

Assembly Bill (AB) 32 Environmental Justice Advisory Committee (EJAC) 2021-2022 Meeting Summary

Purpose

The California Global Warming Solutions Act of 2006 (AB 32) required the California Air Resources Board (CARB or Board) to convene an Environmental Justice Advisory Committee (EJAC or Committee) to advise the CARB Board in developing the Scoping Plan for climate change efforts and in any other pertinent matter in implementing Division 25.5 of the Health and Safety Code, which is generally referred to as AB 32, the first law enacting Division 25.5. On January 25, 2007, the CARB Board appointed the first EJAC to advise on the first Scoping Plan. The CARB Board solicited nominations and reconvened the EJAC by appointing members to the EJAC for each subsequent Scoping Plan Update that was adopted in 2013, 2017, and 2022.

Membership

To be a member of the [Environmental Justice Advisory Committee](#), per state law, members must be representatives from communities in the state with the most significant exposure to air pollution, including, but not limited to, communities with minority populations, low-income populations, or both. State law also requires members must be appointed from nominations received from environmental justice organizations and community groups.

Following these statutory requirements, CARB solicits nominations for EJAC members by posting formal solicitations on the Board's Environmental Justice website. For the 2021-2022 EJAC, when appointing the initial group of EJAC members to advise on the development of the 2022 Scoping Plan, the Board in adopting Resolution 21-8 also delegated authority to the Executive Officer to appoint additional Committee members to include representation from underrepresented areas, including representatives from the Bay Area, the Inland Empire, Sacramento, San Diego, California Native American Tribes, and Labor.

The 2021-2022 EJAC consisted of 21 initial members, and one member added as the first Native American Tribal Representative. The 2021-2022 EJAC held 34 meetings, for a total of 123.5 hours of discussion.

2021 – 2022 EJAC Structure

EJAC members were coordinated by three co-chairs at a time which were temporary and changed over time. The initial three co-chairs were:

- Martha Dina Argüello, Physicians for Social Responsibility-Los Angeles (August 2021 – September 2022)
- Sharifa Taylor, Communities for a Better Environment (August 2021 – end of 2022)
- Paulina Torres, Center on Race, Poverty & the Environment (August 2021 – March 2022)

Two co-chairs were elected to fill vacancies when co-chairs stepped down or took a sabbatical:

- Dr. Catherine Garoupa, Central Valley Air Quality Coalition (March 2022 – end of 2022)
- Interim co-chair J. Kevin Jefferson III, Urban Releaf (September 2022 – end of 2022)

The EJAC was governed by the [Draft EJAC Guiding Principles](#), which were first drafted by the 2013 EJAC and reviewed and edited by subsequent EJACs including the 2021 – 2022 EJAC. EJAC voted and approved the Guiding Principles in the September 22, 2021, EJAC meeting.

The 2021-2022 EJAC¹ convened eight Working Groups of EJAC members to develop draft recommendations regarding the 2022 Scoping Plan Update for review, updates, and approval by the EJAC before submission to the Board. These Working Groups covered the topic areas of public health and social costs, natural and working lands (NWL), non-fossil fuel energy generation, fossil fuel industry and just transition, the Cap-and-Trade Program, manufacturing, overarching issues, and community engagement.

The EJAC approved and submitted draft recommendations on the Scoping Plan to the Board prior to the June 23, 2022, Board meeting. At this meeting, the EJAC presented to and discussed with the Board the EJAC's draft recommendations.

EJAC Actions

The EJAC submitted [245 final recommendations](#) to the CARB Board on September 30, 2022, that focused on direct emission reductions and considered all emission sources in the aforementioned areas, as well as recommendations on enforcement, a just transition, community engagement, and carbon capture, use, and storage. [A preliminary version of these recommendations](#) was discussed in a joint EJAC-CARB Board meeting on September 1, 2022. The Final 2022 Scoping Plan Update incorporated more than 60 of these recommendations. The paragraphs below describe actions that took place leading up to the submission of final recommendations.

During the EJAC process for the 2022 Scoping Plan development, the EJAC responded to [Scoping Plan Scenario Input Questions](#) posed by CARB staff, and shared a document outlining their concerns around the process, the need for evaluation, and the need for a tribal representative. In addition, the EJAC developed preliminary draft recommendations to inform the draft Scoping Plan.

EJAC members hosted two community engagement workshops to ground their recommendations to inform the development of the Scoping Plan in the experiences

¹ Following this, all references to "EJAC" are specific to the 2021-2022 EJAC.

of environmental justice community members, and to ensure the voices of those communities most burdened by climate impacts were reflected in the plan. The workshop held on June 16, 2022, had over 165 community participants, included 42 participants relying on Spanish interpretation. These community engagement workshops were summarized in [a report by the EJAC community engagement working group](#), which identified four themes from the workshop discussion: (1) knowledge and language justice, (2) community empowerment, (3) health-driven action, and (4) comprehensive re-imagination.

Development of an Ongoing EJAC

The EJAC also worked towards the development of an ongoing Environmental Justice Advisory Committee to advise CARB on the implementation of climate programs (implementation of Division 25.5), rather than continuing the prior practice of Board convening a new EJAC for each Scoping Plan development. In October 2021, CARB Chair Liane Randolph, restated her support for an ongoing EJAC in a letter to the EJAC.² At the March 10, 2022, joint EJAC-CARB Board meeting, EJAC members called for a transition to an ongoing EJAC to continue after the 2022 Scoping Plan Update was passed. CARB staff at the July 26, 2022, EJAC meeting proposed the development of an Ad Hoc sub quorum of EJAC members to discuss the role and potential for an ongoing EJAC. At the September 27, 2022, EJAC meeting, EJAC members provided further feedback to CARB staff on this proposal, resulting in an initial CARB proposal at the November 30, 2022, EJAC meeting for an ongoing EJAC structure.

At the November 30, 2022 EJAC meeting, the Chair expressed the Board's continued support for an ongoing EJAC structure that allows for more sustained engagement over the implementation of CARB's climate programs, as well as her desire to establish an ongoing EJAC structure that continues to have geographic and issue diversity from around the State, allows members the time they need to do work, and commits to appropriate amounts of CARB staff support and agency resources. At the same meeting, the EJAC members voted to express their support for a Board resolution establishing an ongoing Committee.

At the December 15, 2022, CARB Board meeting, the Chair expressed her commitment to an ongoing EJAC as a means of developing partnership, engagement, and relationships with communities. The ad hoc committee worked with CARB staff and Board member Gideon Kracov to develop an ongoing EJAC Charter for approval by the EJAC and Board. On March 15, 2023, the EJAC approved the proposed EJAC Charter. On March 23, 2023, the CARB Board voted on the proposed charter for an ongoing EJAC and reappointed the then current 2021-2022 EJAC members to an ongoing EJAC for terms of three years.

² [LMR October 19 response to EJAC Letter Final.pdf \(ca.gov\)](#)

Disclaimer: The following intends to provide a high-level summary of comments and ideas shared at and should not be taken as representative of final EJAC recommendations or full elaboration of the topics and issues raised. More information can be found in the resources available online related to the 2021-2022 EJAC and their meetings can be found on CARB's website, at the following link: Resources related to AB 32 Environmental Justice Advisory Committee for 2022 Scoping Plan Update | California Air Resources Board

2021 EJAC Meetings

EJAC Meeting Dates:

1. June 4, 2021, 2:00 p.m. – 4:30 p.m.
2. August 3, 2021, 2:00 p.m. – 6:00 p.m.
3. August 26, 2021, 1:00 p.m. – 5:00 p.m.
4. September 22, 2021, 1:00 p.m. – 5:00 p.m.
5. September 27, 2021, 12:00 p.m. – 4:00 p.m.
6. October 12, 2021, 1:00 p.m. – 5:00 p.m.
7. October 15, 2021, 1:00 p.m. – 5:00 p.m.
8. November 9, 2021, 1:00 p.m. – 5:00 p.m.
9. November 16, 2021, 1:00 p.m. – 5:00 p.m.
10. December 1, 2021, 1:00 p.m. – 5:00 p.m.
11. December 14, 2021, 1:00 p.m. – 5:00 p.m.

June 4, 2021, EJAC Meeting ([Meeting Recording and Agenda](#))

At the first meeting of the 2021-2022 EJAC in June 2021, members introduced themselves. [CARB presented](#) on the expectations for the EJAC and the 2022 Scoping Plan Update, an overview of Scoping Plan goals, EJAC's role in the June 2021 kickoff workshops for the Scoping Plan Update, anticipated additional EJAC members, and an overview of the Bagley-Keene Open Meeting Act which governs advisory committees like this one.

EJAC members raised questions and comments about the Scoping Plan workshop series and Scoping Plan goals, including:

- That equity and environmental justice should be integrated in all the workshops, rather than being in one workshop alone;
- Asking what information is being input into the models and scenarios being used, and for that information to be discussed with EJAC rather than kept separate (*CARB presented information at the August 3, 2021, EJAC meeting*);
- Noting that this is an opportunity to address underlying assumptions that are baked into the models; and
- That moving forward will require a strong foundation with staff from other divisions of CARB in addition to the Office of Environmental Justice to ensure that environmental justice is incorporated into their work.

August 3, 2021, EJAC Meeting ([Meeting Recording and Agenda](#))

At the August 3, 2021, EJAC meeting, [CARB presented on the PATHWAYS greenhouse gas \(GHG\) modeling for the Scoping Plan](#). Members discussed the development of Scoping Plan Modeling Scenarios, including PATHWAYS, and the EJAC's role in the Scoping Plan process. CARB solicited feedback from the EJAC on proposed inputs into the modeling scenarios.

EJAC members raised questions about the PATHWAYS model which included:

- Where the social cost of carbon shows up in the models, and whether CARB will include local impacts of energy production to comply with AB 197;
- How data will be broken down (e.g., to Census tracts, cities, counties) and how it can interact with the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment (OEHHA)'s CalEnviroScreen;
- Whether the model includes the full life-cycle greenhouse gas (GHG) accounting and embedded carbon emitted from extraction, transportation, and manufacturing; and
- Whether the modeling addresses localized or social/health effects.

EJAC members discussed EJAC and environmental justice (EJ)'s role in the Scoping Plan process, including the following topics:

- An emphasis on full transparency, meaning EJAC involvement in planning decisions for workshop presenters, first-hand information to make informed decisions, and clear communication protocols;
- A communications plan for outreach, particularly to disadvantaged EJ communities;
- Making public workshops more accessible, with EJAC being proactive with recommendations, and focusing on EJ impacts in public workshops;
- Ensuring access to CARB staff, including from the Industrial Strategies Division; and
- Timeline extension for discussion on model scenario inputs, to allow new members time to catch up.

