

SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT AND RELEASE

This SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT AND RELEASE (hereinafter "Agreement") is entered into between the STATE OF CALIFORNIA AIR RESOURCES BOARD (hereinafter "ARB") 1001 I Street, Sacramento, California 95814, and GRAEBEL LOS ANGELES MOVERS, INC. (hereinafter "GRAEBEL LA"), 2095 California Avenue, Corona, California.

I. RECITALS

- (1) California Health and Safety Code (HSC) section 44011.6 established the Heavy Duty Vehicle Inspection Program (HDVIP). It authorizes ARB to inspect on-road heavy-duty vehicles for excessive smoke emissions and engine tampering and to issue citations, accordingly. The program also requires the vehicle owner to repair its engines that exceed the prescribed ARB smoke opacity standards, perform a post-repair opacity test, and submit proof of repairs and any assessed penalties under the Regulations of the Heavy-Duty Smoke Inspection Program, Chapter 3.5, sections 2180-2188, Title 13, California Code of Regulations (CCR).
- (2) HSC Section 43701 provides that ARB shall adopt regulations that require owners or operators of heavy-duty diesel motor vehicles to perform regular inspections of their vehicles for excess smoke emissions.
- (3) Title 13, CCR sections 2190 *et seq.* was adopted under the authority of HSC section 43701 and, with limited exceptions, which are not applicable here, apply to all heavy-duty diesel powered vehicles with gross vehicle weight ratings greater than 6,000 pounds that operate on the streets or highways within the State of California.
- (4) Title 13, CCR sections 2190 *et seq.* authorize the Periodic Smoke Inspection Program (PSIP) which requires the owners and operators of California based vehicle fleets of two or more heavy duty diesel motor vehicles with gross vehicle weight ratings greater than 6,000 pounds that operate on the streets or highways within the State of California to conduct annual smoke opacity inspections of their vehicles that are four years older than the model year of the vehicle's engine.
- (5) Title 13, CCR section 2192(a) requires *inter alia* that the owner of the vehicle "[t]est the vehicle for excessive smoke emissions periodically according to the inspection intervals specified in section 2193(a), (b), and (c)", "[m]easure the smoke emissions for each test...", "[r]ecord the smoke test opacity levels and other required test information as specified in section 2194..." and "[k]eep the records specified in section 2194 for two years after the date of inspection."
- (6) HSC section 43016 states, "Any person who violates any provision of this part, or any order, rule, or regulation of the state board adopted pursuant to this part, and for which violation there is not provided in this part any other specific civil penalty

SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT AND RELEASE

ARB and GRAEBEL LA

Page 2 of 6

or fine, shall be subject to a civil penalty of not to exceed five hundred dollars (\$500.00) per vehicle.”

- (7) The ARB considers testing, measuring, recording, and recordkeeping to be critical components in reducing excessive smoke emissions from these heavy-duty vehicles.
- (8) ARB contends GRAEBEL LA failed to test, measure, record, and maintain records of smoke emissions from its fleet of heavy-duty diesel vehicles for the years 2009 and 2010 in violation of Title 13, CCR sections 2190 *et seq.*
- (9) GRAEBEL LA is willing to enter into this Agreement solely for the purpose of settlement and resolution of this matter with ARB. ARB accepts this Agreement in termination of this matter. Accordingly, the parties agree to resolve this matter completely by means of this Agreement, without the need for formal litigation, and therefore agree as follows:

II. TERMS & RELEASE

In consideration of ARB not filing a legal action against GRAEBEL LA for the violations alleged above, ARB and GRAEBEL LA agree as follows:

- (1) Upon execution of this Agreement, GRAEBEL LA shall pay a civil penalty of **\$1,500.00**. Payment shall be made in check form as described below and the payments shall be submitted no later than **July 11, 2011**.

SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT AND RELEASE ARB AND GRAEBEL LA:

- **\$ 1,125.00** made out to **California Air Pollution Control Fund**
- **\$ 375.00** made out to **Peralta Community College District**

All payments and documents shall be sent to the attention of:

Ms. Cathi Slaminski
Air Resources Board, Enforcement Division
P.O. Box 2815
Sacramento, CA 95812

- (2) GRAEBEL LA shall not violate HSC sections 43701 *et seq.* and 44011.6 *et seq.* and Title 13, CCR sections 2180 *et seq.*, 2190 *et seq.*, and 2485 *et seq.*
- (3) GRAEBEL LA shall comply with one or both of the following options to attend the California Council on Diesel Education and Technology (CCDET) class, as described on the ARB webpage at <http://www.arb.ca.gov/enf/hdvp/hdvp.htm>. This

SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT AND RELEASE

ARB and GRAEBEL LA

Page 3 of 6

class is conducted by various California Community Colleges and instructs attendees on compliance with the PSIP and the HDVIP.

