

DRAFT: Consultation Group Meeting 11.10.2021

Combined Chat comments and Poll Everywhere results from The People's Blueprint discussion, Chapters: Introduction – Chapter 2

Exact text of comments submitted in the Poll Everywhere.

1.1 Chapter 1, Introduction: "Introductory Content"

- "Para 2 mentions "lack of community inclusion in some of the mitigation plans that have been developed. 'It might be useful to point to suggested options which may be discussed later in the document."
- "I think its a good final draft."
- "Should have more discussion as to imitations of current laws, which were developed for air basins and not hyperlocal disparities"
- "What do air districts think of the air district perspective"
- "Before this chapter, should have an executive summary with key points"

1.2 Chapter 1, Introduction: "Partnering Framework"

- "There are EJ Organizations who have experience in Community Participatory Research and Community
- Scientist who have experience that should be respected"
- "Perhaps state right away the make up of the CSC here instead of later"
- "More funding and resources for community leads"
- "'community health and well-being as a priority' should be clearly stated up front in the program blueprint."

1.3 Chapter 1, Introduction: "The People's Perspective"

- "Community Perspective should include not enough resources directed to support communities, and communities pitted against each other"
- "This does reflect the peoples perspective. It is based on personal experience across time and should be understood, validated, and respected as such."
- "CARB perspective seems guarded compared to the other sections. The CARB section should say a little more clearly what went wrong to be transparent."
- "*The last bullet in the Air District section- sorry."
- "CARB should not be the mediator"
- "CARB perspective was not written by CARB."
- "still seems to lack specificity about the roles and how conflicts will be resolved - and on what grounds people will have standing in the process"
- "CARB section should say that the process laid bare huge disparities in how supportive local air districts were of EJ efforts"

1.4 Chapter 1, Introduction: "About the People's Blueprint"

- "The concept that the PB is a 'working blueprint' is critical."

- "I appreciate the references to Policylink's equity manifesto and other tools that air districts or CARB may not be aware of. This ideas need to be hardwired and integrated into the BluePrint itself -- both CARB's BluePrint and the People's BluePrint."
- "Training at all levels is important! CSC members, air district staff, CARB staff"
- "I think its a simple description of the PB and why the writer's group felt it is needed."
- "Needs to be more explicit about EJ dimensions: fairness in outcomes, equality in process, recognition of structural inequalities such as racism - would be better to break these out specifically with respect to what would constitute success."
- "Training at all levels is important! CSC members, air district staff, CARB staff"
- "I think its a simple description of the PB and why the writer's group felt it is needed."
- "Needs to be more explicit about EJ dimensions: fairness in outcomes, equality in process, recognition of structural inequalities such as racism - would be better to break these out specifically with respect to what would constitute success."
- "Participatory budgeting can start to hedge against the systems of inst. racisms and centralized power structure"
- "Strong section but for this to work timelines have to change"
- "I love this section"

2.1 Chapter 2, Achieving Equity and Justice: "Introductory Content"

- "The EPA definition of EJ is absolutely necessaty"
- "Redlining is a key component of structural racism that has led to environmental injustice"
- "Ca State definition updated in 2018"
- "1. All categories and types of DAC's be identified and acknowledged. i.e. Mining Communities, Wood Mills, Rendering Facilities, Desert Communities 2. Create map showing regional distribution 3. Create priority list in each category.? Top 5, Increments of 5"
- "Environmental justice should include the phrase "environmental racism" as it was the original term"
- "1. All categories and types of DAC's be identified and acknowledged. i.e. Mining Communities, Wood Mills, Rendering Facilities, Desert Communities 2. Create map showing regional distribution 3. Create priority list in each category.? Top 5, Increments of 5"
- "Environmental justice should include the phrase "environmental racism" as it was the original term"
- "EPA definition watered down under George Bush"
- "I agree use the state definition"
- "The state definition of EJ should be considered as an alternative."
- "I would not include EPA Ej definition - I you may recall it was much stronger when first written then watered down later"
- "Even watered down it is external validation of the basic right to EJ"

2.2 Chapter 2, Achieving Equity and Justice: "Leading with Respect and Dignity"

- "I feel we are so lucky to live in California with such a responsive Air Agency. I think that well-meaning CARB staff were put in situations where they did not have enough training and made mistakes. I have faith in CARB so I think that training for CARB staff should be an explicit part of this. And forgiveness."

