AB 617 Community Air Protection Program

***Annual Progress Reports for Community Emissions Reduction Programs***

**DRAFT Data Collection Template**

**THROUGH DECEMBER 31, 2020**

| **Air District**: | San Joaquin Valley APCD |
| --- | --- |
| **Community Name**: | South Central Fresno |

**Reporting Requirement**: Assembly Bill (AB) 617 requires that air districts prepare an annual report for each community emissions reduction program.[[1]](#footnote-1)

**Data Collection**: This template is designed to collect the information that is needed to create the required annual reports and is not intended to act as a substitute for the annual reports. After the data are collected, it is expected that air districts will work with their community steering committees to compile the information into their own user‑friendly format(s) that reflects community concerns and summarizes progress, challenges, and next steps. California Air Resources Board (CARB) staff will compile data statewide to provide an overall update to CARB’s Governing Board and the public.

This data collection template includes: the metrics defined in each community emissions reduction program; action items from CARB Governing Board Resolutions and Staff Reports; and the minimum requirements listed in CARB’s Community Air Protection Blueprint.[[2]](#footnote-2) CARB staff will provide the relevant information on CARB strategies and associated emissions reduction progress for the annual reports. To support transparency, all information will be publicly available.

**Due Date for Public Release**: CARB’s Community Air Protection Blueprint states that annual progress reports must be made available to the public no later than October 1 of each year. Air districts must post the reports on their webpage, issue a public notification that the report has been released, and then present the report to the district board at a public hearing to discuss the contents.

***Please provide the following information for your OVERALL community emissions reduction program[[3]](#footnote-3)***

* Section A: *Qualitative* progress assessment and status updates for interim milestones identified by the CARB Governing Board; and *Quantitative* summary of progress

***Please fill in the attached spreadsheet to provide an update on each strategy in your community emissions reduction program***

* Section B: Status update for each strategy (attach spreadsheet)

| ***Section A:* QUALITATIVE progress assessment and status updates for interim milestones identified by the CARB Governing Board** |
| --- |
| 1. Provide a *qualitative* progress assessment. Briefly describe the progress made and provide a status update for each of the following items:*[Ref. Blueprint, page C-39, C-40]*
 |
| * Community Engagement.
 |
| Since the District Governing Board’s adoption of the South Central Fresno CERP, the District has utilized bilingual community engagement to continue to collaborate on implementation of CERP measures and community air monitoring within the community. Such engagement mechanisms include: * Design and development of effective voluntary incentive-based emission reduction programs based on community input
* Continued prioritization and feedback on the sources and locations for expenditure of incentive dollars outlined in the CERP measures
* Continued development of tools and resources for engagement and processing of technical air quality information

To ensure successful implementation of AB 617, residents, businesses, non-profits, agencies, and other stakeholders within South Central Fresno have been fully engaged in both English and Spanish. The District has ensured that the CSC meetings continue to facilitate inclusive and balanced public engagement by providing:* Monthly agenda-setting meetings with District, stakeholders, community co-hosts, CARB, and a third-party facilitator to collectively set expectations and plan for upcoming CSC meetings
* Real-time interpretation services in all languages requested by CSC members and members of the public, which to date is English and Spanish
* CSC members have raised concerns about getting meeting materials translated and made available with more time prior to the meetings, to address this issue, District staff have moved up agenda setting meetings to provide for meeting materials to be prepared, translated, and delivered with more time
* Expert presentations from partner agencies such as CARB, City of Fresno, Fresno Council of Governments (COG), and Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment (OEHHA)
* A comprehensive and dedicated bilingual webpage with tools to view real-time air quality monitoring data and maps of emissions
* Neutral meeting facilitation to ensure meetings are inclusive and neutral by bringing out different points of view and preventing individuals from monopolizing discussions
* Weekly phone calls and text exchanges with our Spanish speaking CDC members to ensure they are engaged in the process
* Through March 2020:
	+ Monthly evening meetings at convenient locations in the community
	+ Child activity areas and dinner for all attendees
	+ All meeting materials in hardcopy and via a comprehensive website in all necessary languages
* Since April 2020:
	+ Monthly evening meetings via Zoom, with technical assistance provided to residents and stakeholders upon request
	+ Continued real-time interpretation services through two Spanish interpreters at each meeting
	+ Meeting materials posted ahead of meeting, and send in hardcopy for Spanish-only speakers to facilitate more productive virtual meeting environments
* Understanding that some CSC members were limited in their ability to participate in the virtual meetings, the District has developed a program to lend laptop computers and internet access to members of the CSC to fully allow them to participate in the AB 617 implementation process

