

November 10, 2021 Consultation Group Meeting Notes, **DRAFT**

Dr. Balmes:

- Intro: This meeting want to focus on People's Blueprint (PBP) is a standing independent document that's a first step in CARBs formal process for updating the Program Blueprint.
 - PBP reflects the writer's group but want to hear from everyone in the Consultation Group (CG).
- September 21 meeting recap:
 - CG members received [draft notes](#) from Liliana.
 - Most of meeting centered around PBP. Highlights of first impressions from CG members.
 - Focus on equity,
 - CARB process for updating Program Blueprint was discussed but will

Kevin Hamilton:

- PBP is not intended to be entire BP. Doesn't contain other components of AB 617 (e.g. toxics and BACT/BARCT). Focus on bringing equity to CSC and community selection processes move forward - where most amount of learning. CG can now comment on the document and pick up the rest of the BP in the other schedules. Wants to move the whole thing forward once the CG votes to do that.

Wayne Nastri:

- Procedural question: Some areas can benefit from legal input before we go through the document.

John Balmes:

- PBP stand-alone, independent document that's an important EJ input that CARB will use. Legal has been advising OCAP as PBP is being reviewed.
- Original BP did not have an EJ lens to it. CARB didn't have much experience. AB 617 is an EJ statute. We won't be revising PBP we'll be taking in vital input to develop Program Blueprint. Want to hear from all stakeholders.

Karen Buckley:

- Blueprint Update process: Plenty of opportunities to have discussions. Draft Outline in the Spring, a full draft in the late summer with public workshops and CG meetings. Plan to go to Board late 2022.

Michael Kleinman:

- How does the CG review of PBP fit into the draft outline of the Program Blueprint?

Karen Buckley

- We'll take all comments we hear in CG meeting, public comments, letters and use those to develop the outline.

John Balmes:

- Still late 2021 and starting to review

Luis Olmedo:

- Concerned with timing, fall is around the time they select new communities.

Karen Buckley:

- We select new communities in Feb. We want to move away from the community selection model that has created competition between communities to help more communities throughout the State. Next Community selection is Feb 2022. We'll have a workshop in December.

John Balmes:

- Want to help more communities throughout the State not just those selected.

Michael Jerrett

- Program is terribly underfunded. Is there a recommendation for funding?

John Balmes

- Have two legislative members on the Board. Public meeting for public to advocate for funding. Funding set by legislation. The BP isn't a direct way to advocate, but discussion at the Board meeting is.

Martha Dina Argüello

- Does the timeline align with budget subcommittee to have a unified voice. Sector based approach, funding for that.
- Those conversations can happen throughout. We can certainly outline the need for funding.

John Balmes

- Late 2022 or early 2023 BP discussion will not happen for the next year so we might want to strategize on how to mobilize discussions now.

- CARB is not going to edit PBP. Funded Harder & Co. to help get the ideas on paper. CARB is going to want to get a sense of the PBP concepts that will work or not. This will start the process to the BP.

Wayne Nastri

- Getting input from CSC reps in our region to hear what they'd like to see in legislative changes. There are some concepts in the PBP that we can work on outside of this timeframe.

Liliana Nunez

- Worksheet of PBP Outline of Chapters is meant to start the conversation about the PBP review process in CG meetings and a tool for CG members to track their thoughts.

Luis Olmedo

- Seems useful tool. Process by which comments get integrated or eliminated? What's the goal once we populate it?

Deldi Reyes

- Worksheet is completely optional to help structure your review. If you fill it out and submit to CARB, we will treat it any other comment from CG. Will also consider comments in letters or other formats, this is solely a suggestion.

Ms. Margaret Gordon

- Would like to hear from Harder & Co. to give their opinion on this tool for discussion on the PBP. They were instrumental in supporting us through the PBP. Would like for them to present their expertise on this process.

John Balmes

- Worksheet is just a tool and staff will take all comments from telephone, letters, phone calls as input. For legal reasons CARB must write the Program Blueprint and they will go through a transparent public process.

Ms. Margaret Gordon

- EJ doesn't have an advisor to support and give clarity on the program. Need own resource. We didn't have that in the first BP.

Chanell Fletcher

- Hear loud and clear request for EJ support and that will be a topic in an upcoming meeting with Executive Officer on Friday.

Ariel Ambruster

- Want to get the process discussion going so we can have discussion on contents.
- Poll Everywhere results show the CG would like to go through the PBP in order, beginning to end.

Michelle Byars explains the Poll Everywhere questions are structured by section of PBP.

Jesse Marquez

- Overall comments on PBP:
 - Tables and charts could be clickable. CSC memberships need to be addressed. That CSCs have the option to determine make up of CSCs.
 - Transparency
 - Legal clarifications about mobile sources.
 - Enforcement – more information that include period inspections.