Action Items

EJAC:

- **EJAC members** to send proxy information to CARB staff
- **EJAC members** to send resources and recommendations to CARB staff on co-leadership and co-design models

CARB:

- **CARB staff** to share information on existing outreach to tribes, and follow up with EJAC members who have recommendations about tribal outreach (*memo shared at the September 22, 2021, EJAC meeting*)

- **CARB staff** to provide an overall collaborative schedule of workshops and opportunities for speakers (*addressed during August 26, 2021, EJAC meeting*)
- **CARB staff** to share out the existing social cost of carbon equation and materials (*provided to EJAC and [posted](#) in October 2021*)

August 26, 2021, EJAC Meeting ([Meeting Recording and Agenda](#))

At the August 26, 2021, EJAC meeting, CARB presented an overview of the Bagley-Keene Open Meeting Act, EJAC governance structure, and alignment and transparency on the schedule of events through 2022 for Scoping Plan activities in response to the ask for an overall collaborative schedule. The EJAC and CARB discussed the integration of environmental justice into the Scoping Plan and walked through scenario design input from the EJAC.

EJAC members discussed the design of a leadership committee with co-chairs who would be responsible for working with the agency and EJAC to develop agendas, coordinate community meetings, and run meetings, as the connection between EJAC and CARB staff. EJAC members proposed to move forward with an interim leadership committee of 3 co-chairs, and revise when vacancies on the committee are filled, to address concerns about equity issues with leadership selection, including lack of tribal representation. Martha Dina Argüello, Physicians for Social Responsibility-Los Angeles, Paulina Torres, Center on Race, Poverty & the Environment, and Sharifa Taylor, Communities for a Better Environment, were selected as interim co-chairs by vote.

EJAC members also discussed further details about EJAC governance, including decision-making processes, and norms and rules for working together. Discussion included:

- Considering additional compensation for co-chairs.
- Reviewing the past charter to see what needs updating.
- The suggestion to build upon the past process from the 2017 charter, which involved consensus seeking, options for modified consensus with spectrums of support, and backup voting by a simple majority vote. EJAC members proposed starting with consensus or modified consensus and backing it up with a 2/3 majority vote.
- Participation requirements, including that it is important to set expectations for attendance and to make a good faith effort to check in with folks before removing anyone for missed meetings.

Action Items

EJAC:

- **EJAC members** to review past EJAC guiding principles
- **EJAC Leadership Committee** to review past governance charter and provide comments/considerations for EJAC members
- **EJAC members** to tell CARB staff which September 2021 meeting dates work

CARB:

- **CARB staff** to set up a resource page on the CARB website for EJAC ([2021-2022 EJAC Resources website](#))
- **CARB staff and facilitation team** to connect with the Leadership Committee to plan upcoming meetings (*Future EJAC meetings were planned by CARB, EJAC Co-Chairs, and the facilitation team*)
- **CARB staff** to clarify proxy/alternate roles (*completed on 11/30/21 in follow-up email to EJAC*)

September 22, 2021, EJAC meeting ([Meeting Recording](#))

At the September 22, 2021 EJAC meeting, CARB presented on the tribal memo³ in response to the EJAC request on August 3, 2021. EJAC members discussed the guiding principles charter and meeting guidelines, a workplan for working groups on particular sectors and community engagement, and planning for the model inputs and scenario design discussion on September 27, 2021.

EJAC members discussed the guiding principles charter, meeting guidelines, and tribal representation, and voted to approve the guiding principles charter with edits as suggested. Discussion included comments and questions on:

- Clarification of attendance guidelines;
- Needs for tribal outreach, including possibly to Federal Tribal liaisons and non-federally recognized Tribes, as well as urban indigenous communities; and
- The possibility of a survey to find out what major interests tribes have that could relate to EJAC.

EJAC members discussed the development of working groups, including:

- Where to fit in certain topics into the planned working groups, such as the end of Cap-and-Trade Program, warehouse concerns, biofuels, and refinery emissions;
- That working groups should be sub-quorum groups of EJAC members with expert advice as needed;
- That technical assistance should be included for topics, including other state agency partners and CARB staff from appropriate divisions attending as needed; and
- That discussion of issues should be cross-cutting.

EJAC members discussed a timeline for community engagement through June 2022, and determined to aim for 2-3 rounds of community engagement, including listening sessions. EJAC members raised the following questions and comments during the discussion:

- That workshops are important but not enough, and there may be other options EJAC should pursue for community engagement;

³ [CARB EJAC Tribal memo](#)

- That it would be helpful to use the [Spectrum of Community Engagement](#) as a reference, and strive to get beyond Steps 2 and 3 into collaborative and delegated power phase; and
- That it is important to shift the process for more equitable outcomes with further community engagement, including through listening to communities to co-create, to do community visioning rather than limiting work to technical experts, to increase collaboration and transparency to impacted communities, and to be reciprocal in bringing resources to communities.

Action Items

EJAC:

- **EJAC members** to fill out survey about working group preferences, and review scenario questions from CARB to prepare to bring feedback for September 27, 2021 meeting
- **EJAC members** to send additional thoughts on agendas and technical assistance to co-chairs
- **Co-chairs** to work offline with CARB to clarify working group topics, resolve questions raised about which topics go in which groups, and discuss strategy to provide technical support
- **Co-chairs** to develop preliminary working group assignments based on survey results
- **Technical writer Mark Wilson** to develop table of technical assistance topics/needs in a technical assistance clearinghouse

CARB:

- **CARB staff** to send link to Executive Orders for Scoping Plan scenarios in email (*California Climate Legislative Direction and [Executive Orders](#)*)
- **CARB staff** to continue work on securing tribal representative for EJAC (*Tribal member appointed in February 2022*)
- **CARB staff** to compile public comments received from EJ organizations on scenario inputs, and share with EJAC by the end of the week (*completed on 9/24/21 in follow-up email to EJAC*)

September 27, 2021, EJAC Meeting ([Meeting Recording and Agenda](#))

At the September 27, 2021 EJAC meeting, in response to EJAC members' request, CARB compiled public comments received from EJ organization on scenario inputs. CARB shared a [presentation on scenario design input](#), and solicited feedback from EJAC members on a variety of questions. EJAC members discussed a workplan for Scoping Plan activities and events through 2022 and finalized working groups.

On the workplan for Scoping Plan activities, EJAC members raised comments and questions including:

- That having the current timeframe may be strict and prevent a more accurate Scoping Plan from being developed;
- That the plan for scenario development needs to slow down so that EJAC members can listen to communities and ground their feedback there first, and that community engagement and technical aspects have distinct timelines that need to be considered together; and
- That community members expect EJAC members to engage them rather than coming with predetermined solutions.

EJAC members discussed current milestones for changes to petroleum fuel, vehicle fleet electrification, vehicle miles traveled (VMT), engineered carbon removal, industry, the carbon neutrality timeframe, woody biomass and solid biomass waste, methane, a carbon free electricity grid, and building decarbonization. Comments included:

- Wondering what the status is towards reaching goals like 100% sales of light-duty vehicles being zero emission;
- That VMT reductions need to be coupled with public transit investment;
- Whether there will be money in the budget to support a transition to electric vehicles;
- Whether there is regional variation in VMT related to housing availability and whether that is being considered;
- That agricultural emissions like pesticides should be included in Scoping Plan scenarios;
- That reducing consumption should be part of the conversation, rather than assuming continued economic growth and development;
- That expediting the timeframe for carbon neutrality is good, but not at the expense of communities;
- That it is important to ensure GHGs are not shifting emissions out of state;
- That building decarbonization needs to focus on new and old buildings without increasing gentrification; and
- That the role of EJ is not to determine technical questions but to address how the transition in an equitable way and how to avoid repeating past injustices.

EJAC members voted to develop a subgroup to draft a letter to the Governor requesting timeline extension for the Scoping Plan process, and developed a [written copy of the proposed timeline](#).

October 12, 2021, EJAC Meeting ([Meeting Recording and Agenda](#))

At the October 12 EJAC meeting, CARB shared the [revised draft schedule](#) to provide additional clarity for the EJAC. The members discussed EJAC's role in the 2022 Scoping Plan Update process and continued the discussion on modeling inputs and scenario design after a [Draft Scenario Inputs Technical Workshop](#) presented by CARB's Research Division staff.

Regarding EJAC's role and the process of the Scoping Plan Update, EJAC members raised comments and questions that included:

- Whether there is CARB support for the letter requesting an overall extension;
- Major concerns over the adjusted workshop date of November 24, 2021, which EJAC members said would not allow enough time for meaningful community engagement;
- Wanting to avoid a repeat of the lack of information sent to EJAC for the 9/30 workshop, and requesting that for the October 2021 technical workshop of draft scenarios, EJAC have enough time in advance to review and prepare to provide comments during the workshop; and
- Bringing up transportation and the role of the Cap-and-Trade Program in scenarios consideration as important topics for deep dives.

EJAC members decided via consensus to move forward with sending the drafted letter to the Governor requesting timeline extension for the Scoping Plan process.

EJAC members discussed the model inputs and scenario design for the 2022 Scoping Plan Update with CARB representatives. Discussion comments and questions raised included:

- How certain impacts (e.g., GHG impacts for pesticides and chemical production) are included in PATHWAYS, and if they are not, how they can be added;
- Whether CARB has explored technological innovations to green up and clean up sectors outside of CCS and biofuels, which increase pollution;
- How the Cap-and-Trade Program fits into the scenario, given concerns from the legislature and EJ about the Cap-and-Trade Program as direct emission reductions;
- Asking for more clarity on oil production and refining, including on the balance of imports and exports of produced oil, and on jet fuel use relative to on-road vehicles;
- That scenarios must retool programs to build community capacity to respond to climate change, and that considerable trusted community outreach workers and organizations will be needed in order to reach scenarios where behavioral change and disadvantaged community participation is expected;
- That new thinking is needed about how to get resources to low-income communities to support the transition, e.g., EJAC could meet jointly with the Disadvantaged Communities Advisory Group (DACAG) coordinated by the California Energy Commission and the California Public Utilities Commission to work on ways to protect low-income households; and
- That internships and employment opportunities are needed in the higher echelon of the solar industry for access to local low-income people.

Action Items

EJAC:

- **Letter/Timeline group and co-chairs** to meet offline with **CARB staff** to understand the ask regarding CARB support of EJAC letter requesting timeline extension (Chanell is point person and will identify additional CARB staff as needed)
- **EJAC members** to complete meeting date survey by 10/15/21
- **Co-chairs** to finish working group assignments

CARB:

- **CARB staff** to provide follow up answer to whether working groups count as EJAC meetings for purposes of compensation of EJAC members (*CARB presented on EJAC compensation at the 12/14/21 EJAC meeting*)
- **CARB & facilitation team** to compile list of EJAC member topics/questions on model/scenarios (*completed on 11/12/21 in follow-up email to EJAC*)
- **CARB staff** to share information/presentations for late October 2021 workshop with EJAC in advance so EJAC has time to review.

October 15, 2021, EJAC Meeting ([Meeting Recording and Agenda](#))

At the October 15, 2021 EJAC meeting, CARB provided [responses to EJAC members' chat questions at the October 12, 2021 EJAC meeting](#) regarding scenario development. EJAC members discussed approaches to Working Groups and community engagement and reports back from Working Groups, and continued discussion of model inputs and scenario design for the 2022 Scoping Plan Update.

