Consistently Nominated AB 617 Communities

1. Overview

Since the inception of the Office of Community Air Protection (Program) in 2018, the CARB Board has selected 19 communities for inclusion into the AB 617 program to develop local community air monitoring plans (CAMP) or community emissions reduction programs (CERP) to reduce air pollution. Every community selected by CARB was nominated and supported by local air districts¹ and received strong support from community-based organizations. Communities are recommended for selection based on several factors. Those include exposure to air pollution, prioritizing sensitive populations, and vulnerability measures, such as poverty and unemployment.

Available resources are also one of the more critical factors that impact the number of communities that can be selected under the Program. CARB and air districts consider funding as they anticipate communities^{2,3} that will likely be nominated in the future. Once a community is selected, the air districts assist with the development of a community steering committee, a CAMP and/or CERP, and implement the strategies included in those plans. This generally requires a multi-year commitment by the district for each community, which could potentially be up to 12 years in instances of a CERP.

In addition to the formal recommendations by air districts, CARB continues to receive, on an ongoing basis, community self-nominations from community members and local communitybased organizations across the State. CARB recognizes these self-nominations and constantly seeks ways to support these communities. As outlined before, lack of resources limits the ability to support additional communities under the AB 617 program. Significant resource commitments are needed to implement a CERP or a CAMP in a community. CARB's assessment of the cumulative air pollution exposure burdens in impacted communities⁴ established that hundreds of communities are disproportionately affected by air pollution and need additional support to develop actions and strategies to reduce the air pollution burden. CARB is committed to exploring ways of providing that additional support to the many disadvantaged communities across the State.

Community Air Grants (CAGs) are an identified pathway for where additional support can be provided to consistently nominated communities. CAGs support community capacity building and other technical support to identify, evaluate, and ultimately reduce air pollution

¹ Community Air Protection Program Recommendation Process. https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/capp-selection

² Cleaning the Air in the Most Impacted Communities. http://www.aqmd.gov/docs/default-source/ab-617-ab-134/year-2/community-identification-prioritization/presentation-aug29-2019.pdf?sfvrsn=8

³ Assembly Bill 617 Community Outreach Webinar. https://community.valleyair.org/media/3064/ab-617-future-community-final_eng.pdf

⁴ Table of Metrics - Update November 2021. https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/resources/documents/table-metricsupdate-november-2021

and exposure to harmful emissions in the community. As evident, more communities are deserving and need support than what can be provided by the existing AB 617 recommendation and selection process alone. The current AB 617 communities serve as model communities to inform the Program on what strategies and interventions can benefit other impacted communities across the State. CARB has maintained a list of district priority and nominated communities to show where these other communities that are consistently supported but not selected are located in California. We believe other local, State, or Federal programs can utilize the information provided in this document to prioritize additional support to these impacted communities, up to the extent possible, and help improve air quality in many of our communities across the State.

This document provides an overview of the following:

- Communities that have been nominated since the inception of the AB 617 program but have not been formally selected under the Program - Consistently Nominated Communities list⁵
- The rationale for developing this Consistently Nominated Communities list and how they can be supported
- Current AB 617 communities and the process for developing formal community boundaries and its implications in defining boundaries for Consistently Nominated Communities
- CARB's approach to defining a general geographical area of these Consistently Nominated Communities and limitations to that approach.

2. Consistently Nominated Communities List

The Consistently Nominated Communities list⁵ builds from the air district, community-based organizations, and community nominations since 2018, the first year of the Program. In July 2022, for the fifth year of the Program, CARB staff provided the air districts with a copy of the current list of district priority and nominated communities for confirmation or adjustments. South Coast, San Diego, and Sacramento did not have any changes. After removing duplication and communities selected by the CARB Board, the list is over 65 locations.

As part of the process outlined in Blueprint Appendix B, community self-nominations that come to CARB directly from the public are shared with the applicable air district. CARB directs air districts to consider these nominations, along with those communities identified through their analysis, for submittal. CARB also requested air district include communities they would recommend for future years as priority communities. CARB requests air districts

⁵ CARB – Consistently Nominated Communities list - https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/sites/default/files/2023-04/2023%2004%20Consistently%20Nominated%20Communities.pdf

to re-evalute these priorities annually with any new data and public input before submitting their recommendations.

<u>Bay Area</u>

In addition to the Bay Area's initial year submittal, Bay Area fact sheets and presentations was used to support air district priorities. In July 2022, the air district provided an updated list of communities. The Bay Area refined its communities more specifically than the broad regions they had defined as communities. This refinement, along with the air district's submittal to CARB, was used to identify consistently nominated communities.

