

## SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT AND RELEASE

This SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT AND RELEASE (hereinafter "Agreement") is entered into between the STATE OF CALIFORNIA AIR RESOURCES BOARD (hereinafter "ARB") 1001 I Street, Sacramento, California 95814, and All Valley Environmental, Inc. a.k.a. Kochergen Farms Composting Inc. a.k.a. Green Valley Recycling (hereinafter "AVE"), 523 N Brawley Avenue, Fresno, CA 93706.

### I. RECITALS

- (1) California Health and Safety Code section 44011.6 (HSC § 44011.6) established the Heavy-Duty Vehicle Inspection Program (HDVIP). It authorizes ARB to inspect on-road heavy-duty vehicles for excessive smoke emissions and engine tampering and to issue citations accordingly. The program also requires the vehicle owner to repair its engines that exceed the prescribed ARB smoke opacity standards, perform a post-repair opacity test, and submit proof of repairs and any assessed penalties under the regulations of the HDVIP, chapter 3.5, California Code of Regulations, title 13, sections 2180-2188 (13 CCR §§ 2180-2188).
- (2) HSC § 43701 provides that ARB shall adopt regulations that require owners or operators of heavy-duty diesel motor vehicles to perform regular inspections of their vehicles for excessive smoke emissions.
- (3) 13 CCR § 2190 *et seq.* were adopted under the authority of HSC § 43701 and, with limited exceptions, which are not applicable here, apply to all heavy-duty diesel powered vehicles with gross vehicle weight ratings greater than 6,000 pounds that operate on the streets or highways within the State of California.
- (4) 13 CCR § 2190 *et seq.* authorize the Periodic Smoke Inspection Program (PSIP) which requires the owners and operators of California based vehicle fleets of two or more heavy-duty diesel motor vehicles with gross vehicle weight ratings greater than 6,000 pounds that operate on the streets or highways within the State of California to conduct annual smoke opacity inspections of their vehicles equipped with engines that are four years old or older.
- (5) 13 CCR § 2192(a) requires inter alia that the owner of the vehicle "[t]est the vehicle for excessive smoke emissions periodically according to the inspection intervals specified in section 2193(a), (b), and (c)", "[m]easure the smoke emissions for each test...", "[r]ecord the smoke test opacity levels and other required test information as specified in section 2194..." and "[k]eep the records specified in section 2194 for two years after the date of inspection."
- (6) HSC § 43016 states, "Any person who violates any provision of this part, or any order, rule, or regulation of the state board adopted pursuant to this part, and for which there is not provided in this part any other specific civil penalty or fine, shall

## SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT AND RELEASE

ARB and AVE

Page 2 of 13

be subject to a civil penalty of not to exceed five hundred dollars (\$500.00) per vehicle.”

- (7) ARB considers testing, measuring, recording, and recordkeeping to be critical components in reducing excessive smoke emissions from these heavy-duty vehicles.
- (8) ARB contends AVE failed to test, measure, record, and maintain records of smoke emissions from its fleet of heavy-duty diesel vehicles for years 2013 and 2014 in violation of 13 CCR § 2190 *et seq.*
- (9) 13 CCR § 2183(c) states that “No 1974 or newer diesel powered heavy-duty commercial vehicle shall operate in California without evidence that, at the time of manufacture, the installed engine met emission standards at least as stringent as applicable federal emission standards for the model year of the engine”. ARB shall base its determination on whether an engine meets the above requirements by inspecting the Emission Control Label (ECL) affixed to the vehicle’s engine.
- (10) ARB has documented that AVE failed to provide evidence that their vehicles have ECLs attached to the engines of heavy-duty diesel vehicles in its fleet in violation of HSC § 44011.6, and 13 CCR § 2183, *et seq.* Civil penalties for violation of the regulation covering ECLs have been set per 13 CCR § 2185(a)(2)(B) at \$300 per vehicle per violation.
- (11) HSC §§ 39650-39675 mandate the reduction of the emissions of substances that have been determined to be toxic air contaminants. In 1998, following an exhaustive ten-year scientific assessment process, ARB identified particulate matter (PM) from diesel-fueled engines as a toxic air contaminant. In-use On-Road diesel vehicles are powered by diesel fueled engines that emit toxic PM. On-Road vehicles are controlled under the Truck and Bus regulation (TB), as codified in 13 CCR § 2025.
- (12) 13 CCR § 2025(e)(1)(B) states: “Starting January 1, 2012, for all vehicles with GVWR greater than 26,000 lbs, excluding school buses, fleets must meet the requirements of 13 CCR § 2025(g) or fleets that report may instead comply with the phase-in option of 13 CCR § 2025(i).”
- (13) Failure to comply with the requirements of 13 CCR § 2025 is a violation of state law resulting in penalties. HSC §§ 39674(a) and (b) authorize civil penalties for the violation of the programs for the regulation of toxic air contaminants not to exceed one thousand dollars (\$1,000) or ten thousand dollars (\$10,000), respectively, for each day in which the violation occurs.
- (14) AVE has elected to meet the requirements of the Engine Model Year Compliance Schedule provided for in 13 CCR § 2025(g).

## SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT AND RELEASE

ARB and AVE

Page 3 of 13

- (15) 13 CCR § 2025(g) requires that owners of diesel vehicles with a GVWR greater than 26,000 lbs. (heavier vehicles) meet PM BACT requirements for all 1996 through 1999 engine model years by January 1, 2012, all 2000 through 2004 engine model years by January 1, 2013, and all 2005 through 2006 engine model years by January 1, 2014, and upgrade to a 2010 model year emissions equivalent engine for all 1993 and older model year engines by January 1, 2015.
- (16) ARB has documented that AVE failed to meet PM BACT requirements for all 1996 through 1999 engine model years by January 1, 2012, all 2000 through 2004 engine model years by January 1, 2013, and all 2005 through 2006 engine model years by January 1, 2014, and failed to upgrade all heavier vehicles with a 1993 and older model year engine to a 2010 model year emissions equivalent engine by January 1, 2015.
- (17) HSC §§ 39650-39675 mandate the reduction of the emission of substances that have been determined to be toxic air contaminants. In 1998, following an exhaustive 10-year scientific assessment process, ARB identified particulate matter (PM) from diesel-fueled engines as a toxic air contaminant. In-use off-road diesel-fueled vehicles (off-road vehicles) are powered by diesel-fueled engines that emit toxic PM. Off-road vehicles are controlled under chapter 9, 13 CCR § 2449.
- (18) 13 CCR § 2449(b) states that, except as provided in § 2449(b)(2)(G), the Regulation for In-Use Off-Road Diesel-Fueled Fleets (Off-Road Regulation) "applies to any person, business, or government agency who owns or operates within California any vehicles with a diesel-fueled or alternative diesel fueled off-road compression-ignition engine with maximum power (max hp) of 25 horsepower (hp) or greater provided that the vehicle cannot be registered and driven safely on-road or was not designed to be driven on-road, even if it has been modified so that it can be driven safely on-road."
- (19) 13 CCR § 2449(f) sets forth the requirements for labeling all vehicles with engines subject to the Off-Road Regulation with an ARB-issued equipment identification number (EIN).
- (20) 13 CCR § 2449(g) sets forth the requirements for reporting all vehicles with engines subject to the Off-Road Regulation.
- (21) ARB Enforcement Division has documented that AVE failed to report and label its off-road vehicles.
- (22) Failure to report and label off-road vehicles are violations of state law resulting in penalties. HSC § 39674 authorizes civil or administrative penalties not to exceed

SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT AND RELEASE

ARB and AVE

Page 4 of 13

one thousand dollars (\$1,000) or ten thousand dollars (\$10,000) for each day that the violation occurs.