EJAC members discussed the overall approach to Working Groups, including the need for transparent ways for WGs to contribute to the actual Scoping Plan, and support for the idea of a briefing by CARB on electricity to the energy transition working group and co-chairs in advance for the Electricity workshop in early November 2021.

EJAC members discussed current community engagement efforts and raised several concerns or comments. These included that funding is inadequate for CARB's current engagement with Physicians for Social Responsibility – Los Angeles and other community groups through listening sessions on building decarbonization and electrification, concern that outcomes from listening sessions will be relegated to an appendix in the Scoping Plan and not fully integrated, and wanting to better understand who is doing community engagement.

Regarding model inputs and scenario design, EJAC members raised several questions and comments, including:

- Asking what defines carbon neutrality, and what CARB's past performance is on meeting targets in past Scoping Plans for carbon neutrality;
- Requesting that CARB add a pesticide/chemicals/fertilizer discussion to a future EJAC meeting agenda; and

- Requesting that EJAC offer support to a letter sent to CARB by community organizations requesting inclusion of pesticides in the Scoping Plan.

Several reports were heard by EJAC members from Working Groups on carbon neutrality, the role of carbon capture and storage (CCS), refrigerants, and biomass.

Overall perspectives included:

- *Carbon Neutrality: Most EJAC members* expressed support for aiming to exceed AB 32 2030 target.
- *Carbon Neutrality: Members* expressed concerns about changing the target for industry and the ability of industry to adapt.
- *Role of CCS: Most EJAC members* expressed support for excluding CCS.
- *Role of CCS: Some EJAC members* suggested that CCS is needed in certain industries, and use can be permitted if necessary.
- *Refrigerants: EJAC members* expressed a need to speak with CARB about options for addressing hydrofluorocarbons.
- *Biomass: EJAC members* discussed current developments to use ethanol to produce jet fuel, production of steel without petroleum coke, and other resources.

Action Items

EJAC:

- **Co-chairs** to compile the list of requests from EJAC members to join additional groups, and update Working Group (WG) membership with additional folks who want to join
- **Working Group members** to schedule initial meetings, with support from **CARB staff** for initial coordination and scheduling as needed
- **Community Engagement/Timeline group & co-chairs** to take up request to invite aide from Governor's office to attend EJAC meetings and identify next steps.

CARB:

- **CARB staff** to circulate contact info of EJAC members in working groups to allow for communication
- **CARB staff** to share list of contacts for WG support (*completed on 10/20/21 in follow-up email to EJAC*)
- **CARB & Non-fossil Fuel Energy Generation WG** to schedule a work group meeting at least a week in advance of the November 2021 Scoping Plan workshop to brief WG members (*workgroup meeting held November 15, 2021*)
- **CARB staff** will reach out to EJAC members to invite them to present at the November 2021 Scoping Plan workshop (*completed on 10/20/21 in follow-up email to EJAC*)
- **CARB staff** to share information with EJAC about joint agency meeting on pesticides with the Department of Pesticide Regulation, California Natural Resources Agency, CARB, California Department of Food and Agriculture, and

CalEPA (CARB presented on Pesticides – State Efforts at the 12/14/21 EJAC meeting)

- **CARB staff & co-chairs** to discuss a process to share back information from other related efforts/meetings
- **CARB staff** will relay request to provide informational update from EJAC to the Board at the late October 2021 meeting (EJAC Informational item added to the 10/28/21 Board meeting)
- **CARB staff** to follow up with CARB division working on building decarbonization/electrification listening sessions on how outcomes from discussions are being included in the Scoping Plan.
- **CARB staff** to share upcoming workshop dates for late October 2021 workshop on comments received on scenarios and November 2021 electricity workshop. (completed on 10/20/21 in follow-up email to EJAC)
 - **CARB** will post workshop materials publicly in advance and notify EJAC when they are available.

November 9, 2021, EJAC Meeting ([Meeting Recording and Agenda](#))

At the November 9, 2021 EJAC meeting, E3, the team working with CARB on modeling for the Scoping Plan, [presented](#) to the EJAC to address members' questions as it relates to scenario development. CARB also shared presentations from June 2021 and September 2021 workshops on the [Scoping Plan](#) and on [Short-lived Climate Pollutants](#), respectively. EJAC members had a deep dive discussion on model inputs and scenario design with examples, heard a report back from the Community Engagement Working Group, and voted on support for a letter from Californians for Pesticide Reform, et al, on Addressing Pesticides in the 2022 Scoping Plan Update.

In the deep dive on the PATHWAYS model, EJAC members raised several questions about topics including:

- The level of geographic granularity;
- How international transit is factored into the model;
- The cost of transition and how it can be addressed;
- Model validation; and
- Which model does the geospatial analysis of distribution of risk.

EJAC members also made several requests to CARB for information or assistance, including:

- For a written explanation from CARB on constraints on discussing the Cap-and-Trade Program and electricity market with the EJAC, a timeframe for a Bagley-Keene memo, and a clearer explanation of Bagley-Keene Act limitations;
- For a reference sheet for items not included in the model that might be addressed in the Scoping Plan process;
- For more information on work has done to look at water-electricity relationships and what the impacts of transitioning to greywater infrastructure would be;

- For an overview of how workgroups align with the timeframe and how EJAC feedback will directly feed into the modeling and CARB workshop processes; (presented at December 14, 2021 EJAC meeting)
- For critical analysis on the former Scoping Plan's impact on EJ communities.

Action Items

EJAC:

- **Co-chairs** to delegate scenario questions to working groups to provide input on draft recommendations
 - **CARB staff** to set up working group cluster meeting in advance
 - **Working group clusters** to report back at the 11/16/21 EJAC meeting

CARB:

- **CARB staff** to communicate the greywater question (electricity-water nexus) to CARB staff working on these issues and bring back additional info on what CARB is learning/doing in this area
- **CARB staff** to follow up with absent EJAC members on the letter vote
- **CARB staff & co-chairs** to confer on list of requests from EJAC members

November 16, 2021, EJAC Meeting ([Meeting Recording and Agenda](#))

At the November 16 EJAC meeting, members heard reports back from the Working Group on Community Engagement and discussed EJAC and environmental justice community comments on scenario questions. CARB provided an update on pesticides in the 2022 Scoping Plan Update in response to the previous meeting where the EJAC voted to support addressing pesticides within the Scoping Plan.

EJAC members raised several questions and comments for the Working Group on Community Engagement to consider in their planning, including:

- Asking how hard-to-reach communities can be reached, how barriers to participation can be addressed, and how engagement can be made meaningful for folks who are struggling with cost;
- The need to take a comprehensive look at communities that are being reached out to and engaged with, so that typical outreach approaches are not just replicated even when they are not inclusive; and
- That it would be helpful to have CARB staff weigh in on key milestones and available budget.

EJAC members made the following requests from/for CARB:

- For CARB staff to commit to timelines to answer questions raised, perhaps based on times CARB staff are available;
- For a detailed response to some questions, such as what is within the scope and outside the scope of the model; and

- For CARB to provide a budget for community engagement, and identify key milestones related to community engagement in the schedule/process from CARB's perspective.

Action Items

EJAC:

- **Co-chairs** to develop introductory framing for recommendations
- **EJAC members** to review recommendations matrix and come prepared for vote on sending recommendations forward to CARB at next meeting

CARB:

- **CARB staff** to review questions document and provide timeframes for when EJAC will receive responses

Sac State:

- **Sac State facilitation team** to revise recommendations matrix and questions document and share with CARB and EJAC

December 1, 2021, EJAC Meeting ([Meeting Recording and Agenda](#))

At the December 1, 2021, EJAC meeting, members discussed their responses to the CARB Scenario Inputs, and finalized a document describing those responses. These comments covered questions relating to the carbon neutrality timeframe, the role of engineered carbon removal, a carbon free electricity grid, vehicle fleet electrification, vehicle miles traveled, petroleum fuels, methane, woody biomass and solid biomass waste, residential and commercial building decarbonization, industry (manufacturing, construction, and agriculture), and overarching issues.

Action Items

EJAC:

- **Co-chairs** to deliver final response document and introductory letter to CARB
- **EJAC members** to fill out Scoping Plan Technical Assistance survey

CARB:

- **CARB staff** to follow up with EJAC members who did not vote yet on response document and intro letter (within three days) (*completed on 12/3/21 in follow-up emails to EJAC members*)

December 14, 2021, EJAC Meeting ([Meeting Recording and Agenda](#))

At the December 14, 2021, EJAC meeting, in response to requests from the November 16, 2021 EJAC meeting, CARB presented on the revised Scoping Plan schedule⁴ to address EJAC members' timeline concerns; two joint EJAC - CARB board

⁴ [2022SP_Schedule-Deliverables_12222021.pdf \(ca.gov\)](#)

meetings to facilitate communication between board members and EJAC members; technical assistance support; CARB's efforts to support community engagement; deep dive informational meetings to address EJAC's questions in real time; working group support; EJAC compensation; update on tribal representation, and next steps going forward.

CARB staff from the Industrial Strategies Division also presented on the state's efforts to address pesticides⁵ in response to the EJAC's previous discussion on the role of pesticides in the Scoping Plan. EJAC members finalized introductory framing to EJAC responses to scenario questions, heard presentations from [Californians for Pesticide Reform](#), EJAC member Angel Garcia, and Pesticide Action Network, and heard reports back from working groups.

Regarding pesticides in the 2022 Scoping Plan Update, EJAC members raised several questions, including:

- How pesticide reduction can be added into the initial and final drafts of the Scoping Plan's main document, rather than just in the appendices;
- What CARB's current correspondence record is with the Department of Pesticide Regulation (DPR) for the 2022 Scoping Plan Update;
- Whether PATHWAYS scenario modeling includes the application of pesticides;
- What the specific models are that are used for Natural and Working Lands (NWL) scenario modeling; and
- What implementation language is necessary for action toward pesticide reductions?

Representatives from the various Working Groups reported back on their working group progress. These updates included:

- *Overarching*: The Working Group heard information from the Oil and Gas Branch, heard about protocols for permitting about CCS and about research projects on CCS. They suggested that CCS may deserve a special EJAC session due to current mixed messages. They discussed high-level jobs and just transition jobs, noting that it wasn't clear how that transition will happen, and wanted to circle back with Executive level staff on the implementation of a just transition.
- *Manufacturing*: The discussion has focused on hemp as an alternative to concrete, glass and steel manufacturing, and pesticides. The Working Group is hoping to talk further with modelers, and hear from CARB about how to model a menu of options in this sector without increasing pollution locally.
- *Public Health*: The Working Group has been able to get a good base level of understanding of CARB's public health measures, and OEHHA's Climate Change and Health Equity section is coming to the next WG meeting to share their healthy equity framework. The WG discussed the need to uplift the

⁵ [California Cap-and-Trade Regulation](#)

intersectionality of race and other factors, and wants to come back to how public health impacts are modeled.