- "I appreciate this section!"
- "Failure to remove individuals that do not abide by agreed upon principles must apply to "all" involved CSC stakeholders"
- "Law can't mandate trust and mutual respect"
- "Providing funds for a local community college intern to help community groups is a sign of respect for their time"
- "I appreciate this section!"
- "Failure to remove individuals that do not abide by agreed upon principles must apply to "all" involved CSC stakeholders"
- "Law can't mandate trust and mutual respect"
- "Providing funds for a local community college intern to help community groups is a sign of respect for their time"
- "providing stipends for community members is one sign of respect"

2.3 Chapter 2, Achieving Equity and Justice: "Adoption of Institutional Policies and Practices for Equity, Inclusion, and Civil Rights"

- "CARB staff have not skill in Civil"
- "CARB Board or Staff have no skills in Civil Rights or Inclusion"
- "in order to create will change- participatory budgeting is a key in stepping forward"
- "I agree that participatory budgeting is an absolute necessity for district-CS(co-development of community air monitoring plans and CERPs"
- "Carb needs social scientists on the staff"
- "Base on the outcome of People's Blueprint there must be realignment Consultation Group"
- "could you have an institutional advocate like and ombudsperson appointed to help work through disagreements among parties without resulting to legal remedies"
- "Equity must include participatory and economic"
- "Last bullet 'Define and implement a process to address issues that the participants do not have the time or tools to adequately manage at the time of occurrence' could be discussed more explicitly"
- "Add Environmental Justice"
- "If there was true equity, participatory budget would adopted and practice"
- Community Air Monitoring must include more than just PM, such as a broader spectrum of Criteria Pollutants and Toxic Pollutants. There may be incidents that are emergencies requiring special AQM deployment purchasing of equipment"
- "Could be a position at CARB or somewhat removed in another part of the gov't"

2.4 Chapter 2, Achieving Equity and Justice: "Institutionalize Equity Analysis for Substantive Actions and Plans"

- "Agree that the bulleted section is good to include here"
- "1. All categories and types of DAC's be identified and acknowledged. i.e. Mining Communities, Wood Mills, Rendering Facilities, Desert Communities 2. Create map showing regional distribution 3. Create priority list in each category.? Top 5, Increments of 5" [This comment was resubmitted for this question.]

- " I really appreciate the framing set out in the bulleted section. This could be useful in other policy areas. "
- "Also important to track investments in communities."

Entire chat from the meeting November 10, 2021:

12:04:02 From Liliana Nunez (she/her/s) to Hosts and panelists:

Poll everywhere instructions:

In your browser, go to: pollev.com/cgroup411

With your phone: To this number: 22333, text this message: CGroup411

12:04:50 From Liliana Nunez (she/her/s) to Hosts and panelists:

DRAFT People's Blueprint Outline worksheet:
https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/2021-11/Peoples_Blueprint_Outline_Worksheet_DRAFT.pdf

12:04:50 From Corin Choppin (he,him) to Hosts and panelists:

<http://pollev.com/cgroup411>

12:09:27 From Liliana Nunez (she/her/s) to Hosts and panelists:

Poll everywhere instructions:

In your browser, go to: <http://pollev.com/cgroup411>

With your phone: To this number: 22333, text this message: CGroup411

12:48:56 From Liliana Nunez (she/her/s) to Hosts and panelists:

Poll everywhere instructions:

In your browser, go to: <http://pollev.com/cgroup411>

With your phone: To this number: 22333, text this message: CGroup411

12:51:27 From Brian Moore (he, him) to Hosts and panelists:

Taking quick break too

13:02:09 From Shams Hasan to Hosts and panelists:

Hello, I am not able to see all the attendees. It says I am watching Corin's screen.

13:11:46 From CG Samir Sheikh to Everyone:

Liliana, please also make Ryan a panelist as I also have some conflict during part of the meeting.

13:12:03 From Ariel Ambruster, facilitator (she, her) to Everyone:

Samir, we will do so!

13:12:21 From Brian Moore (he, him) to Shams Hasan and all panelists:

Samir, I just made Ryan a panelist.