The District has been working with CSC to implement effective strategies, including engaging with Valley residents, businesses, agencies, and other stakeholders to identify and implement clean air investments in the South Central Fresno CERP. In addition, the District has taken steps over the past several months to better serve our Spanish speaking CSC members and encourage their active engagement in the meetings and CERP implementation process. Ensuring effective steering committees requires substantial investment of staffing and other resources to schedule, organize, and facilitate frequent after-hours public meetings with extensive related investigation and communications. The District has also continued to conduct public workshops throughout the Valley as needed to solicit additional community input while using outreach and media events as opportunities to discuss AB617 and promote the various grant programs available. Additionally, District staff provides updates and seeks feedback from the Citizens Advisory Committee (CAC) and Environmental Justice Advisory Group (EJAG) as the implementation of AB 617 in the Valley continues to develop. Involving the public in the CERP implementation process continues to be a priority of the CSC and the District. All CSC meetings are promoted on social media and live streamed on Facebook with the meeting videos archived on the South Central Fresno webpage. Response to COVID-19 State of EmergencyOn March 19, 2020, responding to the growing threat of COVID-19 in the state, California Governor Newsom issued Executive Order N-33-20 directing all individuals living in the State of California to stay home except as needed to maintain continuity of operations of the federal critical infrastructure. The result of this order was that none of the existing CSCs could continue to meet in person.  To address this challenge and to continue moving forward with the important work of implementation of the South Central Fresno CERP, District staff developed and sent an online survey to all CSC members to assess the members’ ability and willingness to meet virtually. District staff followed up with phone calls to those members that could not complete the survey or who had indicated technological limitations or concerns on the survey to fully understand CSC members’ ability to participate in virtual meetings. In addition, District staff, CARB, resident members of the CSC, Environmental Justice partners serving on the committee, and AB 617 meeting facilitators had multiple conference calls to discuss the challenges related to COVID-19, the results of the surveys and potential solutions based on CSC member feedback. Almost all CSC members indicated a strong desire to continue implementing AB 617 in all three of the selected communities and selected the use of the online meeting application, Zoom, to meet virtually.In April 2020, based on these discussions and the results of the surveys, the District held a virtual practice meeting via Zoom and via phone with the South Central Fresno CSC. During the practice meeting, the District addressed issues such as Spanish interpretation needs and provided important instruction to CSC members on the use of Zoom and explained how the CSC and District would use the various available features to provide a high level of discussion and engagement, which were keys to success for the in-person meetings up through March. In addition, the District invested in the online mapping tool Social Pinpoint to facilitate community input in a virtual setting. In May 2020, regular Steering Committee meetings began to be held once again with the South Central Fresno Steering Committee. Community Participation and New Resident Stipend ProgramCSCs meet regularly, requiring ongoing participation and a significant time commitment from community residents, business owners, and other stakeholders. In most cases, steering committee meetings occur in the evenings and may draw attendees away from their families and other obligations. Community-resident steering committee members are not paid and do not have expenses reimbursed to participate in the process or attend these meetings. Providing stipends to help cover some time and expenses associated with attending meetings is an important way to support this critical participation and encourage sustained and meaningful community engagement throughout these processes. Towards that end, and in response to several residents and community advocates on the Fresno CSC, CARB recently developed new statewide guidance encouraging districts to work with steering committees in developing stipend programs for resident members of steering committees.On August 20, 2020, the District’s Governing Board responded to the community needs and approved District staff’s recommendation to provide stipends to eligible resident steering committee members, effective retroactively for participation beginning on January 1, 2020. Under the stipend program developed by District staff in consultation with CSC stakeholders across all San Joaquin Valley AB 617 communities, residents who participate as CSC members, who do not receive compensation for their attendance at such meetings, may request a stipend to offset the cost of participating in each regular CSC meeting. Eligible residents may receive a $75 stipend per CSC meeting when their attendance is verified on the meeting roll-call list or sign-in sheet and were present for at least 75% of the scheduled meeting (equivalent to missing up to 30 minutes of a scheduled 2 hour meeting). Residents will receive stipends for attending up to fifteen (15) CSC meetings in a calendar year, for a total cost of up to $1,125 per year. The stipends for resident steering committee members would be subject to the availability of state AB 617 funding and approved allocation in the District’s Budget on an annual basis.  |
| * Enforcement.
 |
| During the development of the South Central Fresno CERP, CSC members identified several primary sources of concern within the community. Based on the analysis of the District’s enforcement history within the AB 617 community, several focused enforcement and compliance assistance measures were included in the CERP aimed at enhancing enforcement and education efforts through existing District enforcement programs to address those areas of community concern discussed below. In addition to the implementation of the enforcement measures adopted in the CERP, the District’s Compliance Department has continued over the past year to promptly respond to public air pollution complaints in the community. A complete summary of complaints received and enforcement actions taken over the past year is attached to this report and can be found here: http://community.valleyair.org/media/2248/2020-sc-fresno-enforcement-report.pdf.**Enhanced Enforcement of Wood Burning Curtailments**To limit the potential for localized PM2.5 impacts associated with the failure to comply with mandatory episodic wood burning curtailments under District Rule 4901, the District optimizes rule effectiveness to reduce the public health impact of wood smoke, the District dedicates extensive staffing resources to operate a robust Rule 4901 enforcement program covering all aspects of the rule. The District’s strategy focuses on both compliance assistance and enforcement activities. On all curtailment days, the District dedicates significant staffing resources to conducting surveillance in neighborhoods and responding to complaints from members of the public to ensure compliance with the rule. The District treats fireplace surveillance and complaint response as the highest priority enforcement activity.To address the community concern of residential wood burning, the District conducted expanded residential wood burning surveillance within the 617 community on each "No Burning Unless Registered" and "No Burning for All" day declared (4 hours of surveillance per day) during the 2019-20 wood-burning curtailment season (November 1 to February 29). **Enhanced Enforcement to Reduce Illegal Burning of Residential Waste**To limit the potential for localized PM2.5 and toxic impacts associated with the illegal open burning of residential waste and to address the community concerns in regards to illegal burning, the District conducted 20 hours of targeted surveillance quarterly to enforce the residential open burning prohibitions in District Rule 4103 and Title 17, California Code of Regulations, Section 93113 within the community. **Enhanced Enforcement of Regulation VIII Fugitive Dust Requirements**District rules limit fugitive dust emissions from construction, demolition, and earthmoving; bulk material storage; open areas; and unpaved roads and vehicle/equipment traffic areas. Furthermore, District rules restrict carryout and trackout onto paved public roadways. In order to facilitate enforcement of fugitive dust prohibitions, a Construction Notification or Dust Control Plan is required for all construction activities in the District involving one or more acre of disturbed surface area.To address the community concern of construction/earthmoving dust emissions, the District conducted inspections of construction sites within the community with active Dust Control Plans or Construction Notifications pursuant to District Rule 8021 to enforce the fugitive dust emission standards contained within District Regulation VIII. Additionally, the District also conducted general area surveillance for other potential sources of fugitive dust in the community. **Enhanced Enforcement of Statewide Anti-Idling Regulation**To address the community concern of heavy-duty trucks and to limit the potential for localized PM2.5 and toxic air quality impacts associated with the failure to comply with the state’s heavy duty anti-idling idling regulation, the District staff performed quarterly anti-idling surveillance. Locations where surveillance was conducted was based on CSC input provided to the District and CARB. To ensure District staff are focusing in the areas where residents are being impacted , the District has included agenda discussions in CSC meetings to provide updates on these efforts and to receive CSC feedback on areas to be focused on while doing surveillance and will continue to do so moving forward. District staff also spoke directly to businesses, who rely on heavy-duty trucking, identified by the CSC to provide compliance assistance and education regarding the state’s anti-idling Airborne Toxic Control Measure requirements and steps to be taken to ensure compliance. While no violations were discovered during the surveillance performed, the District believes that the outreach provided to businesses in community will contribute to increased compliance with the state’s requirements.**Enhanced Inspection Frequency of Stationary Sources**The District conducts inspections and investigations of both permitted sources to determine compliance with a multitude of health-protective local, state, and federal air quality regulations targeting both criteria and toxic pollutants. These include (1) District rules and permit requirements; (2) statewide Airborne Toxic Control Measures; (3) statewide greenhouse gas regulations; and (4) federal New Source Performance Standards, National Emission Standards for Hazardous Air Pollutants, and Maximum Available Control Technology standards. The District closely monitors such sources and strictly enforces applicable requirements. Compliance evaluations are unannounced whenever possible and involve both a physical inspection of the facility and a review of operating and monitoring records. To address the community concern of industrial processes as well as agricultural operations and other permitted sources of air pollution, the District reviewed the enforcement history of all permitted facilities in the community, and for each facility having an emissions violation within the last three years, the District committed to performing inspections of these facilities at least twice per calendar year for the next five years or until the facility has four consecutive inspections without an emission violation, whichever comes first. District staff has fully implemented this measure and increased inspections of these facilities is ongoing.**Pilot Training Program for Conducting Self-Inspections at Gas Stations**The District has developed the training program, however, due to the close one-on-one interaction needed to train gas station owners/operators on conducting more thorough, hands-on vapor recovery system inspections, training will be postponed until such a time that the training can be provided while ensuring the safety of District staff and facility staff. |
