Blueprint Update Topic Categories Chart

Page number	Line number	Category or subcategory	Priority (# of times mentione
1	11	RESOURCES	
1	12	Stipends	
1	23	Training: technical, policy, and engagement	4
		 Equity, diversity and cultural competency training (AD and CARB staff, industry) 	4
1	33	Community tours	
1	37	Opportunities for Pre Selection Work	
2	41	CSC EARLY ACTIONS	
2	42	 Establishing a community boundary 	2
2	46	 Establishing a Charter/Governance System 	4
2	56	Principles of open public meetings	
		Community selection	1
		Community engagement/collaboration	3
2	59	PUBLIC PROCESS	
2	60	Steering committee agenda setting	1 (best p)
2	62	Timing and distribution of meeting materials	
2	69	Meeting facilitation	1 (best p)
2	71	Translation and interpretation services	
2	75	Conflict of Interest, disclosure, and recusal	7
		Conflict resolution	1(1)
		Business role/engagement on CSC	3
3	83	CERP DEVELOPMENT	
3	84	Documenting the process	1
3	90	Information for priority setting	1
3	97	Criteria for emission reduction targets, goals, and	5
		metrics/community assessment	
		 Community-scale inventories and risk assessment (block by block analysis), mobile monitoring techniques 	2
3	99	Strategies	1
		Statutory timelines	2
3	109	ROLES/RESPONSIBILITIES	
3	110	CARB/District/CSC/Business and Blueprint role	11 (1)
		Statute-defined authority: clarity	5
3	112	Land use engagement mechanisms	4
		Agency collaboration (state, regional, local)	2
3	119	BLUEPRINT GENERAL	
4	127	• August 5, 2020 Topics from Letter Submitted by EJ Groups	

4	128	Blueprint Update	
4	140	Community Steering Committee Governance	1
5	176	Community Emission Reduction Plan Guidance	1
5	191	Best Practices for CERP Planning and	7
		Implementation	
6	209	Transparency in Resource and Budget Allocations	5 (1)

Four Baskets (DRAFT)

- 1. Establish and define Partnerships to achieve EJ in DACs
 - a. CSC Charter
 - b. Boundary setting
 - c. Best practices for interpretation/translation and timing/distribution of materials
 - d. Inter-agency collaboration (land use, transportation)
- Process for creating products reflecting shared-leadership

 a. Infrastructure
- 3. Technical aspects of community assessment and progress tracking. Develop community-scale inventories, air quality data, and health impact data (use plain language principles)
- 4. Integration into standard ops at CARB and AD for all highly impacted communities.

Consultation – Statutory and Blueprint References

Excerpt – AB 617 (Appendix H in Blueprint; Health and Safety Code, to read: 44391.2).

.....(b) On or before October 1, 2018, the <u>state board</u> shall prepare, in consultation with the Scientific Review Panel on Toxic Air Contaminants, the districts, the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment, environmental justice organizations, affected industry, and other interested stakeholders, a statewide strategy to reduce emissions of toxic air contaminants and criteria air pollutants in communities affected by a high cumulative exposure burden.

(2) Within one year of the state board's selection, the district encompassing any location selected pursuant to this subdivision shall adopt, in consultation with the state board, individuals, community-based organizations, affected sources, and local governmental bodies in the affected community, a community emissions reduction program to achieve emissions reductions for the location selected using cost-effective measures identified pursuant to paragraph

Blueprint - Community Steering Committee Participants

Excerpt - Page 6 – Community Driven Action Section

The community steering committee will include community members who live, work, or own businesses within communities designated for focused action through community emissions reduction programs and community air monitoring, with the majority representation from community residents.

- Additional members may include: participants from local community-based environmental justice organizations and public health organizations that work in the selected community; schools; city/county officials; land use planning agencies; transportation agencies; local health departments (e.g., hospitals, clinics, physical rehabilitation centers, public health counseling services); academic researchers; and labor organizations, as appropriate.
- The final community steering committee membership should reflect the diverse makeup across the selected community

Excerpt - Page 22 - Community Steering Committee Section

Air districts must form local steering committees using an open and transparent nomination process, that is composed of community members who live, work, or own businesses within each community. To ensure that the community steering committee focuses on the needs of the residents, a majority of the members must be community residents.

