

## SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT AND RELEASE

This SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT AND RELEASE (hereinafter "Agreement") is entered into between the STATE OF CALIFORNIA AIR RESOURCES BOARD (hereinafter "ARB") 1001 I Street, Sacramento, California 95814, and LEGEND TRANSPORTATION INCORPORATED (hereinafter "LEGEND"), 2920-B Colusa Hwy Road, PO Box 712, Yuba City, CA 95992.

### I. RECITALS

- (1) California Health and Safety Code (*H&SC*) Section 44011.6 established the Heavy Duty Vehicle Inspection Program (HDVIP). It authorizes ARB to inspect on-road heavy-duty vehicles for excessive smoke emissions and engine tampering and to issue citations, accordingly. The program also requires the vehicle owner to repair its engines that exceed the prescribed ARB smoke opacity standards, perform a post-repair opacity test, and submit proof of repairs and any assessed penalties under the Regulations of the Heavy-Duty Smoke Inspection Program, Chapter 3.5, Sections 2180-2188, Title 13, California Code of Regulations (CCR).
- (2) *H&SC* Section 43701 provides that ARB shall adopt regulations that require owners or operators of heavy-duty diesel motor vehicles to perform regular inspections of their vehicles for excess smoke emissions.
- (3) Title 13, CCR sections 2190 et seq. were adopted under the authority of *H&SC* section 43701 and, with limited exceptions which are not applicable here, apply to all heavy-duty diesel powered vehicles with gross vehicle weight ratings greater than 6,000 pounds which operate on the streets or highways within the State of California.
- (4) Title 13, CCR sections 2190 et seq. authorize the Periodic Smoke Inspection Program (PSIP) which requires the owners and operators of California based vehicle fleets of two or more heavy duty diesel motor vehicles with gross vehicle weight ratings greater than 6,000 pounds which operate on the streets or highways within the State of California to conduct annual smoke opacity inspections of their vehicles that are four years older than the model year of the vehicle's engine.
- (5) Title 13, CCR section 2192(a) requires inter alia that the owner of the vehicle "[t]est the vehicle for excessive smoke emissions periodically according to the inspection intervals specified in section 2193(a), (b), and (c)", "[m]easure the smoke emissions for each test...", "[r]ecord the smoke test opacity levels and other required test information as specified in section 2194..." and "[k]eep the records specified in section 2194 for two years after the date of inspection."

- (6) H&SC Section 43016 states, "Any person who violates any provision of this part, or any order, rule, or regulation of the state board adopted pursuant to this part, and for which violation there is not provided in this part any other specific civil penalty or fine, shall be subject to a civil penalty of not to exceed five hundred dollars (\$500.00) per vehicle."
- (7) The ARB considers testing, measuring, recording, and recordkeeping to be critical components in reducing excessive smoke emissions from these heavy-duty vehicles.
- (8) ARB contends LEGEND failed to test, measure, record, and maintain records of smoke emissions from its fleet of heavy duty diesel vehicles for the years of 2012 and 2013 in violation of Title 13, CCR Sections 2190 et seq.
- (9) In order to resolve these alleged violations, LEGEND has taken, or agreed to take, the actions enumerated below under "TERMS & RELEASE". Further, the ARB accepts this Agreement in termination and settlement of this matter.
- (10) In consideration of the foregoing, and of the promises and facts set forth herein, the parties desire to settle and resolve all claims, disputes, and obligations relating to the above-listed violations, and voluntarily agree to resolve this matter by means of this Agreement. Specifically, the ARB and LEGEND agree as follows:

## II. TERMS & RELEASE

In consideration of ARB not filing a legal action against LEGEND, for the violations alleged above, and LEGEND'S payment of the penalties set forth in Section 1 below, ARB and LEGEND agree as follows:

- (1) Upon execution of this Agreement, LEGEND shall pay a civil penalty of \$19,125.00. Payment shall be made in 4 quarterly payments as described below, beginning on **August 15, 2014**.

### SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT AND RELEASE ARB AND LEGEND TRANSPORTATION INCORPORATED:

**Payment Due Date:**

August 15, 2014  
November 14, 2014  
February 13, 2015  
May 15, 2015

**In the Amount of and Paid to:**

**\$4,782.00** paid to **Peralta Colleges Foundation**  
**\$4,781.00** paid to **Air Pollution Control Fund**  
**\$4,781.00** paid to **Air Pollution Control Fund**  
**\$4,781.00** paid to **Air Pollution Control Fund**

**Please send the signed Settlement Agreement and any future mailings or documents required per the terms of this Settlement Agreement to:**

**Mr. Sidney Lau/Air Resources Engineer  
Air Resources Board, Enforcement Division  
P.O. Box 2815  
Sacramento, CA 95812**

**Please submit each payment by the applicable payment due date along with the corresponding "Settlement Agreement Payment Transmittal Form" (Attachment A) to:**