| * Metrics for Tracking Progress.
 |
| To address the questions the CSC had regarding implementation of individual measures in the approved CERP, the District developed, with feedback and suggestions from CSC members, a tracking tool that has been posted to the community webpage that shows the work that has been done on CERP measures and the current status of implementation to keep the CSC members and interested parties. District staff update online tracker on a monthly basis with any additional progress made on CERP measures to ensure CSC members and interested parties have up-to-date information. The District and CARB approved CERP includes 47 measures in the adopted CERP, 17 are incentives measures where the District and CSC worked to identify the number of units targeted for replacement, by year, throughout implementation of the CERP. The remaining measures, whether incentive-based, enforcement, outreach, mitigation, or a land use partnership, have metrics that outline the number of planned inspection hours, scheduled meetings, or other interactions expected for the implementation of the each measure. The tracker, updated monthly prior to the CSC meeting, can be found here: <http://community.valleyair.org/fresno-tracker/>.The District continues to reassess and evaluate these metrics with the CSC as CERP implementation meetings continue.  |
| * Implementation Schedule.
 |
| The District and CSC have made no formal changes to the implementation schedule in the District and CARB approved CERP. The majority of the measures listed in the CERP are multi-year projects requiring close coordination with numerous agencies and groups, including CARB, state and local agencies, and community based groups and non-profit organizations.  |
| * Data Analysis.
 |
| The District has developed processes designed to track emissions reductions through implementation of CERP measures. Additionally, using the CSC approved Community Air Monitoring Plan, the District has been analyzing collected air monitoring data and presenting the detailed analyses to the CSC in weekly and quarterly updates, which are posted to the community’s air monitoring webpage, and during the standing updates provided to the CSC during CSC meetings.  |
| * Strategy Development.
 |
| Once the CERP measures were approved by the District’s Governing Board and later CARB, District staff immediately began working with the CSC, partner agencies, businesses, others, to develop strategies to implement the CERP measures. Working off of the priorities established by the CSC members, the District has been bringing in the partner agencies and groups identified for individual CERP measures and have been working on implementing these measures. It should be noted that a little more than a month after the CERP was approved by CARB, the COVID-19 pandemic struck, the District worked with the CSC to understand their desire and ability to continue to meet in a virtual environment. The CSC had a strong desire to continue the important work to implement the CERP as quickly as possible. Once it was decided to continue to hold these meetings, the District selected a platform, held a trial run with the CSC members and began holding regular meetings again in April 2020. Unlike many AB 617 communities statewide, the CSC requested to continue to meet monthly during the implementation phase.Strategy discussions include development of program plans for community identified projects required by CARB to spend incentive funds on the measures, identifying and prioritizing areas within the community to focus the work identified by CERP measures, and identifying necessary outreach to parties, whether for compliance assistance efforts or incentive opportunities to name few. This strategy development is highlighted in the spreadsheet template provided to Districts by CARB. |
| 1. Highlight any “lessons learned” that can be used to support communities with similar sources and air quality challenges. *[Ref. Blueprint, page C-39]*
 |
| Making sure that the CSC members understand that AB 617 does not bring and new legal mandates and that the partner agencies are not required to participate in the AB 617 process and to foster an environment of a desire to work collaboratively with partner agencies and organizations towards the shared goal of improved air quality and health outcomes for those who live and work in the community.The process needs to be viewed as a partnership between the air districts and community steering committees, taking their knowledge and expertise of the area and the challenges facing the community members and first incorporating that information into CERP measures and then continuing to rely on that knowledge to develop the strategies to implement the CERP measures to ensure the highest levels of success.Early identification of potential partners in CERP measure implementation, including cities, counties, state agencies, federal agencies, community based organizations, and local agencies, is a key factor. Bringing people who represent these agencies and groups and having them build a relationship with the CSC members is very important as they build trust with the committee members, provide information needed by the CSCs so they have the ability to provide valuable input and feedback on how to move forward the implementation of measures in the CERP.From the outset, the District has utilized neutral meeting facilitation to ensure meetings are inclusive and bring out different points of view while preventing individuals from monopolizing discussions. Having neutral facilitation has provided an open and safe environment for discussion by all parties while ensuring the discussions to be goal-oriented and move toward shared objectives. In addition to having meeting facilitation, the District also meets with CSC members after CSC meetings to discuss next steps and actions from the meeting and set the agenda for the following meeting. This ensures that the District is working on the CERP measures prioritized by the CSC and gives District adequate time to work on the agenda items. This also provides the necessary to translate and provide hard copies of documents in a timely manner, which has been an ongoing topic for the CSC.The approved CERP included numerous community-identified incentive measures that fall outside of existing CARB Community Air Protection (CAP) Guidelines and requires the development of individual program plans, submittal and approval by CARB staff prior to being able to use CAP funding. It has proven to be very time consuming process developing and working with CARB staff to approve these plans. The time in it takes to approve these program plans has been a source of frustration by CSC members who are eager to see tangible benefits in the communities as a reflection of the time and effort that they have spent.Significant time and effort needs to be put into listening to the needs and concerns of the community steering committee members and the District’s work needs to demonstrate how their concerns are being met and addressed, especially in regards to CSC members being able to fully participate in the process, especially as the pandemic forced the process to continue in a in a virtual environment. Towards that end, through discussions with CSC members the District determined that some of the CSC members were having difficulties with their technology. To address this issue, the District developed a pilot program to provide laptop computers and technology training to CSC members. Additionally, the District has increased interpretation capabilities, using to 2 interpreters to ensure interpretation was not an issue. The District has received recognition and appreciation from CSC members on the District’s efforts to address these issues. Being a brand new program with no proven existing models or formulas from which to draw upon, it has been a learning experience for District staff and the CSC members on how best to work together towards a common goal of improving air quality of the South Central Fresno community. Actively listening by all parties and reviewing expectations and actions is key to ongoing success. To assist in this effort, it is important that CARB provide the necessary guidance to ensure consistency and equity, through their role as developers of the AB 617 Blueprint, and providing air districts and CSC members clarity on things like roles and responsibilities and to look to regularly update with the document with “lessons learned”. |
| 1. The community emissions reduction program will have included a community profile. Describe any community profile updates, such as the following information, if applicable: *[Ref. Blueprint, page C-39]*
 |
| * Describe changes in community attributes (e.g., revised socioeconomic data).
 |
| The Community Profile for South Central Fresno was developed utilizing data from the District’s recent PM2.5 State Implementation Plan, the most recent version of the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment (OEHHA) tool CalEnviroScreen 3.0, and readily available census data. These sources have not been updated since the South Central Fresno CERP was approved; therefore, no changes have been made to the community profile.  |
| * List any new community attributes that have been identified (e.g., new local public health indicators).
 |
| No additional community attributes have been identified since the adoption of the CERP in February 2020. |
| **Action Items in CARB Board Resolution 20-7 and CARB Staff Report*** CARB staff works with the District and the community steering committee to take the additional actions to strengthen implementation as defined in the Staff Report on pages 8, 9, and 10 and as modified by this Resolution, to do the following:
* Board-Directed Action #1: Include a process for making adjustments to incentive measure funding amounts based on ongoing discussions and recommendations from the community steering committee, and continue engaging the committee on prioritization of incentive measures and project selection. This should include the District seeking co-funding for the truck re-routing strategy, with full funding provided by the District if sufficient co-funding is not identified.
 |