		Consistently Nominated By		
Community	County	District	CBO	Community
East Contra Costa County (includes Pittsburg Bay Point)	Contra Costa	Х		
East Palo Alto	San Mateo	Х		
Fairfield	Solano	Х		
Gilroy	Santa Clara	Х		
Greater Oakland	Alameda	Х		
Hayward (parts)	Alameda	Х		
Morgan Hill	Santa Clara	Х		
North Central San Mateo	San Mateo	Х		
Redwood City	San Mateo	Х		
Rodeo to parts of Crockett	Contra Costa	Х		Х
San Francisco	San Francisco	Х		
San Jose	Santa Clara	Х		
San Leandro	Alameda	Х		
San Rafael	Marin	Х		
Santa Rosa	Sonoma	Х		
South San Francisco	San Mateo	Х		
Treasure Island	San Francisco	Х		
Tri-Valley	Alameda, Contra Costa	Х		
Vallejo	Solano	Х		
West Berkeley	Alameda	Х		

Table 1: Bay Area AQMD Consistently Nominated list

<u>Imperial</u>

Imperial APCD, in partnership with Comite Civico del Valle (CCV), nominated the entire North End of Imperial air district in 2019, 2020, and 2021. In 2022, based on prior discussions with CARB staff, Imperial APCD and CCV modified their nomination to include three communities in the county's northern portion, Westmorland, Brawley, and Calipatria, known as the North Imperial Phase 1 Community. The North Imperial Phase 1 Community was selected in the board meeting held in February 2023. Imperial considers their recommendation a phased approach to cover the entire Imperial north end eventually. Before the Year 5 process, the communities around the Salton Sea were referred to as the Salton Sea Communities. At the request of the community, CARB has classified Salton City as a community and the remaining area as the Northern Imperial Corridor.

Table 2: Imperial APCD Consistently Nominated list

		Consistently Nominated By			
Community	County	District	СВО	Community	
Northern Imperial County Corridor- unincorporated communities of Niland, Desert Shores, Salton Sea Beach, Salton Sea, Bombay Beach, Seeley	Imperial	х	Х		
Salton City	Imperial	Х	Х	Х	

Sacramento

In Sacramento, the district's priorities for an additional monitoring community have remained consistent over the last three years. The air district recommends air monitoring in one of the communities of either North Sacramento, Oak Park/ Fruitridge, or Meadowview.

Table 3: Sacramento Metropolitan AQMD Consistently Nominated list

		Consistently Nominated By			
Community	County	District	СВО	Community	
Florin (Community C)	Sacramento			Х	
Meadowview (Community G)	Sacramento	Х	Х	Х	
North Sacramento	Sacramento	Х	Х	Х	
Del Paso Heights, Norwood/Old North Sacramento (Community B in District analysis)	Sacramento			х	
Oak Park, Fruitridge	Sacramento	Х	Х	Х	
South Natomas (Community A in District analysis)	Sacramento	Х			

San Joaquin Valley

In the San Joaquin Valley, the assessment from the San Joaquin Valley's AB 617 Environmental Justice Steering Committee's evaluation was used along with air district submittals to identify communities. San Joaquin Valley APCD clarified its intent in the previous analysis, and even though communities were used in their analysis, that it was not recommending the communities for formal selection. Table 4: San Joaquin Valley APCD Consistently Nominated list

Community	County	Consistently Nominated By		
	-	District	CBO	Community
"The West Side" (Huron, Avenal, and Coalinga)	Fresno		Х	х
Delano	Kern		Х	Х
Fairmead	Madera County		Х	Х
Kettleman City	Kings County		Х	Х
La Viña	Madera County	Х	Х	
Lanare	Fresno		Х	Х
Le Grand	Merced		Х	Х
Lindsay	Tulare		Х	Х
Lost Hills	Kern		Х	Х
North Bakersfield	Kern	Х	Х	Х
South Madera- La Vina, Parkwood, Parksdale, Borden, Italian Swiss Colony, Iragose, and Ripperday	Madera County		х	х
South Merced	Merced		Х	Х
South Modesto (Modesto, Modesto Airport neighborhood)	Stanislaus		Х	х
South Tulare & Matheny Tract	Tulare		Х	Х
Southwest Modesto	Stanislaus		Х	Х
Wasco	Kern		Х	Х
West Stanislaus County	Stanislaus		Х	Х

South Coast

In South Coast, their submittal in the first three years included near-term communities. The following list consists of these communities and notes if community members have nominated the community.