13:13:52 From CG - Kevin D Hamilton, RRT,ACS (he, him, his) to Hosts and panelists:

Just an FYI. It won't let me import my virtual backgrounds including my picture. It just offers the generic Zoom pictures.

13:14:39 From Corin Choppin (he,him) to Hosts and panelists:

Thank you Kevin, I will look into that.

13:15:09 From Corin Choppin (he,him) to Everyone:

If you are having technical issues please call or text me at 916-606-9609.

13:21:26 From Liliana Nunez (she/her/s) to Everyone:

Notes and other materials from September 21 meeting: <https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/ab-617-cg-meeting-210921>

13:34:55 From Ariel Ambruster, facilitator (she, her) to Hosts and panelists:

Consultation Group members - let us know what is needed to make these meetings more inclusive and productive.

13:35:29 From Ariel Ambruster, facilitator (she, her) to Everyone:

Consultation Group members - let us know what is needed to make these meetings more inclusive and productive.

13:39:39 From Brian Moore | CARB (he, him) to Everyone:

Blueprint Process Outline: https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/2021-09/Blueprint%20Process%209.8.21%20FNL_v3.pdf

13:50:24 From Michelle Byars - CARB (she/her/s) to Hosts and panelists:

Name (Alphabetical by first name)

Cathy Reheis-Boyd, President, WSPA

Deidre Sanders, Public Member

Erica Manuel, ILG

Gustavo Aguirre Jr, CCEJN

Jack Broadbent, BAAQMD

Jana Ganion, Blue Lake Rancheria Tribe

Janet Whittick, CCEEB

Jesse Marquez, CFASE

Kate Meis, LGC

Kevin Hamilton, CCAC

Luis Olmedo, CCV

Martha Dina Arguello, PSR-LA

Michael Jerrett, UCLA

Michael Kleinman, UCI/SRP

Ms. Margaret Gordon, WOEIP

Paul English, PHI

Penelope (Jenny) Quintana, San Diego State

Roger Isom, California Cotton Ginners and Growers Association

Samir Sheikh, SJVAPCD

Tung Le, CAPCOA

Wayne Nastri, SCAQMD

Will Barrett, American Lung Association

13:50:33 From CG - Wayne Nastri to Hosts and panelists:

We recommend that for an efficient discussion that CARB guide the discussion chapter by chapter.

13:51:36 From Michelle Byars - CARB (she/her/s) to Hosts and panelists:

To comply with Bagley-Keene, please post comments that are not logistical in nature to "everyone".

13:55:51 From Liliana Nunez (she/her/s) to Everyone:

DRAFT People's Blueprint Outline worksheet:
https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/2021-11/Peoples_Blueprint_Outline_Worksheet_DRAFT.pdf

13:56:50 From CG - Wayne Nastri to Everyone:

Sorry, didn't realize I wasn't communicating to everyone

13:57:14 From CG - Wayne Nastri to Everyone:

Here is my earlier post: We recommend that for an efficient discussion that CARB guide the discussion chapter by chapter.

13:57:46 From Liliana Nunez (she/her/s) to Hosts and panelists:

Poll everywhere instructions:

In your browser, go to: <http://pollev.com/cgroup411>

With your phone: To this number: 22333, text this message: CGroup411

13:57:58 From Ariel Ambruster, facilitator (she, her) to Everyone:

Thank you Wayne! 😊 I displayed poor modeling behavior by doing that myself. We understand we are in learning mode re Zoom Webinar!

14:00:58 From CG - Kevin D Hamilton, RRT,ACS (he, him, his) to Hosts and panelists:

Much easier on the website.

14:04:49 From Michelle Byars - CARB (she/her/s) to Everyone:

22 total members

14:08:13 From Michelle Byars - CARB (she/her/s) to Everyone:

Name (Alphabetical by first name)