1.2: Chapter 1: Introduction: “Partnering Framework”

Penelope (Jenny) Quintana

- Chapter mentions partnerships but not clear on who the partners would be.

Samir Sheikh

- There is a section in the PBP that gets into make-up of CSC (majority residents).

Martha Dina Argüello

- A tension I’ve experienced – we thought they had ownership over this process and so does the district and that has engendered conflicts with agendas and everything.

Ms. Margaret Gordon:

- If you don’t like something about community engagement, write stuff that pertains to legislation. This should be a community driven process. Community must have ownership, we’re still back 20 years being a check off a list. That’s not what AB 617 is about. Need clear interpretation of what AB 617 says about CSCs have real ownership over the process.

1.3: Chapter 1. Introduction: “The People’s Perspective”

John Balmes

- Original BP was written by staff. PBP is the people's perspective, and it should be incorporated into what CARB writes.
- Wants to reiterate what we've heard from Ms. Margaret – have to come up with a process for conflict resolution across multiple platforms (AD-CSCs, CARB-CSCs)

Ms. Margaret Gordon

- Agency staff are not grounded in EJ or civil rights, there is no formal process for them to get the training how it should be included in AB 617. Staff needs to know how to use EJ and CR in the intersections with CSCs.
- Need to address unresolved conflicts and have a case study to include in the PBP.

Penelope (Jenny) Quintana

- Were the air agencies consulted for CARB and air districts' perspective's part? They seem genuine but Air District perspective is more fleshed out.

John Balmes

- Initially there was an effort to get perspectives of various stakeholders into PBP. To focus on the EJ community's perspective there wasn't input from air districts. Now is the time to hear AD perspectives.

Michael Jerrett:

- What were the writer's really intending in this section? Agree air districts' perspective was more fleshed out.

Ms. Margaret Gordon

- Two black women on Sac CSC that were dismissed, with no reason, no criteria. Thought we were talking about conflict resolution.
- Air Districts do not have the same level of engagement and history with communities, there needs to be an organized process, so all sides know how to engage in AB 617.

1.4: Chapter 1. Introduction: "About the People's Blueprint"

Ms. Margaret Gordon

- There are no partnering agreements between sites [CSCs] and CARB staff.
- Suggested the Policy Link's Equity Manifesto be incorporated in the beginning of the process.

2.1: Chapter 2. Achieving Equity and Justice: "Introductory content"

John Balmes

- State and EPA definitions of EJ can be used.

2.1: Chapter 2. Achieving Equity and Justice: "Leading with Respect and Dignity"

Martha Dina Argüello

- Loves this section, the operationalizing of it and changing the culture. Meetings where we always know there will be conflicts or staff will. Before hiring facilitator work with EJ communities because who you get is only as good as you're asking for.

John Balmes

- Culture does have to change. The struggles in AB 617 between CSCs, CARB and districts, that's how culture changes that AB 617 mandates. Change is slow, maybe it's not as fast as we like but have to keep trying.

Ms. Margaret Gordon

- One example of what can be done after a community is recommended for selection the air district and community do a project together or sit and develop partnering agreements (charter) and work with well-versed mediator that has a background in supporting culture changes. Should have happened in certain communities and didn't. Staff needs to be responsive to the culture change too.
- We as community partners selected the CSC members and helped orient them, not the air district. We had the community engagement staff doing that work. Don't know if each air district has a community engagement department to support that.

Luis Olmedo

- Via chat: does CARB still have an ombudsman? What is their role?

Deldi Reyes

- Via Chat: Yes, there is here is a [link](#).

John Balmes

- If there is a desire of an EJ ombudsman, that can be brought up during the EJ partners' meetings with our Executive Officer. It's a reasonable request.
- Pleased with progress made. Governance chapter is key and not enough time to start. Would like more people to speak up but appreciates the PE/chat/verbal comments shared. Good start to having stakeholders comment on PBP.

Deldi Reyes

- Today marked a big shift, we were able to talk as a group about the big ideas. It's very important to CARB that this group be able to discuss PBP. Please read the entire document. We'll start with Chapter 3 next time and will continue to discuss the rest of the document.

Liliana Nunez

- Next meeting is on January 6, 2022.

Deldi

- We will continue as a group to go through the PBP in this way. If the worksheet is helpful feel free to use it, it's just a suggestion. As Karen mentioned earlier, we welcome all forms of comments – letters, phone calls, etc.

John Balmes

- AD and industry please send in comments. We want to hear them.

Ariel Ambruster

- Whatever forum is most helpful to get the diverse set of perspectives.

Deldi Reyes

- The BAAQMD was the first district to share written comments to CARB. Is posted [online](#) and will be shared in next communication to CG members.