Table 5: South Coast AQMD Consistently Nominated list

		Consistently Nominated By		
Community	County	District	CBO	Community
Bloomington, Fontana, Rialto	San Bernardino	Х		Х
Buena Park, Anaheim, Fullerton, Orange*	Orange	Х		Х
Central and East Riverside, Rubidoux	Riverside	Х		
Chiriaco Summit	Riverside	Х		Х
Colton, Grand Terrace, San Bernardino (southwest)	San Bernardino	Х		Х
Compton, Rancho Dominguez, Willowbrook, Lynwood	Los Angeles	Х		Х
Corona, Temescal Valley	Riverside	Х		Х
El Monte, South El Monte, Avocado Heights, Hacienda Heights, La Puente (west), Bassett	Los Angeles	Х		Х
Gardena, Alondra Park, Lawndale	Los Angeles	Х		Х

		Consistently Nominated By		
Community	County	District	CBO	Community
Inglewood, Hawthorne, Westmont, Vermont*	Los Angeles	Х	Х	
Maywood, Commerce (east), Vernon, Bell	Los Angeles	Х	Х	
Mira Loma, Jurupa Valley, Eastvale, Pedley	Riverside	Х	Х	
Pacoima, North Hollywood, Sun Valley, San Fernando, Sylmar	Los Angeles	Х	х	
Paramount, North Long Beach	Los Angeles	Х	Х	
Rancho Cucamonga, Ontario (east)	Riverside	Х	Х	
Santa Ana	Orange	Х	Х	
Torrance	Los Angeles	Х	Х	
Van Nuys	Los Angeles	Х	Х	
Westlake, Korea Town, Mid-city, Mid-Wilshire	Los Angeles	Х	Х	

3. Limitations to Area Definition

As part of their nomination, the air districts will often provide a *preliminary draft boundary that* CARB uses to develop a preliminary community profile for inclusion in the staff report for community recommendation to the CARB Board. Once a community is selected for the AB 617 program, the air district will develop and convene a community steering committee (CSC) that will discuss this preliminary boundary and decide on how, or if, they need to change it to address the community's concerns better. The community stakeholders and the air district use the final community boundary to develop and implement a CERP.

However, most community self-nominations and future communities anticipated by air districts lack a *preliminary draft* boundary definition at the time of their submission. Therefore, approximating the location of these communities becomes essential so that other programs can quickly identify and isolate a geographic area as a starting point to direct resources and support local communities.

As a part of developing the Consistently Nominated Communities list, CARB staff developed a methodology to define an approximate geographical area for each Consistently Nominated Community. While CARB staff intends to provide the most representative information, we note there are limitations to using area definitions for the Consistently Nominated Communities. These include:

- These areas do NOT represent CARB's definition of an official community boundary nor CARB's expectation of what a boundary should look like.
- These areas are for informational purposes only
- These areas serve as a rough idea of where these communities may geographically be located
- It is anticipated that other programs beyond AB 617 that want to engage with communities and local air districts will use these definitions as a starting point for discussion but will, over time, develop their understanding of the expanse of a community area.

• These definitions are subject to change, for example, when a community is formally nominated by an air district for AB 617 program along with a preliminary draft boundary.

To provide some general guidance on where these communities are located geographically so other programs can support these communities, CARB developed this methodology to approximate the location of these communities.

4. Geolocation of Consistently Nominated Communities

CARB staff often relies on community nomination documents to look for detailed community descriptions, including their physical location. If the nomination includes such descriptions, the mapping of Consistently Nominated Communities will reflect the community's description. Ideally, all nominations would consist of a description of the area of the community, but not all nominations include this information. If a nomination does not describe the community's location, CARB staff has used two analyses to determine a community's areas. The analyses include the US Census TIGER/Line shapefiles and the USGS Geographic Names Information System. It is important to note that in either case of a community describing its area or CARB determining the location via analysis, these areas are for informational use only. Official AB 617 community boundaries are developed through a collaboration between the Community Steering Committee of a selected community and the local Air District.

TIGER\Line Incorporated Places and Census Designated Places (TIGER Places) (2021)⁶ Shapefiles are extracts of selected geographic and cartographic information from the Census Bureau's Master Address File (MAF)/Topologically Integrated Geographic Encoding and Referencing (TIGER) Database (MTDB). Staff referenced the 2021 TIGER/Line Shapefiles Incorporated Places (legal entities) and Census Designated Places (statistical entities). Staff cross-referenced the submitted community names with the TIGER Places dataset to obtain estimated community areas. When the community names could not be found in TIGER Places, staff referenced a dataset by the US Geological Survey.

