet these goals. To ensure that lead agencies, like the County, stay in step with evolving scientific knowledge to protect public health from adverse air quality and greenhouse gas impacts from the transportation sector, which serves as the basis of the Governor's Executive Order N-79-20, CARB staff urges the County to plan for the use of zero-emission technologies within the Project area as described in this letter.

---

<sup>2</sup> With regard to greenhouse gas emissions from this project, CARB has been clear that local governments and project proponents have a responsibility to properly mitigate these impacts. CARB's guidance, set out in detail in the Scoping Plan issued in 2022, explains that in CARB's expert view, local mitigation is critical to achieving climate goals and reducing greenhouse gases below levels of significance. CARB's 2022 Scoping Plan for Achieving Carbon Neutrality, published November 16, 2022, is available at [https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/2022-12/2022-sp\\_1.pdf](https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/2022-12/2022-sp_1.pdf)

## **The DEIR Used Incorrect Trip Lengths When Modeling the Project's Air Quality Impacts from Mobile Sources**

The City may have underestimated mobile source air pollutant emissions in the DEIR by relying on unrealistic truck trip lengths. According to the California Emissions Estimator Model (CalEEMod) input files presented in Appendix C1 (Air Quality Impact Analysis) of the DEIR, the Project's mobile air quality impacts were modeled assuming trucks would travel a distance of up to 36 miles. The County does not provide any substantial evidence in the DEIR explaining why this would be a conservative trip distance. Since trucks serving the Project may originate from the Ports of Long Beach and Los Angeles, which are approximately 73 miles from the Project site, CARB urges the City to use Project-specific truck trip distances in their air quality impact analysis. Unless the County re-evaluates or provides substantiation for the designated truck trip lengths, the Project should include a mitigation measure or project design feature that restricts trucks from traveling a distance greater than what was analyzed in the DEIR.

## **The County Used Inappropriate Assumptions When Modeling the Project's Health Risk Impacts**

The Health Risk Analysis (HRA) prepared for the Project and presented in Section 4.3 (Air Quality) of the DEIR concluded that residences near the Project site would be exposed to diesel PM emissions that would result in cancer risks of 1.95 chances per million during Project operations. Since the Project's cancer risks were below the South Coast Air Quality Management District's (SCAQMD) significance threshold of 10 chances per million, the DEIR concluded that the Project would have a less than significant impact on public health.

The County may have underestimated the Project's health risk impacts by assuming an idling duration for onsite heavy-duty trucks that is not supported by substantial evidence. The County assumed an idling duration of 15 minutes for onsite heavy-duty trucks when evaluating the Project's health risk impacts. CARB's Airborne Toxic Control Measure to Limit Diesel-Fueled Commercial Motor Vehicle Idling (ATCM) restricts trucks from idling longer than five minutes. However, the ATCM has an exemption for trucks equipped with a diesel engine meeting the optional nitrogen oxides (NOx) idling emissions standard when operating outside of 100 feet of a restricted area (e.g., residences, schools).<sup>3</sup> Because trucks starting with model year 2008+, are clean-idle certified, many of the trucks operating within the Project site could idle longer than five minutes. According to Table 4.4.2-5 of the EMFAC2021 Volume III Technical Document, heavy-duty trucks can idle for as long as approximately five hours in any one location.<sup>4</sup> To fully evaluate the Project's potential health

---

<sup>3</sup> CARB. Airborne Toxic Control Measure to Limit Diesel-Fueled Commercial Motor Vehicle Idling. Accessible at [https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/2022-06/13\\_CCR\\_2485\\_OAL\\_06222022-2\\_ADA\\_06272022\\_0.pdf](https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/2022-06/13_CCR_2485_OAL_06222022-2_ADA_06272022_0.pdf)

<sup>4</sup> CARB. EMFAC2021 Volume III Technical Document. Page 161. Table 4.4.2-5. Accessible at [https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/2021-03/emfac2021\\_volume\\_3\\_technical\\_document.pdf](https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/2021-03/emfac2021_volume_3_technical_document.pdf)

risk impacts, the County must either add a project design feature in the DEIR restricting heavy-duty truck idling within the Project site to less than 15 minutes or revise the Project's HRA to assume a heavy-duty truck idling duration supported by substantial evidence.

