

May 9, 2024

Liane M. Randolph, Chair
California Air Resources Board
1001 I Street
Sacramento, CA 95814

Re: Comments on the April 10, 2024 LCFS Workshop

Dear Chair Randolph:

CARB staff continue to suppress the issues that have been raised by the undersigned organizations, the Environmental Justice Advisory Committee, environmental justice organizations, and several Board members. The workshop did not include those issues which we have consistently raised throughout the rulemaking process, including (1) ending avoided methane crediting; (2) adopting Senate Bill 1383 regulations; and (3) protecting the civil rights of San Joaquin Valley and refinery communities.

Defensores del Valle Central para el Agua y el Aire Limpio (“Defensores”) and the other signatories to this letter have amplified concerns regarding the proliferation of factory farm gas and its harmful effects on communities’ health. We have tried to ensure that CARB addresses those concerns throughout – and even prior to – this rulemaking. Unfortunately, CARB staff have consistently chosen to ignore those concerns while blatantly erasing communities’ lived experiences and the impacts communities suffer every day. Accordingly, when Defensores’ members learned that CARB staff excluded their concerns from the workshop agenda, Defensores decided to boycott the workshop.

Defensores’ decision was a wise call. CARB staff leading the meeting attempted to dismiss and discredit comments from environmental justice and public interest stakeholders. Additionally, CARB staff gave priority to in-person participation despite the meeting notice advertising the ability to make comments in person or virtually. In fact, CARB staff ended the Workshop at 4 p.m. even though many remote participants had not had an opportunity to comment, including Food & Water Watch. There was no interpretation available for in-person or remote participants. Had Defensores members participated, had they even been able to participate given the decision to cut off public comments and lack of interpreters, it seems that they would have been reminded by CARB staff, as the other signatories to this letter were, that the LCFS rulemaking would continue to ignore their experience and expertise.

We urge you to watch the entire video of the workshop with a civil rights lens and ask yourself, “if I was participating in this workshop as a member of the public concerned about the impacts of the rule changes, would I feel heard or dismissed?” Any neutral observer of the April 10 workshop would have reached the same conclusion that we communicate to you today: CARB staff is not considering the concerns of all Californians, including those who live, breathe, and drink near large scale livestock operations or refineries. We call on you and the rest of the Board to reset this rulemaking with a civil rights lens, set an even playing field for environmental

justice issues, and ensure that CARB staff respect and understand communities' lived experiences.

Rather than repeat the issues we have consistently raised for several years, which have been ignored by CARB staff, we direct you to our comments in the docket on both the [ISOR](#) and the [environmental analysis](#), as well as [comments from Defensores](#).

Thank you for your commitment to environmental justice.

Sincerely,

Jamie Katz
Phoebe Seaton
Michael Claiborne
Leadership Counsel for Justice & Accountability

Defensores del Valle Central para el Agua y el Aire Limpio

Brent Newell
Law Offices of Brent J. Newell

Tyler Lobdell
Food & Water Watch

Christine Ball-Blakely
Animal Legal Defense Fund