Cathy Reheis-Boyd, President, WSPA

Deidre Sanders, Public Member

Erica Manuel, ILG

Gustavo Aguirre Jr, CCEJN

Jack Broadbent, BAAQMD

Jana Ganion, Blue Lake Rancheria Tribe

Janet Whittick, CCEEB

Jesse Marquez, CFASE

Kate Meis, LGC

Kevin Hamilton, CCAC

Luis Olmedo, CCV

Martha Dina Arguello, PSR-LA

Michael Jerrett, UCLA

Michael Kleinman, UCI/SRP

Ms. Margaret Gordon, WOEIP

Paul English, PHI

Penelope (Jenny) Quintana, San Diego State

Roger Isom, California Cotton Ginners and Growers Association

Samir Sheikh, SJVAPCD

Tung Le, CAPCOA

Wayne Nastri, SCAQMD

Will Barrett, American Lung Association

14:15:53 From Deldi Reyes (she, her/s) CARB to Everyone:

I hope we can discuss the Peoples Blueprint soon! ;)

14:16:17 From CG - John R. BALMES (he,him) to Hosts and panelists:

I second Deldi's hope

14:19:09 From Liliana Nunez (she/her/s) to Hosts and panelists:

Poll everywhere instructions:

In your browser, go to: <http://pollev.com/cgroup411>

With your phone: To this number: 22333, text this message: CGroup411

14:22:58 From Brian Moore | CARB (he, him) to Everyone:

Link to People's Blueprint:

The People's Blueprint:

https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/2021-09/PBP%20Writers%20Group%20Draft%20for%20CARB%202021.09.08_acc.pdf

14:24:30 From Liliana Nunez (she/her/s) to Everyone:

DRAFT People's Blueprint Outline worksheet:

https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/2021-11/Peoples_Blueprint_Outline_Worksheet_DRAFT.pdf

14:28:20 From CG - Michael Jarrett to Hosts and panelists:

Can someone send me the link to the actual blueprint document - sorry can't find it

14:28:46 From CG - John R. BALMES (he,him) to Hosts and panelists:

We should also spell Dr. Jarrett's name correctly

14:29:14 From Brian Moore | CARB (he, him) to Everyone:

Current Program Blueprint

Current Program Blueprint and appendices:

<https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/capp-blueprint>

14:30:52 From CG - MarthaDina to Everyone:

We need more resources for the community participation

14:34:12 From Deldi Reyes (she, her/s) CARB to Everyone:

the section we are looking at now says this: "The focus of AB 617 is community. Community representatives from impacted communities have a lead role, working in equal partnership with State and local air pollution control agencies.² The Program relies on a multi-stakeholder partnering framework with the aim to produce community driven and focused emission reduction strategies and actions. In partnership with California Air Resources Board (CARB), air districts, and

community representatives, each identified AB 617 community develops solutions to mitigate, reduce and/or preferably eliminate, air pollution. Community representatives, local business representatives and government agencies arrive at the partnership with their own interests, assets, capabilities, and needs. The

biggest strength of the Program is intentionality in bringing together various perspectives and interests to

allow for community representatives to consider and design innovative solutions.

14:40:47 From CG Veronica Eady to Hosts and panelists:

Can someone share the polling information again? Sorry. I just got back, and I'm trying to figure out where we are. Thx.

14:41:05 From Liliana Nunez (she/her/s) to Hosts and panelists:

Poll everywhere instructions:

In your browser, go to: <http://pollev.com/cgroup411>

With your phone: To this number: 22333, text this message: CGroup411

14:41:07 From Brian Moore | CARB (he, him) to Hosts and panelists:

PE instructions for chat:

Poll everywhere instructions:

In your browser, go to: <http://pollev.com/cgroup411>

With your phone: To this number: 22333, text this message: CGroup411

15:00:08 From CG Luis Olmedo to Hosts and panelists:

is there a setting where the zoom moderator can allow photos to appear when off camera?

15:01:02 From CG - MarthaDina to Everyone:

Increasing readiness for all parties to participate productively in the process is important. What

helps communities get ready? What do they need to know about? Similarly, what can help to get

district staff ready? The chapter on readiness discusses training, shared understanding, and

competencies to help prepare partners to work together. We believe this will make it easier for

everyone.

15:01:59 From CG - Gustavo to Hosts and panelists:

names are not coming up on the poll everywhere- is that on purpose? just a Q- been adding to the poll

15:02:05 From CG - Ms.Margaret to Hosts and panelists:

Where are the partnering agreements between CARB and the AB 617

15:03:05 From Ariel Ambruster, facilitator (she, her) to Everyone:

Ms. Margaret: Where are the partnering agreements between CARB and the AB 617. The sites - the CSCs.