| The District has continued to work with the South Central Fresno Community CSC to discuss individual CERP measure implementation since the District Governing Board adopted the CERP in September 2019. This has included assessing adjustments to incentive measure funding amounts based on CSC feedback. For example, during the March 2020 CSC meeting, the committee came to a consensus that the CERP measure funding the replacement of older locomotives with cleaner engines (HD.9) was no longer a priority, and asked that the funding for this measure be reallocated to other priority measures, including incentives for electric school buses (HD.7). in response, the District agreed to no longer pursue the locomotive measure and will look to reallocate the funds to other priority measures as suggested at a later date.During the August 2020 CSC meeting, committee members suggested that the District continue to assess the cost of the school filtration measure (SC.1) and reallocate funding as necessary to ensure that schools with older air conditioning systems are still able to take advantage of the measure as approved by CARB.Finally, the District is continuing to work with the City of Fresno and Fresno Council of Governments to identify co-funding for the truck rerouting study measure (HD.11). The District and the City of Fresno established a truck rerouting study subcommittee, whose role is to help develop and steer the study’s scope of work and identify qualified contractors to perform the study. The District has been working directly with the City of Fresno and the CSC. |
| * Board-Directed Action #2: Develop and provide specific criteria for project funding amounts and project selection, and clarify in the “Metrics to Track Progress” the process for adjusting allocations when projects are undersubscribed or oversubscribed.
 |
| The District is currently developing program plans for fireplace/natural gas residential heating devices, passenger vehicle replacement, and urban greening/vegetative barriers in accordance with Chapter 6 of CARB’s Community Air Protection Incentives Guidelines. Once these program plans have been approved and incentive money used to fund these projects, the District will provide routine updates to the CSCs in regards to the participation levels and to receive input and feedback on any changes necessary regarding possible increased outreach to increase participation and the possibility of needing to make adjustments to the program plan to ensure full subscription. As other program plans are developed in coordination with the CSC and approved by CARB, the District will continue to work with the community to develop more specific criteria for project funding amounts. |
| * Board-Directed Action #3: Update the emissions reduction targets as new information becomes available for the regulatory and other strategies that do not yet have defined benefits where quantification is feasible.
 |
| The District will update the emissions reduction targets as new information becomes available for the regulatory and other strategies that do not yet have defined benefits where quantification is feasible.For outreach measures, mitigation measures, enhanced enforcement measures, and land use partnership measures, quantification is not yet feasible. However, the District is continuing to look for ways to include these estimates where possible. For example, the vegetative barriers measure (VB.1) did not have a quantifiable target in the CERP, but District partners at Tree Fresno and Sonoma Technologies Inc. (STI) are working to help the District and CSC understand the potential emissions reduction benefits from this program as we move forward with implementation. |
| * Board-Directed Action #4: Conduct a review of stationary source rules applicable to sources in the community and discuss current permitting and rule-making processes, as well as next steps in a transparent and expeditious manner with the community steering committee members by the end of 2020.
 |
| During the July 2020 CSC meeting, the District provided a detailed update on current and future rulemaking efforts. During this update, the District offered to hold ad hoc and/or subcommittee meetings with CSC members to enhance public participation opportunities for the CSC. Additionally, the District also provides bilingual emails to CSC members for all public meetings and workshops regarding rule development efforts and continues to encourage participation.The CSC had identified several specific sources of concern including a glass plant, biomass plant, and bulk fuel terminal and the District prioritized rule making efforts regarding these sources. The District has begun rule-making efforts applicable to these sources, and CSC members have been provided opportunities to participate in the public process.  |
| * Board-Directed Action #5: Continue to strengthen the working relationship with the agencies that have land use and transportation authority in South Central Fresno to address community steering committee concerns, including seeking to establish a Memorandum of Understanding or other appropriate mechanisms with these agencies, including the City and County of Fresno, to address air quality impacts and concerns. To support these efforts, CARB staff will continue to move forward on development of the Freight Handbook and CARB and the District commit to work with the community steering committee to advance implementation of the best practices discussed in Tables 5 and 6 of the Freight Handbook Concept Paper.
 |
| Understanding of the importance of this measure to the CSC, the District has been diligently working on this action. The District has had several conversations with the City of Fresno in regards to the CSC’s desire to develop an Memorandum of Understanding or other appropriate mechanism to address air quality impacts and concerns. Additionally, the District has also provided copies of the working draft of the CARB freight handbook to City of Fresno staff to review. At the same time, as part of the commitment under CERP measure LU.2, District staff have been more involved in the City of Fresno’s land use processes including recently commenting on the City of Fresno’s General Plan update and regularly reviewing and providing CEQA comments regarding land use projects in the AB 617 community, which is The District looks to be involved at the early stages to enhance the projects by incorporating clean air measures to minimize overall impacts to the community residents. |
| * Board-Directed Action #6: Continue to improve communication between the District and the community steering committee by developing clear objectives, setting mutually agreed upon deadlines, and providing information and feedback within defined timeframes, including the time needed for translation of materials into Spanish.
 |
| The District has been working diligently to involve the CSC in all aspects of CERP implementation and has been actively listening to and addressing the requests they have been making. There are several examples of this in action. The first is that the District continues to work directly with the CSC on developing the CSC meeting agendas and the specific topics that will be discussed during the meetings. CSC members have requested that meeting documents be developed and translated with enough time to allow them to be prepared for discussion during the CSC meetings., so the District has moved up agenda setting meetings to give District staff the necessary time to meet these objectives. Hard copies of the Spanish translated materials are delivered to the necessary residents and others, as requested.  Additionally, a Spanish and English version of the measures tracker is updated, posted, and sent on a monthly basis to all CSC members, which helps streamline communication about ongoing work on CERP implementation. The measure tracker is located here: http://community.valleyair.org/media/2500/april-fresno-website-tracker.pdf |
| * Board-Directed Action #7: Define a process for continued discussion of any additional community steering committee strategy ideas that are not currently included in the Program, and potential mechanisms for updates through the annual progress reports.
 |
| Through the CSC meeting agenda setting meetings and during discussions with CSCs during meetings, the CSC understands the opportunities they have to discuss agenda items and/or strategies to implement CERP measures. The District has also discussed the process for updating the CERP and what steps would be necessary based on the type of change, whether it is an addition or modification and that the action may require the need to take the change to the District’s Governing Board for inclusion in the CERP.  |
| * Board-Directed Action #8: Include the community steering committee in the agenda setting process, while continuing the rotation of community steering committee members as meeting co-hosts, so that members can continue to actively participate in meeting development and management.
 |
| All CSC members are invited to agenda setting meetings and the District has developed a co-host model where a member of the CSC shares these duties with the District. These changes have been met with positive feedback from CSC members. CSC members who participated in these agenda-setting meetings express their desire to have input into the discussions and develop agenda topics that will promote robust and meaningful discussion during the meetings. During agenda setting meetings, the District shares updates on CERP implementation progress made and discusses any challenges or hindrances that are delaying implementation of individual measures. From these discussions, the CSC has been very helpful by providing their knowledge, experience, and connections to agencies and groups. |
| * Board-Directed Action #9: Identify the specific implementation steps and milestones for each of the strategies in the Program.
 |
| The District, with input from the CSCs, developed a bilingual measure tracking tool that is located on the community webpage. This one-of-a-kind tool tracks progress made on each of the measures in the CERP and the information in the tracker is updated on a monthly basis. The tracking tool serves several purposes, it highlights their work and that of District staff to implement individual measures through progress made and allows CSC members the opportunity to highlight individual measures needing more focus and to bring those to CSC meetings for discussion.The measure tracker is located here: http://community.valleyair.org/media/2500/april-fresno-website-tracker.pdf |
| * Board-Directed Action #10: CARB staff, the District, and the community steering committee report back to the Board semi-annually or as directed by the Board, on implementation of these actions.
 |
| The District and CSC members provided a report back to the CARB Board on September 24, 2020. The report back gave a general overview of the progress that has been made and the work that has been done while working closely with the CSC.  |
| 1. Summarize the status of rules and regulations adopted that impact the community.
 |
| PM2.5 Plan Rule Updates The District has and will continue to analyze and amend District rules to pursue additional emission reduction opportunities beyond BARCT. These rule amendments will be reviewed on the schedule included in the District’s *2018 PM2.5 Plan*, which was recently adopted by CARB into the State Implementation Plan and approved by U.S. EPA. Various source categories addressed through this ongoing regulatory development process include: Flares; Boilers, Steam Generators, and Process Heaters; Internal Combustion Engines; Commercial Underfired Charbroilers; Glass Melting Furnaces; and Solid Fuel-Fired Boilers, Steam Generators, and Process Heaters. District staff have continued moving forward with technical evaluation and public engagement efforts for scheduled regulatory measures, with several District rules scheduled for proposed amendments in the 2020-2021 timeframe. Emissions reductions achieved through the implementation of more stringent limits potentially required through these rule amendments will further contribute to reduced exposure to air pollution in the community. CSC members, members of the AB 617-selected community, and the general public are encouraged to be involved in the upcoming rulemaking process for these rules.

