

## **SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT**

This Settlement Agreement is entered into between the California Air Resources Board (CARB), with its principal location at 1001 I Street, Sacramento, California 95814; and Reefership Marine Services LLC, with its principal location at Piso #6, Ed. Las Terrazas B Centro Corporativo Plaza Roble, Guachapelín de Escazú, San José, Costa Rica (collectively, the "Parties," or individually, "Party").

### **LEGAL BACKGROUND**

- (1) **Purpose.** The California Health and Safety Code mandates the reduction of the emission of toxic air contaminants (TAC). CARB has determined that particulate matter (PM) from diesel-fueled engines is a TAC. (Health & Saf. Code §§ 39650-39675.)
- (2) **Regulation.** CARB adopted the *Fuel Sulfur and Other Operational Requirements for Ocean-Going Vessels Within California Waters and 24 Nautical Miles of the California Baseline* (Low-Sulfur Fuel Regulation) to reduce diesel PM and criteria pollutant emissions from ocean going vessels. (Cal. Code Regs., tit.13, § 2299.2; Cal. Code Regs., tit.17, § 93118.2.)
- (3) **Regulatory Provisions.** Any person who owns, operates, charters, rents, or leases any ocean-going vessel that operates in Regulated California Waters must meet the operational requirements for fuel sulfur content limits for auxiliary diesel engines, main engines, and auxiliary boilers, as well comply with the recordkeeping, reporting, and monitoring requirements on noncompliance fee provision.
- (4) **Penalty Provisions.** Failure to comply with the regulatory requirements is a violation of state law that may result in penalties up to ten thousand dollars (\$10,000) for strict liability violations; twenty-five thousand dollars (\$25,000) for negligent violations; and forty thousand dollars (\$40,000) for failing to take corrective action, and seventy-five thousand dollars (\$75,000) for willful and intentional violations, respectively, for each day in which the violation occurs. (Cal. Code Regs., tit.13, § 2299.2; Cal. Code Regs., tit. 17, § 93118.2; Health & Saf. Code §§ 39674, 39675, 42400 et seq., 42402 et seq., [42400.1, 42400.2, 42402.3], and 42410.)

### **CASE BACKGROUND**

- (5) **Corporate Entity.** At all relevant times, Reefership Marine Services LLC was organized under the laws of the United States as a corporation and conducted business in the State of California.

- (6) Allegations. This Settlement Agreement resolves Notice of Violation (NOV) OGV092721\_REEFERSHIP, which was issued on September 28, 2021. CARB alleges Reefership Marine Services LLC violated the Low-Sulfur Fuel Regulation by failing to comply with the operational requirements on three voyages into Regulated California Waters by three different vessels entering the Port of San Diego, resulting in three days of violations, as outlined in Notice of Violation OGV092721\_REEFERSHIP. CARB alleges that if the allegations described in paragraphs 1 through 6 were proven, civil penalties could be imposed against Reefership Marine Services LLC for each and every vessel involved in the violation and each day.
- (7) Acknowledgment. Reefership Marine Services LLC admits to the facts in paragraphs 1 through 6, but denies any liability resulting from said allegations.
- (8) Consideration. In consideration of the foregoing, and of the promises and facts set forth herein, the Parties desire to settle and resolve all claims, disputes, and obligations relating to the above-listed alleged violations and voluntarily agree to resolve this matter by means of this Settlement Agreement. In order to resolve the violations described herein, Reefership Marine Services LLC has taken, or agrees to take, the actions enumerated below within the Terms and Conditions. Further, CARB accepts this Settlement Agreement in termination and full settlement of this matter.

