

SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT AND RELEASE

This SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT AND RELEASE (hereinafter "Agreement") is entered into between the STATE OF CALIFORNIA AIR RESOURCES BOARD (hereinafter "ARB") 1001 I Street, Sacramento, California 95814, and G. B. SERVICES, INC. (hereinafter "G.B.SERVICES"), 904 South Vail Avenue, Montebello, California 90640.

I. RECITALS

- (1) California Health and Safety Code section 44011.6 (HSC § 44011.6) established the Heavy-Duty Vehicle Inspection Program (HDVIP). It authorizes ARB to inspect on-road heavy-duty vehicles for excessive smoke emissions and engine tampering and to issue citations accordingly. The program also requires the vehicle owner to repair its engines that exceed the prescribed ARB smoke opacity standards, perform a post-repair opacity test, and submit proof of repairs and any assessed penalties under the regulations of the HDVIP, chapter 3.5, California Code of Regulations, title 13, sections 2180-2188 (13 CCR §§ 2180-2188).
- (2) HSC § 43701 provides that ARB shall adopt regulations that require owners or operators of heavy-duty diesel motor vehicles to perform regular inspections of their vehicles for excessive smoke emissions.
- (3) 13 CCR § 2190 *et seq.* were adopted under the authority of HSC § 43701 and, with limited exceptions, which are not applicable here, apply to all heavy-duty diesel powered vehicles with gross vehicle weight ratings greater than 6,000 pounds that operate on the streets or highways within the State of California.
- (4) 13 CCR § 2190 *et seq.* authorize the Periodic Smoke Inspection Program (PSIP) which requires the owners and operators of California based vehicle fleets of two or more heavy-duty diesel motor vehicles with gross vehicle weight ratings greater than 6,000 pounds that operate on the streets or highways within the State of California to conduct annual smoke opacity inspections of their vehicles equipped with engines that are four years old or older.
- (5) 13 CCR § 2192(a) requires inter alia that the owner of the vehicle "[t]est the vehicle for excessive smoke emissions periodically according to the inspection intervals specified in section 2193(a), (b), and (c)", "[m]easure the smoke emissions for each test...", "[r]ecord the smoke test opacity levels and other required test information as specified in section 2194..." and "[k]eep the records specified in section 2194 for two years after the date of inspection."
- (6) HSC § 43016 states, "Any person who violates any provision of this part, or any order, rule, or regulation of the state board adopted pursuant to this part, and for which there is not provided in this part any other specific civil penalty or fine, shall

SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT AND RELEASE

ARB and G. B. SERVICES, INC.

Page 2 of 9

be subject to a civil penalty of not to exceed five hundred dollars (\$500) per vehicle."

- (7) ARB considers testing, measuring, recording, and recordkeeping to be critical components in reducing excessive smoke emissions from these heavy-duty vehicles.
- (8) ARB contends G. B. SERVICES failed to test, measure, record, and maintain records of smoke emissions for its fleet of heavy-duty diesel vehicles for years 2014 and 2015 in violation of 13 CCR § 2190 *et seq.*
- (9) Under authority of HSC §§ 39601 and 39660, 13 CCR § 2020 *et seq.* requires owners of diesel fueled solid waste collection vehicles (SWCV) over 14,000 pounds gross vehicle weight with model-year engines from 1960 to 2006 used to collect solid waste to use Best Available Control Technology (BACT) for each SWCV in the active fleet. Records of the installed diesel emission control strategies and corresponding compliance plan must be accessible at the terminal. Each SWCV must have a legible and durable label with complete and accurate information affixed to the driver's side doorjamb or another readily accessible location known to the driver.
- (10) ARB Enforcement Division contends that G. B. SERVICES failed to install BACT to SWCVs in its fleet according to the implementation schedule outlined in 13 CCR § 2021 *et seq.* at their terminal in Montebello, California.
- (11) HSC §§ 39674(a) and (b) authorize civil penalties for the violation of the programs for the regulation of toxic air contaminants not to exceed one thousand dollars (\$1,000) or not to exceed ten thousand dollars (\$10,000) respectively, for each day in which the violation occurs.
- (12) In order to resolve these alleged violations, G. B. SERVICES has taken, or agreed to take, the actions enumerated below under "RELEASE". Further, ARB accepts this Agreement in termination and settlement of this matter.
- (13) In consideration of the foregoing, and of the promises and facts set forth herein, the parties desire to settle and resolve all claims, disputes, and obligations relating to the above-listed violations, and voluntarily agree to resolve this matter by means of this Agreement. Specifically, ARB and G. B. SERVICES agree as follows:

II. TERMS AND RELEASE

In consideration of ARB not filing a legal action against G. B. SERVICES for the alleged violations referred to above, and G. B. SERVICES's payment of the

penalties set forth in Section 1 below, ARB and G. B. SERVICES agree as follows:

- (1) Upon execution of this Agreement, G. B. SERVICES shall pay a civil penalty of \$18,375. Payment shall be made in four payments as described below, beginning on **October 10, 2016**.

Payment Due Date:	In the Amount of and Payable to:	
October 10, 2016	\$1,000	the Peralta Colleges Foundation
November 10, 2016	\$1,000	the Peralta Colleges Foundation
December 13, 2016	\$1,000	the Peralta Colleges Foundation
January 10, 2017	\$1,000	the Peralta Colleges Foundation
February 10, 2017	\$590	the Peralta Colleges Foundation
April 7, 2017	\$6,800	the Air Pollution Control Fund
June 9, 2017	\$6,985	the Air Pollution Control Fund

Please send the signed Settlement Agreement and any future mailings or documents required per the terms of this Settlement Agreement to:

**Mr. Stephen Binning
California Air Resources Board
Enforcement Division
P.O. Box 2815
Sacramento, California 95812**

Please submit each payment by the applicable payment due date along with the corresponding "Settlement Agreement Payment Transmittal Form" (Attachment A) to:

**California Air Resources Board
Accounting Office
P.O. Box 1436
Sacramento, California 95812-1436**

- (2) **Effect of Untimely Payment.** If any payment is more than 15 days late, the entire remaining balance becomes immediately due and payable. In addition, if the Attorney General files a civil action to enforce this settlement agreement, G. B. SERVICES shall pay all costs of investigating and prosecuting the action, including expert fees, reasonable attorney's fees, and costs.
- (3) It is agreed that if G. B. SERVICES, including its subsidiary or parent company, at any time becomes insolvent, or makes an assignment for the benefit of creditors or similar action adversely involving G. B. SERVICES, its subsidiary, or

SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT AND RELEASE

ARB and G. B. SERVICES, INC.

Page 5 of 9

obtain proof that the contractor's staff conducting the smoke opacity tests completed the CCDET I course within the past four years. This proof of CCDET I completion shall be provided to ARB with PSIP records as required by this Agreement and be maintained with the annual PSIP records.

- (7) G. B. SERVICES shall comply with the following options to attend the CCDET II class (Diesel Exhaust After Treatment and Maintenance), described on the ARB's webpage <http://www.arb.ca.gov/enf/hdvip/ccdet/ccdet.htm>. This class is conducted by various California Community Colleges and instructs attendees on California's emission regulations and the proper care and maintenance of diesel exhaust after-treatment systems (DEATS).
- (a) G. B. SERVICES shall have the fleet maintenance manager (or equivalent) and all staff responsible for maintenance of DEATS attend the CCDET II class. Proof of CCDET II completion shall be provided to ARB within six months of the date of this Agreement and also be maintained in each applicable employee's file for the term of his or her employment.
- (b) In case G. B. SERVICES uses a contractor for the maintenance of DEATS, in addition to having the fleet maintenance manager (or equivalent) attend the CCDET II course, G. B. SERVICES shall obtain proof that the contractor's staff maintaining the DEATS device(s) completed the CCDET II course within the last four years. This proof of the CCDET II completion shall be provided by G. B. SERVICES to ARB within six months of the date of this settlement and be maintained with the DEATS installation and maintenance records.
- (c) In case G. B. SERVICES is unable to find a CCDET II certified contractor within a radius of 25 miles from its yard for the maintenance of DEATS, in addition to having the fleet maintenance manager (or equivalent) attend the CCDET II course, G. B. SERVICES shall contract only with the authorized verified diesel emission control strategy installer(s) or original equipment manufacturer distributor(s) for the maintenance of DEATS. The proof of the CCDET II completion for the fleet maintenance manager (or equivalent) shall be provided by G. B. SERVICES to ARB within six months of the date of this settlement and be maintained with the DEATS installation and maintenance records.
- (8) G. B. SERVICES shall submit copies of all PSIP compliance records for the years 2016 and 2017 to ARB by January 31 of the following year. **Copies shall be addressed to the attention of Mr. Stephen Binning at the California Air Resources Board, Enforcement Division, P.O. Box 2815, Sacramento, California 95812.** ARB reserves the right to visit any G. B. SERVICES fleet location at any time to conduct compliance audits for the HDVIP and PSIP, or any other applicable ARB program.

SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT AND RELEASE

ARB and G. B. SERVICES, INC.

Page 6 of 9

- (9) G. B. SERVICES shall complete Low NOx Software Upgrades (reflash) on all applicable heavy-duty diesel engines operating in California and report to ARB within 45 days of this agreement.
- (10) G. B. SERVICES shall remain in compliance with the ECL regulation as codified in 13 CCR § 2183.
- (11) G. B. SERVICES shall instruct all employees who operate diesel-fueled vehicles to comply with the idling regulations set forth in 13 CCR § 2485, within 45 days of this Agreement.
- (12) G. B. SERVICES shall not violate the Truck and Bus regulation as codified in 13 CCR § 2025.
- (13) Each SWCV shall comply with the label requirements set forth in 13 CCR § 2021.2(f) (2) within 30 days of this agreement.
- (14) **G. B. SERVICES shall retrofit SWCVs with BACT by November 4, 2016.** G. B. SERVICES will keep records of installed diesel control strategies and update the SWCV compliance plan accordingly.
- (15) G. B. SERVICES shall submit an updated compliance plan demonstrating compliance with the SWCV Rule to Stephen Binning P.O. Box 2815, Sacramento, CA 95812 or electronically at Stephen.binning@arb.ca.gov **by November 4, 2016.**
- (16) This Agreement shall apply to and be binding upon G. B. SERVICES, and its officers, directors, receivers, trustees, employees, successors and assignees, subsidiary and parent corporations and upon ARB and any successor agency that may have responsibility for and jurisdiction over the subject matter of this Agreement.
- (17) This Agreement constitutes the entire agreement and understanding between ARB and G. B. SERVICES concerning the subject matter hereof, and supersedes and replaces all prior negotiations and agreements between ARB and G. B. SERVICES concerning the subject matter hereof.
- (18) No agreement to modify, amend, extend, supersede, terminate, or discharge this Agreement, or any portion thereof, is valid or enforceable unless it is in writing and signed by all parties to this Agreement.
- (19) Severability. Each provision of this Agreement is severable, and in the event that any provision of this Agreement is held to be invalid or unenforceable, the remainder of this Agreement remains in full force and effect.

SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT AND RELEASE

ARB and G. B. SERVICES, INC.

Page 7 of 9

- (20) This Agreement shall be interpreted and enforced in accordance with the laws of the State of California, without regard to California's choice-of-law rules.
- (21) This Agreement is deemed to have been drafted equally by the Parties; it will not be interpreted for or against either party on the ground that said party drafted it.
- (22) Senate Bill 1402 (Dutton, Chapter 413, statutes of 2010) requires ARB to provide information on the basis for the penalties it seeks (HSC § 39619.7). This information, which is provided throughout this settlement agreement, is summarized here:

The manner in which the penalty amount was determined, including a per unit or per vehicle penalty.

Penalties must be set at levels sufficient to discourage violations. The penalties in this matter were determined in consideration of all relevant circumstances, including the eight factors specified in HSC §§ 42403 and 43024.