- (a) GRAEBEL LA shall have at least one staff member responsible for compliance with the PSIP and the HDVIP attend the CCDET class. Proof of CCDET completion shall be provided to ARB within one year of the date of this Agreement and shall be maintained in each applicable employee's file for the term of his or her employment, or as provided by GRAEBEL LA rules, regulations, codes, or ordinances, whichever is longer.
 - (b) If GRAEBEL LA uses a contractor to perform the annual smoke opacity testing required under the PSIP, GRAEBEL LA shall obtain proof that the contractor's staff conducting the smoke opacity tests completed the CCDET course within the past four years. This proof of CCDET completion shall be provided to ARB with PSIP records as required by this Settlement Agreement and shall be maintained with the annual PSIP records.
- (4) GRAEBEL LA shall comply with one or both of the following options to attend the CCDET II class (Diesel Exhaust After Treatment and Maintenance), described on the ARB's webpage at <http://www.arb.ca.gov/enf/hdvp/ccdet/ccdet.htm>. This class is conducted by various California Community Colleges and instructs attendees on California Compliance emission regulations and the proper care and maintenance of Verified Diesel Emission Control Strategies (VDECS).
- (a) GRAEBEL LA shall have at least one staff member responsible for maintenance of VDECS attend the CCDET II class. Proof of CCDET II completion shall be provided to ARB within one year of the date of this Agreement and shall also be maintained in each applicable employee's file for the term of his or her employment, or as provided by GRAEBEL LA, rules, regulations, codes, or ordinance, whichever is longer.
 - (b) In case GRAEBEL LA uses a contractor for the maintenance of VDECS, GRAEBEL LA shall obtain proof that the contractor's staff maintaining the VDECS completed the CCDET II course within the last four years. This proof of the CCDET II completion shall be provided be GRAEBEL LA to the ARB within one year of the date of this settlement and shall also be maintained with VDECS maintenance records.
- (5) Since 2011 records have already been submitted, GRAEBEL LA shall submit copies of all PSIP compliance records for 2012 to the ARB by January 31 of the following year. Copies shall be addressed to the attention of Ms. Cathi Slaminski at the California Air Resources Board, Enforcement Division, P.O. Box 2815, Sacramento, CA 95812. The ARB reserves the right to visit any GRAEBEL LA

SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT AND RELEASE

ARB and GRAEBEL LA

Page 4 of 6

fleet location at any time to conduct compliance audits for the HDVIP and PSIP, or any other applicable ARB program.

- (6) GRAEBEL LA shall complete Low NOx Software Upgrades (reflash) on all applicable heavy-duty diesel engines operating in California and report to the ARB within 45 days of this agreement.
- (7) Each 1974 or newer diesel powered heavy-duty vehicle in the GRAEBEL LA fleet shall comply with the emission control label (ECL) requirements set forth in the Title 13, CCR section 2183(c) within 45 days of this agreement.
- (8) GRAEBEL LA shall instruct all employees who operate diesel-fueled vehicles to comply with the idling regulations set forth in Title 13, CCR section 2485, within 45 days of this Agreement.
- (9) This Agreement shall apply to and be binding upon GRAEBEL LA, and its officers, directors, receivers, trustees, employees, successors and assignees, subsidiary and parent corporations and upon ARB and any successor agency that may have responsibility for and jurisdiction over the subject matter of this Agreement.
- (10) This Agreement constitutes the entire agreement and understanding between ARB and GRAEBEL LA, concerning the subject matter hereof, and supersedes and replaces all prior negotiations and agreements between ARB and GRAEBEL LA, concerning the subject matter hereof.
- (11) No agreement to modify, amend, extend, supersede, terminate, or discharge this Agreement, or any portion thereof, is valid or enforceable unless it is in writing and signed by all parties to this Agreement.
- (12) Severability. Each provision of this Agreement is severable, and in the event that any provision of this Agreement is held to be invalid or unenforceable, the remainder of this Agreement remains in full force and effect.
- (13) This Agreement shall be interpreted and enforced in accordance with the laws of the State of California, without regard to California's choice-of-law rules.
- (14) This Agreement is deemed to have been drafted equally by the Parties; it will not be interpreted for or against either party on the ground that said party drafted it.
- (15) Now, therefore, in consideration of the payment by GRAEBEL LA, in the amount of \$1,500.00, ARB hereby releases GRAEBEL LA and its principals, officers, directors, agents, subsidiaries, predecessors, and successors from any and all claims that ARB may have based on the facts and allegations described in recital

SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT AND RELEASE

ARB and GRAEBEL LA

Page 5 of 6

paragraphs (1) through (8) above. The undersigned represent that they have the authority to enter into this Agreement.

(16) **Senate Bill 1402**

Senate Bill 1402 (Dutton, Chapter 413, statutes of 2010) requires the ARB to provide information on the basis for the penalties it seeks (see HSC section 39619.7). This information, which is provided throughout this settlement agreement, is summarized here.

The manner in which the penalty amount was determined, including a per unit or per vehicle penalty.

Penalties must be set at levels sufficient to discourage violations. The penalties in this matter were determined in consideration of all relevant circumstances, including the eight factors specified in HSC sections 42403 and 43024.

PSIP Violations

The per vehicle penalty for the PSIP violations involved in this case is a maximum of \$500 per vehicle per violation. The penalty obtained for the PSIP violations involved in this case is \$1,500.00 for 2 vehicles, or \$375.00 per vehicle per violation. The penalty was discounted based on the fact that this was a first time violation and the violator made diligent efforts to comply and to cooperate with the investigation.

The provision of law the penalty is being assessed under and why that provision is most appropriate for that violation.

PSIP Violations

The penalty provision being applied to the PSIP violations is HSC section 43016 because GRAEBEL LA failed to test, measure, record, and maintain records of smoke emissions from its fleet of heavy duty diesel vehicles for the years 2009 and 2010, in violation of the PSIP regulation in Title13, CCR sections 2190 *et seq.*, for eleven vehicles. Since the PSIP regulation was adopted pursuant to authority granted in Part 5 of Division 26 of the Health and Safety Code and since there is no specific penalty or fine provided for PSIP violations in Part 5, HSC section 43016 is the applicable penalty provision.

Is the penalty being assessed under a provision of law that prohibits the emission of pollution at a specified level, and, if so a quantification of excess emissions, if it is practicable to do so.

SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT AND RELEASE

ARB and GRAEBEL LA

Page 6 of 6

The provisions cited above do prohibit emissions above a specified opacity or level of g/hp-hr. However, since the hours of operation of the non-compliant units involved and their individual emission rate are not known, it is not practicable to quantify the excess emissions.

- (17) GRAEBEL LA acknowledges that ARB has complied with SB1402 in prosecuting and settling this case. Specifically, ARB has considered all relevant facts, including those listed at HSC section 43024, has explained the manner in which the penalty amount was calculated, has identified the provision of law under which the penalty is being assessed and has considered and determined that this penalty is being assessed under a provision of law that prohibits the emission of pollutants at a specified level.
- (18) Penalties were determined based on the unique circumstances of this matter, considered together with the need to remove any economic benefit from noncompliance, the goal of deterring future violations and obtaining swift compliance, the consideration of past penalties in similar cases, and the potential costs and risk associated with litigating these particular violations. Penalties in future cases might be smaller or larger on a per unit/vehicle basis.
- (19) The penalty was based on confidential settlement communications between ARB and GRAEBEL LA that ARB does not retain in the ordinary course of business either. The penalty is the product of an arms length negotiation between ARB and GRAEBEL LA and reflects ARB's assessment of the relative strength of its case against GRAEBEL LA, the desire to avoid the uncertainty, burden and expense of litigation, obtain swift compliance with the law and remove any unfair advantage that GRAEBEL LA may have secured from its actions.

California Air Resources Board

Graebel Los Angeles Movers, Inc.

By: _____

By: _____

Name: James R. Ryden

Name: Randy Rogers

Title: Chief, Enforcement Division

Title: OPERATIONS MANAGER

Date: 7/20/11

Date: 6/27/2011