## TERMS AND CONDITIONS

In consideration of CARB not filing a legal action against Reefership Marine Services LLC for the alleged violations referred to above in the Legal Background and Case Background, and Reefership Marine Services LLC agreement to complete all terms and conditions set forth below, CARB and Reefership Marine Services LLC agree as follows:

- (9) Settlement Amount. Reefership Marine Services LLC shall pay a civil penalty of nineteen thousand five hundred dollars (\$19,500.00 USD). Reefership Marine Services LLC shall make all payments within 30 calendar days from the date CARB notifies Reefership Marine Services LLC of the full execution of the Settlement Agreement.
- (10) Civil Penalty and Mitigation Payment Method. Reefership Marine Services LLC shall pay the civil penalty by check, credit card, wire transfer, or portal, payable to CARB, using instructions provided separately by CARB in a Payment Transmittal Form. Reefership Marine Services LLC is responsible for all payment processing fees. Payments shall be accompanied by the Payment Transmittal Form to ensure proper application. CARB shall deposit the civil penalty and mitigation amount into the Air Pollution Control Fund for the purpose of carrying out CARB's duties and functions

Reefership Marine Services LLC Settlement Agreement  
Notice of Violation: OGV092721\_REEFERSHIP

to ensure the integrity of its air pollution control programs. Should payment instructions change, CARB will provide notice to Reefership Marine Services LLC in accordance with Paragraph 12 (Notices).

- (11) Documents. Reefership Marine Services LLC shall promptly email or mail the signed and dated Settlement Agreement, with copy of proof of payment of the penalty, mitigation, and/or SEP (if applicable), a copy of the Payment Transmittal Form(s) (if applicable), and the signed and dated Compliance Plan (if applicable) to the address or email in Paragraph 12 (Notices).
- (12) Notices. Unless otherwise specified in this Settlement Agreement, whenever notifications, submissions, or communications are required by this Settlement Agreement, they shall be submitted in writing to the address or email below:

As to CARB:

California Air Resources Board  
Enforcement Division / Settlement Agreements  
Field Operations Branch / Railroad and Marine Enforcement Section  
P.O. Box 2815  
Sacramento, California 95812-2815  
Settlement\_Agreement@arb.ca.gov

As to Reefership Marine Services LLC:

Reefership Marine Services LLC  
c/o Dole Tropical Products  
Piso#6, Ed. Las Terrazas B  
Centro Corporativo Plaza Roble,  
Guachipelín de Escazú  
San José, Costa Rica  
Vessel.Operations@dole.com

Any Party may, by written notice to the other Parties, change its designated notice recipient or notice address provided above. Notices submitted pursuant to this section shall be deemed submitted upon emailing or mailing.

- (13) Repeat Violations. Reefership Marine Services LLC agrees to comply with all regulatory requirements and acknowledges that repeat violations could result in increased penalties in the future.
- (14) Entirety. This Settlement Agreement constitutes the entire agreement and understanding between the Parties concerning the Case Background and supersedes and replaces any and all prior negotiations and agreements of any kind, whether written or oral, between the Parties concerning the Case Background hereof. This Settlement Agreement consists of 6 pages and 32 paragraphs.

Reefership Marine Services LLC Settlement Agreement  
Notice of Violation: OGV092721\_REEFERSHIP

- (15) Binding Effect. This Settlement Agreement binds Reefership Marine Services LLC, and any principals, officers, receivers, trustees, successors and assignees, subsidiary and parent corporations and CARB and any successor agency that may have responsibility for and jurisdiction over the subject matter of this Settlement Agreement.
- (16) Effective Date. The effective date shall be the date upon which this Settlement Agreement is fully executed.
- (17) Modification and Termination. No agreement to modify, amend, extend, supersede, terminate, or discharge this Settlement Agreement, or any portion thereof, is valid or enforceable unless it is in writing and signed by all Parties to this Settlement Agreement.
- (18) Severability. Each provision of this Settlement Agreement is severable, and in the event that any provision of this Settlement Agreement is held to be illegal, invalid or unenforceable in any jurisdiction, the remainder of this Settlement Agreement remains in full force and effect.
- (19) Choice of Law. This Settlement Agreement shall be interpreted and enforced in accordance with the laws of the State of California, without regard to California's choice-of-law rules.
- (20) Non-Discharge. It is further agreed that the penalties described in this Settlement Agreement are non-dischargeable under United States Code, title 11, section 523(a)(7), which provides an exception from discharge for any debt to the extent such debt is for a fine, penalty, or forfeiture payable to and for the benefit of a governmental unit.
- (21) Not Tax Deductible. For purposes of this Settlement Agreement, Reefership Marine Services LLC shall not deduct any monies spent to comply with any provision of this Settlement Agreement in calculating and submitting its federal, state, or local income tax.
- (22) Rules of Construction. Any rule of construction to the effect that ambiguities are to be resolved against the drafting party shall not be applied in interpreting this Settlement Agreement.
- (23) Non-Waiver. The failure to enforce any provision of this Settlement Agreement shall not be construed as a waiver of any such provision, nor prevent such Party thereafter from enforcing such provision or any other provision of this Settlement Agreement. The rights and remedies granted all Parties herein are cumulative and the election of one right or remedy by a Party shall not constitute a waiver of such

Party's right to assert all other legal remedies available under this Settlement Agreement or otherwise provided by law.