USGS Geographic Names Information System (GNIS) (2021)⁷ contains information about the physical geographic features of many types in the United States. The database holds the Federally recognized name of each feature and defines the feature location by State, county, USGS topographic map, and geographic coordinates. Other attributes include names or spellings other than the official name, feature designations, feature classification, and historical and descriptive information.

⁶ US Census TIGER/Line Shapefile Technical Documentation - https://www.census.gov/programssurveys/geography/technical-documentation/complete-technical-documentation/tiger-geo-line.2021.html#listtab-C1XKBO88QMRGRG1GHU

⁷ US Geological Survey GNIS - https://www.usgs.gov/tools/geographic-names-information-system-gnis

In recognition of the need to ensure a common understanding of the location of consistently nominated communities, staff determined an intersecting point, or centroid, of the community based on the boundaries found by cross-referencing TIGER Places or GNIS. The centroids provide a reasonably accurate location for each consistently nominated community. If the need arises to refer to estimated regions, one suggestion could be drawing a one mile radius circle around each centroid.

5. Supporting Communities Beyond AB 617 Program

The Consistently Nominated Communities list has over 60 communities distributed geographically across California. As mentioned earlier, limited resources within the AB 617 program make it difficult to include all these deserving communities under the Program. This list is dynamic, and as we continue to receive nominations, other communities can be added or adjusted.

It is important to note that AB 617 does not give CARB or Air Districts any new authority to compel other state, regional, or local agencies to come to the table. To achieve the community-driven Program goals, establishing trust and relationship-building are critical if California aims to achieve meaningful emission and exposure reductions in overburdened communities. Many efforts are being piloted to leverage current aspects of the Program better.

- CARB applied for and received a federal American Rescue Plan Grant for \$499,100. CARB's Monitoring and Laboratory will lead the grant efforts to engage the community and build partnerships to co-design and implement air quality monitoring in the environmental justice communities of La Viña and Maywood-Vernon-Bell-East Commerce. The goal addresses the community concern of needing additional pesticide monitoring in La Viña and heavy metals monitoring in Maywood-Vernon-Bell-East Commerce. The lessons learned on the Grant implementation will inform the development of a statewide community air monitoring program and guide the enhancement of the air toxics program.
- The Methane Task Force is a joint effort led by the Department of Conservation California Geologic Energy Management Division (CalGEM) and the California Air Resources Board (CARB). The task force will identify and respond to methane leaks from oil infrastructure near communities, as well as address the outsized impact methane has on climate change.
- Several incentive programs that fund emission and exposure reductions across the State can be accessed by all burdened communities, to name a few
 - Community Air Protection Incentives⁸,

⁸ CARB – Community Air Protection Incentives : https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/ourwork/programs/community-airprotection-incentives/ab-617-community-air-protection-incentives

- Supplemental Environmental Projects⁹. Supplemental Environmental Projects have been used for air filtration in homes in schools.
- Community Air Grants¹⁰, and
- Carl Moyer Program¹¹
- Community Engagement Driving Enforcement- CARB enforcement has responded to several community-driven complaints of odor, oil and gas, truck operations, idling, fugitive dust, and pesticide applications.
- Building relationships is still a foundation of the Program. Salton City has repeatedly
 asked to be selected as an AB 617 community. CARB joined the California Natural
 Resources Agency (CNRA), working with the California Department of Water
 Resources and the California Department of Fish and Wildlife to implement the Salton
 Sea Management Program to address air quality and ecological threats at the Salton
 Sea. CARB is also working with the CNRA in its initial stages to leverage opportunities
 to help communities like Salton City to collect monitoring data and reduce emissions
 and exposure to air pollution in the community.

However, CARB also recognizes that resources beyond the AB 617 program may be available to support these communities through many other programs/grants, etc. CARB often receives an inquiry about the location of these communities. This list can serve as a starting point for programs beyond AB 617 to identify communities across California that need support and resources. CARB is also developing an interactive mapping tool that will be continually updated with the l

⁹ CARB – Supplemental Environmental Projects: https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/our-work/programs/supplementalenvironmental-projectsseps/supplemental-environmental-project-sep-1

¹⁰ CARB – Community Air Grants: *https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/capp-cag*

¹¹ CARB – Carl Moyer Program: https://ww2.arb.ca.gov/carl-moyer-program-statistics-and-reports