- (23) AVE has 2 outstanding citations, as noted in the table below, dated February 26, 2013 and February 27, 2013:

Citation Number	Violation Type	VIN	Issue Date	Penalty Amount	Company Name
ECL022613001CK	ECL	1FUYSMDB5VP770279	02/26/2013	\$800.00	Kochergen Farms Composting
STB022713003SCB	TB	1FUJBBAS91LJ22908	02/27/2013	\$1,000.00	All Valley Environmental

- (24) In order to resolve these alleged violations, AVE has taken, or agreed to take, the actions enumerated below under "RELEASE". Further, ARB accepts this Agreement in termination and settlement of this matter.

- (25) In consideration of the foregoing, and of the promises and facts set forth herein, the parties desire to settle and resolve all claims, disputes, and obligations relating to the above-listed violations, and voluntarily agree to resolve this matter by means of this Agreement. Specifically, ARB and AVE agree as follows:

**II. TERMS AND RELEASE**

In consideration of ARB not filing a legal action against AVE for the alleged violations referred to above, and AVE's payment of the penalties set forth in Section 1 below, ARB and AVE agree as follows:

- (1) Upon execution of this Agreement, AVE shall pay a civil penalty of \$140,050.00. Payment shall be made in 12 monthly payments as described below, beginning on **May 2, 2016**.

Payment Due Date:	In the Amount of and Paid to:
<b>(1) May 2, 2016</b>	<b>\$11,771.00</b> paid to <b>San Joaquin Valley Air Pollution Control District</b> , with the following notation in the memo line of the check: <b>"For the School Bus and Diesel Emission Reduction SEP"</b>
<b>(2) June 2, 2016</b>	<b>\$11,671.00</b> paid to <b>San Joaquin Valley Air Pollution Control District</b> , with the following notation in the memo line of the check: <b>"For the School Bus and Diesel Emission Reduction SEP"</b>

SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT AND RELEASE

ARB and AVE

Page 5 of 13

(3) July 5, 2016	\$11,571.00	paid San Joaquin Valley Air Pollution Control District, with the following notation in the memo line of the check: "For the School Bus and Diesel Emission Reduction SEP"
(4) August 2, 2016	\$11,671.00	paid to Air Pollution Control Fund
(5) September 2, 2016	\$11,671.00	paid to Air Pollution Control Fund
(6) October 3, 2016	\$11,671.00	paid to Air Pollution Control Fund
(7) November 2, 2016	\$11,671.00	paid to Air Pollution Control Fund
(8) December 2, 2016	\$11,671.00	paid to Air Pollution Control Fund
(9) January 2, 2017	\$11,671.00	paid to Air Pollution Control Fund
(10) February 2, 2017	\$11,671.00	paid to Air Pollution Control Fund
(11) March 2, 2017	\$11,671.00	paid to Air Pollution Control Fund
(12) April 3, 2017	\$11,669.00	paid to Air Pollution Control Fund

Please send the signed Settlement Agreement and any future mailings or documents required per the terms of this Settlement Agreement to:

Terry Allen  
Air Pollution Specialist  
California Air Resources Board  
Enforcement Division  
9480 Telstar Avenue Suite 4  
El Monte, California 91731

Please submit each payment by the applicable payment due date along with the corresponding "Settlement Agreement Payment Transmittal Form" (Attachment A) to:

California Air Resources Board  
Accounting Office  
P.O. Box 1436  
Sacramento, California 95812-1436

- (2) Effect of Untimely Payment. If any payment is more than 15 days late, the entire remaining balance becomes immediately due and payable. In addition, if the Attorney General files a civil action to enforce this settlement agreement, AVE shall pay all costs of investigating and prosecuting the action, including expert fees, reasonable attorney's fees, and costs.
- (3) It is agreed that if AVE, including its subsidiary or parent company, at any time becomes insolvent, or makes an assignment for the benefit of creditors or similar action adversely involving AVE, its subsidiary, or parent company, or a



## SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT AND RELEASE

ARB and AVE

Page 6 of 13

proceeding or petition under any bankruptcy, reorganization, arrangement of debt, insolvency, readjustment of debt, or receivership law or statute is filed by or against AVE, its subsidiary, or parent company, or a trustee in bankruptcy, custodian, receiver or agent is appointed or authorized to take charge of any of AVE's, its subsidiary, or parent company's properties, or if any deposit account or other property of AVE, its subsidiary, or parent company be attempted to be obtained or held by writ of execution, garnishment, attachment, condemnation, levy, forfeiture or other legal process, or AVE, its subsidiary, or parent company takes any action to authorize any of the foregoing, the entire remaining balance becomes immediately due and payable without notice or demand.

- (4) It is further agreed that the penalties described in "Terms and Release", paragraph 1 are punitive in nature, rather than compensatory. Furthermore, the penalty is intended to deter and punish AVE for violations of state environmental statutes, and these penalties are payable to and for the benefit of ARB, a governmental unit. Therefore, it is agreed that these penalties imposed on AVE by ARB arising from the facts described in recital paragraphs (1) through (23) are non-dischargeable under 11 United States Code § 523 (a)(7), which provides an exception from discharge for any debt to the extent such debt is for a fine, penalty or forfeiture payable to and for benefit of governmental unit, and is not compensation for actual pecuniary loss, other than certain types of tax penalties.
- (5) AVE shall not violate HSC §§ 43701 *et seq.*, 44011.6 *et seq.*, and 13 CCR §§ 2180 *et seq.*, 2190 *et seq.*, and 2485 *et seq.*
- (6) AVE shall comply with one or both of the following options to attend the California Council on Diesel Education and Technology (CCDET I) class, (SAE J1667 Snap Acceleration Smoke Test Procedure for Heavy-Duty Diesel Powered Vehicles) as described on the ARB webpage at <http://www.arb.ca.gov/enf/hdvip/ccdet/ccdet.htm>. This class is conducted by various California Community Colleges and instructs attendees on compliance with the PSIP, ECL and the HDVIP.
  - (a) AVE shall have the fleet maintenance manager (or equivalent) and all staff performing opacity tests for compliance with PSIP and the HDVIP attend the CCDET I class. Proof of CCDET I completion shall be provided to ARB within six months of the date of this Agreement and be maintained in each applicable employee's file for the term of his or her employment.
  - (b) If AVE uses a contractor to perform the annual smoke opacity testing required under the PSIP, in addition to having the fleet maintenance manager (or equivalent) attend the CCDET I course, AVE shall obtain proof that the contractor's staff conducting the smoke opacity tests completed the CCDET I course within the past four years. This proof of CCDET I completion shall be

## SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT AND RELEASE

ARB and AVE

Page 7 of 13

provided to ARB with PSIP records as required by this Agreement and be maintained with the annual PSIP records.

- (7) AVE shall comply with one or both of the following options to attend the CCDET II class (Diesel Exhaust After Treatment and Maintenance), described on the ARB's webpage <http://www.arb.ca.gov/enf/hdvip/ccdet/ccdet.htm>. This class is conducted by various California Community Colleges and instructs attendees on California's emission regulations and the proper care and maintenance of diesel exhaust after-treatment systems (DEATS).
  - (a) AVE shall have the fleet maintenance manager (or equivalent) and all staff responsible for maintenance of DEATS attend the CCDET II class. Proof of CCDET II completion shall be provided to ARB within six months of the date of this Agreement and also be maintained in each applicable employee's file for the term of his or her employment.
  - (b) In case AVE uses a contractor for the maintenance of DEATS, in addition to having the fleet maintenance manager (or equivalent) attend the CCDET II course, AVE shall obtain proof that the contractor's staff maintaining the DEATS device(s) completed the CCDET II course within the last four years. This proof of the CCDET II completion shall be provided by AVE to ARB within six months of the date of this settlement and be maintained with the DEATS installation and maintenance records.
- (8) As is typically required, AVE shall submit copies of all PSIP compliance records for the two years (2015 and 2016) after the close of the audit to ARB by January 31 of the following year. ARB acknowledges that AVE has already submitted copies of all PSIP compliance records for year 2015 and has therefore complied with that requirement. AVE must still submit copies of all PSIP compliance records for year 2016 to ARB by January 31 of the following year. **Copies shall be addressed to the attention of Terry Allen at the California Air Resources Board, Enforcement Division, 9480 Telstar Avenue Suite 4, El Monte, California 91731.** ARB reserves the right to visit any AVE fleet location at any time to conduct compliance audits for the HDVIP and PSIP, or any other applicable ARB program.
- (9) AVE shall complete Low NOx Software Upgrades (reflash) on all applicable heavy-duty diesel engines operating in California and report to ARB within 45 days of this agreement.
- (10) AVE shall remain in compliance with the ECL regulation as codified in 13 CCR § 2183.



SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT AND RELEASE

ARB and AVE

Page 8 of 13

- (11) AVE shall instruct all employees who operate diesel-fueled vehicles to comply with the idling regulations set forth in 13 CCR § 2485, within 45 days of this Agreement.
- (12) AVE shall not violate the Truck and Bus regulation as codified in 13 CCR § 2025.
- (13) AVE shall submit proof of compliance with the Truck and Bus regulation (as codified in 13 CCR § 2025), within 45 days of the execution of this Agreement, to **Terry Allen, Air Pollution Specialist, California Air Resources Board, Enforcement Division, 9480 Telstar Avenue Suite 4, El Monte, California 91731.**
- (14) AVE shall not violate the requirements for off-road vehicles set forth in 13 CCR § 2449.
- (15) Within 45 days of the execution of this Agreement, AVE shall bring all vehicles subject to the Off-Road Regulation into compliance, and shall submit proof of those actions to: Terry Allen, Air Pollution Specialist, California Air Resources Board, Enforcement Division, 9480 Telstar Avenue Suite 4, El Monte, California 91731.
- (16) AVE has 1 outstanding citation, (citation number ECL022613001CK, dated February 26, 2013), for not meeting the requirements of the ECL program. This citation will be cleared through this Agreement.  
  
AVE has 1 outstanding citation, (citation number STB022713003SCB, dated February 27, 2013), for not meeting the requirements of the Truck and Bus regulation. This citation will be cleared through this Agreement.
- (17) This Agreement shall apply to and be binding upon AVE, and its officers, directors, receivers, trustees, employees, successors and assignees, subsidiary and parent corporations and upon ARB and any successor agency that may have responsibility for and jurisdiction over the subject matter of this Agreement.
- (18) This Agreement constitutes the entire agreement and understanding between ARB and AVE concerning the subject matter hereof, and supersedes and replaces all prior negotiations and agreements between ARB and AVE concerning the subject matter hereof.
- (19) No agreement to modify, amend, extend, supersede, terminate, or discharge this Agreement, or any portion thereof, is valid or enforceable unless it is in writing and signed by all parties to this Agreement.



## SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT AND RELEASE

ARB and AVE

Page 9 of 13

- (20) Severability. Each provision of this Agreement is severable, and in the event that any provision of this Agreement is held to be invalid or unenforceable, the remainder of this Agreement remains in full force and effect.
- (21) This Agreement shall be interpreted and enforced in accordance with the laws of the State of California, without regard to California's choice-of-law rules.
- (22) This Agreement is deemed to have been drafted equally by the Parties; it will not be interpreted for or against either party on the ground that said party drafted it.
- (23) Senate Bill 1402 (Dutton, Chapter 413, statutes of 2010) requires ARB to provide information on the basis for the penalties it seeks (HSC § 39619.7). This information, which is provided throughout this settlement agreement, is summarized here:

### **The manner in which the penalty amount was determined, including a per unit or per vehicle penalty.**

Penalties must be set at levels sufficient to discourage violations. The penalties in this matter were determined in consideration of all relevant circumstances, including the eight factors specified in HSC §§ 42403 and 43024.