PSIP Violations

The per vehicle penalty for the PSIP violations involved in this case is a maximum of \$500 per vehicle per violation per year. The penalty obtained for the PSIP violations involved in this case is \$3,375 for violations involving ten vehicles, or \$375 per vehicle per violation.

The penalty was discounted based on the fact that this was a first time violation and the violator made diligent efforts to comply and to cooperate with the investigation.

SWCV Violations

The per vehicle penalty for the SWCV Rule violations involved in this case is a maximum of \$1,000 per vehicle per day for strict liability violations or \$10,000 per vehicle per day for negligent or intentional violations. The penalty obtained for failing to install BACT by the implementation deadline for 20 violations involving ten vehicles in this case is \$15,000 or \$750 per vehicle per violation.

The penalty was discounted based on the fact that this was a first time violation and the violator made diligent efforts to comply and to cooperate with the investigation.

The provision of law the penalty is being assessed under and why that provision is most appropriate for that violation.

PSIP Violations

The penalty provision being applied to the PSIP violations is HSC § 43016 because G. B. SERVICES failed to test, measure, record, and maintain records of smoke emissions from its fleet of heavy-duty diesel vehicles for the years 2014 and 2015 in violation of the PSIP regulation in 13 CCR § 2190 *et seq.*, for eight vehicles. Since the PSIP regulation was adopted pursuant to authority granted in Part 5 of Division 26 of the HSC and since there is no specific penalty or fine provided for PSIP violations in Part 5, HSC § 43016 is the applicable penalty provision.

SWCV Violations

The penalty provision being applied for the SWCV Rule (13 CCR § 2020 *et seq.*) violations is HSC § 39674. The SWCV Rule is an Airborne Toxic Control Measure adopted pursuant to authority contained in HSC §§ 39002 *et seq.*, 39650-39675 and because G. B. SERVICES failed to install BACT on nine vehicles by the implementation deadlines as required by the SWCV Rule during the years 2013-2016.

Is the penalty being assessed under a provision of law that prohibits the emission of pollution at a specified level, and, if so a quantification of excess emissions, if it is practicable to do so.

PSIP and SWCV Violations

The provisions cited above do prohibit emissions above a specified opacity or level of g/hp-hr. However, since the hours of operation of the noncompliant units involved and their individual emission rates are not known, it is not practicable to quantify the excess emissions.

- (23) G. B. SERVICES acknowledges that ARB has complied with Senate Bill 1402 in prosecuting or settling this case. Specifically, ARB has considered all relevant facts, including those listed at HSC § 43024, has explained the manner in which the penalty amount was calculated, has identified the provision of law under which the penalty is being assessed and has considered and determined that this penalty is being assessed under a provision of law that prohibits the emission of pollutants at a specified level.

- (24) Penalties were determined based on the unique circumstances of this matter, considered together with the need to remove any economic benefit from noncompliance, the goal of deterring future violations and obtaining swift compliance, the consideration of past penalties in similar cases, and the potential costs and risk associated with litigating these particular violations. Penalties in future cases might be smaller or larger on a per unit basis.
- (25) The penalty was based on confidential settlement communications between ARB and G. B. SERVICES that ARB does not retain in the ordinary course of business. The penalty is the product of an arms length negotiation between ARB and G. B. SERVICES and reflects ARB's assessment of the relative strength of its case against G. B. SERVICES, the desire to avoid the uncertainty, burden and expense of litigation, obtain swift compliance with the law and remove any unfair advantage that G. B. SERVICES may have secured from its actions.
- (26) Now therefore, in consideration of the payment on behalf of G. B. SERVICES to the Air Pollution Control Fund and the Peralta Colleges Foundation, ARB hereby releases G. B. SERVICES and their principals, officers, agents, predecessors and successors from any and all claims, ARB may have or have in the future based on the circumstances described in paragraphs (1) through (11) of the Recitals. The undersigned represent that they have the authority to enter into this Agreement.

California Air Resources Board

Signature: 

Print Name: Dr. Todd Sax

Title: Chief, Enforcement Division

Date: 10/14/16

G. B. SERVICES, INC.

Signature: 

Print Name: Allan Babash

Title: owner

Date: 10-01-2016