The County may have underestimated the Project's operational cancer risk impacts by not using conservative TRU idling durations in the Project's HRA. Based on CARB's review of the modeling methodology provided in the HRA of the DEIR, the County assumed TRUs on trucks and trailers would idle within the Project site for 30 minutes.<sup>5</sup> CARB has obtained survey data indicating trucks with TRUs can operate for as long as two hours while unloading and two hours while loading frozen goods from trucks and trailers, totaling four hours of onsite operation in cases where both loading and unloading take place within the same visit. To conservatively evaluate the Project's cancer risk impacts to residents near the Project site, the County should revise the HRA assuming each TRU visiting the Project site would idle for four hours per visit, or provide evidence to substantiate a 30-minute idling time.

## **The County Must Provide More Meaningful Mitigation Measures to Reduce the Project's Significant and Unavoidable Impact on Air Quality**

The County concluded in Section 4.3 (Air Quality) of the DEIR that the operation of the Project would result in a significant impact on air quality. According to Table 4.3-12 (Summary of Peak Operational Emissions (Without Mitigation)), the operation of the full buildout of the Project would emit as much as 64 pounds per day of NO<sub>x</sub>, which was found to exceed the SCAQMD's significance threshold and would result in a significant impact on air quality. To mitigate the Project's operational air quality impacts, the DEIR included seven mitigation measures (MM 4.3-1 through MM 4.3-7). These mitigation measures would require the installation of electric vehicle charging stations, use of electric onsite equipment, use of off-road equipment equipped with Tier 4 engines during Project construction, and all heavy-duty trucks to use 2010 or newer engines. After the implementation of these mitigation measures, the County concluded in the DEIR that the Project's air quality impact would result in a significant and unavoidable impact under CEQA.

The Project could be used for cold storage, which would result in trucks and trailers with transport refrigeration units (TRU) serving the proposed warehouse development.<sup>6</sup> TRUs on trucks and trailers can emit large quantities of diesel exhaust while operating within the Project site. Residences and other sensitive receptors (e.g., daycare facilities, senior care facilities, and schools) located nearby would be exposed to diesel emissions that would

---

<sup>5</sup> Riverside County. Cajalco Commerce Center Draft Environmental Impact Report. Appendix C2. Page 16. Accessible at <https://ceqanet.opr.ca.gov/2023060799/2/Attachment/VLvmUJ>

<sup>6</sup> TRUs are refrigeration systems powered by integral diesel engines that protect perishable goods during transport in an insulated truck and trailer vans, rail cars, and domestic shipping containers.

result in a significant cancer risk impact to the nearby community. To fully mitigate this potential health risk impact, CARB urges the County to include one of the following design measures in the Final Environmental Impact Report (FEIR):

- A Project design measure requiring contractual language in tenant lease agreements that prohibits tenants from operating diesel-powered TRUs within the Project site; or
- A condition requiring a restrictive covenant over the parcel that prohibits the applicant's use of diesel-powered TRUs on the property unless the applicant seeks and receives an amendment to its conditional use permit allowing such use.

CARB also urges the County include a mitigation measure in the DEIR that would require all heavy-duty trucks serving the Project to be zero-emission. A list of commercially-available zero-emission trucks can be obtained from the Hybrid and Zero-emission Truck and Bus Voucher Incentive Project (HVIP).<sup>7</sup> The HVIP is a part of California Climate Investments to incentivize the purchase of zero-emission trucks. Based on CARB's review of the zero-emission trucks listed in the HVIP, there are commercially available electric trucks that can meet the cargo transportation needs of individual industrial uses proposed in the County today. CARB has implemented or is developing regulations that will require the use of zero-emission trucks.

The list below details the CARB regulations that will result in the reduction of diesel PM and NOx emissions from trucks within California:

- **Drayage Truck Regulation:** The existing Drayage Truck Regulation requires all drayage trucks to operate with an engine that is a 2007 model year or newer.
- **Truck and Bus Regulation:** The Truck and Bus Regulation requires all trucks, including drayage, to have 2010 or newer model year engines by January 1, 2023.
- **Heavy-Duty Low-NOx Omnibus Rule:** The Heavy-Duty Low-NOx Omnibus Rule requires truck emission standards to be reduced from 0.20 to 0.05 grams per brake horsepower-hour (g/bhp-hr) from 2024 to 2026, and to 0.02 g/bhp-hr in 2027.
- **Advanced Clean Trucks Regulation:** The Advanced Clean Trucks Regulation, approved by CARB on June 25, 2020, requires manufacturers to start the transition from diesel trucks and vans to zero-emission trucks beginning in 2024. The rule is expected to result in about 100,000 zero-emission trucks in California by the end of 2030 and about 300,000 by 2035. The Advanced Clean Trucks regulation is part of CARB's overall approach to accelerate a large-scale transition to zero-emission medium-and heavy-duty vehicles. CARB approved amendments to the Advanced Clean Trucks regulation in March 2021; the amendments help ensure that more zero-emission vehicles are brought to market. CARB directed staff to ensure that fleets, businesses, and public entities that own or direct the operation of

