



UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY
REGION IX
75 Hawthorne Street
San Francisco, CA 94105-3901

OFFICE OF THE
REGIONAL ADMINISTRATOR

Richard W. Corey
Executive Officer
California Air Resources Board
1001 I Street
Sacramento, California 95814

Dear Executive Officer Corey:

This letter is in response to your letter dated December 20, 2018, submitting the “2017 Quantitative Milestone Report for the 1997 and 2006 NAAQS,” and your letter dated August 12, 2019, providing supplemental information (collectively “2017 Quantitative Milestone Report”). The 2017 Quantitative Milestone Report provides California’s demonstration that all measures found in the Fine Particulate Matter (PM_{2.5}) Attainment Plan for the San Joaquin Valley area (“SJV PM_{2.5} Plan” or “Plan”) are being implemented and that the 2017 quantitative milestones identified in the Plan have been met. Section 189(c)(2) of the Clean Air Act and 40 CFR 51.1013(b) require the State to submit a quantitative milestone report no later than 90 days after each milestone date. The SJV PM_{2.5} Plan provides information on the quantitative milestones to be met by the December 31, 2017 milestone date for the 1997 and 2006 PM_{2.5} national ambient air quality standards (NAAQS) in the San Joaquin Valley.

The Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) has determined that the 2017 Quantitative Milestone Report is adequate. The basis for this determination is set forth in the enclosed document. This determination is based on the EPA’s review of information contained in the SJV PM_{2.5} Plan, as revised February 11, 2020, and the 2017 Quantitative Milestone Report.

This determination of adequacy does not constitute an approval of any component of the SJV PM_{2.5} Plan. The EPA approved all but the contingency measure element of the Plan for purposes of the 2006 PM_{2.5} NAAQS on July 22, 2020, (85 FR 44192) but has not yet acted on the Plan for purposes of the 1997 PM_{2.5} NAAQS.

If you have any questions, please contact Elizabeth Adams, Air and Radiation Division Director, EPA Region IX, at (415) 972-3183, or your staff may contact Rory Mays at (415) 972-3227.

Sincerely,

Deborah Jordan
Acting Regional Administrator

Enclosure: EPA Evaluation of the 2017 Quantitative Milestone Report

cc: Samir Sheikh, San Joaquin Valley Air Pollution Control District

ENCLOSURE

EPA Evaluation of 2017 Quantitative Milestone Report

OVERVIEW

Section 189(c) of the Clean Air Act (CAA) requires that attainment plans for all fine particulate matter (PM_{2.5}) nonattainment areas contain quantitative milestones that: (1) demonstrate reasonable further progress (RFP); and (2) are to be achieved every three years until the area is redesignated to attainment. For all areas designated nonattainment for the 1997 or 2006 PM_{2.5} NAAQS before January 15, 2015, the starting point for the first three-year period for quantitative milestones under CAA section 189(c) is December 31, 2014, and the first quantitative milestone date is December 31, 2017.¹

Section 189(c)(2) of the CAA requires each state containing a PM_{2.5} nonattainment area to submit, no later than 90 days after the date on which a milestone applicable to the area occurs, a demonstration that all measures in the approved state implementation plan (SIP) have been implemented and that the milestone has been met. We refer to these submissions as “quantitative milestone reports.” Under the EPA’s implementation rule for the PM_{2.5} NAAQS,² each quantitative milestone report submitted by a state must include, at minimum: (1) a certification by the Governor or Governor’s designee that the SIP control strategy is being implemented consistent with the RFP plan, as described in the applicable attainment plan; (2) technical support, including calculations, sufficient to document completion statistics for appropriate milestones and to demonstrate that the quantitative milestones have been satisfied and how the emissions reductions achieved to date compare to those required or scheduled to meet RFP; and (3) a discussion of whether the area will attain the applicable PM_{2.5} NAAQS by the projected attainment date for the area.³

This attachment contains the EPA’s evaluation of the first quantitative milestone report submitted by the California Air Resources Board (CARB or “State”) and the San Joaquin Valley Air Pollution Control District (“District”) for the San Joaquin Valley PM_{2.5} nonattainment area, which is classified as Serious nonattainment for the 1997 and 2006 PM_{2.5} NAAQS. CARB and the District elected to base the first quantitative milestones for these NAAQS on the achievement of specified amounts of direct PM_{2.5} and NO_x emission reductions by the end of 2017 through implementation of existing control measures. The 2017 Quantitative Milestone Report confirms that these control measures are in effect and provides information on the emission reductions achieved by these measures, consistent with the RFP demonstrations in the CAA section 189(d) plan for the 1997 PM_{2.5} NAAQS (“Section 189(d) Plan”) and the Serious area plan for the 2006 PM_{2.5} NAAQS (“Serious Area Plan”) for the San Joaquin Valley, both of which are contained in the SJV PM_{2.5} Plan submitted May 10, 2019. Based on this evaluation, we find that the 2017 Quantitative Milestone Report adequately demonstrates that the December 31, 2017 milestones have been met.

¹ 40 CFR 51.1013(a)(4).

² 81 FR 58010 (August 24, 2016) (codified at 40 CFR part 51, subpart Z).

³ 40 CFR 51.1013(b).