#### PSIP Violations

The per vehicle penalty for the PSIP violations involved in this case is a maximum of \$500.00 per vehicle per violation per year. The penalty obtained for the PSIP violations involved in this case is \$1,875.00 for 5 violations involving 3 vehicles, or \$375.00 per vehicle per violation.

The penalty was discounted due to financial hardship and based on the fact that this was a first time violation and the violator made diligent efforts to comply and to cooperate with the investigation.

#### ECL Violations

The per vehicle penalty for the labeling violations involved in this case is a maximum of \$300.00 per vehicle per violation. The penalty obtained for the ECL violations involved in this case is \$675.00 for 3 vehicles, or \$225.00 per vehicle.

The penalty was discounted due to financial hardship and based on the fact that the violator made diligent efforts to comply and to cooperate with the investigation.

#### Truck and Bus Violations

## SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT AND RELEASE

ARB and AVE

Page 10 of 13

The per unit penalty for the Truck and Bus violations involved in this case is a maximum of \$1,000 per vehicle per day for strict liability violations or \$10,000 per vehicle per day for negligent or intentional violations.

The penalty obtained for the Truck and Bus violations involved in this case for failure to meet the requirements of the Engine Model Year Compliance Schedule for heavier vehicles is \$134,500.00 or \$250.00 per month of violation:

- \$11,500.00 for (1) vehicle with a 1996 through 1999 model year engine (46 months in violation); and
- \$10,250.00 for (1) vehicle with a 1996 through 1999 model year engine (41 months in violation); and
- \$8,500.00 for (1) vehicle with a 1996 through 1999 model year engine (34 months in violation); and
- \$8,250.00 for (1) vehicle with a 1996 through 1999 model year engine (33 months in violation); and
- \$15,000.00 for (2) vehicles with a 1996 through 1999 model year engine (30 months in violation); and
- \$6,000.00 for (1) vehicle with a 1996 through 1999 model year engine (24 months in violation); and
- \$17,000.00 for (2) vehicles with a 2000 through 2004 model year engine (34 months in violation); and
- \$8,250.00 for (1) vehicle with a 2000 through 2004 model year engine (33 months in violation); and
- \$15,000.00 for (2) vehicles with a 2000 through 2004 model year engine (30 months in violation); and
- \$27,500.00 for (5) vehicles with a 2005 through 2006 model year engine (22 months in violation); and
- \$1,750.00 for (1) vehicle with a 2005 through 2006 model year engine (7 months in violation); and
- \$3,000.00 for (2) vehicles with a 2005 through 2006 model year engine (6 months in violation); and
- \$2,500.00 for (1) vehicle with a 1993 and older model year engine (10 months in violation).

The penalty was discounted due to financial hardship and based on the fact that the violator made diligent efforts to comply and to cooperate with the investigation.

### Off-Road Vehicle Violations

## SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT AND RELEASE

ARB and AVE

Page 11 of 13

The per vehicle penalty for the off-road vehicle violations involved in this case is a maximum of \$1,000 per vehicle per day for strict liability violations or \$10,000 per vehicle per day for negligent or intentional violations. The penalty obtained for failure to report and label off-road vehicles in this case is \$3,000.00 or \$600.00 per vehicle for 5 vehicles.

The penalty was discounted due to financial hardship and based on the fact this was a first time violation and that the violator made diligent efforts to comply and to cooperate with the investigation.

**The provision of law the penalty is being assessed under and why that provision is most appropriate for that violation.**

### PSIP Violations

The penalty provision being applied to the PSIP violations is HSC § 43016 because AVE failed to test, measure, record, and maintain records of smoke emissions from its fleet of heavy-duty diesel vehicles for the years 2013 and 2014 in violation of the PSIP regulation in 13 CCR § 2190 *et seq.*, for 3 vehicles. Since the PSIP regulation was adopted pursuant to authority granted in Part 5 of Division 26 of the HSC and since there is no specific penalty or fine provided for PSIP violations in Part 5, HSC § 43016 is the applicable penalty provision.