- Business perspectives must also be reflected in the community steering committee membership. This can include the owners of small businesses which are important community voices, locallybased business associations, as well as larger industrial sources, but committee membership must draw from workers or managers from the facility itself to keep the focus on the community.
- The final community steering committee membership should reflect the diverse makeup across the selected community.
- Air district staff will serve as the conveners of the public meetings. Additional members may include: participants from local community-based environmental justice organizations and local public health organizations that work in the selected community; schools; city/county officials; land

HANDOUT A

use planning agencies; transportation agencies; local health departments (e.g., hospitals, clinics, physical rehabilitation centers, public health counseling services); academic researchers; and labor organizations, as appropriate.

Appendix C - Criteria for Community Emissions Reduction Programs

Excerpt - Page C- 8 - Community Steering Committee Section

Understanding a community's air quality challenges and developing effective solutions requires the expertise and participation of a variety of stakeholders. Community residents, business owners, and people who work within a community all have first-hand knowledge of the impacts of air pollution within their community and potential solutions. Governmental agencies including air districts, CARB, local health departments and other health organizations, schools, and land use and transportation agencies also have valuable expertise and will be involved in implementing various aspects of the community emissions reduction program.

C-10 Participation Section

The community steering committee will include community members who live, work, or own businesses within the community (e.g., community residents, small businesses, facility managers/facility workers, school personnel).

- Business perspectives must also be reflected in the community steering committee membership. This can include the owners of small businesses which are important community voices, locallybased business associations, as well as larger industrial sources, but committee membership must draw from workers or managers from the facility itself to keep the focus on the community.
- To further encourage a comprehensive discussion of issues impacting the community and needed solutions, additional members should include: participants from local community-based environmental justice organizations and local public health organizations that work in the selected community; schools; city/county officials; land use planning agencies; transportation agencies; local health departments (e.g., hospitals, clinics, physical rehabilitation centers, public health counseling services); academic researchers; and labor organizations, as appropriate.
- The final community steering committee membership should reflect the diverse makeup across the selected community. To ensure that the community steering committee focuses on the needs of the residents, a majority of the members must be community residents.

Richmond

Richmond CSC Membership

Excerpt from AB 617 Community Steering Committee Charter - Richmond Monitoring

Steering Committee members will represent people who live in the Richmond-San Pablo area and other interested stakeholders affiliated with various sectors.

- These sectors can include community-based organizations, youth organizations, non-profits, faith leaders, education, government, health, and business representatives from the Richmond-San Pablo area.
- To ensure the Plan development remains community-driven, at least half (50%) of the membership must include individuals who represent people or groups of people who live in the Richmond-San Pablo area.
- The official roster will contain one primary name for each affiliation to be represented on the committee. This person should have the authority to make decisions on behalf of their organization, agency, business, etc.
- One alternate name can substitute for the primary member if the primary member is unable to attend a meeting. However, only one member from each affiliation will be allowed to deliberate at meetings to reach consensus.

Excerpt from Participation Agreement

We are committed to working collectively and cooperatively with all stakeholders within the community-local residents, businesses and organizations, youth groups, schools, local, regional and State governments, health agencies and faith-based organizations-to ensure all represented parties are heard and can agree on an outcome that protects public health.

To work towards consensus while recognizing that not everyone will agree on every issue and to resolve conflicts in a positive, swift and constructive manner.

Disclosure

Self-Identification (listed on Committee Roster)

Conflict of Interest

Excerpt from Charter

Steering committee members may choose to recuse themselves from decisions at any time. Members must recuse themselves from decisions where there is a conflict of interest. A conflict of interest is any situation in which financial or other business or personal considerations may unduly influence the member's judgment. Steering Committee members who participate in this process are expected to sign the *Richmond-San Pablo Area Steering Committee Participation Agreement* (Page 5 of this Charter) which outlines the expected conduct of all Steering Committee members.

HANDOUT B

Excerpt from Participation Agreement

Recusing oneself from decisions where a conflict of interest occurs.

Dispute Resolution/Voting

Excerpt from Charter - Deliberation and Consensus

- Decision-making will not proceed without a quorum of active members. A Quorum will be reached when 51% of active members of the Steering Committee are present and of those present, 51% are individuals who represent people or groups of people who live in the Richmond-San Pablo area.
- A professional and impartial facilitator(s) will be employed to support the steering committee in the overall organization, order and focus of the meeting, resolve conflicts and help reach consensus to ensure the goals and objectives of this charter are met.
- Achieving full consensus of the steering committee may not always be possible. In the event of an impasse, the co-lead team will be the final decision-makers, carefully weighing the consequences of any decision where there is a lack of consensus.
- If the co-lead team cannot agree, then the action in question will not proceed. Community Steering Committee members who do not agree with a majority consensus on a decision may submit a minority position statement.

Excerpt from Participation Agreement

Working towards consensus while recognizing that not everyone will agree on every issue and to resolve conflicts in a positive, swift and constructive manner.

