

SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT AND RELEASE

This SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT AND RELEASE (hereinafter "Agreement") is entered into between the STATE OF CALIFORNIA AIR RESOURCES BOARD (hereinafter "ARB") 1001 I Street, Sacramento, California 95814, and Hills Valley Transportation, Incorporated (hereinafter "HVT"), P.O. Box 297, Orange Cove, California 93646.

I. RECITALS

- (1) California Health and Safety Code (*H&SC*) Section 44011.6 established the Heavy Duty Vehicle Inspection Program (HDVIP). It authorizes ARB to inspect on-road heavy-duty vehicles for excessive smoke emissions and engine tampering and to issue citations, accordingly. The program also requires the vehicle owner to repair its engines that exceed the prescribed ARB smoke opacity standards, perform a post-repair opacity test, and submit proof of repairs and any assessed penalties under the regulations of the Heavy-Duty Smoke Inspection Program, Chapter 3.5, Sections 2180-2188, Title 13, California Code of Regulations (CCR).
- (2) *H&SC* Section 43701 provides that ARB shall adopt regulations that require owners or operators of heavy-duty diesel motor vehicles to perform regular inspections of their vehicles for excess smoke emissions.
- (3) Title 13, CCR sections 2190 et seq. were adopted under the authority of *H&SC* section 43701 and, with limited exceptions which are not applicable here, apply to all heavy-duty diesel powered vehicles with gross vehicle weight ratings greater than 6,000 pounds which operate on the streets or highways within the State of California.
- (4) Title 13, CCR sections 2190 et seq. authorize the Periodic Smoke Inspection Program (PSIP) which requires the owners and operators of California based vehicle fleets of two or more heavy duty diesel motor vehicles with gross vehicle weight ratings greater than 6,000 pounds which operate on the streets or highways within the State of California to conduct annual smoke opacity inspections of their vehicles that are four years older than the model year of the vehicle's engine.
- (5) Title 13, CCR section 2192(a) requires inter alia that the owner of the vehicle "[t]est the vehicle for excessive smoke emissions periodically according to the inspection intervals specified in section 2193(a), (b), and (c)", "[m]easure the smoke emissions for each test...", "[r]ecord the smoke test opacity levels and other required test information as specified in section 2194..." and "[k]eep the records specified in section 2194 for two years after the date of inspection."

SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT AND RELEASE

ARB and HVT

Page 2 of 10

- (6) H&SC Section 43016 states, "Any person who violates any provision of this part, or any order, rule, or regulation of the state board adopted pursuant to this part, and for which violation there is not provided in this part any other specific civil penalty or fine, shall be subject to a civil penalty of not to exceed five hundred dollars (\$500.00) per vehicle."
- (7) The ARB considers testing, measuring, recording, and recordkeeping to be critical components in reducing excessive smoke emissions from these heavy-duty vehicles.
- (8) ARB contends HVT failed to test, measure, record, and maintain records of smoke emissions from its fleet of heavy duty diesel vehicles for 2008 and 2009 in violation of Title 13, CCR Sections 2190 et seq.
- (9) Title 13, CCR section 2183 (c) states, "No 1974 or newer diesel powered heavy-duty commercial vehicle shall operate in California without evidence that, at the time of manufacture, the installed engine met emission standards at least as stringent as applicable federal emission standards for the model year of the engine. The ARB shall base its determination on whether an engine meets the above requirements by inspecting the Emission Control Label (ECL) affixed to the vehicle's engine."
- (10) Title 13, CCR section 2185 (a) (2) (B) after the first year from the effective date of the amended regulation, February 15, 2007, the owner shall receive a citation assessing the owner a \$300 penalty.
- (11) ARB has documented violations of the ECL Program.
- (12) ARB contends that if the facts described in recital paragraphs (1) – (11) were proven civil penalties could be imposed against HVT, as provided in H&SC section 43016.
- (13) HVT is willing to enter into this Agreement solely for the purpose of settlement and resolution of this matter with ARB. ARB accepts this Agreement in termination of this matter. Accordingly, the parties agree to resolve this matter completely by means of this Agreement, without the need for formal litigation, and therefore agree as follows:

SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT AND RELEASE

ARB and HVT

Page 3 of 10

II. TERMS & RELEASE

In consideration of the ARB not filing a legal action against HVT, for the violations referred to above, the ARB and HVT agree as follows:

(1) Upon execution of this Agreement, a civil penalty of eleven thousand, one hundred dollars (\$11,100.00) shall be made in check form as described below and the full amount shall be submitted as per agreed payment schedule:

- \$8,325.00 to the **California Air Pollution Control Fund**
- \$2,775.00 to the **Peralta Community College District**

ARB to receive by:

06/15/2012	First Payment
10/15/2012	Second Payment
02/15/2013	Third Payment
06/17/2013	Fourth Payment

- First payment is due on June 15, 2012, and shall be made in form of check payable to the **Peralta Community College District** in the amount of \$2,775.00.
- Second payment is due on October 15, 2012, and shall be made in the form of a check payable to the **California Air Pollution Control Fund** in the amount of \$2,775.00.
- Third payment is due on February 15, 2013, and shall be made in the form of a check payable to the **California Air Pollution Control Fund** in the amount of \$2,775.00.
- Fourth payment is due on June 17, 2013, and shall be made in the form of a check payable to the **California Air Pollution Control Fund** in the amount of \$2,775.00.

SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT AND RELEASE

ARB and HVT

Page 4 of 10

- Checks with the signed settlement agreement shall be sent to:

Mr. Aldo Chaney, Air Pollution Specialist
Air Resources Board, Enforcement Division
9480 Telstar Ave., Suite 4
El Monte, CA 91731

- (2) Effect of Untimely Payment or Performance. If any payment is more than 15 days late, the entire remaining balance becomes immediately due and payable. In addition, if the Attorney General files a civil action to enforce this settlement agreement, HVT shall pay all costs of investigating and prosecuting the action, including expert fees, reasonable attorney's fees, and costs.
- (3) It is agreed that if HVT, including its subsidiary or parent company, at any time becomes insolvent, or makes an assignment for the benefit of creditors or similar action adversely involving HVT, its subsidiary, or parent company, or a proceeding or petition under any bankruptcy, reorganization, arrangement of debt, insolvency, readjustment of debt, or receivership law or statute is filed by or against HVT, its subsidiary, or parent company, or a trustee in bankruptcy, custodian, receiver or agent is appointed or authorized to take charge of any of HVT, its subsidiary, or parent company's properties, or if any deposit account or other property of HVT, its subsidiary, or parent company be attempted to be obtained or held by writ of execution, garnishment, attachment, condemnation, levy, forfeiture or other legal process, or HVT, its subsidiary, or parent company takes any action to authorize any of the foregoing, the entire remaining balance becomes immediately due and payable without notice or demand.
- (4) It is further agreed that the penalties described in Terms and Release paragraph (1) are punitive in nature, rather than compensatory. Furthermore, the penalty is intended to deter and punish HVT for violations of state environmental statutes, and these penalties are payable to and for the benefit of ARB, a governmental unit. Therefore, it is agreed that these penalties imposed on HVT by ARB arising from the facts described in recital paragraphs (1) – (11) are non-dischargeable under 11 U.S.C § 523 (a) (7), which provides an exception from discharge for any debt to the extent such debt is for a fine, penalty or forfeiture payable to

SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT AND RELEASE
ARB and HVT
Page 5 of 10

and for benefit of governmental unit, and is not compensation for actual pecuniary loss, other than certain types of tax penalties.

- (5) HVT shall comply with one or both of the following options to attend the California Council on Diesel Education and Technology (CCDET I) class, (SAE J1667 Snap Acceleration Smoke Test Procedure for Heavy-Duty Diesel Powered Vehicles) as described on the ARB webpage at <http://www.arb.ca.gov/enf/hdvp/ccdet/ccdet.htm>. This class is conducted by various California Community Colleges and instructs attendees on compliance with the PSIP, ECL and the HDVIP.
- (a) HVT shall have the fleet maintenance manager (or equivalent) and all staff performing opacity tests for compliance with PSIP and the HDVIP attend the CCDET I class. Proof of CCDET I completion shall be provided to ARB within one year of the date of this Agreement and be maintained in each applicable employee's file for the term of his or her employment.
- (b) If HVT uses a contractor to perform the annual smoke opacity testing required under the PSIP, in addition to having the fleet maintenance manager (or equivalent) attend the CCDET I course, HVT shall obtain proof that the contractor's staff conducting the smoke opacity tests completed the CCDET course within the past four years. This proof of CCDET completion shall be provided to ARB with PSIP records as required by this Agreement and be maintained with the annual PSIP records.
- (6) HVT shall comply with one or both of the following options to attend the CCDET II class (Diesel Exhaust After Treatment and Maintenance), described on the ARB's webpage <http://www.arb.ca.gov/enf/hdvp/ccdet/ccdet.htm>. This class is conducted by various California Community Colleges and instructs attendees on California's emission regulations and the proper care and maintenance of exhaust after treatment systems (EATS).
- (a) HVT shall have the fleet maintenance manager (or equivalent) and all staff responsible for maintenance of EATS attend the CCDET II class. Proof of CCDET II completion shall be provided to ARB within one year of the date of this Agreement and also be maintained in each applicable employee's file for the term of his or her employment.

SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT AND RELEASE

ARB and HVT

Page 6 of 10

- (b) In case HVT uses a contractor for the maintenance of EATS, in addition to having the fleet maintenance manager (or equivalent) attend the CCDET II course; HVT shall obtain proof that the contractor's staff maintaining the EATS device(s) completed the CCDET II course within the last four years. This proof of the CCDET II completion shall be provided by HVT to the ARB within one year of the date of this settlement and be maintained with the EATS installation and maintenance records.
- (7) HVT shall provide copies of all PSIP compliance records for the 2012, and 2013 to ARB by January 31 of the following year. Copies shall be addressed to the attention of Mr. Aldo Chaney, Air Pollution Specialist, ARB Enforcement Division, 9480 Telstar Avenue, Suite 4, El Monte, CA 91731. The ARB reserves the right to visit any HVT fleet location at any time to conduct compliance audits for the HDVIP and PSIP, or any other applicable ARB program.
- (8) HVT shall complete Low NOx Software Upgrades (reflash) on all applicable heavy duty diesel engines operating in California and report back to the ARB, within 45 days of this Agreement.
- (9) Each 1974 or newer diesel powered heavy-duty commercial vehicle in the HVT fleet shall comply with the emission control label (ECL) requirements set forth in the CCR, Title 13, Section 2183 (c).
- (10) HVT shall instruct all employees who operate diesel fueled commercial vehicles to comply with the idling regulations set forth in CCR, Title 13, Section 2485, within 45 days of the execution of this agreement.
- (11) HVT shall not violate Health and Safety Code Sections 43701 et seq. and 44011.6 et seq., Title 13, CCR, Sections 2180 et seq., 2190 et seq., and 2485 et seq.
- (12) HVT shall comply with the Truck and Bus Regulation as codified in CCR, Title 13, Section 2025.
- (13) This Agreement shall apply to and be binding upon HVT, and its officers, directors, receivers, trustees, employees, successors and assignees, subsidiary and parent corporations and upon ARB and any successor agency that may have responsibility for and jurisdiction over the subject matter of this Agreement.

SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT AND RELEASE

ARB and HVT

Page 7 of 10

- (14) This Agreement constitutes the entire agreement and understanding between ARB and HVT concerning the subject matter hereof, and supersedes and replaces all prior negotiations and agreements between ARB and HVT concerning the subject matter hereof.
- (15) No agreement to modify, amend, extend, supersede, terminate, or discharge this Agreement, or any portion thereof, is valid or enforceable unless it is in writing and signed by all parties to this Agreement.
- (16) Severability. Each provision of this Agreement is severable, and in the event that any provision of this Agreement is held to be invalid or unenforceable, the remainder of this Agreement remains in full force and effect.
- (17) This Agreement shall be interpreted and enforced in accordance with the laws of the State of California, without regard to California's choice-of-law rules.
- (18) This Agreement is deemed to have been drafted equally by the Parties; it will not be interpreted for or against either party on the ground that said party drafted it.
- (19) **SB 1402 Statement**

Senate Bill 1402 (Dutton, Chapter 413, statutes of 2010) requires the ARB to provide information on the basis for the penalties it seeks (see Health and Safety Code section 39619.7). This information, which is provided throughout this settlement agreement, is summarized here

The manner in which the penalty amount was determined, including a per unit or per vehicle penalty.

Penalties must be set at levels sufficient to discourage violations. The penalties in this matter were determined in consideration of all relevant circumstances, including the eight factors specified in Health and Safety Code section 42403 and 43024.