---

<sup>7</sup> Zero-Emission Truck and Bus Voucher Incentive Project. Accessible at: <https://californiahvip.org/>

medium- and heavy-duty vehicles in California purchase and operate ZEVs to achieve a smooth transition to ZEV fleets by 2045 everywhere feasible, and specifically to reach:

- 100% zero-emission drayage trucks, last mile delivery, and government fleets by 2035
- 100% zero-emission refuse trucks and local buses by 2040
- 100% zero-emission capable utility fleets by 2040
- **Advanced Clean Fleets Regulation:** The Advanced Clean Fleets Regulation is part of CARB's overall strategy to accelerate a large-scale transition to zero-emission medium- and heavy-duty vehicles. This regulation works in conjunction with the Advanced Clean Trucks regulation. The regulation applies to trucks performing drayage operations at seaports and railyards, fleets owned by State, local, and federal government agencies, and high priority fleets. High priority fleets are those entities that own, operate, or direct at least one vehicle in California, and that have either \$50 million or more in gross annual revenue, or that own, operate, or have common ownership or control of a total of 50 or more vehicles. The regulation affects medium- and heavy-duty on-road vehicles with a gross vehicle weight rating greater than 8,500 pounds, off-road yard tractors, and light-duty mail and package delivery vehicles. All drayage trucks entering seaports and intermodal railyards would be required to be zero-emission by 2035.

With the implementation of the regulations listed above, specifically the Advanced Clean Trucks Regulation, tenants at the proposed industrial/warehouse development must begin the transition from diesel trucks and vans to zero-emission trucks. To help mitigate the Project's impact on air quality and public health, CARB urges the County to include contractual language in tenant lease agreements requiring future tenants to use zero-emission trucks during their operation in the FEIR.

## Conclusion

CARB is concerned about the Project's air quality and public health impacts. To fully assess the Project's impact on neighboring communities, the County must provide substantial evidence supporting the trip lengths used to estimate the Project air quality impacts. The County must also provide substantial evidence supporting the 15-minute heavy-duty truck and 30 minute TRU idling durations used to estimate the Project's health risk impacts. Lastly, County should include a mitigation measure in the FEIR that would require all heavy-duty trucks and TRUs serving the Project to be zero-emission to reduce the Project's air quality impacts.

CARB appreciates the opportunity to comment on the DEIR for the Project. Given the breadth and scope of projects subject to CEQA review throughout California that have air quality and greenhouse gas impacts, coupled with CARB's limited staff resources to

substantively respond to all issues associated with a project, CARB must prioritize its substantive comments here based on staff time, resources, and its assessment of impacts. CARB's deliberate decision to substantively comment on some issues does not constitute an admission or concession that it substantively agrees with the lead agency's findings and conclusions on any issues on which CARB does not substantively submit comments.

CARB staff can provide assistance with zero-emission technologies and emission reduction strategies, as needed. Please include CARB on your list of selected State agencies that will receive the FEIR. If you have questions, please contact Stanley Armstrong, Air Pollution Specialist via email at [stanley.armstrong@arb.ca.gov](mailto:stanley.armstrong@arb.ca.gov).

Sincerely,



Matthew O'Donnell, Chief, Risk Reduction Branch

cc: State Clearinghouse  
[state.clearinghouse@opr.ca.gov](mailto:state.clearinghouse@opr.ca.gov)

Yassi Kavezade, Organizer, Sierra Club  
[yassi.kavezade@sierraclub.org](mailto:yassi.kavezade@sierraclub.org)

Sam Wang, Program Supervisor, CEQA Intergovernmental Review, South Coast Air Quality Management District  
[swang1@aqmd.gov](mailto:swang1@aqmd.gov)

Morgan Capilla, NEPA Reviewer, U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Air Division, Region 9  
[capilla.morgan@epa.gov](mailto:capilla.morgan@epa.gov)

Stanley Armstrong, Air Pollution Specialist, Risk Reduction Branch