West Oakland

West Oakland CSC Membership

<u>Excerpt from AB 617 Community Steering Committee Charter – West Oakland</u> Steering Committee membership is comprised of individuals representing community residents and various stakeholders from a variety of sectors.

Excerpt from Participation Agreement

Our goal is to remedy persistent air pollution problems and excessive local health risk exposures to people who live, work and play in and around West Oakland. We are committed to working collectively and cooperatively with all stakeholders within the community-local residents, businesses and organizations, youth groups, schools, local, regional and State governments, health agencies and faith-based organizations-to ensure all represented parties are heard and can agree on an outcome that protects public health.

To work towards consensus while recognizing that not everyone will agree on every issue and to resolve conflicts in a positive, swift and constructive manner.

Disclosure

Self-Identification (listed on Committee Roster)

Conflict of Interest / Dispute Resolution/Voting

Excerpt from Charter - Deliberation and Consensus

A professional and impartial facilitator(s) will be employed to support the steering committee in the overall organization, order and focus of the meeting, resolve conflicts and help reach consensus to ensure the goals and objectives of this charter are met.

- Achieving full consensus of the Steering Committee may not always be possible. In the event of an impasse, the co-leads shall be the final decision-makers, carefully weighing the consequences of any decision where there is a lack of consensus.
- If the co-leads cannot agree, then the action in question will not proceed.
- Steering Committee members who do not agree with a majority consensus on a decision may submit a minority position statement.

Excerpt from Participation Agreement

Strive for consensus in decision making. Respect that decision, even if it is not your preference.

Imperial

Community CSC Membership

Excerpt from Charter

The Committee shall consist

- District's Air Pollution Control Officer, or his/her designee, ex officio;
- Executive Director of CCV, or his/her designee, ex officio; and
- Thirteen (13) members including individuals, community-based organizations, affected sources and local government bodies in the affected community (Calexico-Heber-El Centro) pursuant to AB 617. (Alternates)

Qualifications.

Each member of the Committee shall either reside, work, or own businesses within the community corridor (Calexico-Heber-El Centro), as defined by the Community Air Protection (CAP) Program(s) and CAP Blueprint.

The District Board shall appoint Committee members in the following manner:

The positions of Air Pollution Control Officer and CCV Executive Director are *ex officio* members and shall serve as Co-Chairpersons in accordance with Article IV of this Charter.

The remaining positions shall be appointed in compliance with a standardized application process including but not limited to submitting an application form to the District including information (as necessary) to demonstrate the applicant's interest in the community corridor pursuant to AB 617.

Applications for the appointment of Committee members shall be assembled by the Clerk of the Committee.

Persons applying in accordance with the above-mentioned process shall be recommended by the Co-Chairpersons and appointed by a majority of the District Board in accordance with all applicable laws.

In the event a consensus cannot be reached among the Co-Chairpersons, all applications shall be submitted to the District Board for consideration. Committee members serve at the pleasure of the District Board, and may be removed from office by a majority vote of the District Board.

Conflict of Interest

Excerpt from Charter

Disqualification from Voting. A Committee member shall be disqualified from voting on any contract or any other matter in which he/she has a financial interest, as required by law.

Dispute Resolution

N/A

Voting

Excerpt from Charter

Voting. All actions of the Committee shall be adopted by an affirmative vote of a majority of the Committee members present and eligible to vote, provided that at least a quorum of Committee members are present and eligible to vote. Any act of the Committee shall be accomplished by a roll call vote when such a vote is requested by any member in attendance.

SAN DIEGO

Portside Community CSC Membership

Excerpt from Charter

The Steering Committee members must include individuals residing, working, or owning businesses within the Portside Community, with residents being in the majority.

Other members may include, but are not limited to: local, community-based environmental justice organizations; local public health organizations that work within the Portside Communities; schools; academic researchers; labor unions; land use planning agencies; city/county officials; transportation agencies; local investor-owned utilities; locally-based business associations, and workers or managers from the larger industrial sources located in the Portside Communities.

Conflict of Interest

N/A

Dispute Resolution

Excerpt from Charter

The Steering Committee has retained the services of a professional and impartial facilitator to lead Steering Committee meetings. The firm and their principal advisors were chosen for their experience in facilitating meetings focused on air quality issues throughout the state and their expertise in helping groups with varied opinions come together and reach agreement on issues.

Voting

Excerpt from Charter

Agenda items for some issues may require a vote of the voting members of the Steering Committee.