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **Rule** | **Stationary/Area Source Category** | **Rule Development Status** |
| *4901* | *Wood burning fireplaces and heaters*  | *Completed: Adopted/enforced in 2019/20 winter season* |
| 4311 | Flares | Regulatory and public engagement process currently in progress – amendments scheduled for consideration in 2020 |
| 4306 & 4320 | Boilers, steam generators, and process heaters |
| 4702 | Internal combustion engines |
| 4692 | Under-fired charbroilers at commercial restaurants |
| 4354 | Glass Melting Furnaces | Regulatory and public engagement process to begin in 2020 - amendments scheduled for consideration in 2021 |
| 4352 | Solid-Fuel Fired Boilers | Regulatory and public engagement process to begin in 2020 - amendments scheduled for consideration in 2021 |

Best Available Retrofit Control Technology (BARCT)AB 617 required districts that are in nonattainment for one or more air pollutants to adopt expedited schedules by January 2019 for the implementation of Best Available Retrofit Control Technology (BARCT). Significant work was necessary to demonstrate that existing rules met BARCT requirements or, where it was not clear that BARCT requirements were met, identify potential gaps in the existing rules, establish a rule-review schedule, and take the schedule to the District’s Governing Board for approval before the deadline. The Board adopted the District’s BARCT Analysis Schedule on December 20, 2018. The District is now implementing the plan, and, where necessary, develop rule amendments consistent with state BARCT requirements. The District must also share its findings with the state as CARB compiles the BARCT clearinghouse. District’s expedited BARCT Schedule: <http://community.valleyair.org/best-available-retrofit-control-technology-barct>Starting in 2019 and continuing in 2020, the District has begun performing a further BARCT analysis of 12 of the 16 rules identified, typically in the order of documented priority. Each District rule and source category are evaluated in comparison to federal and state air quality regulations and the regulations of other air districts in California and throughout the country). The District held a public workshop on July 30, 2020 and provided a update to the public on the progress the District has made on the 8 rule evaluations (see published report – [link](http://community.valleyair.org/media/1790/final-barct-rule-analysis-july-30-2020.pdf)) and discussed the next steps associated with further evaluating the remaining District Rules for satisfying BARCT requirements. The following table summarizes the status of the BARCT rule evaluations.