- *NWL*: The Working Group met with fluorinated gases (F-gases) and dairy digester experts at their last meeting, and suggested that a lot more can be done about dairy emissions and manure management. They talked about alternatives to improve soil health, and asked about the official inclusion of DPR as a consulting agency in the scoping plan.
- *Cap-and-Trade Program*: Had an initial exploratory meeting without CARB staff.
- *Fuel Industry*: Had great involvement from CARB staff but was concerned about the lack of clear answer from CARB on how this work will feed into the Scoping Plan process.
- *Community Engagement*: Connected with San Joaquin Valley organizations about community engagement there, and submitted an initial high-level outline for a plan starting in January 2022, with the first round of workshops in February 2022.
- *Non-fossil fuel energy generation*: Heard a comprehensive review of legislation and renewable portfolio standards, and got further detail/discussion on a variety of topics, including on the reduction of small-scale solar, on life-cycle health assessments of electric vehicles and lithium batteries, on green hydrogen as possible backup storage in homes, on energy import issues, and on biomass on federal lands that impacts non-federal and indigenous lands.

EJAC members further noted the lack of a State plan to transition fossil fuel workers, because the [High Road Training Partnerships initiative](#) would not provide sufficient guarantees of full-time jobs and appropriate per hour pay. EJAC members requested further information on whether the High Road Training Partnerships initiative is the current policy approach, or if there are other opportunities for just transition careers for fossil fuel workers.

Action Items

EJAC:

- **EJAC members** to let CARB know if a Working Group wants to invite other agencies to participate in WG discussion.
- **Natural and Working Lands (NWL) Working Group** to develop draft recommendations for pesticides to bring back to the full EJAC at the next EJAC meeting

CARB:

- **Facilitation team & CARB** to share notes on pesticide discussion from today with NWL Work Group ASAP, for 12/17/21 WG meeting
- **CARB staff** will reach out to DPR and CalEPA to ask them to attend the next EJAC meeting discussion on pesticides (*DPR attended the April 25-26, 2022, EJAC meeting for pesticide discussion*)

- **CARB staff** to make a commitment to crowdsource the topics so that the right staff people are attending the meetings.
- Moving forward, **CARB staff** will post the notes from WG meetings on the website. *(completed in February 2022)*
 - **EJAC members** who have any concern with that should let CARB know ASAP.

2022 EJAC Meetings

Meeting Dates:

1. 1/25/22, 1:00 p.m. – 5:00 p.m.
2. 2/8/22, 1:00 p.m. – 5:00 p.m.
3. 2/28/22, 1:00 p.m. – 5:00 p.m., and 3/1/22, 1:00 p.m. – 5:00 p.m.
4. 3/10/22, 4:00 p.m. – 8:00 p.m. (Joint Meeting with CARB Board)
5. 3/30/22, 1:00 p.m. – 5:00 p.m.
6. 4/25/22, 1:00 p.m. – 5:00 p.m., and 4/26/22, 9:00 a.m. – 12:30 p.m.
7. 5/23/22, 1:00 p.m. – 5:00 p.m., and 5/24/22, 9:30 a.m. – 12:30 p.m.
8. 6/27/22, 1:00 p.m. – 5:00 p.m., and 6/28/22, 9:30 a.m. – 12:30 p.m.
9. 7/25/22, 1:00 p.m. – 5:00 p.m., and 7/26/22, 9:30 a.m. – 11:00 a.m.
10. 8/22/22, 1:00 p.m. – 5:00 p.m., and 8/23/22, 9:00 a.m. – 11:00 a.m.
11. 9/1/22, 1:00 p.m. – 6:00 p.m. (Joint Meeting with CARB Board)
12. 9/26/22, 12:30 p.m. – 4:00 p.m., and 9/27/22, 10:00 a.m. – 12:00 p.m.
13. 10/24/22, 2:30 p.m. – 5:00 p.m., and 10/25/22, 9:30 a.m. – 12:30 p.m.
14. 11/29/22, 2:30 p.m. – 6:00 p.m., and 11/30/22, 9:30 a.m. – 12:00 p.m.

January 25, 2022, EJAC Meeting ([Meeting Recording and Agenda](#))

At the January 2022 EJAC meeting, CARB presented [updates on activities to ensure Tribal representation on the EJAC](#), [updates on the PATHWAYS modeling assumptions](#) and how EJAC recommendations on scenario modeling inputs were incorporated into agency assumptions, and a [high-level review of CARB's responses to the 2017 EJAC recommendations](#), as well as an [update on progress since the 2017 Scoping Plan Update](#). EJAC co-chairs reported back on technical assistance to support the EJAC, and the Community Engagement working group reported back on community engagement efforts. The EJAC and CARB staff discussed expectations for EJAC involvement in the 2022 Scoping Plan process.

EJAC members made several recommendations for community engagement working groups, including stepping away from hard deadlines to focus on seeing where regions and topics can fit in. Specific workshop topics were discussed, as well as the recommendation to hold statewide topical workshops remotely and local workshops in-person where possible by coordinating with local planning partners.

EJAC members asked for further information or raised concerns about a variety of topics relating to the 2017 EJAC Recommendations and other CARB work, including:

- The extent and distribution of benefits from CARB programs in environmental justice communities (e.g., the Funding Agricultural Replacement Measures for Emission Reductions (FARMER) Program, criterion toxics reductions at oil refineries);
- How the 2022 Scoping Plan will incorporate EJAC recommendations (i.e., in an addendum or in the Scoping Plan itself);
- CARB auditing procedures for air pollution data submitted by companies; and
- A timeframe for the Cap-and-Trade Program reductions, and the relationship between the Cap-and-Trade Program and other programs (e.g., CAPCOA carbon market, San Joaquin Valley Emissions Reductions Credits).

EJAC members expressed concerns over new language in the PATHWAYS scenario assumptions about phasing down refining “in line with demand.” EJAC members recommended more discussion about the phase down in refinery production, that more be done on VMT, and that the phaseout of refining should instead be tied directly to the most feasible date, at least by 2045.

Action Items

EJAC:

- **Community Engagement Working Group** to:
 - Meet and discuss feedback from EJAC on proposed community engagement approach; will send out short survey to get info from EJAC members on what people want to see at events
 - Confirm final date for SJV community workshop
- **Working Groups** meet to develop draft recommendations by end of February 2022

CARB:

- **CARB staff (on behalf of co-chairs)** to share Technical Assistance scope of work and the results of the TA survey (*completed on 1/26/22 in follow-up email to EJAC*)
- **CARB staff** to share the letter from Eduardo Garcia that CARB referenced about the Cap-and-Trade Program (*completed on 1/26/22 in follow-up email to EJAC*)

February 8, 2022, EJAC Meeting ([Meeting Recording and Agenda](#))

At the February 8, 2022, EJAC meeting, CARB presented [updates](#) on the 2022 Scoping Plan development schedule and the status of adding Tribal representation to the EJAC. CARB presented [information about the statewide AB 617 Community Air Protection Program Technology Clearinghouse](#), which identifies technologies for reducing emissions of criteria pollutants and toxic air contaminants. The Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment (OEHHA) presented information on the [impacts and benefits of AB 32 and health](#) for EJAC discussion, and EJAC members

heard a [presentation on transportation justice](#) from the Environmental Health Coalition.

Regarding AB 32 impacts, EJAC members raised questions with representatives OEHHA about their recent [report](#). These questions addressed topics ranging from the limitations of the research and analysis in the report (e.g., margins of error, inclusion criteria for the industrial and electricity sectors) to what OEHHA is doing about gaps that have been identified in the report.

EJAC members raised questions or requests about several other processes and projects, including:

- How EJAC and CARB can work to make the AB 617 Community Air Protection Program Technology Clearinghouse more accessible for environmental justice community members; and
- Adding items to future EJAC meeting agendas, such as a briefing on the [petition for rulemaking to amend the LCFS](#) to a future EJAC meeting agenda, and a deeper discussion on the Cap-and-Trade Program.

The EJAC heard from the Environmental Health Coalition about their work on the 10 Transit Lifelines campaign in San Diego and how it could shape EJAC recommendations for the Scoping Plan. EJAC members supported the consideration of Environmental Health Coalition (EHC) recommendations as part of the EJAC recommendations to CARB for the Scoping Plan and requested that specific EHC recommendations (e.g., programs like Green Raiteros: Electric Rideshares for Rural Huron) be addressed in the transportation working group.

Action Items

EJAC:

- **EJAC co-chairs and CARB** discuss when/how to bring following topics to full EJAC discussion
 - LCFS (hear from petitioners on their petition for rulemaking to CARB)
 - The Cap-and-Trade Program (particularly offset project costs, where they have occurred)
- **EJAC co-chairs and CARB** to identify and communicate to EJAC members the process for compiling recommendations from all work groups
- **Working groups** meet and develop draft recommendations to review and discuss at the February 28, 2022 EJAC meeting

CARB:

- **CARB staff** to coordinate follow up with OEHHA to identify opportunity to further discuss report
 - **OEHHA** potentially to join upcoming working group meetings, if that is desired. *(completed – OEHHA attended the Cap-and-Trade Program workgroup meeting in March 2022)*

- **CARB staff** to follow up internally on EJAC questions about offset project costs.
- **CARB staff** to help coordinate EHC participation in transportation working group
 - Make sure EHC has meeting invite (*completed – EHC invited to February 2022 transportation workgroup meeting*)
 - Include EHC recommendations in materials for discussion (*completed*)
- **CARB staff** to help coordinate the inclusion of staff from the Department of Public Health in working group discussion. (*completed – CDPH invited to February 2022 public health & social costs workgroup meeting*)

February 28 – March 1, 2022, EJAC Meetings (Meeting Recordings and Agendas for [2/28](#), [3/1](#))

At the February 28, 2022, and March 1, 2022, EJAC meetings, CARB provided [updates](#) on the 2022 Scoping Plan development schedule and the status of adding Tribal representation to the EJAC. EJAC members discussed agenda development for the March 10, 2022, Joint EJAC - CARB Board meeting, voted on support of [a letter](#) from Environmental Justice Organizations on Addressing Public Health and Equity in the 2022 Scoping Plan Update, and reviewed the Draft EJAC Recommendations for the 2022 Scoping Plan Update.

In the discussion about the Joint EJAC CARB Board meeting, EJAC members raised several comments, including:

- That it would be important to make sure that multiple perspectives are represented when consensus is not there; and
- Discussion about timeline extension for the meeting, including because the EJAC was asked to develop recommendations without GHG modeling, which contributed to delays.

Martha Dina Argüello, Physicians for Social Responsibility – Los Angeles, and Connie Cho, Communities for a Better Environment, presented an overview of the Letter from Environmental Justice Organizations on Addressing Public Health and Equity in the 2022 Scoping Plan update in the February 28, 2022, meeting. EJAC members discussed information from it and how it could be incorporated into EJAC recommendations, including the quantification and health equity pieces.