SAN JOAQUIN VALLEY NONATTAINMENT AREA CONTROL STRATEGY AND RFP PLAN

(1) State and District Control Measures identified in 2017 Quantitative Milestone Report

The table below lists the State and District control measures identified in the 2017 Quantitative Milestone Report that contribute to RFP in 2017 and attainment of the 1997 and 2006 PM_{2.5} NAAQS by the applicable attainment dates. Both the Section 189(d) Plan and the Serious Area Plan rely on reductions in emissions of direct PM_{2.5} and NO_x from 2013 base year emission levels to demonstrate RFP and attainment of the 1997 and 2006 PM_{2.5} NAAQS by the applicable attainment dates.⁴ The EPA fully approved all but the contingency measure element of the Serious Area Plan on July 22, 2020 (85 FR 44192).⁵ The EPA has not yet taken action on the Section 189(d) Plan.

Table 1. State and District Control Measures Contributing to RFP in 2017 and Attainment

State or District Control Measure	EPA Approval Date	Federal Register (FR) Citation
SJV Rule 4901 (“Wood Burning Fireplaces and Wood Burning Heaters”)	10/6/2016	81 FR 69393
SJV Rule 4308 (“Boilers, Steam Generators, and Process Heaters = 0.075 MMBtu/hr to less than 2.0 MMBTU/hr”)	2/12/2015	80 FR 7803
SJV Rule 4905 (“Natural Gas-Fired, Fan-Type Central Furnaces”)	3/29/2016	81 FR 17390
SJV Rule 4354 (“Glass Melting Furnaces”)	1/31/2013	78 FR 6740
SJV Rule 4702 (“Internal Combustion Engines”)	4/25/2016	81 FR 24029
SJV Rule 4902 (“Residential Water Heaters”)	5/5/2010	75 FR 24408
CARB On-Road Heavy Duty Diesel Vehicles (In-Use) Regulation	4/4/2012	77 FR 20308
CARB Advanced Clean Cars Program	6/16/2016	81 FR 39424
CARB In-Use Off-Road Diesel-Fueled Fleets Regulation	6/16/2016	81 FR 39424

EPA’S EVALUATION OF THE 2017 QUANTITATIVE MILESTONE REPORT

(1) Certification by the Governor or Governor’s Designee

40 CFR 51.1013(b)(1): The quantitative milestone report must include certification by the Governor or Governor’s designee that the state’s attainment plan control strategy is being implemented as described in the applicable attainment plan.

⁴ SJV PM_{2.5} Plan, App. H (as revised February 11, 2020), section H.1 (“Reasonable Further Progress (RFP)”), App. G (“Precursor Demonstration”), and App. K (“Modeling Attainment Demonstration”). See also *id.* at Chapter 4 (“Attainment Strategy for PM_{2.5}”).

⁵ As part of the EPA’s action approving the SJV PM_{2.5} Plan for purposes of the 2006 PM_{2.5} NAAQS, the EPA approved the State’s demonstration that emissions of sulfur oxides (SO_x), volatile organic compounds (VOCs), and ammonia do not contribute significantly to PM_{2.5} levels that exceed the 2006 PM_{2.5} NAAQS in the San Joaquin Valley area. 85 FR 17382, section IV.B (March 27, 2020) (proposed rule) and 85 FR 44192 (July 22, 2020) (final rule).

CARB submitted the 2017 Quantitative Milestone Report by letter, dated December 20, 2018, from Richard W. Corey, the California Governor's designee for submitting SIPs to the EPA. Mr. Corey also provided supplemental information by letter, dated August 12, 2019. These letters confirm that the 2017 Quantitative Milestone Report documents the State's and District's implementation of control measures consistent with the control strategy in the Section 189(d) Plan and the Serious Area Plan. We find these letters adequate to meet this requirement.

(2) 2017 Quantitative Milestone Report Technical Support

40 CFR 51.1013(b)(2): The quantitative milestone report must contain technical support, including calculations, sufficient to document completion statistics for appropriate milestones and to demonstrate that the quantitative milestones have been satisfied. It must also demonstrate how the emissions reductions achieved to date compare to those required or scheduled to meet RFP.

CARB and the District elected to base the 2017 quantitative milestones found in Appendix H of the Section 189(d) Plan and Serious Area Plan on specific amounts of emissions reductions reflected in the emissions inventory, which are achieved through implementation of the RFP control strategy. The 2017 Quantitative Milestone Report identifies the 2017 RFP emissions targets for direct PM_{2.5} and NO_x in the Section 189(d) Plan and Serious Area Plan and provides quantitative information demonstrating that those emissions targets have been met through implementation of the RFP control strategy. Additionally, the report discusses the implementation status of each of the primary control measures for direct PM_{2.5} and NO_x that achieved the necessary emission reductions. We find the report adequate to meet this requirement.

(3) Attainment by the Applicable Attainment Date

40 CFR 51.1013(b)(3): The quantitative milestone report must include a discussion of whether the PM_{2.5} NAAQS will be attained by the projected attainment date for the area.

Based on the information provided in the 2017 Quantitative Milestone Report, CARB and the District conclude that the emission reductions needed to demonstrate RFP have been achieved, the 2017 quantitative milestones have been met, and thus, ongoing progress is being made to attain the 1997 and 2006 PM_{2.5} NAAQS by the projected attainment dates for each NAAQS. The Section 189(d) Plan contains a demonstration that the San Joaquin Valley area will attain the 1997 PM_{2.5} NAAQS by December 31, 2020, and the Serious Area Plan contains a demonstration that the area will attain the 2006 PM_{2.5} NAAQS by December 31, 2024.

CONCLUSION

Based on these evaluations, we have determined that the 2017 Quantitative Milestone Report contains each of the required components and adequately demonstrates that the San Joaquin Valley nonattainment area's 2017 quantitative milestones for purposes of attaining the 1997 and 2006 PM_{2.5} NAAQS have been met.