15:05:33 From CG - Wayne Nastri to Everyone:

I need to step away for a moment. Can you please elevate Kathryn Higgins to a panelist?

15:05:50 From CG - Wayne Nastri to Everyone:

Thanks!

15:06:23 From Corin Choppin (he,him) to Hosts and panelists:

Kathryn Higgins is now a panelist.

15:08:44 From Brian Moore | CARB (he, him) to Hosts and panelists:

PE instructions for chat:

Poll everywhere instructions:

In your browser, go to: <http://pollev.com/cgroup411>

With your phone: To this number: 22333, text this message: CGroup411

15:08:44 From CG-Kathryn Higgins to Hosts and panelists:

Thank you. I have the links.

15:08:49 From Liliana Nunez (she/her/s) to Hosts and panelists:

PE instructions for chat:

Poll everywhere instructions:

In your browser, go to: <http://pollev.com/cgroup411>

With your phone: To this number: 22333, text this message: CGroup411

15:08:57 From CG - MarthaDina to Everyone:

I am back

15:20:44 From CG - John R. BALMES (he,him) to Hosts and panelists:

I like Ms. Margaret's idea

15:34:55 From CG Luis Olmedo to Hosts and panelists:

Does ombudsman still a position at CARB and what do they do?

15:35:41 From Ariel Ambruster, facilitator (she, her) to Everyone:

Luis Olmedo: Does ombudsman still a position at CARB and what do they do?

15:37:00 From CG - Ms.Margaret to Hosts and panelists:

Who's the Civil Right training in CARB

15:37:49 From Ariel Ambruster, facilitator (she, her) to Everyone:

Ms. Margaret: Who is the Civil Rights trainer at CARB?

15:37:53 From Michelle Byars - CARB (she/her/s) to Everyone:

Just a quick reminder to all CG members and staff to post substantive comments/questions to "everyone" - you can choose this from the dropdown just above the comment block.

15:38:19 From Deldi Reyes (she, her/s) CARB to Everyone:

@Luis, there is an Ombudsman role in CARB. Here's a link .the Ombudsman's office is in the Chair's Office: Office of the Ombudsman | California Air Resources Board

15:38:41 From Deldi Reyes (she, her/s) CARB to Everyone:

<https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/our-work/programs/office-ombudsman#:~:text=CARB%27s%20Office%20of%20the%20Ombudsman%20has%20progra ms%20specifically,and%20painless%20as%20possible.%20More%20about%20this%20progra m>

15:38:41 From Liliana Nunez (she/her/s) to Everyone:

<https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/our-work/programs/office-ombudsman#:~:text=CARB%27s%20Office%20of%20the%20Ombudsman%20has%20progra>

ms%20specifically,and%20painless%20as%20possible.%20More%20about%20this%20program

15:40:39 From CG - MarthaDina to Everyone:

This speaks to the comment that the agency needs to diversify who it hires, and focus on cultural anthropologists

15:41:13 From CG Luis Olmedo to Hosts and panelists:

Thank @Deldi, looks like it's an office dedicated to business. Is there an Environmental Justice Ombudsman? It would be great to have such position specially around incentives to disadvantaged communities.

15:42:12 From Deldi Reyes (she, her/s) CARB to Everyone:

Thanks Luis. Thank @Deldi, looks like it's an office dedicated to business. Is there an Environmental Justice Ombudsman? It would be great to have such position specially around incentives to disadvantaged communities.

15:42:27 From Deldi Reyes (she, her/s) CARB to Everyone:

Just posted Luis' comment, so all can see.

15:43:00 From CG - Gustavo to Hosts and panelists:

I totally agree with Martha!

15:43:17 From Ariel Ambruster, facilitator (she, her) to Everyone:

From Gustavo: I totally agree with Martha!

15:54:47 From CG - Michael Jerrett to Hosts and panelists:

I thought this was a productive meeting - thank you John, Ariel staff and colleagues.

15:55:44 From CG - John R. BALMES (he,him) to Hosts and panelists:

Thanks, Mike

15:56:04 From CG-Kathryn Higgins to Hosts and panelists:

The chapter by chapter approach was very productive. Thank you

15:56:13 From Deldi Reyes (she, her/s) CARB to Everyone:

thanks everyone!