EJAC members reviewed the draft EJAC recommendations for the 2022 Scoping Plan, and discussed information from each working group. Comments raised by EJAC members are included below, separated by category:

Fossil Fuel:

- EJAC members expressed that further information was needed from CARB on CCS options with or without injection, and that worst case scenarios needed to be further considered.

- EJAC members expressed interest in clarification on how regulations apply to refineries, including the refinery investment credit program, to cover ranges of risks.

Overarching:

- EJAC members expressed concern that specific oversight strategies are needed for the implementation of CCUS in the long-term, and raised Governor’s staff and IPCC comments on the limitations of CCUS.
- EJAC members suggested increasing funding for participatory and community-based research, as well as the possibility of a special district to implement a California carbon bank.
- EJAC members suggested including principles of “do no harm” and harm reduction in the overarching recommendations for accountability, and to develop guidelines to ensure investments and programs match communities where they are most needed before funding is released.
- EJAC members commented that the Scoping Plan must ensure to not prevent current agreements between tribal nations and the state.

Manufacturing:

- EJAC members expressed the concern that more time was needed for consideration of manufacturing, since it is a broad category that could drive investments and efforts for decades.
- EJAC members expressed repeated interest in technical documents and expert resources for education about technologies like regenerative heat or solar heating technology. They also asked how the Scoping Plan would affect the manufacturing sector, and asked for a clearinghouse on the subject.
- EJAC members expressed that the model of engagement with communities through a just transition process should include investment in building up the transition workforce across the state, especially where natural resources will be extracted from those communities.

Public Health:

- EJAC members expressed that they would like the California Department of Public Health to be asked to work on tracking and health analysis with HIPPA-compliant data, which would require an invitation from CARB. A member noted that this should involve a recommendation for significant investment in the CDPH Office of Health Equity’s programs around actions for walkable communities.
- EJAC members expressed that a statement should be included on how tribal lands and ancestral lands for traditional use will be impacted by the Scoping Plan.

Non-Fossil Fuels:

- EJAC members had several comments on current recommendations, including to add incentivizing and mandatory grey water systems for housing units, to

add rooftop solar and microgrid systems, to form siting rules for consideration of what counts as clean generation, and to avoid taking agricultural lands out of use for solar capacity-building.

- EJAC members discussed the need to acknowledge and recognize that tribes are governments that have status equal to or greater than the state.

Cap and Trade:

- EJAC members discussed the increased opportunities for Cap-and-Trade Program enforcement with a new legal team, as well as other changes.
- EJAC members discussed the need to have further inclusion of tribal communities in current recommendations, and to further ground-truth with organizations' members.

Natural and Working Lands:

- EJAC members discussed the importance of including all agricultural emissions in the Scoping Plan.
- EJAC members raised comments and additions for inclusion in the recommendations about tribal sovereignty.

March 10, 2022, Joint EJAC-CARB Board Meeting ([Meeting Recording and Agenda](#))

On March 10, 2022, the EJAC met with the CARB Board in a joint meeting to discuss the [EJAC's preliminary draft recommendations](#) for the development of the draft 2022 Scoping Plan. The EJAC Co-Chairs presented an overview of major EJAC concerns and desired outcome for the Scoping Plan. EJAC sub quorum working group leads presented draft recommendations.

March 30, 2022, EJAC Meeting ([Meeting Recording and Agenda](#))

At the March 30, 2022, EJAC meeting, CARB presented [updates](#) on the 2022 Scoping Plan development schedule, hybrid meetings, and the [2022 Scoping Plan Update Initial Modeling Results](#). The co-chairs provided updates on technical assistance. EJAC members discussed EJAC governance and community engagement efforts, and reviewed Draft EJAC Recommendations for the 2022 Scoping Plan Update. Dr. Catherine Garoupa was confirmed as the third EJAC co-chair.

EJAC members raised questions about the initial modeling of the Scoping Plan, including:

- How many EJAC recommendations CARB would incorporate into the draft Scoping Plan, and what authority CARB has to unilaterally decide not to include recommendations;
- Whether Alternatives 1 and 2 align with existing statutes and Executive Orders;

- Which strategies and tools are included in the modeling (e.g. traditional cultural burning, fuel sources for electrification) and how the model was constructed/updated; and
- Whether EJAC could create new hybrid sets of measures that choose from different scenarios.

EJAC members had several suggestions or requests for technical assistance. These included:

- Further support for coalitions representing EJ perspectives to participate in the process beyond EJAC, with a particular emphasis on the border region;
- A deeper discussion on technical information that should be made available to tribes, especially around how recommendations and scenarios would impact them;
- Further technical assistance around several key topics, such as the energy transition, transportation, and natural and working lands (NWL) forest management and carbon sequestration.

EJAC members discussed some of the next steps for EJAC recommendations. Potential steps forward included a legislative briefing to share recommendations more widely, EJAC work to develop clear asks for CARB on specific aspects of the next round of modeling, and further refinement of recommendations to explicitly name direct emissions reductions and point out Early Action Measures. In this refinement process, EJAC members raised the questions of how the process can connect with ground truthing and how to engage communities in localizing the recommendations.

Action Items

EJAC:

- **EJAC Meeting Planning Team (CARB/EJAC co-chairs/facilitation team)** to add Building Energy, Equity and Power (BEEP) community engagement report back to April 2022 EJAC meeting agenda; add report back on San Joaquin Valley community workshop to May 2022 EJAC meeting agenda
- **EJAC co-chairs** to discuss approach to planning to present at Board meetings
- **EJAC co-chairs** to follow up with CARB about speaking at the April 7, 2022, Board meeting
- **CARB & EJAC co-chairs** connect to coordinate resending out information to the whole EJAC on the TA survey
- **Martha Dina Argüello** to follow up with EJAC members on remaining unresolved questions on preliminary recommendations
- **EJAC co-chairs** to work on Technical assistance plan to propose to the EJAC.
- **EJAC co-chairs & Overarching Working Group** to plan informational CCUS meeting/workshop
 - Matt Holmes sent out Doodle poll to Overarching Working Group; **WG members** to respond

CARB:

- **CARB staff (OEJ)** to follow up with Kevin Hamilton on potential satellite meeting location in the Central Valley (*June 2022 EJAC meeting included a Fresno satellite location*)
- **CARB staff (OEJ)** to follow up with the EJAC to clarify who can receive travel reimbursement for travel to in person meetings
- **CARB staff (OEJ)** to follow up on question about in person quorum (*completed on 4/6 in follow-up email to EJAC*)
- **CARB** to add Dr. Catherine to co-chair planning calls (*Dr. Catherine was added to future Co-Chairs meetings*)
- **CARB (ISD)** to follow up with EJAC on request to share information on the changes and updates made to the PATHWAYS model since the last time it was used for the Scoping Plan
- **CARB staff** to compile questions received and take back to appropriate staff to develop answers

April 25-26, 2022, EJAC Meetings (Meeting Recordings and Agendas for [4/25](#), [4/26](#))

At the April 25-26, 2022, EJAC meetings, CARB provided [updates](#) on the 2022 Scoping Plan development schedule and the status of adding Tribal representation to the EJAC, the [2022 Scoping Plan Update Initial Air Quality and Health Impacts and Economic Analyses Results](#), including a [specific update on Natural and Working Lands](#), and EJAC permanence. EJAC co-chairs presented an [update on technical assistance](#). EJAC members heard an [overview of community engagement efforts](#) from members of the Building Energy, Equity, and Power (BEEP) Coalition, and discussed pesticides in the 2022 Scoping Plan Update with the Department of Pesticide Regulation (DPR).

EJAC members raised several questions to CARB about the health and economic modeling being developed for the 2022 Scoping Plan. These questions covered topics including:

- How IMPLAN macroeconomic modeling works with other models and what it can be used to calculate;
- How data is managed within CARB (e.g., data bias, determination of “best available” data);
- Whether modeling includes particular components (e.g., costs of decentralized clean energy, specific health benefits/costs for CCS); and
- Whether it is possible to conduct annual evaluation of Alternatives #1 and #3, rather than episodic evaluation?

EJAC members discussed pesticide use and regulation and raised several key issues/ideas/concerns. One suggestion was that CDFA and DPR need to make firm commitments to reduce or eliminate the worst pesticides, reduce the rest, adopt alternative farming methods, and restore soil health. Another related to the Scoping

Plan, suggesting that chemical herbicides should be excluded from it because they are not climate-smart. EJAC members expressed interest in a community support fund with resources from DPR to prevent synthetic pesticide use, and requested further information from DPR about agency pesticide studies.

EJAC members reflected on community engagement strategies and inclusion in the Scoping Plan, with reflections on the Building Energy, Equity and Power (BEEP) presentation. They noted that community health workers/promotoras are key, and that the state needs to fund grassroots programs around building decarbonization and increase interagency coordination. EJAC members suggested finding new strategies for engagement, like filtering community engagement results through the EJAC to incorporate into recommendations, or sharing results directly with CARB staff. They also suggested creating a backup plan for regions without community engagement organization, to fill the gaps.

Regarding EJAC permanence and budgeting, EJAC members established several components of the vision for what EJAC can look like and achieve. These included:

- Focusing on co-design of the entire Scoping Plan process, with further involvement in designing all public workshops and further tracking of implementation progress (i.e., ensuring accountability);
- Using EJAC permanence to incorporate EJAC knowledge into other agency processes, such as regulatory and research processes, the State Implementation Plan, rule-making approaches, Tribal relations, and interagency coordination;
- Increase direct meetings with CARB staff to discuss issues of concern, so that discussion can be more productive (like the EJAC Low Carbon Fuel Standard discussion with CARB staff);
- Build off the Energy Commission/Public Utilities Commission Disadvantaged Communities Advisory Group (DACAG) model, and serve as a model for other agencies; and
- Develop budgetary allocation from the legislature to fund standard staffing arrangements (like other advisory boards), adjust stipends to level of effort put in, include community participation stipends, and fund further modeling.

Action Items

EJAC:

- **EJAC members** fill out community engagement survey if have not done so already.
- **EJAC members** work with Colin and Sarina to complete and submit community engagement proposals to CARB ASAP.
- **Co-chairs & EJAC members** identify potential opportunities in the timeline to advocate for permanent EJAC funding support for the May 2022 budget revision.