PSIP Violations

The per vehicle penalty for the PSIP violations involved in this case is a maximum of \$500 per vehicle per violation per year. The penalty obtained for the PSIP violations involved in this case is \$375.00 per violation for 29 PSIP violations for a penalty of \$10,875.00 after considering all factors specified in 43024. The penalty reflects that fact these were unintentional first time violations and that HVT cooperated with the investigation.

ECL Violations

The per vehicle penalty for the labeling violations involved in this case is a maximum of \$300 per vehicle per violation. The penalty obtained for the ECL violations involved in this case is \$225.00 per violation for 1 ECL violations for a penalty of \$225.00 after consideration all factors specified in 43024. The penalty reflects that fact this was a unintentional first time violations and that HVT cooperated with the investigation.

The provision of law the penalty is being assessed under and why that provision is most appropriate for that violation.

PSIP Violations

The penalty provision being applied to the PSIP violations is H&SC section 43016 because HVT failed to test, measure, record and maintain records of smoke emissions from its fleet of heavy duty diesel vehicles for years 2008, and 2009 in violation of the PSIP regulation in Title 13, CCR sections 2190 et seq. for 29 violations. Since the PSIP regulation was adopted pursuant to authority granted in Part 5 of Division 26 of the H&SC and since there is no specific penalty or fine provided for PSIP violations in Part 5, H&SC section 43016 is applicable penalty provision.

ECL Violations

The penalty provision being applied for the ECL Program (Title 13, CCR, section 2180 et seq.) violations is Health and Safety Code section 44011.6 because HVT failed to affix emission control labels as required by Title 13, CCR section 2183 (c).

SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT AND RELEASE

ARB and HVT

Page 9 of 10

Is the penalty being assessed under a provision of law that prohibits the emission of pollution at a specified level, and, if so a quantification of excess emissions, if it is practicable to do so.

PSIP Violations

The provisions cited above do prohibit emissions above a specified opacity level. However, since the hours of operation of the non-compliant trucks involved and their individual emission rates are not known, it is not practicable to quantify the excess emissions.

ECL Violations

The penalty is not being assessed under a provision of law that prohibits the emission of pollution at a specified level.

- (20) HVT acknowledges that ARB has complied with SB 1402 in prosecuting or settling this case. Specifically, ARB has considered all relevant facts, including those listed at HSC section 43024, has explained the manner in which the penalty amount was calculated (including a per unit or per vehicle penalty, if appropriate), has identified the provision of law under which the penalty is being assessed and has considered and determined that this penalty is being assessed under a provision of law that prohibits the emission of pollutants at a specified level. However, since the hours of operation of the non-compliant trucks involved and their individual emission rates are not known, it is not practicable for ARB to quantify the excess emissions.
- (21) Penalties were determined based on the unique circumstances of this matter, considered together with the need to remove any economic benefit from noncompliance, the goal of deterring future violations and obtaining swift compliance, the consideration of past penalties in similar cases negotiation, and the potential costs and risk associated with litigating these particular violations. The penalty reflects violations extending over a number of days considered together with the complete circumstances of this case. The penalty was discounted in this matter based on the fact that this was a first time violation and the violator made unusually diligent efforts to comply and to cooperate with the investigation. Penalties in future cases might be smaller or larger on a per unit basis.

SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT AND RELEASE

ARB and HVT

Page 10 of 10

- (22) The penalty in this case was based in part on confidential business information provided by HVT that is not retained by ARB in the ordinary course of business. The penalty in this case was also based on confidential settlement communications between ARB and HVT that ARB does not retain in the ordinary course of business either. The penalty also reflects ARB's assessment of the relative strength of its case against HVT, the desire to avoid the uncertainty, burden and expense of litigation, obtain swift compliance with the law and remove any unfair advantage that HVT may have secured from its actions.
- (23) Now therefore, in consideration of the payment by HVT, in the amount of eleven thousand, one hundred dollars (\$11,100.00), ARB hereby releases HVT and its principals, officers, agents, predecessors and successors from any and all claims that ARB may have based on the facts and allegations described in recital paragraphs (1) – (11) above. The undersigned represent that they have the authority to enter into this Agreement.

California Air Resources Board

By: 

Name: James Ryden
Title: Chief Enforcement Division
Date: 6/11/12

Hills Valley Transportation,
Incorporated

By: 

Name: Ernie Hernandez
Title: President
Date: 6/5/12