- (24) Intent to be Bound. The Parties represent that: They have participated fully in the review and drafting of this Settlement Agreement; understand and accept all terms; enter into this Settlement Agreement freely and voluntarily; have had an opportunity to consult with legal counsel; are fully informed of the terms and effect of this Settlement Agreement; have agreed to this Settlement Agreement after independent investigation and agree it was not arrived at through fraud, duress, or undue influence; and knowingly and voluntarily intend to be legally bound by this Settlement Agreement.
- (25) Venue. The Superior Court of California, located in the County of Sacramento, shall hear any dispute between the Parties arising from this Settlement Agreement.
- (26) Counterparts and Electronic Signatures. This Settlement Agreement may be executed in counterparts. Electronic, facsimile or photocopied signatures shall be considered as valid signatures.
- (27) Release. In consideration of full payment of the civil penalty, and all other undertakings above, CARB hereby releases Reefership Marine Services LLC and its principals, officers, receivers, trustees, successors and assignees, subsidiary and parent corporations, from any claims CARB may have based on the circumstances described in all paragraphs contained in the Case Background above.
- (28) Authority. The undersigned represents that he or she has full authority to enter into this Settlement Agreement.

#### **PENALTY BASIS**

- (29) Per Unit Penalty. The per unit or per vehicle penalty in this case is a maximum of ten thousand dollars (\$10,000) per day under Health and Safety Code section 39674, for violations of the Low-Sulfur Fuel Regulation. (Cal. Code Regs., tit.13, § 2299.2; Cal. Code Regs., tit.17, § 93118.2.) The penalty of \$19,500.00 over three days of violation is for three noncompliant vessels. The per unit penalty in this case is approximately \$6,500.00 per noncompliant day.
- (30) Emissions. The provisions cited above do not prohibit emissions above a specified level. Without information on engine usage and emission rates, it is not practicable to quantify the excess emissions. However, since CARB has alleged that the vessel(s) did not meet the regulatory requirements, all of the emissions from it were excess and illegal.
- (31) Aggravating and Mitigating Factors. The penalties in this matter were determined in consideration of all relevant circumstances, including statutory factors as described

Reefership Marine Services LLC Settlement Agreement  
Notice of Violation: OGV092721\_REEFERSHIP

in CARB's Enforcement Policy. CARB considered whether the violator came into compliance quickly and cooperated with the investigation; the extent of harm to public health, safety and welfare; nature and persistence of the violation, including the magnitude of the excess emissions; compliance history; preventative efforts taken; innovative nature and the magnitude of the effort required to comply, and the accuracy, reproducibility, and repeatability of the available test methods; efforts to attain, or provide for, compliance prior to violation; action taken to mitigate the violation; financial burden to the violator; and voluntary disclosure. The penalties are set at levels sufficient to deter violations, to remove any economic benefit or unfair advantage from noncompliance, to obtain swift compliance, and the potential costs, risks, and uncertainty associated with litigation. Penalties in future cases might be smaller or larger depending on the unique circumstances of the case.

- (32) Confidential Business Information. CARB based this penalty in part on confidential business information provided by Reefership Marine Services LLC and confidential settlement communications, neither of which are retained by CARB in the ordinary course of business.

ACKNOWLEDGED AND ACCEPTED BY:

**California Air Resources Board**

Signature: /S/

Name: Todd P. Sax, D.Env.

Title: Chief, Enforcement Division

Date: April 7, 2022

**Reefership Marine Services LLC**

Signature: /S/

Name: David Cairns

Title: Vice President, Fleet Operations

Date: March 9, 2022