CARB:

- **CARB staff** to send EJAC members link to map of air quality monitors used for CMAQ modeling.
- **CARB staff** to follow up on modeling related requests for information (Assumptions and details on CCS & DAC; numbers/types of jobs; annual evaluation of health impacts for Alts #1 & #3).
- **Chanell** to follow up with names of CCS projects (e.g., Petra Nova).
- **Chanell** to follow up with DPR to discuss scheduling a meeting; will coordinate with co-chairs to have a discussion with the EJAC NWL workgroup.
 - Meeting topics include further discussion of agency approach to glyphosate, DPR's approach to estimating risk, and pesticide project data and methodology.
- **CARB staff** follow up with EJAC to clarify request to CDFA and DPR on written commitment regarding reduction of pesticides. (*completed on 7/13/22 in follow-up email to EJAC*)
- **CARB staff** to follow up with EJAC on the status of the request to translate the draft Scoping Plan into Spanish and Chinese by May 10, 2022. ([Draft Scoping Plan in English, Spanish, and Chinese](#))
- **CARB staff** to share timeline for the May 2022 budget revise. (*Governor's Budget Process Update presented at the May 2022 EJAC meeting*)

May 23-24, 2022, EJAC Meetings (Meeting Recordings and Agendas for [5/23](#), [5/24](#))

At the May 23-24, 2022, EJAC meetings, the primary focus was the [draft 2022 Scoping Plan Update](#). CARB provided [updates](#) on the 2022 Scoping Plan development schedule, and the Governor's budget process. The EJAC asked questions and provided comments and suggestions related to the draft Plan and the topics covered therein. EJAC members also [presented outcomes from the February 2022 community engagement workshop](#) on the 2022 Scoping Plan Update, held in the San Joaquin Valley and gave updates on other planned community engagement events. EJAC members heard a [presentation from Regenerate California](#) on the 2022 Scoping Plan related to the electricity sector.

EJAC members asked several questions about the draft Scoping Plan, including questions around:

- How EJAC will be involved in the implementation of the Scoping Plan, and what the role of a permanent EJAC can be in that process;
- How EJAC can be involved in co-planning the communication strategy for the Scoping Plan;
- How much of the agency's budget is allocated for EJAC's work now, permanent EJAC, and for the Office of Environmental Justice; and
- What the staffing structure is at CARB, and who worked on the draft Plan (e.g. how many engineers, cultural anthropologists)?

EJAC members made several requests to CARB about Scoping Plan development, including:

- For EJAC to co-design a summer workshop on public health, and for public health to be prioritized further in the Scoping Plan;
- For a more detailed written response to how EJAC recommendations were incorporated in the draft, including details on who wrote the sections, the consultation process, and CARB's limitations;
- For further discussion with CARB staff on assumptions and data about lithium extraction to ground truth the information;
- For information on past memoranda of understanding (MOU) in the border region, with qualification and quantification;

EJAC members provided a wide range of comments and suggestions on the draft Scoping Plan. These consisted of comments on public health, impacts to tribes, CCS inclusion, fossil fuels and transportation, natural and working lands, and other sectors. Comments and suggestions included noting that:

- *General:* The Scoping Plan should reflect three pillars of EJ: to address cumulative impacts, use the precautionary principle, and have meaningful public participation;
- *General:* The draft Scoping Plan used EJ language, but without EJ assumptions for inputs into modeling, raising concerns about greenwashing and whitewashing in the draft Plan;
- *General:* Further discussions are needed with Plan authors to ground truth, and CARB needs include community-based research in its modeling because local people know what the problems are that affect them;
- *General:* Further engagement would be helpful around quantification of enforcement actions on emissions reductions, region definitions and clear frameworks for defining regions accurately, and substantive agreements with border communities;
- *Public Health:* Significant concern that CARB proposes Alternative 3 as the proposed scenario, because public health is not its main focus, but the Plan should be more ambitious around public health for frontline workers like farmworkers, as well as other vulnerable populations with outdoor pollution burdens like homeless people;
- *Impact to Tribes:* Not every tribe has historic preservation offices, and CARB needs to engage in further discussion with tribal leaders and attorneys to discuss impacts to cultural resources and engage in consultation for project-specific mitigation, or may face lengthy litigation;
- *Impact to Tribes:* Tribes are involved in efforts to address climate change, but these efforts may require further support---for example, the Hoopa Tribe received a grant to put in electric vehicle charging stations, but after two years, the chargers are dead because electrical infrastructure does not support them;

- *CCS*: Significant concerns about the continued inclusion of CCS in all pathway scenarios because of built-in assumptions in the modeling, which implies potential expansion of current fossil fuel infrastructure in disadvantaged communities;
- *CCS*: The draft Plan relies on risky technologies like engineered carbon management instead of using the precautionary approach---these strategies need much stronger guardrails and protections from CARB, and ignore adverse impacts to EJ communities and significant research that states CCS releases more CO₂ than it removes;
- *Fossil Fuels and Transportation*: The draft Plan relies heavily on VMT reductions and electric vehicles (EVs), but this raises major concerns about lithium mining impacts in the Imperial Valley and other areas, and may leave many people behind;
- *Fossil Fuels and Transportation*: The draft Plan needs to include a plan for a full phase-out of fossil fuels, otherwise there are huge gaps in strategy as EVs are mostly powered by the grid, which still includes a large portion of natural gas (40 percent);
- *Natural and Working Lands*: There is not enough engagement with pesticide issues beyond a mention on page 65 of the Scoping Plan, and further EJAC recommendations have not been implemented;
- *Natural and Working Lands*: Further interagency coordination is needed for addressing climate change to avoid planning at cross purposes;
- *Other Sectors*: The Cap-and-Trade Program needs more robust analysis, and there is the question of whether CARB is the appropriate entity to be assessing itself and its own program;
- *Other Sectors*: The Plan should not prioritize investor-owned utilities, but rather prioritize the needs of frontline communities (e.g. community-owned microgrids like Blue Lake Rancheria's, and decentralized rooftop solar with energy storage);

EJAC co-chair Dr. Catherine Garoupa and EJAC members Tom Helme, Matt Holmes, and Juan Flores gave an overview of the February 2022 workshop and key takeaways (see presentation slides [here](#)). They shared several takeaways, including:

- That community members are generally excited for the energy transformation, and knowledgeable about renewable energy possibilities;
- That people understand the issues with natural gas appliances, and want the electricity powering electric appliances to not come from generators polluting their communities;
- That workshop participants were critical of carbon capture and sequestration given groundwater reserve concerns, and expressed disbelief that money will be spent on "silly things" instead of basic things; and
- That communities ask above all that the state put EJ communities at the forefront of the transition.

Action Items

EJAC:

- **All members** to attend respective Work Group meetings to discuss topic/sector specific issues and recommendations.
 - Request for further discussion and closer look at underlying assumptions of CCS deployment in the refinery sector (Fossil Fuel Industry & Transportation WG).
- **EJAC co-chairs** to convene Ad Hoc work group to develop presentation for June 2022 Board meeting
 - EJAC presentation materials should be provided to CARB no less than 3 days in advance of the Board meeting (by June 20, 2022)

CARB:

- **CARB staff** to schedule Work Group meetings as soon as possible (high priority for all to meet in advance of June 15, 2022, so that Board Presentation Ad hoc Workgroup can prepare). *(completed – workgroup meetings held in June 2022)*
- **CARB staff** to develop written response to EJAC questions/requests. CARB will share draft list with co-chairs to confirm.
- **CARB staff** to confirm internally with Legal staff the answer to outstanding questions regarding options for meeting quorum in a hybrid meeting setup. *(completed on 6/10/22 in follow-up email to EJAC)*

June 27-28, 2022, EJAC Meetings (Meeting Recordings and Agendas for [6/27](#), [6/28](#))

At the June 2022 EJAC meetings, CARB presented [updates](#) on 2022 Scoping Plan development activities, and presented information on the underlying assumptions for [Carbon Capture Utilization and Storage \(CCUS\) and Direct Air Capture \(DAC\)](#) in the Draft 2022 Scoping Plan Update, and on CARB's current CCUS monitoring protocol under the Low Carbon Fuel Standard. EJAC members additionally heard an update from the EJAC Fossil Fuel Industry Working Group and a [presentation](#) from Comité Civico del Valle on lithium extraction in the Salton Sea. The EJAC discussed next steps for finalizing EJAC recommendations for the 2022 Scoping Plan Update.

EJAC members expressed several comments and questions about [CCUS and DAC assumptions](#) in the draft Scoping Plan after presentations from staff in CARB's Industrial Strategies Division. These comments and questions included:

- Emphasizing the need for lifecycle assessments of all the technological options for the areas that are difficult to electrify, as well as for CCS and the solvents and chemicals used for CCS/CCUS and DAC;
- Emphasizing the importance of informed prior consent through community-based decisions on what risks are acceptable, given concern about the history of failed monitoring and the experimental nature of this technology;
- Asking about the health and safety thresholds that CARB sets for carbon capture certification and how they are updated; and

- Emphasizing that CCUS facilities are expensive, and those financial resources could be used for other strategies like natural storage, rather than additional sequestering infrastructure in communities already living with oil and gas wells and refineries.

Janira Figueroa, Comité Civico del Valle, shared a presentation on lithium extraction in the Salton Sea area and Imperial County. Luis Olmedo, Comité Civico del Valle, shared information about the Lithium Valley Commission, on which he serves. The commission is currently developing a report on their recommendations. He emphasized the importance of early involvement of EJ communities to help ensure equitable investments in communities, and to ensure extraction is conducted in the best way possible to reduce emissions, waste streams, and water use.

EJAC members discussed next steps for finalizing the EJAC recommendations for the 2022 Scoping Plan. Since CARB is planning to conduct several updates and revisions to the modeling, as well as follow up on Board direction and questions from the June 2022 Board meeting, EJAC members felt it was important to receive those updates from CARB to better inform any needed revisions to the current EJAC recommendations. In the meantime, the EJAC agreed that work groups should meet over the next few weeks and report back at the July 2022 meeting on the following questions:

- Is the work group updating their recommendations, and if so, by when?
- How is the work group pivoting to implementation plans?
- Work groups are also asked to integrate public comments and feedbacks, where relevant and identify any topics or areas of discussion that are missing.

EJAC members raised several other points on the topic of Scoping Plan recommendations, including that:

- The EJAC would like to know if there will be a sensitivity analysis, and if there has been a cost benefit analysis of mass transit;
- The EJAC should consider how to include comments that have been submitted by other organizations, coalitions, etc., to see where EJAC recommendations align with public comments;
- There is a need to incorporate community workshop outcomes, impacts to tribes, and cultural views that have not been fully considered so far into the EJAC recommendations; and
- There is concern that the EJAC recommendations and learning is not reaching the Board, so EJAC members would like to explore ways the EJAC can get the Board to be more aware of the issues in discussion, as well as to include an opportunity for formal feedback from the Board and/or CARB staff on the recommendations.

Action Items

EJAC:

- **All members** to attend respective work group meetings to discuss topic/sector specific issues and recommendations.
- **Work groups** should plan to report back at the July meeting on the following questions:
 - Is the work group updating their recommendations, and if so, by when?
 - How is the work group pivoting to implementation plans?
 - Work groups are also asked to integrate public comments and feedbacks, where relevant and identify any topics or areas of discussion that are missing.
- **Co-chairs** to reach out to potential hosts for July 2022, August 2022, and September 2022 meetings (proposed locations are San Diego, Los Angeles, and Fresno, respectively).
 - Follow up with EJAC member John Harriel, Jr. on coordinating tour of net zero training trucks.

CARB:

- **CARB staff** to develop written response to EJAC requests for follow up on the following items:
 - Bagley-Keene compliance and what constitutes compliance in a hybrid meeting setup. *(completed on 7/12/22 in follow-up email to EJAC)*
 - Potential legal and/or CEQA compliance issues related to the timeline for translating the draft Scoping Plan into Spanish and Mandarin (e.g., the translated materials were not available within the 45-day comment period).