- Voting should only commence following discussion of the item during the meeting by the Steering Committee members. Again, there must be a quorum of voting members physically or virtually present at the meeting.
- After an agenda item has been discussed and a_Steering Committee action on that item is required, a motion must be made by a voting Steering Committee member and seconded by another voting member in order for the item to move forward.
- The facilitator will then restate the motion and ask for a show of hands in favor of the motion, and a show of hands for against the motion. The vote counts will be recorded on the sign-in/voting form and announced.
- Any member of the Steering Committee may ask for a roll call vote. When a roll call vote is requested, the facilitator will call on each member at the table for their vote and the votes will be recorded on the sign-in/voting form. The results will be announced after the votes have been compiled.
- This could result in a tie vote on a specific item. If this occurs, the Committee may decide to continue discussions and voting until an agreement is reached.
- Alternatively, the Committee can decide to continue the item to the next meeting. Issues that are continued will be added to a future meeting agenda, where additional information or discussion may be required to reach an agreement.
- All voting will be held in public during Steering Committee meetings. The Steering Committee will not conduct any e-mail voting on issues outside of public meetings.

South Coast (Summary of 2018 Communities and <u>SELA</u>)

CSC Membership

Excerpt from AB 617 Community Steering Committee Selection Criteria

... As stated in the CARB AB 617 Blueprint, the air districts will be responsible for convening a Community Steering Committee, which will include community members who live, work, own businesses, and/or attend school within the community

- Residents from within the community will be selected to ensure representation from different areas within this community, including residents from Muscoy and San Bernardino. Residential applicants will be considered based on a variety of factors
- Community organizations will be selected to represent a diverse group of community interests and provide relevant expertise within their type of organization
- Business applicants must work or own businesses within the community as specified. As stated in the CARB AB 617 Blueprint, this may include the owners of small businesses, locally-based business associations, as well as larger industrial sources, as long as committee membership draws from workers or managers from the facility itself.
- Government agencies that can provide technical support and relevant recommendations to the community steering committee.

Disclosure (Part of Application Process)

Self-Identification from categories below (listed on Committee Roster) Resident Community Organizations Business Government Agencies

Conflict of Interest

N/A

Voting

Excerpt from Charter - Code of Conduct

Strive for consensus in decision making; if an impasse is reached, a simple majority vote will be used. Respect that decision, even if it is not your preference."

East Los Angeles, Boyle Heights, West Commerce Charter

San Bernardino, Muscoy Charter

Wilmington, Carson, West Long Beach

San Joaquin Valley

(All Communities: Shafter Charter, Fresno Charter, Stockton Charter)

CSC Membership

Excerpt from AB 617 Community Steering Committee Selection Criteria

....Seek the balanced perspectives provided by the following criteria:....

- The majority of committee membership must be residents of the defined community.
- The core of the steering committee should directly represent the residents and businesses in the community.
- Government officials/agencies are entities that can take action, and are encouraged to participate. Government officials serve as full participants in the committee, except that they serve in an advisory role in final consensus building and decision making processes.

Disclosure (Part of Application Process)

Self-Identification from categories below (to be listed on Committee Roster)

Home within Boundary Resident of community

Business AND Corresponding Address within Boundary Own, manage, or directly represent business in community

Locally-based business association (Association's address must be within boundary)

Work at business in community (Representing self, not business)

Entity/Agency Local Government

Health Care, School Association or Faith-based Name Local Community-based Environmental Justice Organization

Conflict of Interest

Excerpt from Participation Agreement

We are committed to working collectively and cooperatively with all stakeholders within the community—local residents, businesses and organizations, youth groups, schools, local, regional and State governments, health agencies and faith-based organizations—to ensure all represented parties and interested members of the public are heard. To work towards consensus while recognizing that not everyone will agree on every issue and to resolve conflicts in a positive, swift and constructive manner

Voting

Excerpt from Charter - Deliberation and Consensus

A professional and impartial facilitator(s) will be employed to support the steering committee in the overall organization, order and focus of the meeting, resolve conflicts and help reach consensus to ensure the goals and objectives of this charter are met. Achieving full consensus of the steering committee may not always be possible. However, reasonable efforts will be made to capture all of the perspectives that were expressed in meeting minutes, committee documents, and related reports, including the final CERP.

AB617 Consultation Group Subcommittee Roles- A Focused Topic Discussion October 16, 2020

The subject of roles has been a topic that has come up many times in all of our meetings. The list below is intended to provide focus topics to discuss, collaborate, and identify roles for CARB/Air District/Community Members.

- Agenda setting
- Steering committees
- Training
- Facilitation
- Dispute Resolution