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **Rule** | **Title** | **BARCT Status** |
| ***4454*** | *Refinery Process Unit Turnaround* | ***Meets BARCT*** |
| ***4641*** | *Cutback, Slow Cure, And Emulsified Asphalt, Paving And Maintenance Operations* | ***Meets BARCT*** |
| ***4104*** | *Reduction of Animal Matter* | ***Meets BARCT*** |
| **4409** | Components at Light Crude Oil Production Facilities, Natural Gas Production Facilities, and Natural Gas Processing Facilities | Combined rule development public process to evaluate/implement additional BARCT requirements commencing 2020 - expediting the rulemaking efforts for three of the five rules (Rules 4623, 4624, and 4401) to streamline assessment |
| **4455** | Components at Petroleum Refineries, Gas Liquids Processing Facilities, and Chemical Plants |
| **4623** | Storage of Organic Liquids |
| **4624** | Transfer of Organic Liquids |
| **4401** | Steam-Enhanced Crude Oil Production Wells |
| **4352** | Solid Fuel-Fired Boilers, Steam Generators, and Process Heaters | Rule development public process to evaluate/implement additional BARCT requirements commencing 2020 - expediting the rulemaking effort for this rule |
| **4354** | Glass Melting Furnace | Rule development public process to evaluate/implement additional BARCT requirements commencing 2020 - expediting the rulemaking effort for this rule |
| **4702** | Internal Combustion Engines (VOC only) | BARCT evaluation in progress and scheduled for 2020 completion |
| **4694** | Wine Fermentation and Storage Tanks | BARCT evaluation in progress and scheduled for 2020 completion |
| **4603** | Surface Coating of Metal Parts and Products, Plastic Parts and Products, and Pleasure Crafts | BARCT evaluation in progress and scheduled for 2020 completion |
| **4601** | Architectural Coatings | BARCT evaluation in progress and scheduled for 2020 completion |
| **4566** | Organic Material Composting Operations | BARCT evaluation scheduled for 2021 completion |
| **4625** | Wastewater Separators | BARCT evaluation scheduled for 2021 completion |
| **4621** | Gasoline Transfer Into Stationary Storage Containers, Delivery Vessels, and Bulk Plant | BARCT evaluation scheduled for 2021 completion |
| **4402** | Crude Oil Production Sumps | BARCT evaluation scheduled for 2021 completion |