July 25-26, 2022, EJAC Meetings (Meeting Recordings and Agendas for [7/25](#), [7/26](#))

On July 25 and 26, 2022, the EJAC convened to discuss updates on the 2022 Scoping Plan development schedule, hear updates on Community Engagement efforts, and hear from Work Groups on the status of sector-specific recommendations and ideas for the implementation phase of the Scoping Plan. The EJAC planned to present final recommendations to the California Air Resources Board (CARB) at a joint EJAC - CARB Board meeting on September 1, 2022. CARB [presented updates](#) on 2022 Scoping Plan development activities.

In addition, EJAC members received presentations on the Low Carbon Fuel Standard (LCFS) from invited guest speakers Dr. Maureen McCue from [Physicians for Social Responsibility Iowa](#), and Jamie Katz of the [Leadership Council for Justice and Accountability](#). The primary meeting location was San Diego, with opportunity to participate via zoom.

Sharifa Taylor, Communities for a Better Environment, EJAC Co-Chair, provided an overview of [the EJAC 2022 Community Engagement Synthesis Report](#) (English and Spanish versions), highlighting key sections. EJAC members shared several comments and questions regarding community engagement efforts, including:

- Expressing appreciation for efforts from the EJAC Community Engagement Work Group;
- Recognizing that lack of funding for follow-up activities significantly hinders continued engagement, and encouraging CARB to set high standards for community engagement moving forward; and
- Requesting that Spanish and traditional Chinese written translations of the report be made available in the future immediately upon publication of the English version of the report.

Dr. Catherine Garoupa, Central Valley Air Quality Coalition, EJAC Co-Chair, invited representatives from the various Work Groups to provide updates on the development of recommendations, including indicating which recommendations have been revised, finalized, and/or should be prioritized for discussion. These updates are summarized as follows:

- *Cap-and-Trade Program*: Recommended that CARB should initiate a program review of the Cap-and-Trade Program, and that an adaptive management dashboard to monitor pollutant levels in communities be prioritized.
- *Overarching*: Recommended that no CCUS be included in the Scoping Plan, and that there should be further effort towards interagency collaboration, Tribal consultation and effective collaboration with Advisory Committees.
- *Non-fossil fuel energy*: Did not meet since the June 2022 EJAC meeting, but will meet in advance of the August 2022 EJAC meeting to provide an updated list of recommendations.
- *Fuel industry and transportation*: Discussed the need to develop a fossil fuel phaseout plan that accounts for moral hazards issues.
- *Natural and working lands*: Waiting on modeling updates from CARB before providing additional recommendations but remains concerned about dairy digesters incentivizing dairy growth without addressing the need to capture enteric emissions, as well as concerned about groundwater pollution from industrial agriculture and CCUS incentivization of biomass burning. The Work Group supports an increase in organic farming and sustainable agricultural practices, application of grey water to farms and landscapes, whole orchard recycling, replenishment of groundwater aquifers, coastal and river ecological restoration, and natural carbon sequestration methods.
- *Manufacturing*: Did not meet since the June 2022 EJAC meeting, but overall recommendations still stand.

Dr. Maureen McCue, Physicians for Social Responsibility (PSR) Iowa, provided a presentation entitled: [Ethanol & Pipelines: Unintended Consequences from Iowa to California](#). She discussed how industrial agriculture and monocropping of corn and

soybeans is destroying communities of rural Iowa and creating major health hazards. She stated that ethanol and Carbon Capture and Storage (CCS) are false solutions for climate change.

Brett Newell and Jamie Katz, Leadership Council for Justice and Accountability, next provided a presentation entitled: [Fatal Flaws in the Low Carbon Fuel Standard and the Scoping Plan: Environmental Injustice in the Proliferation of Factory Farm Gas](#). They discussed four primary flaws in the LCFS regarding dairy biogas, and further provided three recommendations for the Scoping Plan.

Finally, EJAC members began exploratory discussions for their role in supporting the implementation of the 2022 Scoping Plan. An Ad Hoc Work Group to discuss the EJAC's role in AB 32 implementation post-Scoping Plan adoption was suggested by CARB staff. The Work Group may discuss future EJAC governance structure and Scoping Plan implementation, as well as identify pertinent AB 32 topics on which to advise CARB.

Action Items

EJAC:

- **Committee Members** interested to join the September 1, 2022, EJAC - CARB meeting Planning Group contact Ambreen Afshan no later than Friday 7/29/22.
- **Matt Holmes** to share presentations from 6/29/22 *Dairy Digester Workshop* with Ambreen Afshan for circulation to broader Committee.
- **Working Groups** to continue refining recommendations for presenting at upcoming September 1, 2022, Joint EJAC – CARB meeting.

California Air Resources Board (CARB):

- **CARB staff** to share information related to penetration of carbon intensity levels with Matt Holmes and other interested Committee members.

August 22-23, 2022 EJAC Meetings (Meeting Recordings and Agendas for [8/22](#), [8/23](#))

On August 22 and 23, 2022, the EJAC convened to hear and discuss updates on the 2022 Scoping Plan development schedule, hear from Work Groups on the status of sector-specific recommendations to the Scoping Plan, and prepare to present updated recommendations to the California Air Resources Board (CARB) at a joint EJAC - CARB Board meeting on September 1, 2022. CARB provided [updates](#) on 2022 Scoping Plan development activities, including updates on planning for the Ad Hoc September 1, 2022 Planning Workgroup and updates on changes to the Scoping Plan based on the Board and Governor's directions.

Rajinder Sahota, Deputy Executive Officer for Climate Change and Research, provided an overview of the expected changes for the Final 2022 Scoping Plan, as outlined in

the document "[Proposed Changes for the Final 2022 Scoping Plan, August 22-23, 2022, EJAC Meeting](#)" on the EJAC website. EJAC members expressed several comments and questions, including:

- That the Scoping Plan should clearly outline a Just Transition as the states moves towards clean fuel production, phasing out reliance on oil and gas; and
- That NWL as carbon sinks should be a priority focus before engineered carbon removal efforts, with an emphasis on interagency cooperation (e.g., with the California Natural Resources Agency).

Representatives from the various Work Groups first provided brief updates on the development of recommendations, then discussed which recommendations and/or topics should be prioritized for discussion at the joint EJAC-Board meeting.

Action Items

EJAC:

- **Members** to submit written comments on the draft Infographic/Roadmap *Path to Real Zero* to Trish Johnson no later than August 24, 2022, at noon. Ms. Johnson will compile comments and send to Martha Dina Argüello for incorporation.
- **Co-Chairs** to submit updated recommendations and companion materials to Trish Johnson, CARB, no later than August 25, 2022, for posting and circulation in advance of the September 1, 2022, EJAC – CARB Board meeting.

California Air Resources Board (CARB):

- **CARB staff** to support posting and distribution of September 1, 2022, meeting materials. ([AB 32 Environmental Justice Advisory Committee Meeting - September 1, 2022 | California Air Resources Board](#))

September 1, 2022, Joint EJAC-CARB Board Meeting ([Meeting Recording and Agenda](#))

On September 1, 2022, the EJAC met with the CARB Board in a joint meeting to discuss the EJAC's recommendations for the development of the final 2022 Scoping Plan. The EJAC Co-Chairs presented information to guide the Board's understanding of their recommendations in a [letter](#) directed to the Chair of the Board, as well as in an [infographic](#) that laid out a summary of the recommendations offered.

In addition, EJAC sub quorum working groups presented information about their recommendations and work for [Natural and Working Lands](#) and [the Cap-and-Trade Program](#), in separate handouts. EJAC members provided additional updates on community engagement work completed in the process of developing their recommendations, including with a [summary of results from community listening sessions](#), and an [update on tribal engagement](#).

September 26-27, 2022, EJAC Meetings (Meeting Recordings and Agendas for [9/26](#), [9/27](#))

On September 26 and 27, 2022, the EJAC convened to hear and discuss updates on the 2022 Scoping Plan development schedule, debrief the September 1, 2022, joint EJAC - CARB Board meeting, discuss EJAC governance and take action to approve an interim EJAC co-chair, and discussion and take action to finalize their recommendations for the 2022 Scoping Plan Update. CARB provided [updates](#) on the 2022 Scoping Plan development schedule.

Trish Johnson, OEJ, CARB, provided a brief recap of the September 1, 2022, joint EJAC - CARB meeting, a discussion of EJAC recommendations and on developing the Final 2022 Scoping Plan. The meeting began with opening remarks by EJAC Co-Chairs, followed by an overview of the EJAC Roadmap, or “path for real-zero alternative.” AB 52 Consultation with Tribes was next discussed. The EJAC then initiated dialogue with Board members on the following four priority topics: (1) Just transition and refinery phaseout, (2) Natural and working lands (NWL), (3) Carbon market, the Cap-and-Trade Program, and (4) Carbon capture use and storage (CCUS). The Board Chair issued direction, identified key issues for consideration, and commented upon several of these topics.

EJAC members shared comments and questions on the provided overview and the joint CARB Board/EJAC meeting, including:

- Support from several members for increased interagency and interdepartmental coordination, as well as support from most members for more regular interaction with CARB Board members;
- Several members were in support of increased attendance by CARB Board members and staff at toxic tours;
- Several members agreed that enforcement should be addressed in this Scoping Plan update;
- Several EJAC members suggested exploring the issue of methane pipe leaks and use of methane monitoring satellites;
- Several EJAC members raised issues that may not be receiving sufficient Board or Scoping Plan attention, including lithium and other minerals that are crucial for transportation strategies, and health effects of poor air quality as a metric for monitoring and implementation; and
- EJAC members repeated the request for a document outlining CARB staff composition, and requested further analysis of how emissions reductions strategies map to environmental justice benefits.

EJAC members shared feedback on the matter of EJAC permanence. They further commented upon the EJAC’s existing structure and shared ideas for governance structure under the assumption of a permanent Committee beginning in 2023.

Members were reminded of the [draft 2021 Guiding Principles](#). All members stated their support for EJAC permanence. Comments included:

- That improvements can be made to organization and communication among Working Groups and the full Committee;
- That increased community engagement efforts are needed, perhaps through regional community listening sessions;
- That CARB should provide more resources to Committee members to expand successful efforts, which may include financial support and more regular and meaningful engagement with staff in CARB departments like the Industrial Strategies Division; and
- That the first several months of 2023 could be used to design a permanent EJAC.

Following open discussion on EJAC governance/permanence, members considered the temporarily vacant Co-Chair seat due to Martha Dina Argüello's sabbatical until January 2023. Co-chair Dr. Catherine Garoupa, Central Valley Air Quality Coalition, described associated responsibilities and estimated weekly level of effort. J. Kevin Jefferson III, Urban Releaf, was nominated to fill the position of interim Co-Chair. Members acted to unanimously appoint Mr. Jefferson to this position.