**California Air Resources Board  
Accounting Office  
P.O. Box 1436  
Sacramento, CA 95812-1436**

- (2) Effect of Untimely Payment. If any payment is more than 15 days late, the entire remaining balance becomes immediately due and payable. In addition, if the Attorney General files a civil action to enforce this settlement agreement, LEGEND shall pay all costs of investigating and prosecuting the action, including expert fees, reasonable attorney's fees and costs.
- (3) It is agreed that if LEGEND, including its subsidiary or parent company, at any time becomes insolvent, or makes an assignment for the benefit of creditors or similar action adversely involving LEGEND, its subsidiary, or parent company, or a proceeding or petition under any bankruptcy, reorganization, arrangement of debt, insolvency, readjustment of debt, or receivership law or statute is filed by or against LEGEND, its subsidiary, or parent company, or a trustee in bankruptcy, custodian, receiver or agent is appointed or authorized to take charge of any of LEGEND'S, its subsidiary, or parent company's properties, or if any deposit account or other property of LEGEND, its subsidiary, or parent company be attempted to be obtained or held by writ of execution, garnishment, attachment, condemnation, levy, forfeiture or other legal process, or LEGEND, its subsidiary, or parent company takes any action to authorize any of the foregoing, the entire remaining balance becomes immediately due and payable without notice or demand.
- (4) It is further agreed that the penalties described in "Terms and Release", paragraph 1 are punitive in nature, rather than compensatory. Furthermore, the penalty is intended to deter and punish LEGEND for violations of state environmental statutes, and these penalties are payable

to and for the benefit of ARB, a governmental unit. Therefore, it is agreed that these penalties imposed on LEGEND by ARB arising from the facts described in recital paragraphs (1) through (9) are non-dischargeable under 11 United States Code § 523 (a)(7), which provides an exception from discharge for any debt to the extent such debt is for a fine, penalty or forfeiture payable to and for benefit of governmental unit, and is not compensation for actual pecuniary loss, other than certain types of tax penalties.

- (5) LEGEND shall not violate HSC sections 43701 *et seq.*, 44011.6 *et seq.*, and title 13 CCR, sections 2183, 2190 *et seq.*, and 2485 *et seq.*
- (6) LEGEND shall comply with one or both of the following options to attend the California Council on Diesel Education and Technology (CCDET I) class (SAE J1667 Snap Acceleration Smoke Test Procedure for Heavy-Duty Diesel Powered Vehicles) as described on the ARB webpage at <http://www.arb.ca.gov/enf/hdvip/ccdet/ccdet.htm>. This class is conducted by various California Community Colleges and instructs attendees on compliance with the PSIP, ECL and the HDVIP.
  - (a) LEGEND shall have the fleet maintenance manager (or equivalent) and all staff performing opacity tests for compliance with PSIP and the HDVIP attend the CCDET I class. Proof of CCDET I completion shall be provided to ARB within six months of the date of this Agreement and be maintained in each applicable employee's file for the term of his or her employment.
  - (b) If LEGEND uses a contractor to perform the annual smoke opacity testing required under the PSIP, in addition to having the fleet maintenance manager (or equivalent) attend the CCDET I course, LEGEND shall obtain proof that the contractor's staff conducting the smoke opacity tests completed the CCDET I course within the past four years. This proof of CCDET I completion shall be provided to ARB with PSIP records as required by this Agreement and be maintained with the annual PSIP records.
- (7) LEGEND shall comply with one or both of the following options to attend the CCDET II class (Diesel Exhaust After Treatment and Maintenance), described on the ARB's webpage <http://www.arb.ca.gov/enf/hdvip/ccdet/ccdet.htm>. This class is conducted by various California Community Colleges and instructs attendees on California's emission regulations and the proper care and maintenance of diesel exhaust after treatment systems (DEATS).

- (a) LEGEND shall have the fleet maintenance manager (or equivalent) and all staff responsible for maintenance of DEATS attend the CCDET II class. Proof of CCDET II completion shall be provided to ARB within six months of the date of this Agreement and also be maintained in each applicable employee's file for the term of his or her employment.
  - (b) In case LEGEND uses a contractor for the maintenance of DEATS, in addition to having the fleet maintenance manager (or equivalent) attend the CCDET II course, LEGEND shall obtain proof that the contractor's staff maintaining the DEATS device(s) completed the CCDET II course within the last four years. This proof of the CCDET II completion shall be provided by LEGEND to the ARB within six months of the date of this settlement and be maintained with the DEATS installation and maintenance records.
- (8) LEGEND shall submit copies of all PSIP compliance records for 2014 and 2015 to the ARB by January 31 of the following year. **Copies shall be addressed to the attention of Mr. Sidney Lau, ARB, P.O. Box 2815, Sacramento, CA 95812.** The ARB reserves the right to visit any LEGEND fleet location at any time to conduct compliance audits for the HDVIP and PSIP, or any other applicable ARB program.
  - (9) LEGEND shall complete Low NOx Software Upgrades (reflash) on all applicable heavy-duty diesel engines operating in California and report to the ARB within 45 days of this agreement.
  - (10) Each 1974 or newer diesel powered heavy-duty commercial vehicle in LEGEND's fleet shall maintain compliance with the emission control label (ECL) requirements set forth in the CCR, Title 13, Section 2183(c), within 45 days of this agreement.
  - (11) LEGEND shall instruct all employees who operate diesel fueled commercial vehicles to comply with the idling regulations set forth in CCR, Title 13, Section 2485, within 45 days of this Agreement.
  - (12) LEGEND shall not violate the Truck and Bus Regulation as codified in Title 13 CCR, Section 2025.
  - (13) This Agreement shall apply to and be binding upon LEGEND, and its officers, directors, receivers, trustees, employees, successors and assignees, subsidiary and parent corporations and upon ARB and any successor agency that may have responsibility for and jurisdiction over the subject matter of this Agreement.