The District is also working with the affected facilities to identify the potential control options that may result in additional emissions reductions. The affected facilities are providing the District with technical information and costs related to potential control options to determine the feasibility of implementing each option identified. |
| 1. Summarize the interactions with other agencies to address local exposure to air pollution (e.g., number of meetings with city and county governments). *[Ref. South Central Fresno Program, Section 6.1, page 180]*
 |
| The District has focused efforts, to date with the City of Fresno, due to the majority of the significant projects with the potential for impacting the AB 617 community are happening within the City. The District has also worked with the various school districts within the South Central Fresno boundary, Olivene, Tree Fresno, GRID Alternatives, CPUC, and many other organizations and they have provided updates and opportunities for CSC members in alignment with CERP implementation in the South Central community, as well as preparing for future updates for the CSC members and the public who participate in the process. |
| 1. Co-Benefits – Summarize additional co-benefits, including the following: *[Ref. South Central Fresno Program, Section 6.1, page 180]*
* Trainings and Outreach, including number of public meetings held in the community and the number of people in attendance.
 |
| While the ongoing pandemic has limited the types of trainings and outreach events, the District has transitioned to providing more air pollution related online training in both English and Spanish and have shared this information with CSC members. The District is continuing to adjust to virtual trainings and outreach, as evidenced through the quick transition to virtual CSC meetings and broad use of social media platforms link Facebook, Instagram, Next Door, etc to share regional and community-level air quality information to CSC members.  |
|  |
| * Workforce Development.
 |
| The CERP contains workforce development measures that involves incentive funding. The District is currently developing the program plan for this measure and once approved by CARB, will work closely with the CSC to make the community aware of opportunities. |
| * Technical Capacity-Building.
 |
| Much of the work done during the CERP development process revolved around the technical capacity building of the CSC members. Considerable time was spent explaining what air pollution is, where it comes from, how it is monitored for, and options for reducing emissions and exposure. As a result of the CSC members commitment to the process, they have gained tremendous knowledge that they have in-turn shared with other members of the community. |