This meeting provided the final opportunity for members to collectively discuss needed or proposed updates to various recommendations prior to finalization and submission to CARB for inclusion in the 2022 Scoping Plan update. Members were requested to submit final text for recommendations to Trish Johnson, OEJ, CARB, and Mark Wilson, CCP, no later than 9:00 am Friday, September 30, 2022, for compilation. Mr. Wilson will then compile finalized recommendations for the 2022 Scoping Plan update and submit to CARB on behalf of the EJAC no later than 5:00 pm Friday, September 30, 2022.

During day 1 of the meeting, representatives from the various Work Groups provided brief updates on the development of respective recommendations. Committee members asked questions, issued feedback, raised concerns or issued support for any recommendation still under development. Recommendations *not* raised for group discussion on day 1 were considered final.

Following the conclusion of the meeting on day 1, several Work Groups met in separate locations to continue developing recommendations with consideration of the comments shared by fellow Committee members.

On day 2, Work Groups reported out on work conducted since the previous day. Several revised recommendations were shared on-screen, and comments captured/revisions made real-time by Mr. Wilson.

Following discussion, Committee members voted unanimously to approve the suite of recommendations for finalization and submission. Mr. Wilson will work with identified

Committee members to obtain final text, compile all recommendations and associated materials, including an updated cover letter, and submit the package to CARB by September 30, 2022.

Action Items

EJAC:

- **Working Group Members** to submit final text for recommendations to Trish Johnson and Mark Wilson no later than 9:00 am Friday, September 30, 2022, for compilation.
- **Mark Wilson** to compile finalized recommendations for the 2022 Scoping Plan update and submit to CARB on behalf of the EJAC no later than 5:00 pm Friday, September 30, 2022.

CARB:

- **Trish Johnson** to identify the minimum amount of time for the comment period for the Scoping Plan and inform the EJAC. *(completed – CARB shared verbally during October 2022 EJAC meeting)*

October 24-25, 2022, EJAC Meetings (Meeting Recordings and Agendas for [10/24](#), [10/25](#))

At the October 24-25, 2022, EJAC Meetings, CARB provided [updates](#) on the recirculated draft Environmental Analysis (EA) and [on transparency requirements](#) for Advisory Committees, including Bagley-Keene Open Meeting Act, conflict of interest requirements under Gov. Code section 87104, and Public Records Act requirements. CARB also presented a Permanent EJAC Proposal. The EJAC further discussed EJAC governance and permanence, and debriefed the Fresno community tour.

Carey Bylin, Industrial Strategies Division (ISD), CARB, provided a brief overview of the recirculated draft EA. The EA assesses the environmental impacts of implementing the Scoping Plan. CARB released the draft EA in May 2022. Subsequently, CARB received new direction from the Board and Governor's Office to add new information to the EA, including updated project descriptions, offshore wind energy, revised carbon removal, and more. As the updates were substantial, the draft EA was recirculated for a 45-day comment period on September 9, 2022.

Trish Johnson, Office of Environmental Justice (OEJ), CARB, reviewed a document outlining [CARB Advisory Committee Transparency Requirements](#). The document provides a summary and reminder of key components of transparency-related legal requirements for advisory committees of CARB. These advisory groups include the Assembly Bill 617 Consultation Group, Environmental Justice Advisory Committee, Research Screening Committee, and the Scientific Review Panel on Toxic Air Contaminants. The document serves as a high-level overview and general reference on the following three topics: the Bagley-Keene Open Meeting Act, the Conflicts of Interest Rules, and the Public Records Act. EJAC members had several comments and questions, including:

- Asking for clarification and examples on the legal difference between EJAC providing recommendations to CARB and influencing CARB on decisions related to community engagement;
- Expressing concern that this memo is an indication that EJAC will not be able to have open dialogue with CARB, and concern over the ability to advise CARB without violating regulations;
- Asking for further clarification on what constitutes an official gathering or meeting, on when Committee members are considered organizational representatives versus individuals, and on how legal requirements apply to contracts and grants;
- Asking if CARB would support EJAC with legal representation to avoid conflicts of interest, and suggesting reform to the AB 32 statutory requirement for the EJAC; and
- Requesting that CARB staff and legal team consider the topic of Advisory Committee Conflict of Interest policy by way of scenarios to make the issues clearer.

Chanell Fletcher, Deputy Executive Officer, OEJ, CARB, provided an overview of recent discussions on EJAC permanence. In July 2022, CARB proposed an Ad Hoc EJAC Permanence Workgroup to discuss the EJAC's role in AB 32 implementation post Scoping Plan adoption. In September 2022, CARB heard EJAC's thoughts and suggestions on this proposal. CARB continues to refine its EJAC permanence proposal, specifically regarding internal coordination and resources necessary to sustain an ongoing EJAC. In November 2022, CARB may share an EJAC permanence proposal and may solicit a sub quorum of EJAC members to provide ongoing input on the proposal and/or EJAC Charter. EJAC members shared several questions, comments, and thoughts, including:

- Supporting increased CARB staffing to support a future permanent EJAC;
- Suggesting several strategies for permanent Charter development, one that the Ad Hoc group coordinate the development of the permanent EJAC's Charter as a collaboration between CARB staff and current Committee members, and other to conduct Charter development as a complete Committee;
- Noting that EJAC should continue to reside under OEJ rather than moving back to the Industrial Strategies Division;

- Asking if funding will be provided to EJAC members working to develop the Charter during the transition to permanence; and
- Noting that Central Valley Air Quality Coalition (CVAC) and their members recently submitted written recommendations for EJAC permanence and governance. They include: retain the current EJAC composition; allow the EJAC to review all of CARB's programs (not only the Scoping Plan); provide more resources to EJAC; provide additional staffing resources to OEJ; provide additional resources to community based organizations to conduct community engagement.

Action Items

EJAC:

- **Mark Wilson** to work with EJAC Co-chairs to develop synthesis report of toxic tours.
- **Meagan Wylie** to schedule several virtual meetings with sub-quorum of members to support preparations for December 15, 2022, CARB Board hearing. Likely composition: Co-chairs, Connie Cho, and Matt Holmes.

CARB:

- **CARB staff** to coordinate with **Jill Sherman-Warne** regarding transportation and hotel recommendations for the November 29/30, 2022, EJAC meeting in Hoopa. Share insights with EJAC and facilitation team as soon as possible to aid with travel bookings. *(completed – November 2022 EJAC meeting held in Hoopa)*
- **CARB staff** to share statute language related to required public comment periods for: CEQA, Rules and Regulations, and State Implementation Plans.
- **CARB staff and CARB legal team** to consider Advisory Committee Conflict of Interest by way of scenarios. Suggested to share and discuss scenarios at the November 29/30, 2022, meeting. *(CARB Legal presented Transparency Requirements for Advisory Committees at February 2023 EJAC meeting)*
- **CARB staff** to share prepared guidance for issuing public comment at upcoming December 15/16, 2022, Board hearing with EJAC members. **EJAC members** to subsequently share with constituencies. *(completed on 11/29/22 in follow-up email to EJAC)*
- **CARB staff** to develop proposal for EJAC permanence. Suggested to share proposal at the November 29/30, 2022, meeting. *(completed – CARB presented on Ongoing EJAC at the November 29/30, 2022, EJAC meeting)*

November 29-30, 2022, EJAC Meetings (Meeting Recordings and Agendas for [11/29](#), [11/30](#))

On November 29 and 30, 2022, the Environmental Justice Advisory Committee (EJAC) convened to review the [proposed final 2022 Scoping Plan update](#); discuss preparations for a presentation at the December 15, 2022, California Air Resources

Board (CARB) Board meeting; and discuss a potential transition to a permanent EJAC. CARB [presented information](#) on the transition to an ongoing EJAC.

Matt Botill, Division Chief, Industrial Strategies Division (ISD), CARB, presented an overview of outcomes from the proposed final 2022 Scoping Plan, noting changes related to EJAC feedback. EJAC members shared several questions, comments, and responses, including:

- Concern over the continued inclusion of CCS and the Cap-and-Trade Program in the Scoping Plan;
- Interest in increased ambition for organic farming;
- Surprise that air pollution was not included in the Climate Vulnerability Metric (CVM); and
- Concern that the Scoping Plan would not be enforceable, but instead only offers policy recommendations.

EJAC members and CARB staff discussed preparations for the EJAC's presentation to the CARB Board at the December 15, 2022, meeting. Dr. Catherine Garoupa, Executive Director, Central Valley Air Quality Coalition (CVAQ) and EJAC member and co-chair, thanked the Board for the opportunity to converse, and highlighted the value of convening a planning group to prepare a presentation and comments. EJAC members discussed several questions, comments, and responses, including:

- That it is important for agencies to comply with and integrate AB 52 and Tribal Consultation;
- Whether subjects discussed at the joint EJAC - CARB Board meeting on September 1, 2022, should be discussed again (NWL, CCUS, fossil fuels, carbon markets), or if the EJAC presentation should focus on more overarching themes;
- Whether concerns regarding how the Scoping Plan could affect rulemaking, such as Clean Cars II, should be included in the presentation; and
- Several members supposed including LCFS discussion in the presentation.

Chanell Fletcher, Deputy Executive Officer, Office of Environmental Justice (OEJ), CARB, provided an overview of CARB's presentation on how to structure an ongoing and permanent EJAC, which served as an initial proposal to be used as a starting framework for the EJAC and CARB staff to co-design the final proposal. EJAC members expressed questions, comments, and responses that included:

- Support from several members for an increase in CARB staffing to support an ongoing EJAC;
- A suggestion to include working sessions in the yearly joint meetings with CARB Board members, and to have working sessions that do not need to be official meetings;
- From several members, that the number of EJAC members should not be decreased;
- That CARB consultations with tribal governments should be a separate process from CARB's discussions with and input from EJ organizations;

- That components like an 11-member EJAC, three-year term limits, and the proposal for the Charter to be the current EJAC's sole focus are limitations, and that there is a need for greater flexibility and focus on what can be possible; and
- EJAC members asked for clarifying language around the ad hoc working group.

An EJAC member made a proposal to include the establishment of a permanent EJAC in the Board resolution approving the Scoping Plan. Following discussion, a motion was made and seconded. It was unanimously approved to include language that would make the EJAC permanent in the resolution to adopt the Scoping Plan the CARB Board will vote on during their December 15, 2022, Board meeting.

Action Items

EJAC:

- **The EJAC** will remain as currently established to help determine the governance of the potential permanent EJAC.
- Seven **EJAC members** will work with **CARB** as an ad hoc working group to reach common ground and co-plan the permanent EJAC.

CARB:

- **CARB staff** will coordinate with **EJAC Co-Chairs** to create an ad hoc working group. The ad hoc working group will collaborate with CARB to develop a draft charter to propose to the existing EJAC. (*Ad Hoc meetings held February - March 2023*)

At the December 15, 2022, CARB Board meeting, the Board voted to approve Resolution 22-21, the 2022 Climate Change Scoping Plan for Achieving Carbon Neutrality. The link to the full text of the resolution can be found [here](#).