### ECL Violations

The penalty provision being applied to the ECL requirements is 13 CCR § 2185(a)(2) because AVE failed to provide evidence that 3 of their vehicles have ECLs attached as required.

### Truck and Bus Violations

The penalty provision being applied for the Truck and Bus regulation (13 CCR § 2025) violations in this case is HSC § 39674 because the Truck and Bus regulation is an Airborne Toxic Control Measure adopted pursuant to authority contained in HSC §§ 39002 *et seq.*, 39650-39675 and because AVE failed to bring their diesel fleet into compliance by the deadlines set forth in 13 CCR § 2025(g).

### Off-Road Vehicle Violations

The penalty provision being applied for the Off-Road Regulation (13 CCR § 2449) violations (including labeling) is HSC § 39674 because the Off-Road Regulation is an Airborne Toxic Control Measure adopted pursuant to authority



## SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT AND RELEASE

ARB and AVE

Page 12 of 13

contained in HSC §§ 39002 et seq., 39650-39675 and because AVE failed to report and label 5 off-road vehicles.

**Is the penalty being assessed under a provision of law that prohibits the emission of pollution at a specified level, and, if so a quantification of excess emissions, if it is practicable to do so.**

### PSIP Violations

The PSIP provisions cited above do prohibit emissions above a specified opacity or level of g/hp-hr. However, since the hours of operation of the noncompliant units involved and their individual emission rates are not known, it is not practicable to quantify the excess emissions.

### ECL Violations

The penalty is not being assessed under a provision of law that prohibits the emission of pollution at a specified level.

### Truck and Bus Violations

The provisions cited above do prohibit emissions above a specified level of g/hp-hr. However, since the hours of operation of the noncompliant trucks involved and their individual emission rates are not known, it is not practicable to quantify the excess emissions.

### Off-Road Vehicle Violations

The provisions cited above for reporting and labeling violations do not prohibit emissions above a specified level of g/hp-hr.

- (24) AVE acknowledges that ARB has complied with Senate Bill 1402 in prosecuting or settling this case. Specifically, ARB has considered all relevant facts, including those listed at HSC § 43024, has explained the manner in which the penalty amount was calculated, has identified the provision of law under which the penalty is being assessed and has considered and determined that this penalty is being assessed under a provision of law that prohibits the emission of pollutants at a specified level.
- (25) Penalties were determined based on the unique circumstances of this matter, considered together with the need to remove any economic benefit from noncompliance, the goal of deterring future violations and obtaining swift compliance, the consideration of past penalties in similar cases, and the potential

SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT AND RELEASE

ARB and AVE

Page 13 of 13

costs and risk associated with litigating these particular violations. Penalties in future cases might be smaller or larger on a per unit basis.

- (26) The penalty was based on confidential settlement communications between ARB and AVE that ARB does not retain in the ordinary course of business. The penalty is the product of an arms length negotiation between ARB and AVE and reflects ARB's assessment of the relative strength of its case against AVE, the desire to avoid the uncertainty, burden and expense of litigation, obtain swift compliance with the law and remove any unfair advantage that AVE may have secured from its actions.
- (27) Now therefore, in consideration of the payment on behalf of AVE to the Air Pollution Control Fund and the San Joaquin Valley Air Pollution Control District, ARB hereby releases AVE and their principals, officers, agents, predecessors and successors from any and all claims, ARB may have or have in the future based on the circumstances described in paragraphs (1) through (23) of the Recitals. The undersigned represent that they have the authority to enter into this Agreement.

**California Air Resources Board**

**All Valley Environmental, Inc. a.k.a.  
Kochergen Farms Composting Inc. a.k.a.  
Green Valley Recycling**

Signature: 

Signature: 

Print Name: Richard W. Corey

Print Name: Mike J. Kochergen

Title: Executive Officer

Title: owner/president

Date: 7/10/2016

Date: 4-26-16