| ***Section A:* QUANTITATIVE Summary of progress for the community emissions reduction program** |
| --- |
| 1. Status of the Strategies Included in the Program – Summarize the total number of strategies that have been fully implemented, the number that are in progress, and the number that have not yet begun implementation. *[Ref. Blueprint pages C-38, C-39. South Central Fresno Program, Section 4, pages 46-152]*
 |
| See data collection tracking spreadsheet. |
| 1. Completion of Required Elements – Describe completion of required elements (e.g., emissions reduction targets, milestones for compliance goals, etc.). Some required elements are provided below in 9a, 9b, and 9c.*[Ref. Blueprint pages C-3, C-4, C-38, C-40*

9a) Emission Reduction Targets – Summarize progress toward achieving overall emission reduction targets (PM2.5, PM10, DPM, NOX, and VOC, as applicable). *[Ref. Blueprint pages C-16 to C-19, C-38, C-40. South Central Fresno Program, pages 153-155]* |
| See data collection tracking spreadsheet. |
| 9b) Proximity-Based Goals - Summarize progress toward achieving proximity-based goals (e.g., for Health Air Living/HAL schools program, air filtration, vegetative barriers). *[Ref. Blueprint pages C-19, C-20. South Central Fresno Program, Section 6.1, page 180]* |
| See data collection tracking spreadsheet. |
| 9c) Compliance Goals - Provide an update on progress toward achieving compliance goals and improving compliance (e.g., summarize non-compliance rates and other key compliance statistics). *[Ref. Blueprint page C-31. South Central Fresno Program, Section 6.1., page 180]* |
| See data collection tracking spreadsheet. |
| 1. Incentives Investments - Summarize the total investments for incentive programs deployed in and around the community that are identified in the community and the associated emissions reductions. *[Ref. South Central Fresno Program, Section 6.1, page 180]*
 |
| See data collection tracking spreadsheet. |
| 1. Air Monitoring Results – For the five-year milestone report, summarize air monitoring results. *[Ref. South Central Fresno Program, Section 6.2, page 181, “…the five year milestone report submitted to CARB for South Central Fresno will include a comprehensive report of air quality monitoring data obtained in the community throughout the term of the CERP…”]*
 |
| See data collection tracking spreadsheet. |

| ***Section B:* Status update for EACH STRATEGY in the community emissions reduction program** |
| --- |
| Please fill in the attached spreadsheet template and provide an update on the status and specific metrics for EACH STRATEGY. [Ref. Blueprint, page C-39] |
| See data collection tracking spreadsheet. |

**[ATTACH SPREADSHEET FOR *Report Section B:* Status update for EACH STRATEGY in the community emissions reduction program]**

1. Assembly Bill 617, Garcia, C., Chapter 136, Statutes of 2017; codified in California Health and Safety Code section 44391.2(c)(7) which states that each district “…shall prepare an annual report summarizing the results and actions taken to further reduce emissions, pursuant to the community emissions reduction program…” [↑](#footnote-ref-1)
2. California Air Resources Board, “Community Air Protection Blueprint”, October 2018, Appendix C, pages C-38 to C-40, available at: <https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/our-work/programs/community-air-protection-program/community-air-protection-blueprint> [↑](#footnote-ref-2)
3. San Joaquin Valley Air Pollution Control District, “Community Emissions Reduction Program South Central Fresno” (i.e., South Central Fresno Program), September 19, 2019, available at: <http://community.valleyair.org/selected-communities/south-central-fresno>. [↑](#footnote-ref-3)