- (14) This Agreement constitutes the entire agreement and understanding between ARB and LEGEND, concerning the subject matter hereof, and supersedes and replaces all prior negotiations and agreements between ARB and LEGEND, concerning the subject matter hereof.
- (15) No agreement to modify, amend, extend, supersede, terminate, or discharge this Agreement, or any portion thereof, is valid or enforceable unless it is in writing and signed by all parties to this Agreement.
- (16) Severability. Each provision of this Agreement is severable, and in the event that any provision of this Agreement is held to be invalid or unenforceable, the remainder of this Agreement remains in full force and effect.
- (17) This Agreement shall be interpreted and enforced in accordance with the laws of the State of California, without regard to California's choice-of-law rules.
- (18) This Agreement is deemed to have been drafted equally by the Parties; it will not be interpreted for or against either party on the ground that said party drafted it.
- (19) Senate Bill 1402 (Dutton, Chapter 413, statutes of 2010) requires the ARB to provide information on the basis for the penalties it seeks (see Health and Safety Code section 39619.7). This information, which is provided throughout this settlement agreement, is summarized here.

**The manner in which the penalty amount was determined, including a per unit or per vehicle penalty.**

Penalties must be set at levels sufficient to discourage violations. The penalties in this matter were determined in consideration of all relevant circumstances, including the eight factors specified in Health and Safety Code sections 42403 and 43024.

Periodic Smoke Inspection Program Violations

The per vehicle penalty for the PSIP violations involved in this case is a maximum of \$500 per vehicle per violation per year. The penalty obtained for the PSIP violations involved in this case is \$19,125 for 51 violations, or \$375 per vehicle per violation.

**The provision of law the penalty is being assessed under and why that provision is most appropriate for that violation.**

Periodic Smoke Inspection Program Violations

The penalty provision being applied to the PSIP violations is Health and Safety Code section 43016 because LEGEND failed to test, measure, record, and maintain records of smoke emissions from its fleet of heavy duty diesel vehicles for the years 2012 and 2013 in violation of the PSIP regulation in Title 13, CCR Sections 2190 et seq, for 51 vehicles. Since the PSIP regulation was adopted pursuant to authority granted in Part 5 of Division 26 of the Health and Safety Code and since there is no specific penalty or fine provided for PSIP violations in Part 5, Health and Safety Code section 43016 is the applicable penalty provision.

**Is the penalty being assessed under a provision of law that prohibits the emission of pollution at a specified level, and, if so a quantification of excess emissions, if it is practicable to do so.**

Periodic Smoke Inspection Program Violations

The PSIP provisions cited above do prohibit emissions above a specified opacity or level of g/hp-hr. However, since the hours of operation of the non-compliant trucks involved and their individual emission rates are not known, it is not practicable to quantify the excess emissions.

- (20) LEGEND acknowledges that ARB has complied with SB 1402 in prosecuting or settling this case. Specifically, ARB has considered all relevant facts, including those listed at HSC section 43024, has explained the manner in which the penalty amount was calculated, has identified the provision of law under which the penalty is being assessed and has considered and determined that this penalty is being assessed under a provision of law that prohibits the emission of pollutants at a specified level.
- (21) Penalties were determined based on the unique circumstances of this matter, considered together with the need to remove any economic benefit from noncompliance, the consideration of past penalties in similar cases, and the potential costs and risk associated with litigating these particular violations. Penalties in further cases might be smaller or larger on a per unit basis.
- (22) The penalty was based on confidential settlement communications between ARB and LEGEND that ARB does not retain in the ordinary course of business either. The penalty is the product of an arms length negotiation between ARB and LEGEND and reflects ARB's assessment of the relative strength of its case against LEGEND, the desire to avoid the uncertainty, burden and expense of litigation, obtain swift compliance with

the law and remove any unfair advantage that LEGEND may have secured from its actions.

(23) Now therefore, in consideration of the payment on behalf of LEGEND to the Air Pollution Control Fund and the Peralta Colleges Foundation, the ARB hereby releases LEGEND and their principals, officers, agents, predecessors and successors from any and all claims, the ARB may have or have in the future based on the circumstances described in paragraph (1) through (9) of the Recitals. The undersigned represent that they have the authority to enter into this Agreement.

**California Air Resources Board**

By: Ellen M. Peter

Name: Ellen M. Peter

Title: Chief Counsel

Date: 10/2/2014

**Legend Transportation  
Incorporated**

By: Bobby K. Samard

Name: Bobby K. Samard

Title: Manager

Date: 9/30/14